

UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA CIRCUIT

OCT - 5 2006

RECEIVED

No. 05-5139

---

IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA CIRCUIT

---

MARRITA MURPHY and  
DANIEL J. LEVEILLE,

Appellants

v.

INTERNAL REVENUE SERVICE and  
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

Appellees

---

ON APPEAL FROM THE ORDER OF THE UNITED STATES  
DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

---

APPELLEES' PETITION FOR REHEARING *EN BANC*

---

EILEEN J. O'CONNOR  
*Assistant Attorney General*

GILBERT S. ROTHENBERG (202) 514-3361  
KENNETH L. GREENE (202) 514-3573  
FRANCESCA U. TAMAMI (202) 514-1882

*Attorneys*  
*Tax Division*  
*Department of Justice*  
*P.O. Box 502*  
*Washington, D.C. 20044*

*Of Counsel:*  
KENNETH L. WAINSTEIN  
*United States Attorney*

---

---

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|   | Page(s) |
|---|---------|
| Table of authorities .....  | i       |
| Statement under Fed. R. App. P. 35(b)(1) .....  | 1       |
| Statement .....   | 2       |
| Argument .....  | 4       |
| A.    The panel erred in declaring I.R.C. § 104(a)(2)<br>unconstitutional .....   | 4       |
| B.    The panel misconstrued the Supreme Court's decision<br>in <i>O'Gilvie v. United States</i> and erred in determining that the<br>damages here are not income ..... | 8       |
| C.    Even if the award is not income, it is constitutionally<br>taxable .....  | 14      |
| Conclusion .....  | 14      |
| Addendum .....  | 16      |
| Certificate of Parties, Rulings and Related Cases .....   | 41      |
| Certificate of Service .....  | 42      |

## TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

### Cases:

|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| <i>Brushaber v. Union Pac. R.R. Co.</i> , 240 U.S. 1 (1916) .....           | 4, 5      |
| <i>Burk-Waggoner Oil Association v. Hopkins</i> , 269 U.S. 110 (1925) ..... | 5         |
| <i>Coleman v. Commissioner</i> , 791 F.2d 68 (7th Cir. 1986) .....          | 13        |
| <i>Commissioner v. Banks</i> , 543 U.S. 426 (2005) .....                    | 10        |
| <i>Commissioner v. Glenshaw Glass Co.</i> , 348 U.S. 426 (1955) .....       | 9, 11, 13 |
| <i>Commissioner v. Schleier</i> , 515 U.S. 323 (1995) .....                 | 1, 10     |
| <i>Commissioner v. Tufts</i> , 461 U.S. 300 (1983) .....                    | 8         |
| <i>Diedrich v. Commissioner</i> , 457 U.S. 191 (1982) .....                 | 8         |
| <i>Dotson v. United States</i> , 87 F.3d 682 (5th Cir. 1996) .....          | 7         |
| <i>Eisner v. Macomber</i> , 252 U.S. 189 (1920) .....                       | 5, 8, 9   |
| <i>Green v. Commissioner</i> , 74 T.C. 1229 (1980) .....                    | 12        |
| <i>Helvering v. Bruun</i> , 309 U.S. 461 (1940) .....                       | 8         |
| <i>Hylton v. United States</i> , 3 U.S. 171 (1796) .....                    | 14        |
| <i>Knowlton v. Moore</i> , 178 U.S. 41 (1900) .....                         | 14        |
| <i>Lary v. United States</i> , 787 F.2d 1538 (11th Cir. 1986) .....         | 12        |
| <i>Lindsey v. Commissioner</i> , 422 F.3d 684 (8th Cir. 2005) .....         | 1         |

| Cases (cont'd):   | Page(s)         |
|---|-----------------|
| <i>Mahana v. United States</i> , 88 F. Supp. 285 (Ct. Cl. 1950) .....                         | 8               |
| <i>O'Gilvie v. United States</i> , 519 U.S. 79 (1996) .....                                   | 1, 3, 8, 10, 13 |
| <i>Penn Mutual Indemnity Co. v. Commissioner</i> ,<br>277 F.2d 16 (3d Cir. 1960) .....        | 14              |
| <i>Pollock v. Farmers' Loan &amp; Trust Co.</i> , 158 U.S. 601 (1895) .....                   | 4               |
| <i>Polone v. Commissioner</i> , 449 F.3d 1041 (9th Cir. 2006) .....                           | 1, 11           |
| <i>Raytheon Prod. Corp. v. Commissioner</i> ,<br>144 F.2d 110 (1st Cir. 1944) .....           | 11              |
| <i>Roemer v. Commissioner</i> , 716 F.2d 693 (9th Cir. 1983) .....                            | 11              |
| <i>Rust v. Sullivan</i> , 500 U.S. 173 (1991) .....   | 9               |
| <i>Simmons v. United States</i> , 308 F.2d 160 (4th Cir. 1962) .....                          | 14              |
| <i>Steward Machine Co. v. Davis</i> , 301 U.S. 548 (1937) .....                               | 5               |
| <i>United States v. Burke</i> , 504 U.S. 229 (1992) .....                                     | 1, 10           |
| <i>United States v. Connor</i> , 898 F.2d 942 (3d Cir. 1990) .....                            | 13              |
| <i>United States v. Manufacturers National Bank of Detroit</i> ,<br>363 U.S. 194 (1960) ..... | 14              |
| <i>Young v. United States</i> , 332 F.3d 893 (6th Cir. 2003) .....                            | 1               |

**Statutes and Constitutional Provisions:**

Internal Revenue Code of 1986 (26 U.S.C.):

|  |               |
|--|---------------|
| § 61 .....   | <i>passim</i> |
| § 104(a)(2) .....  | <i>passim</i> |
| § 1001 .....   | 11            |
| §§ 1271-1278 .....   | 8             |
| § 7872 .....   | 8             |
| Revenue Act of 1913, Sec. II .....   | 7             |
| Revenue Act of 1918, Sec. 211 .....  | 7             |
| Small Business Job Protection Act, Pub. Law No. 104-188,<br>§ 1605(a), 110 Stat. 1755, 1838 (1996) ..... | 2             |

U.S. Constitution

|                             |               |
|-----------------------------|---------------|
| Art. I, sec. 8, cl. 1 ..... | 4             |
| Art. I, sec. 9, cl. 4 ..... | 4             |
| Amend. XVI .....            | <i>passim</i> |

| <b>Administrative Rulings and Regulations:</b>                | <b>Page(s)</b> |
|---|----------------|
| 31 Op. Att’y Gen. 304 (1918) .....                            | 7              |
| Sol. Mem. 957, 1919-1 C.B. 65 (1919) .....                    | 7              |
| Sol. Mem. 1384, 1920-2 C.B. 71 (1920) .....                   | 7              |
| Sol. Op. 132, I-1 C.B. 92 (1922) .....                        | 8              |
| Reg. No. 33 (Rev.), Art. 4(25), 20 Treas. Dec. 126, 130 ..... | 7              |
| T.D. 2135, 17 Treas. Dec. 39, 42 (1915) .....                 | 6              |
| T.D. 2570, 19 Treas. Dec. 321, 323 (1917) .....               | 6              |
| T.D. 2747, 20 Treas. Dec. 457 (1918) .....                    | 7              |

**Miscellaneous:**

|   |       |
|---|-------|
| 1 Boris I. Bittker & Lawrence Lokken, <i>Federal Taxation of Income, Estates, and Gifts</i> ¶ 5.6 (3d ed. 1999) .....   | 13    |
| J. Martin Burke & Michael Friel, <i>Tax Treatment of Employment-Related Personal Injury Awards: The Need for Limits</i> , 50 Mont. L. Rev. 13 (1989) .....                      | 12    |
| Mark Cochran, <i>Should Personal Injury Damage Awards be Taxed?</i> , 38 Case W. Res. L. Rev. 43 (1987) .....   | 12    |
| Joseph M. Dodge, <i>The Story of Glenshaw Glass: Towards a Modern Concept of Income</i> , TAX STORIES 31-37 (2003) .....  | 6     |
| Lawrence Frolik, <i>Personal Injury Compensation as a Tax Preference</i> , 37 Me. L. Rev. 1 (1985) .....  | 12    |
| H.R. Rep. No. 65-767 (1918), <i>reprinted in</i> 1939-1 C.B. (pt. 2) 86 .....   | 7     |
| H.R. Rep. No. 83-1337 (1954), <i>reprinted in</i> 1954 U.S.C.C.A.N. 4017 .....  | 9     |
| F. Patrick Hubbard, <i>Making People Whole Again: The Constitutionality of Taxing Compensatory Damages for Mental Distress</i> , 49 Fla. L. Rev. 725 (1997) .....               | 12    |
| Douglas Kahn, <i>The Constitutionality of Taxing Compensatory Damages for Mental Distress When There Was No Accompanying Physical Injury</i> , 4 Fla. Tax Rev. 128 (1999) ..... | 12    |
| Allen Kenney, <i>Murphy a Boon for Protestors, Critics Say</i> , 112 Tax Notes 832 (Sept. 4, 2006) .....  | 15    |
| S. Rep. No. 83-1622, at 168 (1954), <i>reprinted in</i> 1954 U.S.C.C.A.N. 4621 .....  | 9     |
| Lee Sheppard, <i>Murphy’s Law-Tax Provision Declared Unconstitutional</i> , 112 Tax Notes 825 (Sept. 4, 2006) .....   | 12    |
| Sheryl Stratton, <i>Experts Ponder Murphy Decision’s Many Flaws</i> , 112 Tax Notes 822 (Sept. 4, 2006) .....   | 14-15 |
| Robert J. Wells, <i>Was D.C. Circuit Taken by 21st Century Murphy Game?</i> , 112 Tax Notes 813 (Sept. 4, 2006) .....   | 14    |

