

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF NORTH CAROLINA

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, STATE OF  
NORTH CAROLINA, STATE OF  
CALIFORNIA, STATE OF COLORADO,  
STATE OF CONNECTICUT, STATE OF  
MINNESOTA, STATE OF OREGON, STATE  
OF TENNESSEE, and STATE OF  
WASHINGTON,

*Plaintiffs,*

vs.

Case No. 1:24-cv-00710-LCB-JLW

REALPAGE, INC.,

*Defendant.*

**PLAINTIFFS' OPPOSITION TO DEFENDANT'S MOTION TO DISMISS**

Plaintiffs United States of America, and the States of North Carolina, California, Colorado, Connecticut, Minnesota, Oregon, Tennessee, and Washington, acting by and through their respective Attorneys General, oppose Defendant RealPage, Inc.'s Motion to Dismiss under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 12(b)(6), filed on December 3, 2024 (ECF No. 43). RealPage's Motion misapprehends governing law and gives short shrift to Plaintiffs' extensive allegations of RealPage's anticompetitive conduct.

Nevertheless, Plaintiffs respectfully have amended their complaint as a matter of right, *see* FED. R. CIV. 15(a)(1)(B), to add six of the many landlords that have participated in this anticompetitive scheme with RealPage (Greystar, LivCor, Camden, Cushman &

Wakefield/Pinnacle, and Willow Bridge, and Cortland) as Defendants, two additional States as co-Plaintiffs, and additional allegations of Defendants’ anticompetitive conduct.<sup>1</sup> As this Court has held, the filing of the Amended Complaint in this action (*see* ECF No. 47) “can serve as a response to a motion to dismiss under Rule 12(b),” and it “supersedes the original complaint, rendering the original complaint of no legal effect and any motion to dismiss it moot.” *Tucker Auto-Mation of N.C., LLC v. Rutledge*, No. 1:15-cv-00893, 2016 WL 11590593, at \*1 & \*2 (M.D.N.C. Sept. 23, 2016) (citing *Young v. City of Mount Ranier*, 238 F.3d 567, 572–73 (4th Cir. 2001)). Plaintiffs therefore respectfully request that the Court deny RealPage’s Motion to Dismiss (the original Complaint) as moot. Should RealPage renew its Motion in response to the Amended Complaint, Plaintiffs will respond on the merits.

Dated: January 7, 2025

Respectfully submitted,

By: s/ Name

Henry C. Su  
David A. Geiger

Attorneys  
United States Department of Justice  
Antitrust Division  
450 Fifth Street N.W., Suite 7100  
Washington, DC 20530  
Telephone: (202) 307-6200  
Email: [henry.su@usdoj.gov](mailto:henry.su@usdoj.gov)

---

<sup>1</sup> Rule 15(a)(1)(B) provides that “[a] party may amend its pleading once as a matter of course no later than ... 21 days after service of a motion under Rule 12(b)[.]” FED. R. CIV. P. 15(a)(1)(B). Here, that deadline was extended to January 7, 2025, by the Court in an order entered on November 19, 2024.

**FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF NORTH  
CAROLINA:**

JEFF JACKSON  
Attorney General of North Carolina

*/s/ Kunal J. Choksi*

---

KUNAL J. CHOKSI  
Special Deputy Attorney General  
N.C. Bar. No. 55666  
JESSICA V. SUTTON  
Special Deputy Attorney General  
N.C. Bar No. 41652  
North Carolina Department of Justice  
114 W. Edenton Street  
Raleigh, NC 27603  
Telephone: 919-716-6032  
Email: [kchoksi@ncdoj.gov](mailto:kchoksi@ncdoj.gov)

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of North  
Carolina*

**FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF  
CALIFORNIA:**

ROB BONTA  
Attorney General of California

*/s/ Pamela Pham*

---

DOAN-PHUONG (PAMELA) PHAM  
QUYEN TOLAND  
Deputy Attorneys General  
Office of the Attorney General  
California Department of Justice  
300 South Spring Street, Suite 1702  
Los Angeles, CA 90013  
Tel: (213) 269-6000  
Email: [Pamela.Pham@doj.ca.gov](mailto:Pamela.Pham@doj.ca.gov)

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of California*

**FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF  
COLORADO**

PHILIP J. WEISER  
Attorney General

*/s/ Elizabeth W. Hereford*

---

ELIZABETH W. HEREFORD  
Assistant Attorney General  
BRYN WILLIAMS  
First Assistant Attorney General  
Colorado Department of Law  
Office of the Attorney General  
Ralph L. Carr Judicial Center  
1300 Broadway, 7th Floor  
Denver, CO 80203  
Telephone: (720) 508-6000  
Email: Bryn.williams @coag.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Colorado*

**FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF  
CONNECTICUT:**

WILLIAM TONG  
Attorney General of Connecticut

*/s/ Julián A. Quiñones Reyes*

JULIÁN A. QUIÑONES REYES  
Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the Connecticut Attorney  
General  
165 Capitol Avenue  
Hartford, CT 06106  
Telephone: (860) 808-5030  
Email: Julian.Quinones@ct.gov

*Attorney for Plaintiff State of  
Connecticut*

**FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF  
MINNESOTA:**

KEITH ELLISON  
Attorney General of Minnesota

/s/Katherine A. Moerke

KATHERINE A. MOERKE  
ELIZABETH ODETTE  
SARAH DOKTORI  
Assistant Attorneys General  
Office of the Minnesota Attorney  
General  
445 Minnesota Street, Suite 600  
St. Paul, MN 55101-2130  
katherine.moerke@ag.state.mn.us  
Telephone: (651) 757-1288  
elizabeth.odette@ag.state.mn.us  
Telephone: (651) 728-7208  
sarah.doktori@ag.state.mn.us  
Telephone: (651) 583-6694

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Minnesota*

**FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF  
OREGON:**

DAN RAYFIELD  
Attorney General of Oregon

/s/ Timothy D. Smith

Timothy D. Smith  
Attorney-in-Charge  
Antitrust, False Claims, & Privacy  
Section  
Oregon Department of Justice  
100 SW Market St, Portland OR 97201  
503.798.3297 |  
tim.smith@doj.oregon.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Oregon*

**FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF  
TENNESSEE:**

JONATHAN SKRMETTI  
Attorney General of Tennessee

*/s/ S. Ethan Bowers*

---

S. ETHAN BOWERS  
Senior Assistant Attorney General  
DANIEL LYNCH  
Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the Tennessee Attorney General  
P.O. Box 20207  
Nashville, Tennessee 37202  
6.15.837.5582 |  
Ethan.Bowers@ag.tn.gov

*Attorneys for State of Tennessee*

**FOR PLAINTIFF STATE OF  
WASHINGTON:**

ROBERT W. FERGUSON  
Attorney General

*/s/ Rachel A. Lumen*

---

BRIAN H. ROWE  
RACHEL A. LUMEN  
SARAH SMITH-LEVY  
KENDALL SCOTT COWLES  
Assistant Attorneys General  
800 Fifth Avenue, Suite 2000  
Seattle, WA 98104-3188  
(206) 464-7744  
brian.rowe@atg.wa.gov  
rachel.lumen@atg.wa.gov  
sarah.e.smith-levy@atg.wa.gov  
kendall.scottcowles@atg.wa.gov

*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Washington*

## WORD COUNT CERTIFICATION

I certify that this Opposition complies with the applicable word limits excluding the caption, signature lines, certificate of service, and any cover page or index in accordance with Local Civil Rule 7.3(d)(1). This certification is made in accordance with Local Civil Rule 7.3(d)(1). The undersigned relied on the word count feature provided by word processing software. The Opposition contains 307 words.

Dated: January 7, 2025

By: s/ Henry C. Su  
Henry C. Su

Attorney  
United States Department of Justice  
Antitrust Division  
450 Fifth Street N.W., Suite 7100  
Washington, DC 20530  
Telephone: (202) 307-6200  
Email: henry.su@usdoj.gov

*Attorney for Plaintiff United States of  
America*

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on January 7, 2025, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system, which will send notification of such filing to all counsel of record.

By: s/ Henry C. Su  
Henry C. Su