Fourth Report of the Independent Reviewer Covering August 8, 2014 – January 30, 2015

The Agreement between the City of Missoula Police Department and the United States Department of Justice Regarding Response to Sexual Assault

Respectfully Submitted By:

Thomas R. Tremblay

Thomas R. Tremblay, Independent Reviewer Tom Tremblay Consulting & Training March 24, 2015

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction	Page 3 – 4
Overview and Work Conducted / Observed by the Independent Reviewer August 8, 2014 – January 30, 2015	Page 5 – 9
Assessment of Progress to Date / Compliance Graph	Page 10 – 19
Conclusion	Page 19 - 20

INTRODUCTION

On May 15, 2013 the City of Missoula (the "City") acting through the Missoula Police Department ("MPD"), and the United States Department of Justice ("DOJ") (collectively, "the Parties") entered into an Agreement. See full Agreement for details: <u>http://www.justice.gov/crt/about/spl/documents/missoulapdsettle_5-15-13.pdf</u>

The Agreement focuses on the improvement of MPD policies, practices, supervision, and training related to MPD's response to reported sexual assaults. The following general categories are listed in the Agreement that MPD must implement to improve MPD's response to adult sexual assault and to fulfill the terms of the Agreement:

- Assess and Modify Sexual Assault Policies and Protocols
- Provide Initial and On-going Sexual Assault Response and Investigations Training
- Review of Policies and Training to Ensure that Terms of the Agreement are included in MPD Policies and Training
- Enhance Investigation of Non-Stranger and Alcohol-or-Drug Facilitated Sexual Assault
- Enhance Victim-Centered Response to Sexual Assault
- Ensure Close Supervision and Internal Oversight of All Sexual Assaults
- Enhance Coordination with Law Enforcement and Community Partners to Improve the Reporting and Participation Experience for Victims of Sexual Assault
- Assess and Enhance Data Collection and Reporting for Improved Analysis of Sexual Assault Cases
- Establish External Review of (Felony) Sexual Assault Cases to be Conducted by a Panel of Qualified Representatives
- Community-Conducted Sexual Assault Response Safety and Accountability Audit
- Independent Oversight by Selected Independent Reviewer (the "Reviewer") to Assess and Report Whether the Requirements of the Agreement Have Been Implemented.

Thomas R. Tremblay was jointly selected by the Parties as the Independent Reviewer (the "Reviewer") to oversee the terms of this Agreement with the understanding that the City / MPD bear the burden of demonstrating compliance with the Agreement.

The Parties also jointly selected Anne Munch, Esq. to assist the City, MPD, the External Review Panel, and the Reviewer with respect to training.

The Agreement stipulates that the City / MPD anticipate compliance with the Agreement within two years of the Effective Date of the Agreement; meaning May 15, 2015. In accordance with the Agreement, "Compliance" shall be defined to require both sustained compliance with all material requirements of the Agreement, and sustained and continuing improvement in the response to, and investigation of, reports of sexual assault, as demonstrated pursuant to the outcome measures determined by the Independent Reviewer.

The Reviewer and the City signed a contract for service on June 19, 2013 to begin the independent review process.

The first report of the Reviewer was released November 6, 2013; the second report of the Reviewer was released June 10, 2014; the third report of the Reviewer was released on November 6, 2014. All three reports can be found on the MPD website at the following link: http://www.ci.missoula.mt.us/1621/Improving-Our-Response-to-Sexual-Assault.

This is the fourth report from the Reviewer and covers the period between August 8, 2014 and January 30, 2015.

Overview and Work Conducted / Observed by the Independent Reviewer August 8, 2014 – January 30, 2015

During this twenty-five week observation period the Reviewer has conducted over one-hundred and seventy-seven hours of remote reviewing activity and consultation, and over sixty-six hours of on-site compliance review activity and consultation during two separate site visits to Missoula, MT. The remote review activity and compliance visits include a complete review of documentation regarding the progress to date on the terms of the Agreement.

The review services and consultation were specific to the terms of the Agreement and have included: sexual assault case reviews and analysis, External Review Team case reviews, policy / SOP reviews, training, compliance assessments, observation of the Community Conducted Safety and Accountability Audit Team, and interviews with community members, community service organizations, criminal justice partners, and department personnel.

The Reviewer is pleased to report continued information and evidence that the Agreement is having its intended effect, which is to improve MPD's response to sexual assault.

As one example, the Agreement requires that MPD develop a survey to receive feedback on treatment of victims from victims and advocates. The survey was developed and was made available to victims and advocates beginning in October 2014. The initial survey results show extremely positive comments from victims and advocates about the way they were treated by MPD officers and detectives. These initial survey results demonstrate the MPD policy, training, and oversight is leading to best practices for trauma informed and victim centered service approaches.

The MPD continues to demonstrate an exceptional effort to comply with all the terms of the Agreement. Training for all MPD personnel continues, the MPD Sexual Assault Policy and SOP was updated as scheduled, the SVU continues to develop, and the External Review Team continues to review all felony sexual assault cases that are reported to MPD.

Coordination and communication between MPD and all community partners has been enhanced through the ongoing efforts of the Community Conducted Safety and Accountability Audit (CCSAA) which is nearing completion.

As of January 30, 2015, MPD has demonstrated compliance with twenty-three of the twenty-four requirements of the Agreement and MPD is in partial compliance with the one remaining requirement of the Agreement. Furthermore, of the twenty-three requirements of the Agreement that MPD is compliance with, MPD has demonstrated sustained compliance¹ with seventeen of those requirements. (See Compliance Graph on pages 10 - 19)

While progress on implementation of the Agreement continues, the MPD must eventually achieve compliance with all terms of the Agreement with specific focus on the Community Conducted Safety and Accountability which is nearing completion.

MPD demonstrated data collection and analysis of 2013 data which was covered in the 3rd Reviewer Report dated November 6, 2014. MPD has now demonstrated compliance with the data collection requirements of the Agreement by collecting their 2014 data. Analysis of that data continues beyond the date of this report. The Missoula County Attorney's Office (MCAO) is also collecting data in accordance with their own Agreement with the DOJ, and the Montana Attorney General's Office, signed on June 10, 2014. For details see: <u>https://dojmt.gov/wp-content/uploads/MTAGO-MC-June2014.pdf</u> (agreement between the Montana Attorney General's Office and the Missoula County Attorney's Office)

MPD must conduct analysis with the MCAO and compare MPD data with the MCAO data to further demonstrate compliance with the data collection requirements of the MPD Agreement. The Reviewer will be required to further verify the data and analysis prior to making a sustained compliance determination for this requirement of the Agreement.

¹ Sustained Compliance defined: Found by the Reviewer to have been fully implemented in practice based on a qualitative assessment showing MPD achieved the desired outcomes for the area covered by the Agreement.

The only remaining requirement of the Agreement with which MPD has not yet achieved full compliance on is the Community Conducted Safety and Accountability Audit (CCSAA). MPD and all of the community partners involved in the CCSAA have demonstrated significant commitment to completing a thorough CCSAA.

The CCSAA Team has reported that the majority of the audit work is completed and they are on schedule to report the findings to all community partners in April 2015. They are also on schedule to report out to the general public in a community forum in April 2015.

Following the CCSAA, and in accordance with the Agreement, MPD must make "recommendations for changes that will improve participants' ability to perform their duties, support victims, and hold offenders accountable, and a plan for implementing those changes."

While MPD has made significant efforts and demonstrated compliance with the Agreement regarding "Coordination with Law Enforcement and Community Partners," during this review period the Reviewer noted some continued challenges regarding coordination and communication between the MPD and the Missoula City / County Crime Victim Advocate Program (CVA).

These challenges were documented in the third report of the Reviewer and centered on conflict with information sharing between MPD and the CVA based on MPD's understanding of Montana law regarding sharing "confidential criminal justice information"² with non "criminal justice agencies."

MPD and the CVA have worked together to achieve some level of information sharing to provide victim services. MPD and the CVA have created new information sharing forms and modified the forms as necessary, but the CVA does not have access to all information that they feel is necessary to ensure appropriate and timely victim safety services and support. As a result, information sharing is hampered and the interpretation of Montana law remains the key challenge.

² More specifically, MPD determined that the CVA is not a "criminal justice agency," and as a result the CVA could not have immediate access to "confidential criminal justice information" available through the MPD's computer system. See Montana Criminal Justice Information Act of 1979, Title 44, Chapter 5; subsection 44-5-103(3) MCA (definition of confidential criminal justice information); subsection 44-5-103(7) MCA (definition of criminal justice agency).

In accordance with a Department of Justice Office on Violence Against Women (OVW) grant, the CVA and MPD received funding to assign a victim advocate in the MPD Special Victims Unit (SVU).

This assignment has created improved communication and coordination between the assigned advocate and the SVU detectives for victims of sexual assault. Both the assigned advocate and the SVU detectives report positive outcomes for victims with the assignment of an advocate within the SVU.

While the CVA received OVW funding to add an advocate in the SVU, the CVA reported that OVW did not fund a previously funded position for a victim advocate for victims of domestic violence. The CVA reports that this reduction in funding has required the CVA to reduce their services for domestic violence victims and this has caused some additional conflict between the CVA, MPD, and the City of Missoula regarding funding and services.

The Reviewer observed that this has also opened dialogue that is essentially dividing the community partners about whether the city should continue to fund the CVA at current levels, or redirect the funding to establish a domestic violence advocate position within the MPD.

The Reviewer has communicated that to MPD and all community partners that there are many successful models for victim advocacy. While this is not a matter that is directly covered by the Agreement, the Reviewer has observed the critical role that the CVA plays in Missoula. Efforts to fulfill the terms of the Agreement have resulted in many significant advancements in Missoula for improved victim services. The current challenges as described in this report detract from those advancements and should be resolved by all the stakeholders in Missoula, and the state of Montana, to ensure appropriate and timely victim centered safety services and support for victims of domestic violence and sexual assault.

MPD will eventually be required to demonstrate to the Reviewer sustained compliance with all requirements of the Agreement in order to achieve full compliance with the Agreement on the target end date, May 15, 2015.

In addition, MPD must demonstrate that the changes it has already made will be sustained and continuing. MPD must demonstrate both sustained compliance with all material requirements of the Agreement, including those with which it has already achieved initial compliance, and sustained compliance, and show continuing improvement in the overall response to, and investigation of, reports of sexual assault.

For this reason the Reviewer has tasked MPD with completing a "Sustained Compliance Report" documenting their efforts throughout the Agreement, including measurements and outcomes, to assist in proving sustained compliance. Completion of the Sustained Compliance Report is scheduled to be completed by MPD and received by the Reviewer on April 1, 2015.

Assessment of Progress to Date on the Requirements of the Agreement:

The Reviewer is pleased to report throughout this reporting period, and the first eighteen months of the Agreement, that substantial progress on the terms of the Agreement has been made and continues. More importantly, these efforts are beginning to show the intent of the Agreement, which is to ensure the success of MPD's effort to improve its response to adult sexual assault.

As of January 30, 2015, MPD is in compliance with twenty-three of the twenty-four requirements and MPD is in partial compliance with the one remaining requirements. The Reviewer remains impressed with MPD efforts towards compliance and their efforts that go beyond the requirements of the Agreement.

The following compliance graph shows all the requirements of the Agreement and the work that MPD has accomplished to date (January 30, 2015).

The compliance graph uses compliance definitions to categorize the status of each requirement of the Agreement.

The compliance definitions are as follows:

Pending compliance: Current plans for implementation but not yet implemented in approved policy/SOP, training, or actual practice

Partial Compliance: Plans for compliance have been implemented, reflected in approved policy/SOP and, training, but not yet observed in actual practice

Compliance: Plans for compliance have been implemented in approved policy / SOP and training, and evidence of actual practice

Sustained Compliance: Found by the Reviewer to have been fully implemented in practice based on a qualitative assessment showing MPD achieved the desired outcomes for the area covered by the Agreement

Missoula Police Department – DOJ Agreement Action Items – Deadlines – Compliance

Pending compliance, Partial compliance, Compliance, Sustained compliance

DOJ ACTION ITEM	PROPOSED ACTION	DEADLINE	COMPLIANCE STATUS
I.	Recitals	N/A	N/A
п.	Definitions and Abbreviations	N/A	N/A
III.A.	Improving MPD's Response to Sexual Assault	May 15, 2015	Sustained Compliance / Date found to be in sustained compliance January 30, 2015. Date found to be in compliance August 7, 2014.
III.A.2. III. A.2. a – i	MPD shall assess and modify as necessary its policies and protocols to strengthen its response to sexual assault, and ensure that the policy incorporates the requirements of this agreement and comports with best practices and current professional standards. These policy modifications shall include but not limited to revising MPD's existing policy, entitled "Response to Rape and Sexual Assaults." MPD's revised sexual assault policy should incorporate the requirements of the International Association of Chiefs of Police Model Policy on Investigating Sexual Assaults on at least the topics defined in III.A.2. a - i.	Jan 1, 2014	Sustained Compliance / Date found to be in sustained compliance January 30, 2015. Date found to be in compliance February 16, 2014. Updated Policy and SOP November 20, 2014.

III.B.	Sexual Assault Response Training	Nov 1, 2013	Sustained Compliance / Date found in sustained compliance January 30, 2015. Date found in Compliance November 1, 2013. Developed and following two year training plan.
III.B.3.	MPD shall provide initial and on-going annual in-service training to all MPD officers, detectives, and recruits about law enforcement response to sexual assault. This initial and annual in- service training shall ensure that all MPD officers and detectives understand and can perform their duties pursuant to the Agreement, and shall reflect and incorporate any developments in applicable law, best practices, and professional standards. Annual in- service training also shall address any training needs identified throughout the previous year. This initial and in- service training shall be of sufficient length and scope to include the topics as detailed in section III.B.3. a – h.	Sep 30, 2013	Sustained Compliance / Date found in sustained compliance January 30, 2015. Date found in Compliance September 30, 2013. March 14, 2014: Developed and following two year training plan.
III.B.4.	This training shall include presentations by victims of sexual assault and victims' advocates in order to provide officers with the unique perspectives of those who have been victimized by sexual assault and/or those who work with sexual assault survivors.	Sep 30, 2013	Sustained Compliance / Date found in sustained compliance January 30, 2015. Date of Compliance September 30, 2013. March 14, 2014: Developed and following two year training plan.

III.B.5. a. – d.	MPD shall provide additional in-depth training in sexual assault investigations to all MPD detectives who conduct such investigations. The training shall include topics detailed in section III.B.5. a. – d.	Aug 9, 2013	Sustained Compliance / Date found in sustained compliance January 30, 2015 Date found in Compliance August 9, 2013. March 14, 2014: Developed and following two year training plan.
III.B.6.	MPD personnel who provide direct supervision of officers who respond to reports of sexual assault and of detectives who investigate sexual assault allegations shall receive training on how to review sexual assault response and investigations for comprehensiveness and to detect indications of bias, including how to implement the supervisory reviews and responsibilities contained in this Agreement.	Nov 1, 2013	Sustained Compliance / Date found in sustained compliance January 30, 2015 Date found in Compliance February 6, 2014. March 14, 2014: Developed and following two year training plan.
III.B.7.	Training pursuant to the Agreement shall be provided in accordance with best practices and include adult- learning methods that incorporate role- playing scenarios and interactive exercises, as well as traditional lecture formats. Training also shall include testing and/or writings that indicate that MPD personnel taking the training comprehend the material taught.	Nov 1, 2013	Sustained Compliance / Date found in compliance January 30, 2015. Date found in Compliance November 1, 2013. March 14, 2014: Developed and following two year training plan.
III.C.	Review of Policies and Training	May 15, 2015	Sustained Compliance / Date found in sustained compliance January 30, 2015. Date of Compliance December 9, 2013. March 14, 2014: Developed and following two year training plan. Update policy and SOP November 20, 2014.

III.C.8.	Each of the requirements of the Agreement shall be incorporated into MPD policy, and all relevant MPD officers and employees shall be trained on how to meet the requirements of this agreement. MPD shall submit new and revised policies and protocols related to sexual assault and/or the terms of the Agreement, and all curricula for trainings developed pursuant to this agreement, to the Independent Reviewer and DOJ for review and comment prior to implementation and/or training delivery.	Ongoing review by Independent Reviewer / DOJ as required throughout the Agreement	Sustained Compliance / Date found in sustained compliance January 30, 2015. Date found in Compliance December 9, 2013. March 14, 2014: Developed and followed two year training plan. Update policy and SOP November 20, 2014.
III.C.9.	MPD sexual assault related policies shall be publicly available.	Jan 1, 2014	Sustained Compliance / Date found in sustained compliance January 30, 2015 Date found in Compliance December 9, 2013. See Policy at: <u>http://www.ci.missoula.mt.us/Do</u> <u>cumentCenter/View/25082</u> See also: <u>http://www.ci.missoula.mt.us/16</u> 21/Improving-Our-Response-to- Sexual-Assault
III.D.	Investigating Non-Stranger and Alcohol or Drug Facilitated Sexual Assault	May 15, 2015	Sustained Compliance / Date found in sustained compliance January 30, 2015. Date found in Compliance Nov 1, 2013.

III.D.10.	MPD shall enhance and improve policy, training, and oversight to ensure that officers: 1) recognize the prevalence of non-stranger and alcohol or drug facilitated sexual assault, and relative infrequency of false reporting of such assault, and 2) accordingly take all appropriate investigative steps when investigating non-stranger sexual assault, alcohol or drug facilitated sexual assault, and sexual assault involving victims who were incapacitated at the time of the assault or otherwise unable or unwilling to clearly describe the assault.	May 15, 2015	Sustained Compliance / Date found in sustained compliance January 30, 2015. Date found in Compliance November 1, 2013.
III.E.	Victim-Centered Response to Sexual Assault	May 15, 2015	Sustained Compliance / Date found in sustained compliance January 30, 2015 Date found in Compliance August 8, 2014.
III.E. 11 a h.	MPD shall enhance and improve policy, training, and oversight to ensure victim-centered practices in the areas of sexual assault response, interviews, and investigations in order to increase the likelihood of victims' continued participation with law enforcement; improve the experience for victims; and strengthen sexual assault investigations. These practices include the details of III.E.11. a-g	May 15, 2015	Sustained Compliance / Date found in sustained compliance January 30, 2015. Date found in Compliance June 10, 2014.

III.F.	Close Supervision and Internal Oversight	May 15, 2015	Compliance / Date found in Compliance January 30, 2015. Close supervision and internal oversight has been demonstrated Victim survey was initiated in October 2014 and initial results are very positive demonstrating trauma informed and victim centered service. Sustained Compliance to be determined by Reviewer following analysis and measurement of outcomes.
III.F.12. a-g	MPD shall establish and implement measures to ensure close supervision and internal oversight of all sexual assault investigations including details of III.F.12 a-g	May 15, 2015	Compliance; ongoing effort. Close supervision and internal oversight has been demonstrated Victim survey was initiated in October 2014 and initial results are very positive demonstrating trauma informed and victim centered service. Sustained Compliance to be determined by Reviewer following analysis and measurement of outcomes.
III.G.	Coordination with Law Enforcement and Community Partners	May 15, 2015	Compliance / Date found in compliance August 8, 2014.
III.G.13. a - f.	To improve the reporting and participation experience for victims of sexual assault, MPD shall increase and improve its communication, coordination, and collaboration with community and law enforcement partners, including the University of Montana (University), the University's Office of Public Safety (OPS), the Missoula County Attorney's Office and community advocates. MPD shall include details of III.G.a - f.	Sep 1, 2014	Compliance / Date found in compliance June 10, 2014. Memorandum of Understanding for case referral with the MCAO is in effect. Continued monitoring of MOU required. Sustained Compliance may be achieved following data collection, analysis and measurement of outcomes.

Ш.Н.14.	Data Collection and Reporting	May 15, 2015	Compliance on January 30, 2015, ongoing effort. New RMS. Also new database built for ERP that documents cases, feedback to department member, and grading of cases by color code, and notes on comprehension and bias and final disposition. Sustained Compliance will be determined by Reviewer based on further analysis and measurement of outcomes.
III.H.14. a-c	To identify shortcomings, assess improvement, and increase community confidence in Missoula law enforcement's response to sexual assault, MPD shall enhance its data collection, analysis, and reporting and shall include details of III.H.14. a-c.	May 15, 2015	Compliance on January 30, 2015, ongoing effort. New RMS and Crime analysis specialist in SVU. Compliance / Sustained Compliance will be determined by Reviewer based on further analysis and measurement of outcomes.
IV.	External Review of Sexual Assault Cases (In conjunction with OPS)	May 15, 2015	Sustained Compliance / Date of sustained compliance January 30, 2015. Date of Compliance September 18, 2013. ERP continues to review all felony sexual assault cases with a commitment to continue ERP after Agreement. As of 2-6-14 ERP database being utilized by MPD to help measure outcomes ERP to continue to develop to ensure feedback is consistent and valued.

IV.15-17	(ERP) The parties shall jointly select and establish a group of qualified representatives, including experienced sexual assault prosecutors, public defenders, and/or other legal service providers, experienced sexual assault investigators, and/or advocates, to serve as an external review group for sexual assault cases. Beginning August 9, 2013 (three months after effective date of agreement) the external review group shall review, on a semi-annual basis, all reports of sexual assault received by MPD, and all investigations of those reports opened by MPD since the Effective Date. Thereafter, this external review group shall review all reports of sexual assault received by MPD and investigations of those reports opened by MPD, since the external review group's last such review including details of IV.15-17	Aug 9, 2013 Sep 18, 2013	Sustained Compliance / Date of sustained compliance January 30, 2015 Date of Compliance September 18, 2013. ERP continues to review all felony sexual assault cases with a commitment to continue ERP after Agreement.
V. 18. – 26.	Community - Conducted Sexual Assault Response Safety and Accountability Audit (In conjunction with OPS)	May 15, 2015	 Partial compliance on August 8, 2014, ongoing efforts. Janet Donahue selected as Chair of the committee to help lead the audit. CPT Colyer and Janet Donahue attended PRAXIS International Training April 28 – MAY 2, 2014 in St. Paul, MN. MCAO and all community partners participated in Audit. Audit interviews now completed. Compliance contingent on written report being finalized, report out to community partners scheduled for April 2015, report out to public in community forum scheduled for April 2015.

			MPD to develop plan to achieve recommendations from audit. Sustained compliance to be determined by Reviewer following review of plan to implement audit recommendations.
VI.	Independent Oversight	Current / ongoing	
VII.	Agreement Implementation and Enforcement	Current / ongoing	
VIII.	Termination of the Agreement	May 15, 2015	Pending "Full and Sustained Compliance"

Conclusion:

MPD has continued to cooperate fully and professionally with the Reviewer in MPD's efforts to fulfill the terms of the Agreement.

As of January 30, 2015, MPD has demonstrated compliance with twenty-three of the twenty-four requirements of the Agreement and MPD is in partial compliance with the one remaining requirement of the Agreement. Furthermore, of the twenty-three requirements of the Agreement that MPD is compliance with, MPD has demonstrated sustained compliance³ with seventeen of those requirements.

³ Sustained Compliance defined: Found by the Reviewer to have been fully implemented in practice based on a qualitative assessment showing MPD achieved the desired outcomes for the area covered by the Agreement.

The Reviewer remains impressed with MPD efforts towards compliance and their efforts that go beyond the requirements of the Agreement.

Efforts to enhance communication and coordination between MPD, the County Attorney's Office, and the community resources to achieve a true community coordinated response to sexual assault are progressing. Continued efforts are necessary and the community safety and accountability audit recommendations will be helpful to advance those efforts.

Sexual assault case reviews by the Reviewer and the ERP will continue. The MPD Policy and SOP have been updated as scheduled and the two year training plan is being followed. The victim survey is now in effect and initial feedback from victims and advocates have been extremely positive. The CCSAA audit interviews have been completed and the report and recommendations are being finalized with an expected completion date of April 2015. Continued progress towards compliance and sustained compliance on the remaining requirements of the Agreement is expected.

The Reviewer looks forward to the work ahead and the continued commitment of the City, MPD and the community of Missoula.