

United States of America and Plaintiff States v. American Airlines and JetBlue Airways

September 27, 2022

The Government Will Prove The NEA Must Be Enjoined

- Before the NEA Competition benefited travelers.
- 2. The NEA

Cooperation, *not* competition.

3. After the NEA Consumers pay the price.

4. No Justification for the NEA

Competition was already creating growth. "Every contract, combination in the form of trust or otherwise, or conspiracy, in restraint of trade or commerce among the several States, or with foreign nations, is declared to be illegal."

The Sherman Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1

American and JetBlue: Competitors for 20 Years

JetBlue: Keeping Legacy Airlines "In Check"

1. Before the NEA **Robin Hayes Speech to** jetBlue The Aviation Club U.K. ✓ JetBlue September 18, 2019 **Robin Hayes** Disrupted **The Aviation CEO** Jub UK 2. The NEA After the NEA 3. 4. No Justification "Smaller carriers like JetBlue play a critical role in keeping

'Smaller carriers like JetBlue play a <mark>critical role in keeping</mark> the commercial aviation industry competitive and keeping the immense power of the legacy airlines in check."

When JetBlue Competes, Travelers Save Billions

FARE DIFFERENCE AFTER ENTRY INTO MARKET

<u>jetBlue</u>

"JetBlue has saved customers flying to/from Boston ~\$3B dollars over the past 15 years."



BOS to LGA data represents the first 3 quarters following entry; all others depict 4 quarters following entry

PX0518 at 5; PX0644 at 8

When JetBlue Doesn't Compete, Travelers Pay More

FARE DIFFERENCE AFTER EXIT FROM MARKET

<u>jetBlue</u>

"When a low fare competitor exits a market, [legacy competitors] again raise fares (e.g., NYC-PIT/RIC) and traffic usually drops as a result."



Boston: A Battleground For Competition



PX0461 (Miller Report Appendix E and F)

JetBlue Brought Lower Prices To Boston

1. Before the NEA

- ✓ JetBlue✓ Disrupted
- ✓ JetBlue Saved Travelers \$\$\$
- Battlegrounds in Boston and New York City
- 2. The NEA
- 3. After the NEA
- 4. No Justification



jetBlue

Submission to the U.K. Competition & Markets Authority June 3, 2020

PX0870 at 14

JetBlue's Disruption Hurt American Airlines' Wallet ...

1. Before the NEA

- ✓ JetBlue✓ Disrupted
- ✓ JetBlue Saved Travelers \$\$\$
- ✓ Battlegrounds in Boston and New York City
- 2. The NEA
- 3. After the NEA
- 4. No Justification

From: Steven Gilman To: Paul Swartz Sent: August 10, 2019 Re: BOS American Airlines

Paul Swartz Regional Sales Manager



"The fact is unfortunately BOS does not perform well from a profitability perspective as other cities, largely due to the fare destruction B6 have wrought."

... But American Fought Back

1. Before the NEA

- ✓ JetBlueDisrupted
- ✓ JetBlue Saved Travelers \$\$\$
- ✓ Battlegrounds in Boston and New York City
- 2. The NEA
- 3. After the NEA
- 4. No Justification

From: Vasu RajaHTo: [Redacted]TSent: Sept. 30, 2019SRe: BostonH

From: Vasu Raja To: Jim Carter Sent: Jan. 18, 2020 Re: Congrats on Boston American Airlines

Vasu Raja Chief Commercial Officer



"It may take us a bit of time and a lot of change. But we are going to <mark>fight like hell i</mark>n BOS if I have anything to do with it."

"Awesome! Gird your loins. Time to swing the bat in Boston."

PX0122 at 1 (name of nonparty redacted); PX0064 at 1

New York City: A Battleground For Competition



PX0461 (Miller Report Appendix E and F). Includes 17 JFK/LGA markets and 1 EWR market. The BOS-LGA/JFK market is omitted here and included in the figures on slide 7.

American Matched JetBlue's Prices in NYC

1. Before the NEA

- ✓ JetBlue✓ Disrupted
- ✓ JetBlue Saved Travelers \$\$\$
- ✓ Battlegrounds in Boston and New York City
- 2. The NEA
- 3. After the NEA
- 4. No Justification

From: Dave Clark To: Andrew Parker; Evan Jarashow Sent: November 17, 2018 Re: ATPCO Load Report

jetBlue

Dave Clark Head of Revenue and Planning



"AA updated match to B6 sale"

"Let's please be sure we <mark>get competitive</mark> on these routes and travel dates as soon as possible."

Competition Was Set To Intensify In Boston



Competition In NYC Was Increasing Too

1. Before the NEA

American Airlines 🔪

Continue to aggressively pursue 50-seat RJ replacement, to turn LGA and ORD into all two-class operations

jetBlue	We also see the following growth plan:						
		BOS	178	99	145	185	Γ
		FLL	112	59	88	103	
		MCO	75	45	71	80	
		JFK	174	109	182	191	
		LAX	23	19	43	45	

✓ JetBlue
 Disrupted

 ✓ JetBlue Saved Travelers \$\$\$

 ✓ Battlegrounds in Boston and New York City

Escalating
 Competition

- 2. The NEA
- 3. After the NEA
- 4. No Justification

A New Battleground Was On The Horizon

1. Before the NEA

- ✓ JetBlue
 Disrupted
- ✓ JetBlue Saved Travelers \$\$\$
- ✓ Battlegrounds in Boston and New York City
- Escalating
 Competition
- 2. The NEA
- 3. After the NEA
- 4. No Justification

Looking at London, as I said earlier, there's no reason a walk-up fare in business class from the Northeast should set anyone back \$10,000- or more - roundtrip when a

"[O]ur newly imagined Mint experience is inevitably going to drive down the high fares charged by the alliances JVs that dominate 80-90 percent of transatlantic traffic"

experience with these tactics and head-on competition and they are just a fact of life.



jetBlue

So, it's reasonable to assume 50-60% fare drop in BOSLON once B6 starts non-stop service

PX0631 at 5; PX0190 at 99

The NEA: Cooperation, *not* competition.

The NEA: If You Can't Beat Them, Join Them



Network Planning As A "Single Airline"

1. Before the NEA

- 2. The NEA
 - ✓ A De Facto
 Merger

Coordination:

Ťζ

- Capacity
 Coordination
- 3. After the NEA
- 4. No Justification

The agreement between the parties anticipates that they will jointly discuss the best

"In essence, they will engage in network planning as if their Northeast assets were in a single airline"

exclusively by each airline. Neither carrier can veto or stop any capacity decision of the other airline on any route, even within the scope of the partnership.

Defendants' response to DOJ regarding how to characterize the NEA to third-party market participants

November 4, 2020

es

Capacity Coordination Is About The "Best Overall JV Solution"

1. Before the NEA

2. The NEA

- ✓ A De Facto
 Merger
- Capacity
 Coordination
- 3. After the NEA
- 4. No Justification

From: David Fintzen Sent: June 3, 2020 Re: Connie Compare

<u>jetBlue</u>

David Fintzen VP for the NEA



"On #1, the alternative there is we roll back DCA-BOS to mostly or all B6 metal (the constraint here is our slots in DCA as we don't have access to Connie's DCA slots) and put LGA-DCA back on Connie metal. Let's all kick the tires though and see what is best overall JV solution (as that is what drives the economics). If we roll back, we could then co-locate our full operation at Terminal B – if we want to hold the other incremental flying – or roll back more LGA shifts to stay in MAT."

On Nonstop Overlaps, Defendants Will Choose To Make More Money – Not Less



Indifference And Neutrality Are The Opposite Of Competition

- 1. Before the NEA
- 2. The NEA
 - ✓ A De Facto
 Merger
 - Capacity
 Coordination
 - ✓ Revenue Sharing
- 3. After the NEA
- 4. No Justification

Revenue sharing makes "each carrier indifferent as to which carrier an incremental NEA passenger flies."



 Within the NEA, we are metal neutral with B6 since it is a 100% revenue share Maximize revenue between the two by evaluating combined market share for high level health Still manage your flight and respond to drivers and performance metrics B6 is still a competitor in all other routes

jetBlue

Since we put all this flying through a revenue share model in what is intended to be a metal neutral JV, we need to have route level forecasts to ensure we get the RSA right. I'm actually more interested in how revenue share changes if we

The NEA: Cooperation, Not Competition

- 1. Before the NEA
- 2. The NEA
 - ✓ A De Facto
 Merger
 - Capacity
 Coordination
 - ✓ Revenue Sharing
 - Cooperate,
 Not Compete
- 3. After the NEA
- 4. No Justification

- Q. [W]ith the NEA in place, do you agree that the revenue sharing component means that it makes more sense to **cooperate** with American rather than **compete** for NEA routes?
- A. For NEA routes, yes.



Scott Laurence Head of Revenue and Planning

Laurence CID Dep. Tr. 146:18-25

The NEA is a bad deal for travelers.

But Don't Take Our Word For It ...



The NEA Will Harm Travelers Across The Country



PX0461 (Miller Report Appendix F). Includes 11 Boston markets, 17 JFK/LGA markets, and 1 EWR market. The BOS-JFK/LGA market is included among the 11 Boston markets.

The NEA Will Harm Travelers Across The Country



PX0461 (Miller Report Appendix F). Includes 11 Boston markets, 17 JFK/LGA markets, and 1 EWR market. The BOS-JFK/LGA market is included among the 11 Boston markets.

Boston Overlap Markets	Combined Revenue Share	Presumptively Anticompetitive?	
Boston – Charlotte	96.1%	~	
Boston – Chicago	48.5%	~	
Boston – Dallas/Fort Worth	83.6%	✓	
Boston – Los Angeles	62.6%	~	
Boston – Miami	76.5%	~	
Boston – New York City (JFK/LGA)	49.8%	~	
Boston – Philadelphia	86.8%	✓	
Boston – Phoenix	85.2%	✓	
Boston – Rochester	86.2%	✓	
Boston – Syracuse	82.1%	✓	
Boston – Washington, D.C. (DCA)	88.0%	~	

The NEA Is Presumptively Anticompetitive Using Merger Guidelines

PX0461 (Miller Report Exhibit 16)

The NEA Is Presumptively Anticompetitive Using Merger Guidelines

NYC Overlap Markets	Combined Revenue Share	Presumptively Anticompetitive?	NYC Overlap Markets	Combined Revenue Share	Presumptively Anticompetitive?
JFK/LGA – Austin	44.6%	✓	JFK/LGA – Orlando	55.3%	~
JFK/LGA – Charleston	43.6%	 ✓ 	JFK/LGA – Phoenix	61.5%	~
JFK/LGA - Chicago	36.2%	~	JFK/LGA – Portland, ME	37.4%	~
JFK/LGA – Las Vegas	46.5%	~	JFK/LGA – Raleigh- Durham	47.8%	~
JFK/LGA – Los Angeles	57.0%	 ✓ 	JFK/LGA – San Diego	44.7%	~
JFK/LGA – Martha's Vineyard	92.5%	 Image: A start of the start of	JFK/LGA – San Francisco	45.7%	~
JFK/LGA – Miami	55.9%	✓	JFK/LGA – Savannah	46.5%	~
EWR – Miami	31.0%	~	JFK/LGA – West Palm Beach	60.0%	~
JFK/LGA – Nantucket	96.8%	✓			

PX0461 (Miller Report Exhibit 16). The BOS-JFK/LGA market is included in the table on slide 26.

Including Newark In NYC Doesn't Change Much

NYC Overlap Markets	Combined Revenue Share	Presumptively Anticompetitive?	NYC Overlap Markets	Combined Revenue Share	Presumptively Anticompetitive?
JFK/LGA/EWR – Austin	27.2%	\checkmark	JFK/LGA/EWR – Orlando	45.8%	\checkmark
JFK/LGA/EWR - Boston	40.3%	 ✓ 	JFK/LGA/EWR – Phoenix	52.8%	~
JFK/LGA/EWR – Charleston	30.2%	\checkmark	JFK/LGA/EWR – Portland, ME	25.6%	~
JFK/LGA/EWR - Chicago	31.4%		JFK/LGA/EWR – Raleigh- Durham	30.3%	~
JFK/LGA/EWR – Las Vegas	27.9%	\checkmark	JFK/LGA/EWR – San Diego	27.8%	~
JFK/LGA/EWR – Los Angeles	40.7%	\checkmark	JFK/LGA/EWR – San Francisco	24.9%	\checkmark
JFK/LGA/EWR – Martha's Vineyard	92.5%	✓	JFK/LGA/EWR – Savannah	32.9%	~
JFK/LGA/EWR – Miami	48.3%	\checkmark	JFK/LGA/EWR – West Palm Beach	48.4%	
JFK/LGA/EWR – Nantucket	84.0%	\checkmark			

PX0955 (Miller Reply Report at 28 n.57)

The NEA Will Cost Travelers Millions Each Year



The NEA Takes JetBlue Out Of The Fight

- 1. Before the NEA
- 2. The NEA
- 3. After the NEA
 - ✓ Lower
 Capacity
 - ✓ Higher Prices
 - ✓ Market Power
 - ✓ Measurable Harm
 - ✓ Entanglement
- 4. No Justification

jetBlue 202	
Emerging from the Crisis	

 JetBlue may lose some level of independence and may be co-opted by Connie manipulation

> jetBlue Board Presentation June 2020

PX0807 at 66



Minimum of one roundtrip per week in 2022.



Minimum of one roundtrip per week in 2022.

The Airline Industry Is Dominated By Four Players





Capacity Discipline Was Key To Building "Sustained Profits"

- **Before the NEA**
- The NEA 2.
- After the NEA
 - ✓ Lower Capacity
 - ✓ Higher Prices
 - ✓ Market Power
 - ✓ Measurable Harm
 - Entanglement
 - Consolidation
- No Justification

Capacity Discipline – The Key to Future Success

- Capacity discipline is the key to building sustained profits for both US Airways and the industry
 - Allows airlines to match supply with passenger demand
- Why is capacity discipline important?
 - Uncertain economic outlook
 - Unstable fuel prices
- Even Southwest has no planned growth for 2012
 - All but Jet Blue and Virgin America are exercising restraint




Prior Consolidation Slowed Capacity Growth



The NEA Allows American To "Borrow" Rather Than "Build"

. Before the NEA	Organic	<u> </u>	Inorganic	
. The NEA				
. After the NEA	S.M		reel	
 ✓ Lower Capacity 	(1-18			
✓ Higher Prices	BUILD		BORROW	
✓ Market Power	Grow capacity	Codeshare,	Immunized joint	Merger,
 ✓ Measurable Harm 	organically (e.g., maximize hub utilization)	Interline	venture, minority equity stake, common loyalty	controlling share, capacity purchase
✓ Entanglement			program	parenase
✓ Consolidation				
. No Justification			۵me	rican Airlines
				ard Presentatio
				July 202

The NEA Allows American To "Borrow" Rather Than "Build"

- 1. Before the NEA
- 2. The NEA
- 3. After the NEA
 - ✓ Lower
 Capacity
 - ✓ Higher Prices
 - ✓ Market Power
 - ✓ Measurable Harm
 - ✓ Entanglement
 - ✓ Consolidation
- 4. No Justification



The NEA "Will Help Facilitate" Capacity Reductions

1. Before the NEA

2. The NEA

3. After the NEA

- ✓ Lower
 Capacity
- ✓ Higher Prices
- ✓ Market Power
- ✓ Measurable Harm
- ✓ Entanglement
- ✓ Consolidation

4. No Justification

American Airlines 🚡

Robert Isom



American Airlines

Vasu Raja Chief Commercial Officer



From:	Isom, Robert		
	(FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=51C2AD9D4A1249BD8A93E54F70E6C768-ISOM, ROBER>		
To:	Raja, Vasu		
Sent:	3/28/2020 10:44:53 AM		
Subject:	Re: 2021 size		
Attachments:	image001.png; image002.png		

Thanks. And between you and me. Spent a long time on phone last night w Richard Anderson. General agreement, the industry is going to have to shed a tremendous amount of capacity — turning the dial back 5 years as a guide to what 2021 looks like. And might be an 18 month slope to that point once people get traveling. Let's not question, let's go there fast and hard. And your AS/B6 ideas will help facilitate.

PX0069 at 1

Defendants cannot justify the NEA.

Defendants' Claim:	Evidence Will Show:		
The NEA unlocks new growth	Defendants could have grown <i>without the NEA</i>		
American and JetBlue	Defendants could have pursued		
need the NEA	less restrictive alternatives		
The NEA will enhance competition	Delta and United <i>have not</i>		
with Delta and United	<i>responded</i> to the NEA		
Plaintiffs can't meet their burden	Plaintiffs can show the NEA		
to show adverse effects	<i>likely will harm consumers</i>		

JetBlue And American Are Not Complementary

- 1. Before the NEA
- 2. The NEA
- 3. After the NEA
- 4. No Justification
 - ✓ NEA Does Not Create Growth
- Q. [I]s it fair to say that if you simply put the American and JetBlue networks in September 2019 together by turning on the code share but you don't change capacity at all, the NEA does not produce much benefit, right?
- A. The benefit numbers that we talked about as before . . . I mean, they don't reveal much benefit absent some capacity. So I think the series of runs we talked about before indicated that capacity increases were a necessary part of unlocking the benefits.



Mark A. Israel Defense Expert

JetBlue And American Planned To Grow Without The NEA

1. Before the NEA

- 2. The NEA
- 3. After the NEA
- 4. No Justification
 - ✓ NEA Does Not Create Growth

From: Eric Friedman To: Andrea Lusso Sent: June 3, 2020 Re: Follow-ups

jetBlue

Eric Friedman Director, of Route Planning



"we are including value here that would have been generated anyway"

"If we're looking at this from a 'What does JetBlue look like with Connie vs without' we're currently attributing a lot of revenue to Connie that would have already existed."

JetBlue And American Planned To Grow Without The NEA

- 1. Before the NEA
- 2. The NEA
- 3. After the NEA
- 4. No Justification
 - ✓ NEA Does Not Create Growth

From: Brent Alex (AA) To: Andrea Lusso (B6) Sent: February 10, 2020 Re: S20 JFK, part 2

From: Brent Alex (AA) To: Andrea Lusso (B6) Cc: Vasu Raja (AA); Scott Laurence (B6) Sent: February 17, 2020 Re: S20 JFK, part 2

American Airlines

Vasu Raja Chief Commercial Officer



"It now appears there is a joint willingness to look at the additional AA slots for S20 season. These would be beyond the 27 that have already been transferred."

"After discussing internally, we propose the following: All 37 slots to B6 for two years"

The NEA Shell Game Limits JetBlue's Growth In Other Markets

- 1. Before the NEA
- 2. The NEA
- 3. After the NEA
- 4. No Justification
 - ✓ NEA Does Not Create Growth



"While opportunities exist, they are limited in size given JetBlue's multiple growth commitments; more significant funding sources would require de-prioritization of either BOS/FLL/MCO recovery or LAX/EWR/NEA growth – all requiring broader strategic consensus (not recommended today)"

> jetBlue Route Planning Presentation November 2021

American Knew NEA Network Projections Were "No Bueno"...



Chad Schweinzger

Managing Director, Partnerships



PX0372



47

The NEA Harms Consumers More Than Alternative Options

- 1. Before the NEA
- 2. The NEA
- 3. After the NEA
- 4. No Justification
 - ✓ NEA Does Not Create Growth
 - ✓ Less Restrictive Alternatives



AA can sell or lease slots to JetBlue



Codesharing arrangement that excludes nonstop overlaps



Excluding Boston and London from the NEA

Delta and United Have Not Responded To The NEA

- 1. Before the NEA
- 2. The NEA
- 3. After the NEA
- 4. No Justification
 - ✓ NEA Does Not Create Growth
 - Less Restrictive Alternatives
 - ✓ No Response from Delta or United

- Q. What does it mean for United competitively that – that in the Northeast American is – is now competing in part through this alliance with JetBlue rather than 100 percent on its own metal?
- A. To date, it hasn't meant much of anything. It's not something we focus on. And I don't think, you know, at least as of now it's having any impact on United Airlines.



EVP and Chief Commercial Officer

Antitrust Law Stops Harm To Consumers Before It Occurs

- 1. Before the NEA
- 2. The NEA
- 3. After the NEA
- 4. No Justification
 - ✓ NEA Does Not Create Growth
 - ✓ Less Restrictive Alternatives
 - ✓ No Response from Delta or United
 - ✓ Likely Harm to Consumers

The Supreme Court condemned a joint venture's restraints under Section 1 "without regard to their past effect" because "[c]ombinations are no less unlawful because they have not as yet resulted in restraint."

Associated Press v. United States 326 U.S. 1, 12 (1945)

Consumers Bear The Risk If Defendants' "Good Behavior" Ends

- 1. Before the NEA
- 2. The NEA
- 3. After the NEA
- 4. No Justification
 - ✓ NEA Does Not Create Growth
 - ✓ Less Restrictive Alternatives
 - ✓ No Response from Delta or United
 - ✓ Likely Harm to Consumers

"If a demonstration that no anticompetitive effects had occurred at the time of trial or of judgment constituted a permissible defense to a § 7 divestiture suit, violators could stave off such actions merely by refraining from aggressive or anticompetitive behavior when such a suit was threatened or pending."

> United States v. General Dynamics Corp. 415 US 486, 505-06 (1974)

The NEA Comes At Too High A Cost To Consumers

Our industry has never been more concentrated than it is today.

All that power in the hands of a few very deep-pocketed airlines has implications for consumers in the form of reduced options, high fares and often poor service.

JetBlue serves as an important counterbalance.



<u>jetBlue</u>

Robin Hayes



United States of America and Plaintiff States v. American Airlines and JetBlue Airways

September 27, 2022