# Direct Testimony of Prof. Michael D. Whinston

U.S., et al. v. Google LLC

United States District Court for the District of Columbia

October 5, 2023



- Determine whether general search services, general search text advertising, and search advertising in the United States are relevant antitrust markets for the purpose of evaluating Google's market power in this case
- Assess whether in recent years Google has possessed market power in those markets and, if so, assess the extent of Google's market power

- General search services, general search text advertising, and search advertising in the United States are relevant markets
- Google possesses substantial market power protected by barriers to entry in each of the relevant markets

# **Opinion 1**

General search services, general search text advertising, and search advertising in the United States are relevant markets

# **Relevant Market**

# General Search Services General Search Text Advertising Search Advertising

### Trial testimony shows that general search services is a relevant market

**Q.** And users, when they put something in the URL bar of Safari, they have an expectation that its going to go to a general search engine?

A. Yes.

John Giannandrea, Senior VP of Machine Learning and AI Strategy

- **Q.** And who does DuckDuckGo consider to be its search engine competitors?
- **A.** Really most of our users switch from Google. So like far and away, we consider Google just our competitor. Other search engines that compete with us are Bing, Yahoo!, Ecosia, and Brave are probably the main ones in the U.S.
- **Q.** Does DuckDuckGo consider vertical search engines such as Amazon to be competitors that users are likely to switch to or from?
- A. No, not really.

Gabriel Weinberg, CEO & Founder (



- **Q.** During your time in device marketing, has Verizon ever set a vertical search provider as the default search engine on a device?
- **A.** . . . I am not aware of that happening.

#### Brian Higgins, *Chief Customer* verizon<sup>4</sup> **Experience Officer**

- **Q.** And thinking about the market today, who are Bing's search competitors?
- **A.** . . . Candidly, when we talk about competition, it's one company, it's Google.

Jon Tinter, Corporate VP of Microsoft **Business Development** 



### Single location for all queries

- Avoids the time and energy needed to recall or identify the right specialized site
- Provides results with depth and breadth unmatched by any single specialized site
- Caters to habit formation
- Convenient search bars on browsers and devices

"Google should be like a Swiss Army knife: clean, simple, the tool you want to take everywhere."

Marissa Mayer, *Former Product Manager* 





Hal Varian Chief Economist



- **Q.** Google answers noncommercial queries because it hopes, at some point, the user will also type in a commercial query and Google can make money off of it?
- **A.** Something of that sort, yes.

Q. Well, exactly, right?

A. Yeah. Okay.

- Searches often must be done in pre-defined ways (drop-down menus, etc.)
- Results pages on specialized search engines are often very different from results pages on general search engines for the same query
- Many specialized search services limit results to info on site (not entire web)

### The results pages of general search engines and specialized search engines have significant differences

### Google

ama	azo	n.c	Or	n
	~			

valentines day	< 🌷 Q	😥 🎹 Sign	amazon <sub>© Select your add</sub>	All 👻 valentines day		
			<b>⊟ All</b> Best Sellers Amazon Basic	s Today's Deals New Releases F	rime - Customer Service Books Musi	ic Amazon Ho
2 All Images ⊘ Shopping III News I Videos I More	Tools		1-48 of over 100,000 results for "valen	tines day"		
bout 363,000,000 results (0.77 seconds)			Eligible for Free Shipping			
Did you mean: <i>valentine's</i> day			All customers get FREE Shipping on	Gourmet Gift E Shop Nut Cravings®>	Baskets - Nuttin' Says Yum Better.	
Tuesday, February 14 Valentine's Day 2023			orders over \$25 shipped by Amazon Department Movies & TV Prime Video			
eople also ask 🗄	Feedback	More images	Movies & Films Home Décor Products Grocery & Gourmet Food Paper & Printable Media Women's Fashion	101-00 5 Oct	+ Green	uts Gift Basket Ribbon (7 A
Vhat is the real story of Valentine's Day?	~	Valentine's Day <	Men's Fashion Kids' Party Favor Sets		vprime	5,621
Vhat Valentines Day means?	~	Saint's day	<ul> <li>See All 12 Departments</li> <li>Customer Reviews</li> </ul>	¿Quieres comprar en Amaz	on en <i>español</i> ?	
Vhat are the 7 Days of Valentine?	~	Valentine's Day, also called Saint Valentine's Day or	★★★☆ & Up	RESULTS		
/hy is Feb 14 called Valentine's Day?	~	the Feast of Saint Valentine, is celebrated annually on February 14. Wikipedia	★★☆☆☆ & Up ★★☆☆☆ & Up	Price and other details may vary ba	used on product size and color.	
tps://en.wikipedia.org > wiki > Valentine's_Day	Feedback	Date: Tuesday, February 14, 2023 Significance: Feast day of Saint Valentine; the celebration of love and affection	TV Show Spectacular Spider-Man Elimo		Nia Vardalos John Carbett	
alentine's Day - Wikipedia lentine's Day, also called Saint Valentine's Day or the Feast of Saint Valentine, is		Message 🗸	Actor Taylor Swift	DAY	1	
lebrated annually on February 14. It originated as a Christian so called: Saint Valentine's Day or the F Date: February 14; (fixed by the Wester oserved by: People in many countries; Significance: Feast day of Saint Valenti		Colors V	Jessica Biel Jennifer Garner		II	
ant Valentine - Valentine's Day (2010 film) - Valentine's Day (disambiguation)		Text V	Anne Hathaway Jessica Alba Julia Roberts		I HATE Valentine's Day	
tps://www.history.com > history-of-valentines-day-2		Valentines For Friends	Jamie Foxx Bradley Cooper	Valentine's Day (2010) 2010	I Hate Valentine's Day 2009	The V Wasn
istory of Valentine's Day	SOCH	Allerer Certe Armaine	<ul> <li>See more</li> </ul>	<b>★★★★☆</b> ~ 3,941	<b>★★★★</b> ★ ~ 658	1924
eb 11, 2022 — Valentine's feast day in the middle of February in an effort to		And	Director	Prime Video	Prime Video	+++
Christianize" the pagan celebration of Lupercalia. Celebrated at the ides of		Hallmark American For A Paper	Garry Marshall	From <sup>\$399</sup> to rent	From \$299 to rent	From <sup>S</sup>
		Studio Ink Greetings Special Source in	Peter Duncan	From \$12.99 to buy	From \$9.99 to buy Or available with a Prime Video	From 5
ps://www.britannica.com > > Festivals & Holidays		Valentin Funny V Friend V Love wit	Price		Channels Subscription	
alentine's Day   Definition, History, & Traditions   Britannica	Galantine of	Valentine Character View 20+ more	\$0 to \$1 \$1 to \$3			
alentine's Day, also called St. Valentine's Day, holiday (February 14) when lovers	and and		\$3 to \$5	Market and Parket	3 8	
press their affection with greetings and gifts.			\$5 to \$10		88	
tps://www.imdb.com > title	() 東口山山		\$10 to \$15 \$15 to \$20		88	
/alentine's Day (2010) - IMDb		Valentine Jill Vincent Faye	Over \$20			
tertwining couples and singles in Los Angeles break-up and make-up based on the	VAL EN	Wiggin Valentine Valentine Valentine	Video Format			
essures and expectations of Valentine's Day.	REB	People also search for View 10+ more	Prime Video		am	
*** Rating: 5.7/10 - 119,682 votes			Blu-ray		26	





Hello, Sign in Returns Account & Lists - & Orders

Sort by: Featured

Sponsored 1

dle Books Registry Fashion Gift Cards Handmade

Nike Women's Basketball Shoes

**v**prime FREE Shipping by Amazon

Sponsored 1 Jewelry for Women Wife Infinity Heart Birthstone Necklace 18K White Gold ... \*\*\*\*\*\* \$**99**99 Save \$10.00 with coupon (some

Google

- Search function typically limited to the social media platform
- There are likely significant differences in the reliability of the information available on social media vs. general search engines
- Internal Google assessments of possible competition between Google and Facebook found no evidence that increased use of Facebook led to reduced use of Google

• Internal Google documents

Android RSA terms

Chrome defaults

• EU Choice Screen

- Internal Google documents: Google's internal documents focused on general search services rivals and market shares
- Android RSA terms

Chrome defaults

• EU Choice Screen

### Google tracks market shares for general search engines

	Reducted on an and a second se		
From: Sent:	Penny Chu Reserve @google.com] 1/30/2014 7:40:24 AM		
To:	Mitt Cutts mannee Boogle.com]; Ben Gomes Retacted@google.com]; Alan Eustace Redacted@google. Nicolaou Redacted@google.com]; Eisar Lipkovitz <sup>manne</sup> @google.com]; Ben Smith <sup>manne</sup> @google.com	.com); Cos	
	Nicolaou Redacted@google.com]; Eisar Lipkovitz "Matchinggoogle.com]; Ben Smith "Matchinggoogle.co	m]; Scott	
	HuffmanRedacted@google.com]; Amit Singhal Redacted@google.com]; Derek Wong Redacted@	poogle.com]; Willa	
	Lo "Becogie.com]: Sundar Pichai Redacted@google.com]; Hal Varian "Boogle.com]; Lorrain Redacted@google.com]; Joan Braddi "Batant google.com]; Tony Fagan Redacted@google.com]; Jane P	r Twohill	
	Redacted@google.com]; Jake Hubert Redacted@google.com]; Rach Maheshwari fearer@google.com]; Rach Maheshwari fear		
	Redacted @google.com]; Michaela Prescott Redacted @google.com]; Tamar Yehoshua Redacted@google.com]; Michaela Prescott Redacted @google.com]; Tamar Yehoshua Redacted@google.com]; Tamar Yehoshua Re	gle.com]; Patrick	
	Riley mini @google.com]; David Rolefson Redacted @google.com]; Elissa Lee Redacted@google.com		
	Redacted@google.com]; Karen Dubas Redacted@google.com]; Brian Bershad Redacted@google.com		
	Redacted@google.com]; Tara KoushaRedacted@google.com]; Sergio Civetta Redacted@google.com]; Redacted@google.com]; Jeff Whipps Redacted@google.com]; Jim Koehler Redacted@google.com];	; Makoto Uchida	
	Murakami Redacted Sygogle.com]: Alvou Chen Redacted Sygogle.com]: Remo Storni	MICRIEI	
	Redacted geoogle.com); Deepak Ramanathan Redacted geoogle.com); Cliff Hopkins Redacted a		
	Chen Redacted@google.com]; Jonathan Bullock Redacted@google.com]; Ruwin Perera Redacted @	[google.com]	
CC: Subject:	Penny Chu <sup>Beant</sup> @google.com] Finalized Dec and Q4 2013 US internal search share metrics		
subject:	Finalized Dec and Q4 2013 US Internal search share metrics		
Hi everyo			
	ease find our finalized internal US search share metrics for Dec and Q4 2013. All our in		
	nd Comscore show an increase for Bing in both Dec 2013 as well as in Q4 2013. We see		
	g for Google share. Our internal data-sources show Yahoo share being flat in Dec 2013		
	are in Q4 2013 (vs Q3 2013). Comscore is even reporting that Yahoo is at an all-time l are in Dec.	ow with 10.8%	
search sha	are in Dec.		
I am hann	by to report that as of Dec 2013, we are able to re-introduce Analytics as an internal data	source we can	
use for sea	arch share reporting. However, my team also recently discovered that Yahoo Search ha		
	arch share reporting. However, my team also recently discovered that Yahoo Search ha which significantly impacts our ability to track Yahoo share across all three of our inter-		
HTTPS, v	arch share reporting. However, my team also recently discovered that Yahoo Search ha which significantly impacts our ability to track Yahoo share across all three of our inten US online panel, Adsense and Analytics) going forward. My team is actively working t	nal data-	
HTTPS, v sources (U	which significantly impacts our ability to track Yahoo share across all three of our inter-	nal data- o see what	
HTTPS, v sources (U workarou	which significantly impacts our ability to track Yahoo share across all three of our inten US online panel, Adsense and Analytics) going forward. My team is actively working t nds we have, but please note that search share reporting may be impacted in the short-to-	val data- o see what erm.	
HTTPS, v sources (U workarous Adding M	which significantly impacts our ability to track Vahoo share across all three of our inten US online panel, Adsense and Analytics) going forward. My team is actively working t nds we have, but please note that search share reporting may be impacted in the short- tobile tracking to our US online panel should begin in the next few weeks, and I hope v	val data- o see what erm.	
HTTPS, v sources (U workarou Adding M	which significantly impacts our ability to track Yahoo share across all three of our inten US online panel, Adsense and Analytics) going forward. My team is actively working t nds we have, but please note that search share reporting may be impacted in the short-to-	val data- o see what erm.	
HTTPS, v sources (U workarou Adding M some prel	which significantly impacts our ability to track Yahoo share across all three of our inten US online panel, Adsense and Analytics) going forward. My team is actively working t nds we have, but please note that search share reporting may be impacted in the short-to tobile tracking to our US online panel should begin in the next few weeks, and I hope v liminary #s to share with you by end of quarter.	nal data- o see what erm. we will have	
HTTPS, v sources (U workarou Adding M some prel Thanks vo	which significantly impacts our ability to track V ahoo share across all three of our inten US online panel, Adsense and Analytics) going forward. My team is actively working t nds we have, but please note that search share reporting may be impacted in the short-to tobile tracking to our US online panel should begin in the next few weeks, and I hope w liminary #s to share with you by end of quarter.	nal data- o see what erm. we will have	
HTTPS, v sources (U workarou Adding M some prel Thanks vo	which significantly impacts our ability to track Yahoo share across all three of our inten US online panel, Adsense and Analytics) going forward. My team is actively working t nds we have, but please note that search share reporting may be impacted in the short-to tobile tracking to our US online panel should begin in the next few weeks, and I hope v liminary #s to share with you by end of quarter.	nal data- o see what erm. we will have	
HTTPS, v sources (U workarou Adding M some prel Thanks vo you have	which significantly impacts our ability to track V ahoo share across all three of our inten US online panel, Adsense and Analytics) going forward. My team is actively working t nds we have, but please note that search share reporting may be impacted in the short-to tobile tracking to our US online panel should begin in the next few weeks, and I hope w liminary #s to share with you by end of quarter.	nal data- o see what erm. we will have	
HTTPS, v sources (U workarou Adding M some prel Thanks vo you have	which significantly impacts our ability to track V ahoo share across all three of our inten US online panel, Adsense and Analytics) going forward. My team is actively working t nds we have, but please note that search share reporting may be impacted in the short-to tobile tracking to our US online panel should begin in the next few weeks, and I hope w liminary #s to share with you by end of quarter.	nal data- o see what erm. we will have	
HTTPS, v sources (U workarou Adding M some prel Thanks vo you have	which significantly impacts our ability to track V ahoo share across all three of our inten US online panel, Adsense and Analytics) going forward. My team is actively working t nds we have, but please note that search share reporting may be impacted in the short-to tobile tracking to our US online panel should begin in the next few weeks, and I hope w liminary #s to share with you by end of quarter.	nal data- o see what erm. we will have	
HTTPS, v sources (I workarour Adding M some prel Thanks ve you have : -Penny	which significantly impacts our ability to track V ahoo share across all three of our inten US online panel, Adsense and Analytics) going forward. My team is actively working t nds we have, but please note that search share reporting may be impacted in the short-to tobile tracking to our US online panel should begin in the next few weeks, and I hope w liminary #s to share with you by end of quarter.	nal data- o see what erm. we will have	
HTTPS, v sources (U workarour Adding M some prel Thanks vo you have : -Penny 	which significantly impacts our ability to track Y ahoo share across all three of our inten US online panel, Adsense and Analytics) going forward. My team is actively working t nds we have, but please note that search share reporting may be impacted in the short- tobile tracking to our US online panel should begin in the next few weeks, and I hope v liminary #s to share with you by end of quarter. ery much to Remo Stormi and Makoto Uchida for continuing to provide this data. Please any questions.	nal data- o see what erm. we will have	
HTTPS, v sources (I workarour Adding M some prel Thanks ve you have : -Penny 	which significantly impacts our ability to track Y alhoo share across all three of our inten US online panel, Adsense and Analytics) going forward. My team is actively working t nds we have, but please note that search share reporting may be impacted in the short-to tobile tracking to our US online panel should begin in the next few weeks, and I hope v liminary #s to share with you by end of quarter. ery much to Remo Storni and Makoto Uchida for continuing to provide this data. Please any questions. INTERNAL US SEARCH SHARE METRICS (pct pts delta from NOV 2013) Panel Search Session Share (home-only, desktops, incl Mac OS)* 3% (red 3 pt d)	nal data- o see what erm. we will have	
HTTPS, v sources (I workarou Adding M some prel Thanks v you have: -Penny 	which significantly impacts our ability to track Y ahoo share across all three of our inten US online panel, Adsense and Analytics) going forward. My team is actively working t nds we have, but please note that search share reporting may be impacted in the short- tobile tracking to our US online panel should begin in the next few weeks, and I hope v liminary #s to share with you by end of quarter. ery much to Remo Storni and Makoto Uchida for continuing to provide this data. Please any questions. INTERNAL US SEARCH SHARE METRICS (pct pts delta from NOV 2013) Panel Search Session Share (home-only, desktops, incl Mac OS)* a(*02 opt 0)	nal data- o see what erm. we will have	
HTTPS, v sources (I workarou Adding M some prel Thanks v you have : -Penny DEC 2013 US Online Google 78 Bing 13.9 Yahoo 8.7 Yahoo 8.7	which significantly impacts our ability to track Y alhoo share across all three of our inten US online panel, Adsense and Analytics) going forward. My team is actively working t nds we have, but please note that search share reporting may be impacted in the short-to tobile tracking to our US online panel should begin in the next few weeks, and I hope v liminary #s to share with you by end of quarter. ery much to Remo Storni and Makoto Uchida for continuing to provide this data. Please any questions. INTERNAL US SEARCH SHARE METRICS (pct pts delta from NOV 2013) Panel Search Session Share (home-only, desktops, incl Mac OS)* 3% (red 3 pt d)	nal data- o see what erm. we will have	
HTTPS, v sources (I workaroui Adding M some prel Thanks vo you have : -Penny 	which significantly impacts our ability to track Y ahoo share across all three of our inten US online panel, Adsense and Analytics) going forward. My team is actively working to ndis we have, but please note that search share reporting may be impacted in the short- tobile tracking to our US online panel should begin in the next few weeks, and I hope v iminary #s to share with you by end of quarter. ery much to Remo Storni and Makoto Uchida for continuing to provide this data. Please any questions. INTERNAL US SEARCH SHARE METRICS (pct pts delta from NOV 2013) Panel Gearch Gession Share (home-only, desktops, incl Mac OS)* & (+02 out gi) & (+02 out gi) * (no change) espansion aneple size. Observed: 0.4 pct pt for ACL and .0 1 pct pt Ard	nal data- o see what erm. we will have	
HTTPS, v sources (I workarour Adding M some prel Thanks v you have : -Penny DEC 2013 US Online Google 78 Bing 13.39 Yahoo 8.7' "Piert Is 10% Adsense U	which significantly impacts our ability to track Y alnoo share across all three of our inten US online panel, Adsense and Analytics) going forward. My team is actively working t nds we have, but please note that search share reporting may be impacted in the short- tobile tracking to our US online panel should begin in the next few weeks, and I hope v liminary #s to share with you by end of quarter. ery much to Remo Storni and Makoto Uchida for continuing to provide this data. Please any questions. INTERNAL US SEARCH SHARE METRICS (pct pts delta from NOV 2013) Panel Search Session Share (home-only, desktops, incl Mac OS)* 3(6 (40 2 pct pt) (6 (00 change) searchine sequested Store - 0.4 pct pts Act, and -0.1 pct pts Feat	nal data- o see what erm. we will have	
HTTPS, v sources (I workarour Adding M some prel Thanks vo you have : -Penny DEC 2013 US Online Googie 78 Bing 13.39 Yahoo 8.77 "Pierts 106 Adsense U Googie 78	which significantly impacts our ability to track Y ahoo share across all three of our inten US online panel, Adsense and Analytics) going forward. My team is actively working to ndis we have, but please note that search share reporting may be impacted in the short- tobile tracking to our US online panel should begin in the next few weeks, and I hope v iminary #s to share with you by end of quarter. ery much to Remo Storni and Makoto Uchida for continuing to provide this data. Please any questions. INTERNAL US SEARCH SHARE METRICS (pct pts delta from NOV 2013) Panel Gearch Gession Share (home-only, desktops, incl Mac OS)* & (+02 out gi) & (+02 out gi) & (no change) espansion aneple size. Observed: 0.4 pct pt for ACL and .0 1 pct pt Ard	nal data- o see what ern. ve will have e let us know if	
HTTPS, v sources (I workarour Adding M some prel Thanks v you have : -Penny 	which significantly impacts our ability to track Y ahoo share across all three of our inten US online panel, Adsense and Analytics) going forward. My team is actively working to ndis we have, but please note that search share reporting my be impacted in the short- tobile tracking to our US online panel should begin in the next few weeks, and I hope v iminary #s to share with you by end of quarter. ery much to Remo Storni and Makoto Uchida for continuing to provide this data. Please any questions. INTERNAL US SEARCH SHARE METRICS (pct pts delta from NOV 2013) Panel Gearch Session Share (home-only, desktops, incl Mac OS)* 3% (-0.2 pct pt) (+0.2 pct pt) expansion ample size. Observed: 0.4 pct pt for ACL and :0.1 pct pt/or Adk 1.5. Cick Ghare	nal data- o see what erm. we will have	
HTTPS, v sources (I workarour Adding M some prel Thanks v you have : -Penny 	which significantly impacts our ability to track Y alnoo share across all three of our inten US online panel, Adsense and Analytics) going forward. My team is actively working t india we have, but please note that search share reporting may be impacted in the short- tobile tracking to our US online panel should begin in the next few weeks, and I hope w liminary #s to share with you by end of quarter. ery much to Remo Storni and Makoto Uchida for continuing to provide this data. Please any questions. INTERNAL US SEARCH SHARE METRICS (pct pts delta from NOV 2013) Panel Gearch Gession Share (home-only, desktops, incl Mac OS)* .3% (+0.3 pct pt) & (+0.2 pct pt) % (no change)	nal data- o see what ern. ve will have e let us know if Ex. No.	
HTTPS, v sources (I workarour Adding M some prel Thanks v you have : -Penny 	which significantly impacts our ability to track Y alnoo share across all three of our inten US online panel, Adsense and Analytics) going forward. My team is actively working t nds we have, but please note that search share reporting may be impacted in the short- tobile tracking to our US online panel should begin in the next few weeks, and I hope w liminary #s to share with you by end of quarter. ery much to Remo Storni and Makoto Uchida for continuing to provide this data. Please any questions. INTERNAL US SEARCH SHARE METRICS (pct pts delta from NOV 2013) Panel Gearch Session Share (home-only, desktops, incl Mac OS)* .3% (+0.3 pct pt) & (+0.2 pct pt) % (no change).	et us know if Ex. No. UPX0399	
HTTPS, v sources (I workarour Adding M some prel Thanks v you have : -Penny 	which significantly impacts our ability to track Y alnoo share across all three of our inten US online panel, Adsense and Analytics) going forward. My team is actively working t nds we have, but please note that search share reporting may be impacted in the short- tobile tracking to our US online panel should begin in the next few weeks, and I hope w liminary #s to share with you by end of quarter. ery much to Remo Storni and Makoto Uchida for continuing to provide this data. Please any questions. INTERNAL US SEARCH SHARE METRICS (pct pts delta from NOV 2013) Panel Gearch Session Share (home-only, desktops, incl Mac OS)* .3% (+0.3 pct pt) & (+0.2 pct pt) % (no change).	nal data- o see what ern. ve will have e let us know if Ex. No.	
HTTPS, v sources (I workarou Adding M some prel Thanks vc you have: -Penny 	which significantly impacts our ability to track V alnoo share across all three of our inten US online panel, Adsense and Analytics) going forward. My team is actively working to nids we have, but please note that search share reporting may be impacted in the short- tobile tracking to our US online panel should begin in the next few weeks, and I hope v iminary #s to share with you by end of quarter. ery much to Remo Stormi and Makoto Uchida for continuing to provide this data. Please any questions. INTERNAL US SEARCH SHARE METRICS (pct pts delta from NOV 2013) Panel Search Session Share (nome-only, desktops, incl Mac OS)* 3% (+0.2 pct pt) % (no change) ************************************	et us know if Ex. No. UPX0399	

#### DEC 2013 INTERNAL US SEARCH SHARE METRICS (pct pts delta from NOV 2013)

US Online Panel Search Session Share (home-only, desktops, incl Mac OS)\* Google 76.3% (+0.3 pct pt) Bing 13.3% (+0.2 pct pt) Yahoo 6.7% (no change) \*Prior to 10K expansion sample size. Observed -0.4 pct pt for AOL and -0.1 pct pt for Ask

Adsense U.S. Click Share Google 78.6% (-0.5 pct pt) Bing 11.9% (+0.7 pct pt) Yahoo 7.1% (no change)

Analytics US. Click Share [NEW in Dec!] Google 80.6% Bing 10.6% Yahoo 6.6%

(for comparison) Comscore U.S. Explicit Search Share Google 67.3% (+0.6 pct pt) Bing 18.2% (+0.2 pct pt) Yahoo 10.8% (-0.4 pct pt) [all-time low]

#### Q4 2013 INTERNAL US SEARCH SHARE METRICS (pct pts delta from Q3 2013)

US Online Panel Search Session Share (home-only, desktops, incl Mac OS) Google 76.3% (-0.1 pct pt) Bing 13.3% (+0.6 pct pt) Yahoo 6.6% (-0.1 pct pt)

Adsense U.S. Click Share Google 79.0% (+1.1 pct pt) Bing 11.3% (+0.2 pct pt) Yahoo 7.1% (-0.5 pct pt)

### **REDACTED FOR PUBLIC FILING**

2014

### Google collects competitive data on general search engines



2020

- Internal Google documents
- Android RSA Terms: Android RSAs prevent preinstallation of "alternative search services" which has meant alternative general search engines
- Chrome defaults

• EU Choice Screen

• Internal Google documents

- Android RSA terms
- Chrome defaults: Chrome Browser only lists general search engines in the settings option to change the search default
- EU Choice Screen

• Internal Google documents

Android RSA terms

- Chrome defaults
- EU Choice Screen only lists general search engines and does so to "ensure a good user experience"

### Only general search services are eligible for the EU choice screen

8:54 PM	

#### Android Choice Screen

The user will be required to choose one search provider from the choice screen during setup. The effect of a user selecting a search provider from the choice screen will be to (i) set the search provider in a home screen search box to the selected provider, (ii) set the default search provider in chome (fi Installed) to the selected provider, and (iii) install the search apo of the selected provider (if not already installed). Note that in the case where a user takes an action to remove the Google search widget (including by restoring a previous device configuration where the widget had been removed), the widget will not be shown.

The choice screen will begin appearing on devices distributed in the EEA starting in early 2020.

Eligible search providers will need to fill out an application form and can bid for inclusion based on an auction. The auction process is explained in greater detail below.

#### The choice screen auction

Google will use a first-price sealed-bid auction to select the other general search providers that appear in the choice screen. Google will conduct auctions on a per-country basis for the period from January 1, 2020 to December 31, 2020. Following the initial round of auctions, any subsequent rounds will occur once per year.

In each country auction, search providers will attace the price that they are willing to pay each time a user selects them from the choice screen in the given country. Each country will have a minimum bid threshold. The three highest bidders that meet or exceed the bid threshold for a given country will appear in the choice screen for that country.

The auction winners, and Google, will be ordered randomly in the choice screen. In the event of a tie, Google will allocate the slots randomly among the tied bidders. In the event that fewer than three eligible search providers meet or exceed the bid threshold, Google will fill any remaining slots randomly from the pool of eligible search providers. The pool of eligible providers will include those that applied to participate in the choice screen but did not submit bids.

#### Eligibility criteria for participating in the choice screen

To ensure a good user experience, search providers that wish to participate in the choice screen must satisfy the following requirements.

General search provider: The search provider must operate a "general search service." For purposes of the choice screen, a general search service is one that allows users to search for information across the entire Internet. Specialized or "vertical" search providers – those that only index content from a particular subject – are not eligible to participate in the choice screen. Search providers that service when day or affiliated with the same company are eligible to apricipate on the choice screen only concernent ploviders that swindcate search results from another provider are eligible to apricipate.

Localization: Search providers must provide local language support in the countries where they apply to participate. Local
language support in this context means that the user interface of both the search app (e.g., settings menu) and the search
results page (e.g., navigation buttons) must be provided in one of the required local languages. For a list of languages that
must be supported by country, <u>click here</u>. For best practices for localizing apps, visit:
https://developer.android.com/quide/topics/resources/localization/.

· App in Google Play. The search provider must have an app that is available for free in Google Play

https://web.archive.org/web/20190802094608/https://www.android.com/choicescreen

USDOJ-GOOG-00189505

2/5

### "About the choice screen"



#### Eligibility criteria for participating in the choice screen

To ensure a good user experience, search providers that wish to participate in the choice screen must satisfy the following requirements.

General search provider: The search provider must operate a "general search service." For purposes of the choice screen, a general search service is one that allows users to search for information across the entire Internet. Specialized or "vertical" search providers – those that only index content from a particular subject – are not eligible to participate in the choice screen. Search providers that are owned by or affiliated with the same company are eligible to appear on the choice screen only once. Search providers that syndicate search results from another provider are eligible to participate.



# Google's Chief Economist recognizes general search services as a relevant market

### Redacted

### Redacted

On Fri, Feb 19, 2021 at 5:49 PM Hal Varian \*\*\*\*\*\*@google.com> wrote: As I look through the subsequent bullets it seems to me that it is clear that they were looking at the value of "a search ensine".

On Fri, Feb 19, 2021 at 2:40 PM Hal Varian "networks" @google.com > wrote:

On Fri, Feb 19, 2021 at 2:18 PM Guy Ben-Ishai Redacted @google.com> wrote: Hal thanks so much - and I'm so sorry I neglected to link the <u>draft report</u> above.

I agree that the \$625 doesn't seem crazy. But if Erik's methodology is not reliable for estimating our economic impact (and is subject to large variations in results), perhaps we should avoid opening that floodgate, at least for now.

The traditional "economic impact" was to look at the value we provide to our advertisers. This is pretty straightforward since bids for ads are a measure of value, and our advertisers get about 5-7 times as many organic clicks from us as ad clicks. This can be refined of course, but the basic logic is reasonable.

WRT the value of our product, specifically search, if Google were to disappear, people would just switch to Bing. If all search engines were to disappear we look like Borge's universal library, but with no card catalog.

In Erik's experiment asked a meaningful question as I recall: "If I give you \$100 will you stop using Google for a month?" Presumably you could use Bing or DuckDuckGo if you wanted to.

In this specific case, I am more concerned about the framing of the survey, which doesn't seem to isolate the value of the search component and the value of the underlying content, thereby counting the impact of the content providers as ours.

CONFIDENTIAL

GOOG-DOJ-30272059

WRT the value of our product, specifically search, if Google were to disappear, people would just switch to Bing. If all search engines were to disappear we look like Borge's universal library, but with no card catalog.

Hal Varian, Chief Economist



### **REDA**CTED FOR PUBLIC FILING

#### UPX0340, at -058–059 (Mar. 2, 2021) (emphasis added).

# **Relevant Market**

# General Search Services General Search Text Advertising Search Advertising

### General search text ads are differentiated from other search ads

### **General Search Text Ads**



Aug 25, 2022 – **Balance bikes** are perfect bikes for 2-year-olds (and up!) as they teach **kids** to balance on two wheels and ride independently. **Balance bikes** are ... Woom 1 · Strider Classic And Strider... · Balance Bike Faq's

### **Other Types of Search Ads**





#### **Product Listing Ads (PLAs)**



### Search ads are differentiated from other digital ads

### **Search Ads**



### General Search Text Ads







# Socking.com

### **Display/Social Ads**







### **REDACTED FOR PUBLIC FILING**

#### **Other Search Ads**

- > Their role in consumers' purchase journeys
- The characteristics of their audiences and the degree to which they overlap
- > The degree to which ads can be effectively targeted
- > The form and level of their pricing
- The size of their audiences
- Advertisers' awareness of the products effectiveness and prices
- Advertisers' participation on their ad purchasing platforms

# **Relevant Market**

# General Search Services General Search Text Advertising Search Advertising

### Search ads are differentiated from other digital ads

### **Search Ads**



Cartersville: 12 properties found

Point

isent Room with Sofa Be

rtvard by Marriott Cartersville 🖸 🛽

### General Search Text Ads





Booking.com

Your Budget (per nigh

Set your own I

\$50 - \$100 \$100 - \$150



\$277

\$46

### **Display/Social Ads**







### **REDACTED FOR PUBLIC FILING**

#### **Other Search Ads**

- Display ads do not have an expressed signal of a consumer's intent at a given moment
- Display ads are typically used to build awareness or improve brand image rather than "conversion"
- Advertisers pay much higher prices for text ads than for display ads, consistent with their differentiation

# Advertisers pay much higher prices for text ads than for display ads, consistent with their differentiation

Average Price Per Thousand Ad Impressions (CPM) for General Search Text Ads and Display Ads, 2020

# Redacted

**Display ads** 

Search text ads

### **REDACTED FOR PUBLIC FILING**

Google QueryNav data (DOJ RFP 2.70); Google display ads data (DOJ RFP 2.71); Microsoft data (DOJ RFP 1.39). (Whinston Reply Report, Fig. 61, at C-3)

# Google's Chief Economist recognizes that search ads are significantly differentiated from display ads

Why Remarketing Ads are Different Hal Varian October 2017

The two most popular ways of targeting display ads are contextual targeting (as in classical AFC) and remarketing. It turns out that they have rather different implications for ad spend.



Note that the two decisions can be separated. The only way display spend impacts search spend is by affecting the marginal cost of acquiring an additional customer. (We will qualify this below.)

#### Contextual targeting

This is the simple case. You enter queries for cooking recipes into Google, you click on an organic page and you see ads for frying pans. You might click on one. We know that your conversion probability is smaller than if you had entered a query [frying pan] but we are comfortable with that. The advertiser can adjust its bid to reflect its own experience, or we can do it automatically using Smart Pricing.

We generally think that the revenue from the contextual display ads does not cannibalize search ad revenue. This isn't strictly true—think of marketing budgets—but it's probably a good working hypothesis. This is good because we only get to keep a ""% of the display ad revenue. If we thought there was significant cannibalization, as in Amir's "in market" targeting case, then we would worry.

#### Remarketing

With remarketing, we basically get two (or more) shots at the same purchase decision. If the user searches and the user clicks on an advertiser's ad, then the advertiser is getting v<sub>s</sub> of value. If the user doesn't convert, then the same advertiser can target him again. How much is the retargeted user worth? I would argue it would be somewhere between v<sub>s</sub> and v<sub>s</sub>. The user is worth more than a random display ad clicker, but less than someone who just searched on a [frying plan] ad.

If the user clicks on the remarketing ad the advertiser is now pays twice to get the same consumer to visit its site.



We generally think that the revenue from the contextual display ads does not cannibalize search ad revenue.

Hal Varian, Chief Economist 🤇 🧲





### **REDACTED FOR PUBLIC FILING**

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

# Intent captured by retargeting ads is not as strong as intent captured by search ads



"And what matters much more than having a long and detailed history is having a solid indication of what the user is doing now, because recency is everything."

\* \* \*

"So reminder ads are a form of intent. It's not as strong as the intent when you are searching something, but it says, well, you're probably interested in this product because you visited a website and examined that product."

Hal Varian, Chief Economist 🤇 🧲





### Google explains to advertisers how search ads differ from display ads

#### Choose the right campaign type

Google Ads begins with a goal and a campaign. You'll choose a campaign type based on your marketing goals, brand strategy, and how much time you can invest.

This article helps you select the right campaign type for your advertising needs

#### Search campaigns: Text ads on search results

Search campaigns are text ads on search results that let you reach people while they're searching on Google for the products and services you offer.

It's great for driving sales, leads, or traffic to your website, as you can show your ads to people actively searching for your products and services.

#### Why choose Search campaigns

- Sales and leads:
- Boost your online sales and signups.
- Consider using leads if you have a longer sales cycle
- Easy setup:
- Write text ads and pick keywords.
   Skip special files or assets—these aren't needed.
- Try Smart campaigns for an even easier setup.
- Highly specific targeting: Reach people actively searching for what you offer.

CREATE SEARCH CAMPAIGN

#### Display campaigns: Image ads on websites

Display campaigns let you reach a relevant audience with visually engaging ads as they browse millions of websites, apps, and Google-owned properties, such as YouTube, to achieve your marketing objectives. Display campaigns are a great way to expand your reach and stay top of mind with an audience beyond just Google Search.

You can also create a Display campaign that uses your data segments to show ads to people who've visited your website or have used your app.

#### Why choose Display campaigns

- Sales and leads: Use visually engaging call-to-actions to drive sales and signups.
   Awareness and consideration: Create memorable ads to make people aware of your brand or consider your product.
- Reach: Target people beyond search results while they're browsing websites and apps.
   Your data segments: Follow up with people who've already viewed your ads or visited your site.

#### Types of Display campaigns

Tip: It's helpful to use an image editing tool to create square and landscape versions of your display ad in the right dimensions and file size.

#### Why choose Search campaigns

- Sales and leads:
  - Boost your online sales and signups.
- Consider using leads if you have a longer sales cycle.
- · Easy setup:
  - · Write text ads and pick keywords.
  - Skip special files or assets—these aren't needed.
  - Try Smart campaigns for an even easier setup.
- Highly specific targeting: Reach people actively searching for what you offer.

#### Why choose Display campaigns

- Sales and leads: Use visually engaging call-to-actions to drive sales and signups.
- Awareness and consideration: Create memorable ads to make people aware of your brand or consider your product.
- Reach: Target people beyond search results while they're browsing websites and apps.
- Your data segments: Follow up with people who've already viewed your ads or visited your site.

### **REDACTED FOR PUBLIC FILING**

#### UPX8088, at -393 (Sept. 1, 2022).

2022

- Social media ads are targeted based largely on expressed or inferred interests rather than expressed intent at a given moment
- Social media ads are typically aimed at goals like awareness and branding
- Apple's recent privacy initiatives have further reduced the targeting capabilities of social media ads

### Google launched discovery ads to compete with social media ads



### **REDACTED FOR PUBLIC FILING**

2020

### General search text ads are differentiated from other search ads

### **General Search Text Ads**



10 Best Balance Bikes for Kids of All Ages - Two Wheeling Tots

Aug 25, 2022 – **Balance bikes** are perfect bikes for 2-year-olds (and up!) as they teach **kids** to balance on two wheels and ride independently. **Balance bikes** are ... Woom 1 · Strider Classic And Strider... · Balance Bike Faq's

### **Other Types of Search Ads**





#### **Product Listing Ads (PLAs)**



### **Differences wrt Search Ads**

	Shopping	Search Ads
What does it look like?	screenshot	screenshot
Creatives	Relatively Structured (eg: every n-pack offer has image + price + merchant)	Unstructured (mostly free text)
Formats	Slate Level Primarily (eg: npack, showcase)	Ad Level Primarily (eg: click-to-call, site-links)
Ad Targeting	Keywordless (product groups)	Keywords
Multiple ads from same advertiser allowed	Yes	No
Pricing Algorithms	GSP, IGA (GGSP)	FIA++, MIA
New Ads Growth Direction	Horizontal (carousel)	Vertical (consumes VCAP)
LTV Score (Normalize by VCAP height)	No	Yes

2020

### Google has considered and rejected integrating PLA and text ad auctions

Text ad & Shopping Auction Integration Redacted the units perform together and how bids on one impact the other, and build automated systems which can take advantage of this data to improve total conversions at the same ROI UC3: Rudget Allocation Advertisers have difficulty understanding how much incremental spend to allocate to Search whether to spend on Shopping or Text ads. This is a reporting and budget planning tool problem and out of scope for this doc. Apart from these three use cases, there may also be some benefit from improving the simplicit for advertisers trying to participate in both products. One agency noted, "FB and Instagram are cohesive and very easy to bundle and toggle which is not the same as AdWords." In addition to the above, the Shopping and Search Ads VPs have also asked us to re-investig whole page pricing and if it makes sense to normalize value between the two units. While PLAs are a great user experience and provide a great deal of advertiser value, the CPCs tend to be lower than text ads. There is a desire to understand the benefits of making the two units compete nore directly and tie pricing to that competition. There is a belief that if we have equivalent RO across the units, then advertisers may not even need to think about cross-format optimization Apart from the technical challenges (which are non-trivial), there are some product concerns w directly cross-pricing at the query level. Shopping also serves as the canonical result for shopping queries, and so it is important to consider the user information needs and value from the nteraction. Further, there is often value from increasing engagement with the Shopping Propert and Express, and this needs to be accounted for Lastly, user intent and advertiser value ferent across the units, and as a result advertisers are not bidding on the Shopping and Text ads, so query-level CPC equalization could lead to problems with one i The Text ads team has been working on mechanisms to better tie value and prices in the syst for a few years and strongly believes there is a great deal of headroom to increase prices ated The PLA team has been focused on equalizing ROAS with Text ads. Currently, Redacted Redacted Redacted Similar to Text ads Shopping's pricing efforts are blocked both on a lack of good mechanisms as well as the data to make a confident decision

Lastly, user intent and advertiser value is different across the units, and as a result advertisers are not bidding on the same thing on Shopping and Text ads, so query-level CPC equalization could lead to problems with one unit being too expensive.

GOOG-DOJ-03034534.003


#### A majority of Google's search ad revenue comes from advertisers who buy only text ads

**2021 Share of Google Search Ad Revenue From Advertisers Who:** 

# Redacted

Purchase Text Ads But Not PLAs Purchase both Text Ads and PLAs REDACTED FOR PUBLIC FILING

Purchase PLAs But Not Text Ads

Google Customer Spend Data (DOJ RFP 2.76). (Whinston Report, Fig. 59, at 155)

### **2017** Google Email Thread

Shopping [PLAs] and Text Ads are different products with different goals....

Today these two formats [PLAs and text ads] are **siloed** in their own world and don't **compete**, it will be worth looking at pricing from that point of view.

### **2023** Trial Testimony

- **Q.** PLAs are a **different species** than text ads; is that right?
- A. Yes.

Hal Varian, Chief Economist 🧲

### Text ad prices are higher and have increased over time relative to PLA prices, consistent with their differentiation

Average Annual Cost Per Click (CPC) for US Queries, 2016–2021

**Google (Text)** 

Bing (Text)

Bing (PLA)

••• Google (PLA)

 2016
 2017
 2018
 2019
 2020
 2021

 REDACTED FOR PUBLIC FILING

- For many ads on specialized search engines, the consumer is taken to another page on the platform
- Advertisers may view specialized search engines as rivals and therefore do not want to advertise on them
- Specialized search engines—some of the biggest advertisers—are not likely to advertise on their rivals

### **Relevant Market**

# General Search Services General Search Text Advertising Search Advertising



### **Opinion 2**

Google possesses substantial market power protected by barriers to entry in each of the relevant markets

**Monopoly Power** 

### General Search Services General Search Text Advertising Search Advertising

# Economic evidence that Google has monopoly power in general search services

- Google's market shares
- High barriers to entry and expansion
- Google's significant advantages over its general search rivals
- Low consumer responsiveness to quality reductions
- The substantial profits Google earns from its distribution contracts

# Economic evidence that Google has monopoly power in general search services

- Google's market shares
- High barriers to entry and expansion
- Google's significant advantages over its general search rivals
- Low consumer responsiveness to quality reductions
- The substantial profits Google earns from its distribution contracts

#### Google has close to 90% of the US general search services market



StatCounter Global Stats. (Whinston Reply Report, Fig. 60, at C-2)

#### Google has had a dominant and increasing share since at least 2009



#### On mobile phones Google's share is even higher



# Economic evidence that Google has monopoly power in general search services

- Google's market shares
- High barriers to entry and expansion
- Google's significant advantages over its general search rivals
- Low consumer responsiveness to quality reductions
- The substantial profits Google earns from its distribution contracts

- Large fixed and sunk capital costs
- Google's strong brand recognition and loyalty
- Scale
- Google's ownership of Chrome web browser
- Google's control of search access point defaults through its exclusionary contracts

- Annual costs to Google for search services:
   Redacted
- Additional annual costs to Google for search advertising: Redacted
- In 2020, Bing earned only Redacted in search advertising revenue

- Large fixed and sunk capital costs
- Google's strong brand recognition and loyalty
- Scale
- Google's ownership of Chrome web browser
- Google's control of search access point defaults through its exclusionary contracts

# Economic evidence that Google has monopoly power in general search services

- Google's market shares
- High barriers to entry and expansion
- Google's significant advantages over its general search rivals
- Low consumer responsiveness to quality reductions
- The substantial profits Google earns from its distribution contracts

### Search services quality advantages

- Between 2015 and 2021, the difference in the US between Google's and Bing's IS scores ranged from Redacted
- Brand image and reputation advantages

Monetization advantages, especially in mobile

#### **REDACTED FOR PUBLIC FILING**

Google IS score data (RFP 5.6). (Whinston Report, Fig. 100, at 239)

# Google's RPM advantage over Microsoft is driven by its much higher RPM on mobile phones

Search Revenue Per 1,000 Queries (RPM), PCs and Mobile Phones



# Redacted



Google QueryNav data (DOJ RFP 2.70); Microsoft aggregate search statistics data (DOJ RFP 1.39 and CID data). (Whinston Reply Report, Fig. 75, at C-16)

# Economic evidence that Google has monopoly power in general search services

- Google's market shares
- High barriers to entry and expansion
- Google's significant advantages over its general search rivals
- Low consumer responsiveness to quality reductions
- The substantial profits Google earns from its distribution contracts

#### Google's experiments show low consumer responsiveness to quality



### Connect Search Quality Improvements to Growth

In other words, Redacted
Redacted **of Search revenue ex-TAC**(Traffic Acquisition Cost).

#### **REDACTED FOR PUBLIC FILING**

2020

# Economic evidence that Google has monopoly power in general search services

- Google's market shares
- High barriers to entry and expansion
- Google's significant advantages over its general search rivals
- Low consumer responsiveness to quality reductions
- The substantial profits Google earns from its distribution contracts

**Monopoly Power** 

# General Search Services General Search Text Advertising Search Advertising

# Economic evidence that Google has monopoly power in the relevant ad markets

• Google's high market shares

• Barriers to entry

- Google's significant advantages over its search ad rivals
- Low advertiser responsiveness allowed Google to raise its text ad prices significantly

#### Google's US market share in general search text ads was 88% in 2020

General Search Text Advertising Market Shares (US)



Google QueryNav data (DOJ RFP 2.70); Microsoft a **REDACTLED GROR PUBLIC F**, **LUNG** Global Stats. (Whinston Reply Report, Fig. 72, at C-13)

#### Google's US market share in search ads was 74% in 2020

Shares Of Search Ads Revenue (US)



Google QueryNav data (DOJ RFP 2.70); Microsoft a **REDAC** ItaED: **CateOR FPUBLIC Eat CateOR**, Google Industry Metrics data (DOJ RFP 8.7); Google Search vertical data (DOJ RFP 2.73); Google Play data (DOJ RFP 8.8). (Whinston Reply Report, Fig. 70, at C-11)

# Economic evidence that Google has monopoly power in the relevant ad markets

• Google's high market shares

• Barriers to entry

- Google's significant advantages over its search ad rivals
- Low advertiser responsiveness allowed Google to raise its text ad prices significantly

#### Google's text ad prices rose over Redacted from 2013 to 2021



Google search ads price index data (RFP 5.14.a); GOOG-DOJ-03372983, at -999. (Whinston Report, Fig. 109, at 253)

### Google has launched price increases of 5% on search ads and it resulted in an increase in revenue to Google



- Q. And when Google launched price increases of 5 percent on search ads, it resulted in an increase in revenue to Google; correct?
- **A.** Typically, it would result in an increase in revenue.

#### Google adjusted the rules of the auction to raise text ad prices

### Ads Quality BiWeekly July 26, 2018 When Vanilla pricing may no be sufficient Second Pricing works great most of the time, but there are failure scenarios Weak or lack of Auction Pressure When no competition is present, or when competition is of inferior quality Reserve pricing Reserve prices are generally lower than their second price counterpart → We need pricing mechanisms with pricing knobs

We need a way to extract value more directly . . . We need *pricing mechanisms* with *pricing knobs* 

#### 2018

#### Google aimed to set prices

#### Redacted



#### Agenda:

- Do we want to raise prices?
- Is it ok to raise prices?
- How we would roll-out?

### Redacted

#### **REDA**CTED FOR PUBLIC FILING

2017

# A) Momiji Opportunity

Likely billions in format pricing + squashing

- ~10% RPM from Format Pricing
- ~5% RPM from Squashing
- Work well together (i.e. ~15% total)
- More opportunity on Mobile than Desktop

#### **REDACTED FOR PUBLIC FILING**

2016