

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF FLORIDA

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)
) CASE NO. 97-0853-CR-NESBITT
 v.)
) Magistrate Judge Robert L. Dubé
ATLAS IRON PROCESSORS, INC.,) (February 11, 1998, Order of Reference)
 et al.,)
) **MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF**
 Defendants.) **UNITED STATES' MOTION *IN LIMINE***
) **TO PREVENT DEFENDANTS FROM**
) **INTRODUCING EVIDENCE**
) **REGARDING THE EFFECTS OF**
) **PUNISHMENT OR A CONVICTION**

Evidence regarding punishment or the effects of conviction has traditionally been held to be irrelevant, and therefore, inadmissible before the jury. As the Eleventh Circuit's criminal pattern jury instructions provide, "[T]he question of punishment should never be considered by the jury in any way in deciding the case. If the Defendant is convicted the matter of punishment is for the Judge to determine." Devitt and Blackmar concur: "The punishment provided by law for the offenses charged in the indictment is a matter exclusively within the province of the court and should never be considered by the jury in any way in arriving at an impartial verdict as to the offenses charged." Devitt and Blackmar, Federal Jury Practice and Instructions, § 20.01 (4th ed. 1992). In a criminal prosecution, the jury's sole function is to determine guilt or innocence, for the applicable statutes do not lodge with the jury the responsibility of imposing sentence. See United States v. McCracken, 488 F.2d 406, 423 (5th Cir. 1974).¹

¹ The McCracken court held,

Generally speaking, jurors decide the facts in accordance with the rules of law as

FAX: (216) 522-8332

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that true and correct copies of the following:

- 1) *Demand Of Notice Pursuant To Rule 12.1 Of Defendant Anthony J. Giordano, Sr.'s Intention To Offer Defense Of Alibi;*
- 2) *Demand Of Notice Pursuant To Rule 12.1 Of Defendant Anthony J. Giordano, Jr.'s Intention To Offer Defense Of Alibi;*
- 3) *Demand Of Notice Pursuant To Rule 12.1 Of Defendant David Giordano's Intention To Offer Defense Of Alibi;*
- 4) *Demand Of Notice Pursuant To Rule 12.1 Of Defendant Randolph J. Weil's Intention To Offer Defense Of Alibi;*
- 5) *Memorandum In Support Of United States' Motion In Limine To Exclude Evidence Of Reasonableness; and*
- 6) *Memorandum In Support Of United States' Motion In Limine To Prevent Defendants From Introducing Evidence Regarding The Effects Of Punishment Or A Conviction.*

were sent via Federal Express to the Office of the Clerk of Court on this 20th day of April, 1998. Copies of the above-captioned pleadings also were served upon the defendants via Federal Express on this 20th day of April, 1998.

Benedict P. Kuehne, Esq.
Sale & Kuehne, P.A.
Nationsbank Tower, Suite 3550
100 Southeast 2nd Street
Miami, FL 33131-2154

Ralph E. Cascarilla, Esq.
Walter & Haverfield
1300 Terminal Tower
Cleveland, OH 44113-2253

Robert C. Josefsberg, Esq.
Podhurst, Orseck, Josefsberg,
Eaton, Meadow, Olin & Perwin, P.A.
City National Bank Building, Suite 800
25 West Flagler Street
Miami, FL 33130-1780

Patrick M. McLaughlin, Esq.
McLaughlin & McCaffrey, L.L.P.
Ohio Savings Plaza, Suite 740
1801 East Ninth Street
Cleveland, OH 44114-3103

Roberto Martinez, Esq.
Colson, Hicks, Eidson, Colson
Matthews, Martinez & Mendoza, P.A.
First Union Financial Center, 47th Floor
200 South Biscayne Boulevard
Miami, FL 33131-2351

Marc S. Nurik, Esq.
Ruden, McClosky, Smith, Schuster,
& Russell, P.A.
First Union Plaza, 15th Floor
200 East Broward Boulevard
Post Office Box 1900
Fort Lauderdale, FL 33301

WILLIAM J. OBERDICK
Acting Chief
Cleveland Field Office

RICHARD T. HAMILTON, JR.
Court I.D. No. A5500338

Trial Attorney,
U.S. Department of Justice
Antitrust Division
Plaza 9 Building
55 Erieview Plaza, Suite 700
Cleveland, OH 44114-1816
Phone: (216) 522-4107
FAX: (216) 522-8332