

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

Civil Action No. 2:24-cv-1675

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA and  
COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA,  
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL  
PROTECTION,

Plaintiffs,

v.

PENNENERGY RESOURCES, LLC,

Defendant.

---

**COMPLAINT**

---

Plaintiffs, the United States of America, by authority of the Attorney General of the United States and acting at the request of the Administrator of the United States Environmental Protection Agency (“EPA”), and the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Department of Environmental Protection (“PADEP”) (collectively “Plaintiffs”) allege:

**NATURE OF ACTION**

1. This is a civil action against PennEnergy Resources, LLC (“PennEnergy” or “Defendant”) pursuant to Section 113(b) of the Clean Air Act, 42 U.S.C. § 7413(b), and Section 4(1), (10) of the Pennsylvania Air Pollution Control Act, Act of January 8, 1960, P.L. 2119 (1959), *as amended*, 35 P.S. § 4004(1), (10).

2. Plaintiffs seek injunctive relief and civil penalties for violations of the Clean Air Act and the Standards of Performance for Crude Oil and Natural Gas Facilities set forth at 40

C.F.R. Part 60, Subparts OOOO (“NSPS OOOO”) and OOOOa (“NSPS OOOOa”).

### **JURISDICTION AND VENUE**

3. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this action pursuant to Section 113(b) of the Clean Air Act, 42 U.S.C. § 7413(b), and pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331 (Federal Question), 1345 (United States as Plaintiff), and 1355 (Fine, Penalty, or Forfeiture).

4. This Court has supplemental jurisdiction over the state law claims asserted by PADEP pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1367.

5. Venue is proper in this District under Section 113(b) of the Clean Air Act, 42 U.S.C. § 7413(b), and 28 U.S.C. §§ 1391(b) and 1395(a), because the violations that are the basis of this Complaint occurred in this District and the well pads at issue are operated by PennEnergy in this District.

### **NOTICES**

6. Notice has been given to PennEnergy and the appropriate air pollution control agency in the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania in accordance with Section 113 of the Clean Air Act, 42 U.S.C. § 7413.

### **DEFENDANT**

7. PennEnergy is an oil and natural gas exploration and production company incorporated in the State of Delaware. PennEnergy’s corporate headquarters are located in Cranberry Township, Pennsylvania.

8. PennEnergy owns and operates wells in the Appalachian Basin in western Pennsylvania that extract condensate (a type of oil) and natural gas from the Marcellus and Utica shale formations.

9. PennEnergy is a “person” as defined in Section 302(e) of the Clean Air Act, 42

U.S.C. § 7602(e).

## **STATUTORY AND REGULATORY BACKGROUND**

### **The Clean Air Act**

10. The Clean Air Act establishes a regulatory scheme to protect and enhance the quality of the nation’s air to promote the public health and welfare and the productive capacity of its population. 42 U.S.C. § 7401(b)(1).

### **New Source Performance Standards**

11. The Clean Air Act requires EPA to establish performance standards for certain categories of new stationary sources of air pollution. 42 U.S.C. § 7411(b)(1). These standards are known as “new source performance standards.”

12. EPA has established new source performance standards for crude oil and natural gas production facilities. *See* 40 C.F.R. Part 60, Subparts OOOO and OOOOa. These standards apply to specified facilities (referred to as “affected facilities”), including storage vessels, that are, in the case of NSPS OOOO, constructed or modified after August 23, 2011 and on or before September 18, 2015, or, in the case of NSPS OOOOa, constructed or modified after September 18, 2015 and on or before December 6, 2022.

13. The NSPS OOOO standards provide, in relevant part:

- a. Each owner or operator must reduce VOC emissions by 95 percent unless, following at least 12 consecutive months of operation, uncontrolled actual VOC emissions are less than 4 tons per year without considering controls. 40 C.F.R. § 60.5395(d).
- b. Each owner or operator using a control device to reduce emissions from a storage vessel affected facility “must equip the storage vessel with a cover

that meets the requirements of § 60.5411(b) and is connected through a closed vent system that meets the requirements of § 60.5411(c), and . . . route emissions to a control device that meets the conditions specified in § 60.5412(c) and (d).” 40 C.F.R. § 60.5395(e)(1).

- c. Each owner or operator must “demonstrate continuous compliance with standards” as specified in 40 C.F.R. § 60.5415(e)(3). 40 C.F.R. § 60.5395(g)(2).
- d. “The cover and all openings on the cover (e.g., access hatches, sampling ports, pressure relief valves and gauge wells) shall form a continuous impermeable barrier over the entire surface area of the liquid in the storage vessel or wet seal fluid degassing system.” 40 C.F.R. § 60.5411(b)(1).
- e. “Each cover opening shall be secured in a closed, sealed position (e.g., covered by a gasketed lid or cap) whenever material is in the unit on which the cover is installed except during those times when it is necessary to use an opening [to add or remove material, inspect or sample material, inspect or repair equipment, or vent vapors through a closed vent system to a control device].” 40 C.F.R. § 60.5411(b)(2).
- f. “Each storage vessel thief hatch shall be equipped, maintained and operated with a weighted mechanism or equivalent, to ensure that the lid remains properly seated.” 40 C.F.R. § 60.5411(b)(3).
- g. Each owner or operator “must design the closed vent system to route all gases, vapors, and fumes emitted from the material in the storage vessel to a control device that meets the requirements specified in § 60.5412(c) and

(d), or to a process.” 40 C.F.R. § 60.5411(c)(1).

- h. Each owner or operator “must design and operate a closed vent system with no detectable emissions, as determined using olfactory, visual and auditory inspections.” 40 C.F.R. § 60.5411(c)(2).
- i. Each owner or operator must submit a certified annual report containing information on each storage vessel affected facility. 40 C.F.R. § 60.5420(b).
- j. “At all times, including periods of startup, shutdown, and malfunction, owners and operators shall maintain and operate any affected facility including associated air pollution control equipment in a manner consistent with good air pollution control practice for minimizing emissions.” 40 C.F.R. § 60.5370(b).

14. The NSPS OOOOa standards provide, in relevant part:

- a. Each owner or operator must reduce VOC emissions by 95 percent unless, following at least 12 consecutive months of operation, uncontrolled actual VOC emissions are less than 4 tons per year without considering controls. 40 C.F.R. § 60.5395a(a).
- b. Each owner or operator using a control device to reduce VOC emissions “must equip the storage vessel with a cover that meets the requirements of § 60.5411a(b) and is connected through a closed vent system that meets the requirements of § 60.5411a(c) and (d), and . . . route emissions to a control device that meets the conditions specified in § 60.5412a(c) or (d).” 40 C.F.R. § 60.5395a(b)(1).

- c. Each owner or operator must “demonstrate continuous compliance with standards” as specified in 40 C.F.R. § 60.5415a(e)(3). 40 C.F.R. § 60.5395a(d)(2).
- d. “The cover and all openings on the cover (e.g., access hatches, sampling ports, pressure relief devices and gauge wells) shall form a continuous impermeable barrier over the entire surface area of the liquid in the storage vessel or wet seal fluid degassing system.” 40 C.F.R. § 60.5411a(b)(1).
- e. “Each cover opening shall be secured in a closed, sealed position (e.g., covered by a gasketed lid or cap) whenever material is in the unit on which the cover is installed except during those times when it is necessary to use an opening [to add or remove material, inspect or sample material, inspect or repair equipment, or vent vapors through a closed vent system to a control device].” 40 C.F.R. § 60.5411a(b)(2).
- f. “Each storage vessel thief hatch shall be equipped, maintained and operated with a weighted mechanism or equivalent, to ensure that the lid remains properly seated and sealed under normal operating conditions, including such times when working, standing/breathing, and flash emissions may be generated.” 40 C.F.R. § 60.5411a(b)(3).
- g. Each owner or operator “must design the closed vent system to route all gases, vapors, and fumes emitted from the material in the storage vessel to a control device that meets the requirements specified in § 60.5412a(c) and (d), or to a process.” 40 C.F.R. § 60.5411a(c)(1).
- h. Each owner or operator “must design and operate a closed vent system

with no detectable emissions, as determined using olfactory, visual, and auditory inspections or optical gas imaging inspections as specified in § 60.5416a(c).” 40 C.F.R. § 60.5411a(c)(2).

- i. Each owner or operator “must conduct an assessment that the closed vent system is of sufficient design and capacity to ensure that all emissions from the affected facility are routed to the control device and that the control device is of sufficient design and capacity to accommodate all emissions from the affected facility, and have it certified by a qualified professional engineer or an in-house engineer with expertise on the design and operation of the closed vent system in accordance with [§ 60.5411a(d)(1)(i) and (ii)].” 40 C.F.R. § 60.5411a(d).
- j. Each owner or operator must submit a certified annual report containing information on each storage vessel affected facility. 40 C.F.R. § 60.5420a(b).
- k. “At all times, including periods of startup, shutdown, and malfunction, owners and operators shall maintain and operate any affected facility including associated air pollution control equipment in a manner consistent with good air pollution control practice for minimizing emissions.” 40 C.F.R. § 60.5370a(b).

15. It is unlawful to operate a source in violation of an applicable new source performance standard. 42 U.S.C. § 7411(e).

16. The Commonwealth of Pennsylvania has been delegated authority to implement and enforce NSPS OOOO and NSPS OOOOa. 50 Fed. Reg. 34,140, 34,142 (Aug. 23, 1985).

EPA also has the authority to enforce NSPS OOOO and NSPS OOOOa whenever it deems such enforcement necessary to carry out the purposes of the Clean Air Act. *Id. See also* 42 U.S.C. § 7411(c)(2).

### **Title V Operating Permits**

17. Title V of the Clean Air Act, 42 U.S.C. §§ 7661-7661f, establishes an operating permit program for certain sources, including “major sources.” The purpose of Title V is to ensure that all “applicable requirements” for compliance with the Clean Air Act are collected in one place.

18. Pursuant to Section 502(a) of the Clean Air Act, 42 U.S.C. § 7661a(a), it is unlawful for a major source to operate without or in violation of a permit issued pursuant to Title V of the Clean Air Act, 42 U.S.C. § 7661 *et seq.* *See also* 40 C.F.R. § 70.7(b).

19. The Pennsylvania Title V operating permit program was approved by EPA on July 30, 1996. *See* 61 Fed. Reg. 39,597 (July 30, 1996). These regulations are currently codified at 25 Pa. Code § 127.501-127.543.

### **FACTUAL BACKGROUND**

#### **A. Marcellus and Utica Formation**

20. The Marcellus and Utica shale formations are rock formations within the Appalachian Basin that underlie large portions of Pennsylvania, Ohio, and West Virginia. The Marcellus formation lies at various depths from the surface to approximately 8,000 feet. The Utica formation is located below the Marcellus formation. In Pennsylvania, the Marcellus and Utica formations contain trillions of cubic feet of natural gas and millions of barrels of natural gas liquids, known as “condensate.”



**B. PennEnergy Well Pads**

21. PennEnergy is one of many companies that extract natural gas and condensate from the Marcellus and Utica shale formations via extraction wells.

22. The surface site from which a well is drilled is known as a “well pad.” PennEnergy often drills multiple wells from the same well pad.

23. PennEnergy owns and operates dozens of well pads in western Pennsylvania that produce a mixture of condensate, natural gas, and produced water. This mixture flows up the well under pressure to the well-head at the surface. After the gas is separated from the liquids, it goes to a sales pipeline. The liquids are separated into condensate and produced water.

24. Condensate is stored in a condensate storage tank. Produced water is stored in a produced water storage tank. The storage tanks at PennEnergy’s well pads are kept near atmospheric pressure and hence are often referred to as atmospheric storage tanks.

25. When pressurized condensate and produced water is transferred from a separator to an atmospheric storage tank, the pressure drops quickly. This causes some of the hydrocarbons in the liquids, including VOC, Hazardous Air Pollutants (“HAP”), and methane, to vaporize in a phenomenon known as “flashing.” After flashing occurs, the condensate and produced water (which still contains some condensate, even after initial separation) continue to emit vapors due to liquid level changes and temperature fluctuations. These are known as “working” and “breathing” losses.

26. PennEnergy is required to capture and control the vapors from “affected” storage tanks. PennEnergy does this by routing the vapors through a series of pipes or vent lines to a control device.

27. The terms “vapor control system” and “closed vent system” are used herein

interchangeably to refer to the vent lines from a storage tank or group of connected storage tanks to a control device, and all connections, fittings, pressure relief devices (including thief hatches on the storage tanks), and any other appurtenance used to contain and collect storage tank vapors, and to transport or convey the vapors to a control device.

**C. Storage Tank Thief Hatches**

28. The tops of storage tanks have openings called “thief hatches.” Thief hatches are equipped with gaskets that are supposed to seal tight when closed.

29. Thief hatches serve two primary purposes. First, they provide access to the contents of a storage tank for taking samples and measuring the liquid level in the tank (known as “gauging”). Second, they provide a means of (a) relieving pressure from a storage tank to prevent over pressurization and (b) eliminating excessive vacuum.

30. To prevent over pressurization, thief hatches are designed to open (i.e., vent) when the pressure inside the tank exceeds the pressure setting of the thief hatch.

31. PennEnergy uses “spring loaded” thief hatches. The pressure setting is determined by the stiffness of the pressure spring.

32. When the pressure inside a storage tank approaches the pressure setting of the thief hatch, the spring begins to compress, causing the thief hatch to open. When the pressure drops below the pressure setting, the spring expands causing the thief hatch to close.

**D. EPA Inspection and Follow-Up Investigation**

33. In October 2018, EPA inspected 16 PennEnergy well pads in Butler County, Pennsylvania. Using an optical gas-imaging infrared camera (“IR camera”) and a photoionization detector (“PID”), EPA observed that storage tanks at the Bloom, Burr, Dunmire, Hamilton, Michael, and other well pads were emitting vapors to the atmosphere from thief hatches or other

openings on the tanks, bypassing the required control device.

34. Further investigation indicated that PennEnergy had failed to conduct a formal engineering analysis to ensure that each of its vapor control systems was adequately designed and sized to route all storage tank vapors to an emissions control device. On information and belief, in some cases, storage tanks were connected to systems that were not adequate to route all vapors from the storage tanks to emissions controls, forcing vapors to be emitted directly to the atmosphere from thief hatches on the tanks rather than being conveyed to a control device as required by NSPS OOOO and NSPS OOOOa.

### **GENERAL ALLEGATIONS**

35. At all times relevant to the Complaint, PennEnergy conducted oil and natural gas production operations in the Appalachian Basin in Pennsylvania.

36. PennEnergy owns and/or operates the well pads identified in Table A, below.

37. Each of the well pads in Table A is located in Butler County, Pennsylvania.

38. Each of the well pads in Table A is in the “crude oil and natural gas source category” within the meaning of NSPS OOOO, 40 C.F.R. § 60.5430, and NSPS OOOOa, 40 C.F.R. § 60.5430a.

39. Each of the well pads in Table A has one or more storage vessels constructed or modified after August 23, 2011 that has (or had) the potential for VOC emissions equal to or greater than six tons per year.

40. Each storage vessel located at a well pad listed in Table A that (a) was constructed or modified after August 23, 2011 and (b) has (or had) the potential for VOC emissions equal to or greater than six tons per year is subject to either NSPS OOOO (in the case of facilities constructed or modified after August 23, 2011 and on or before September 18, 2015)

or NSPS OOOOa (in the case of facilities constructed or modified after September 18, 2015 and on or before December 6, 2022).

**Table A. PennEnergy Well Pads**

<b>Facility Name</b>	<b>Street Address</b>	<b>County</b>	<b>Latitude</b>	<b>Longitude</b>
Bloom	949 Whitestown Road, Butler, PA	Butler	40.86033	-79.99798
Burr	175 Lower Harmony Road, Prospect, PA	Butler	40.86982	-80.05056
Dunmire	340 East Portersville Road, Portersville, PA	Butler	40.92349	-80.11782
Hamilton	517 Scott Ridge Road, Harmony, PA	Butler	40.8594	-80.15221
Michael	1047 Evans City Road, Renfrew, PA	Butler	40.83788	-79.99954

**FIRST CLAIM FOR RELIEF**  
(Title V Violations)

41. Paragraphs 1 through 40 are incorporated herein by reference.

42. The Bloom, Burr, Hamilton, and Michael well pads, which are identified in Table A above, are or were “major sources” of VOC for purposes of the Title V operating permit program.

43. PennEnergy failed to obtain Title V operating permits for the Bloom, Burr, Hamilton, and Michael well pads, in violation of Section 502(a) of the Clean Air Act, 42 U.S.C. § 7661a, and 25 Pa. Code §§ 127.402(a) and 127.501.

44. Pursuant to Section 113(b) of the Clean Air Act, 42 U.S.C. § 7413(b),

PennEnergy is liable for injunctive relief and civil penalties up to the statutory maximum per day for each violation. *See* 88 Fed. Reg. 89,309, 89,312 (Dec. 27, 2023).

**SECOND CLAIM FOR RELIEF**

(NSPS Subpart OOOO and OOOOa Storage Vessel Violations)

45. Paragraphs 1 through 40 are incorporated herein by reference.

46. One or more of the storage vessels at the well pads identified in Table A are storage vessel affected facilities as that term is defined in NSPS Subparts OOOO and OOOOa.

47. At the well pads identified in Table A, PennEnergy violated one or more of the following requirements of NSPS Subpart OOOO or OOOOa, as applicable:

- a. the requirements applicable to storage vessel covers in 40 C.F.R. § 60.5411(b) or 60.5411a(b);
- b. the requirements applicable to closed vent systems in 40 C.F.R. § 60.5411(c) or 60.5411a(c);
- c. the requirements for controlling VOC emissions from storage vessel affected facilities in 40 C.F.R. § 60.5395(d)(1) and (e)(1) or 40 C.F.R. § 60.5395a(a)(2) and (b)(1);
- d. the continuous compliance requirements referenced in 40 C.F.R. § 60.5395(g)(2) and 60.5415(e)(3) or 40 C.F.R. § 60.5395a(d)(2) and 60.5415a(e)(3);
- e. the emissions determination requirement referenced in 40 C.F.R. § 60.5365(e) or 40 C.F.R. § 60.5365a(e);
- f. the annual reporting requirements specified in 40 C.F.R. § 60.5420(b)(1) and (6) or 40 C.F.R. § 60.5420a(b)(1) and (6); and
- g. the good air pollution control practice requirements in 40 C.F.R. § 60.5370(b) or 40 C.F.R. § 60.5370a(b).

48. Each of the violations alleged in Paragraph 47 is a violation of Section 111(e) of the Clean Air Act, 42 U.S.C. § 7411(e).

49. Pursuant to Section 113(b) of the Clean Air Act, 42 U.S.C. § 7413(b), PennEnergy is liable for injunctive relief and civil penalties up to the statutory maximum per day for each violation. *See* 88 Fed. Reg. 89,309, 89,312 (Dec. 27, 2023).

**PRAYER FOR RELIEF**

WHEREFORE, Plaintiffs request that this Court:

A. Permanently enjoin Defendant from further violating the Clean Air Act, NSPS OOOO and NSPS OOOOa;

B. Order Defendant to take appropriate actions to remedy, mitigate, and offset the harm to public health and the environment caused by its violations of the Clean Air Act, NSPS OOOO, and NSPS OOOOa;

C. Assess a civil penalty against Defendant for each violation of the applicable provisions of the Clean Air Act and NSPS OOOO and NSPS OOOOa up to the statutory maximum per day for each violation;

D. Award Plaintiffs their costs of this action; and

E. Grant such other and further relief as the Court deems just and proper.

Respectfully submitted,

TODD KIM  
Assistant Attorney General  
Environment and Natural Resources Division  
U.S. Department of Justice

/s/ Nicholas Morales

Nicholas Morales, DC Bar No. 1003942  
Environmental Enforcement Section  
U.S. Department of Justice  
P.O. Box 7611  
Washington, D.C. 20044  
Phone: (202) 616-8860  
Fax: (202) 514-8865  
Email: Nicholas.Morales@usdoj.gov

ERIC G. OLSHAN  
United States Attorney  
Western District of Pennsylvania

PAUL SKIRTICH, Bar No. 30440  
Assistant United States Attorney  
U.S. Post Office and Courthouse  
700 Grant Street, Suite 4000  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219  
Phone: (412) 894-7418  
Fax: (412) 644-6995  
Email: Paul.Skirtich@usdoj.gov

OF COUNSEL:

ALEX CHEN  
Attorney Advisor  
Air Enforcement Division  
Office of Civil Enforcement  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

HUMANE ZIA  
Senior Assistant Regional Counsel  
Office of Regional Counsel, Air & Toxics Branch  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA,  
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL  
PROTECTION

/s/ Carl D. Ballard

Carl D. Ballard, PA I.D. No. 320830

Assistant Counsel

Northwest Regional Counsel

230 Chestnut Street

Meadville, PA 16335-3407

Phone: 814-332-6070

Fax: 814-332-6996

Email: caballard@pa.gov



CIVIL COVER SHEET

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. (SEE INSTRUCTIONS ON NEXT PAGE OF THIS FORM.)

I. (a) PLAINTIFFS

USA and Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Dept. of

(b) County of Residence of First Listed Plaintiff

(EXCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES)

(c) Attorneys (Firm Name, Address, and Telephone Number)

See Attachment A

DEFENDANTS

PennEnergy Resources, LLC

County of Residence of First Listed Defendant **Butler**

(IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES ONLY)

NOTE: IN LAND CONDEMNATION CASES, USE THE LOCATION OF THE TRACT OF LAND INVOLVED.

Attorneys (If Known)

See Attachment A

II. BASIS OF JURISDICTION (Place an "X" in One Box Only)

- ☒ 1 U.S. Government Plaintiff ☐ 3 Federal Question (U.S. Government Not a Party)
- ☐ 2 U.S. Government Defendant ☐ 4 Diversity (Indicate Citizenship of Parties in Item III)

III. CITIZENSHIP OF PRINCIPAL PARTIES (Place an "X" in One Box for Plaintiff and One Box for Defendant)

- |   | PTF                        | DEF                        |   | PTF                        | DEF                        |
|---|----------------------------|----------------------------|---|----------------------------|----------------------------|
| Citizen of This State                   | <input type="checkbox"/> 1 | <input type="checkbox"/> 1 | Incorporated or Principal Place of Business In This State     | <input type="checkbox"/> 4 | <input type="checkbox"/> 4 |
| Citizen of Another State                | <input type="checkbox"/> 2 | <input type="checkbox"/> 2 | Incorporated and Principal Place of Business In Another State | <input type="checkbox"/> 5 | <input type="checkbox"/> 5 |
| Citizen or Subject of a Foreign Country | <input type="checkbox"/> 3 | <input type="checkbox"/> 3 | Foreign Nation  | <input type="checkbox"/> 6 | <input type="checkbox"/> 6 |

IV. NATURE OF SUIT (Place an "X" in One Box Only)

Click here for: [Nature of Suit Code Descriptions.](#)

CONTRACT	TORTS	FORFEITURE/PENALTY	BANKRUPTCY	OTHER STATUTES
<input type="checkbox"/> 110 Insurance <input type="checkbox"/> 120 Marine <input type="checkbox"/> 130 Miller Act <input type="checkbox"/> 140 Negotiable Instrument <input type="checkbox"/> 150 Recovery of Overpayment & Enforcement of Judgment <input type="checkbox"/> 151 Medicare Act <input type="checkbox"/> 152 Recovery of Defaulted Student Loans (Excludes Veterans) <input type="checkbox"/> 153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits <input type="checkbox"/> 160 Stockholders' Suits <input type="checkbox"/> 190 Other Contract <input type="checkbox"/> 195 Contract Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 196 Franchise	<b>PERSONAL INJURY</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 310 Airplane <input type="checkbox"/> 315 Airplane Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 320 Assault, Libel & Slander <input type="checkbox"/> 330 Federal Employers' Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 340 Marine <input type="checkbox"/> 345 Marine Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 350 Motor Vehicle <input type="checkbox"/> 355 Motor Vehicle Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 360 Other Personal Injury <input type="checkbox"/> 362 Personal Injury - Medical Malpractice <b>PERSONAL INJURY</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 365 Personal Injury - Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 367 Health Care/Pharmaceutical Personal Injury Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 368 Asbestos Personal Injury Product Liability <b>PERSONAL PROPERTY</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 370 Other Fraud <input type="checkbox"/> 371 Truth in Lending <input type="checkbox"/> 380 Other Personal Property Damage <input type="checkbox"/> 385 Property Damage Product Liability	<input type="checkbox"/> 625 Drug Related Seizure of Property 21 USC 881 <input type="checkbox"/> 690 Other <b>LABOR</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 710 Fair Labor Standards Act <input type="checkbox"/> 720 Labor/Management Relations <input type="checkbox"/> 740 Railway Labor Act <input type="checkbox"/> 751 Family and Medical Leave Act <input type="checkbox"/> 790 Other Labor Litigation <input type="checkbox"/> 791 Employee Retirement Income Security Act <b>IMMIGRATION</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 462 Naturalization Application <input type="checkbox"/> 465 Other Immigration Actions	<input type="checkbox"/> 422 Appeal 28 USC 158 <input type="checkbox"/> 423 Withdrawal 28 USC 157 <b>PROPERTY RIGHTS</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 820 Copyrights <input type="checkbox"/> 830 Patent <input type="checkbox"/> 835 Patent - Abbreviated New Drug Application <input type="checkbox"/> 840 Trademark <input type="checkbox"/> 880 Defend Trade Secrets Act of 2016 <b>SOCIAL SECURITY</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 861 HIA (1395ff) <input type="checkbox"/> 862 Black Lung (923) <input type="checkbox"/> 863 DIWC/DIWW (405(g)) <input type="checkbox"/> 864 SSID Title XVI <input type="checkbox"/> 865 RSI (405(g)) <b>FEDERAL TAX SUITS</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 870 Taxes (U.S. Plaintiff or Defendant) <input type="checkbox"/> 871 IRS—Third Party 26 USC 7609	<input type="checkbox"/> 375 False Claims Act <input type="checkbox"/> 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a)) <input type="checkbox"/> 400 State Reapportionment <input type="checkbox"/> 410 Antitrust <input type="checkbox"/> 430 Banks and Banking <input type="checkbox"/> 450 Commerce <input type="checkbox"/> 460 Deportation <input type="checkbox"/> 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations <input type="checkbox"/> 480 Consumer Credit (15 USC 1681 or 1692) <input type="checkbox"/> 485 Telephone Consumer Protection Act <input type="checkbox"/> 490 Cable/Sat TV <input type="checkbox"/> 850 Securities/Commodities/Exchange <input type="checkbox"/> 890 Other Statutory Actions <input type="checkbox"/> 891 Agricultural Acts <input type="checkbox"/> 893 Environmental Matters <input type="checkbox"/> 895 Freedom of Information Act <input type="checkbox"/> 896 Arbitration <input type="checkbox"/> 899 Administrative Procedure Act/Review or Appeal of Agency Decision <input type="checkbox"/> 950 Constitutionality of State Statutes
<b>REAL PROPERTY</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 210 Land Condemnation <input type="checkbox"/> 220 Foreclosure <input type="checkbox"/> 230 Rent Lease & Ejectment <input type="checkbox"/> 240 Torts to Land <input type="checkbox"/> 245 Tort Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 290 All Other Real Property	<b>CIVIL RIGHTS</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 440 Other Civil Rights <input type="checkbox"/> 441 Voting <input type="checkbox"/> 442 Employment <input type="checkbox"/> 443 Housing/Accommodations <input type="checkbox"/> 445 Amer. w/Disabilities - Employment <input type="checkbox"/> 446 Amer. w/Disabilities - Other <input type="checkbox"/> 448 Education <b>PRISONER PETITIONS</b> <b>Habeas Corpus:</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 463 Alien Detainee <input type="checkbox"/> 510 Motions to Vacate Sentence <input type="checkbox"/> 530 General <input type="checkbox"/> 535 Death Penalty <b>Other:</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 540 Mandamus & Other <input type="checkbox"/> 550 Civil Rights <input type="checkbox"/> 555 Prison Condition <input type="checkbox"/> 560 Civil Detainee - Conditions of Confinement			

V. ORIGIN (Place an "X" in One Box Only)

- ☒ 1 Original Proceeding ☐ 2 Removed from State Court ☐ 3 Remanded from Appellate Court ☐ 4 Reinstated or Reopened ☐ 5 Transferred from Another District (specify) ☐ 6 Multidistrict Litigation - Transfer ☐ 8 Multidistrict Litigation - Direct File

VI. CAUSE OF ACTION

Cite the U.S. Civil Statute under which you are filing (Do not cite jurisdictional statutes unless diversity):  
Clean Air Act, 42 U.S.C. § 7401 et seq.

Brief description of cause:

Violations of Clean Air Act Title V and NSPS Subparts OOOO and OOOOa at PennEnergy oil and gas production facilities.

VII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT:

☐ CHECK IF THIS IS A CLASS ACTION UNDER RULE 23, F.R.Cv.P.

DEMAND \$

CHECK YES only if demanded in complaint:

JURY DEMAND: ☐ Yes ☒ No

VIII. RELATED CASE(S) IF ANY

(See instructions):

JUDGE

DOCKET NUMBER

DATE

SIGNATURE OF ATTORNEY OF RECORD

12/10/2024

NICHOLAS MORALES

Digitally signed by NICHOLAS MORALES  
Date: 2024.12.10 11:24:06 -0500

FOR OFFICE USE ONLY

RECEIPT # AMOUNT APPLYING IFP JUDGE MAG. JUDGE

JS 44A REVISED June, 2009

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA  
THIS CASE DESIGNATION SHEET MUST BE COMPLETED**PART A**This case belongs on the ( ☐ Erie ☐ Johnstown ☒ Pittsburgh) calendar.

1. **ERIE CALENDAR** - If cause of action arose in the counties of Crawford, Elk, Erie, Forest, McKean, Venang or Warren, OR any plaintiff or defendant resides in one of said counties.
2. **JOHNSTOWN CALENDAR** - If cause of action arose in the counties of Bedford, Blair, Cambria, Clearfield or Somerset OR any plaintiff or defendant resides in one of said counties.
3. Complete if on **ERIE CALENDAR**: I certify that the cause of action arose in \_\_\_\_\_ County and that the \_\_\_\_\_ resides in \_\_\_\_\_ County.
4. Complete if on **JOHNSTOWN CALENDAR**: I certify that the cause of action arose in \_\_\_\_\_ County and that the \_\_\_\_\_ resides in \_\_\_\_\_ County.

**PART B** (You are to check ONE of the following)

1. ☐ This case is related to Number \_\_\_\_\_ . Short Caption \_\_\_\_\_ .
2. ☒ This case is not related to a pending or terminated case.

## DEFINITIONS OF RELATED CASES:

**CIVIL:** Civil cases are deemed related when a case filed relates to property included in another suit or involves the same issues of fact or it grows out of the same transactions as another suit or involves the validity or infringement of a patent involved in another suit

**EMINENT DOMAIN:** Cases in contiguous closely located groups and in common ownership groups which will lend themselves to consolidation for trial shall be deemed related.

**HABEAS CORPUS & CIVIL RIGHTS:** All habeas corpus petitions filed by the same individual shall be deemed related. All pro se Civil Rights actions by the same individual shall be deemed related.

**PART C**

## I. CIVIL CATEGORY (Select the applicable category).

1. ☐ Antitrust and Securities Act Cases
2. ☐ Labor-Management Relations
3. ☐ Habeas corpus
4. ☐ Civil Rights
5. ☐ Patent, Copyright, and Trademark
6. ☐ Eminent Domain
7. ☒ All other federal question cases
8. ☐ All personal and property damage tort cases, including maritime, FELA, Jones Act, Motor vehicle, products liability, assault, defamation, malicious prosecution, and false arrest
9. ☐ Insurance indemnity, contract and other diversity cases.
10. ☐ Government Collection Cases (shall include HEW Student Loans (Education), V A Overpayment, Overpayment of Social Security, Enlistment Overpayment (Army, Navy, etc.), HUD Loans, GAO Loans (Misc. Types), Mortgage Foreclosures, SBA Loans, Civil Penalties and Coal Mine Penalty and Reclamation Fees.)

I certify that to the best of my knowledge the entries on this Case Designation Sheet are true and correct

Date: 12/10/2024/s/ Nicholas Morales

ATTORNEY AT LAW

NOTE: ALL SECTIONS OF BOTH FORMS MUST BE COMPLETED BEFORE CASE CAN BE PROCESSED.

**Attachment A**

Attorney for Plaintiff United States of America

Nicholas Morales  
Environmental Enforcement Section  
U.S. Department of Justice  
P.O. Box 7611  
Washington, D.C. 20044  
Phone: (202) 616-8860  
Fax: (202) 514-8865  
Email: Nicholas.Morales@usdoj.gov

Paul Skirtich  
Assistant United States Attorney  
U.S. Post Office and Courthouse  
700 Grant Street, Suite 4000  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219  
Phone: (412) 894-7418  
Fax: (412) 644-6995  
Email: Paul.Skirtich@usdoj.gov

Attorney for Plaintiff Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Department of Environmental Protection:

Carl D. Ballard  
Assistant Counsel  
Northwest Regional Counsel  
230 Chestnut Street  
Meadville, PA 16335-3407  
Phone: 814-332-6070  
Fax: 814-332-6996  
Email: caballard@pa.gov

Attorney for Defendant PennEnergy Resources, LLC:

Gina Falaschi Buchman  
Babst Calland Attorneys at Law  
505 9th Street NW, Suite 602  
Washington, DC 20004  
Phone: 202-853-3455  
Email: gbuchman@babstcalland.com