Chapter 2. Law Enforcement Recruitment and Training

Introduction

Law enforcement agencies across the country are facing critical challenges in recruiting, retaining, and training officers. These challenges do not discriminate—small, medium, large, local, state, tribal, and federal law enforcement agencies are all affected. One of the most significant challenges facing the field today is sustaining staffing levels. With increased demands to tackle issues like public health, school safety, and housing, the law enforcement field is a challenging work environment, and it is critical for officers to join, stay, and receive proficient training during their tenure.

Law enforcement executives should start with the end in mind: change the recruitment process and position descriptions to gain a dedicated, long-term workforce.¹ Before the recruitment process, executives should determine the characteristics they need in a law enforcement officer. From those characteristics, executives should build profiles of ideal recruits. Using this approach, agencies can target individuals who meet the established criteria and increase the efficiency of recruiting.

Across all agencies, there is a high amount of competitive pressure to keep good officers. Officers will leave for better salaries, benefits, pensions, other perks, or completely leave the profession for various reasons. Therefore, once officers are hired, agencies must protect their personnel investments. Law enforcement officers want to maintain morale and build a sense of commitment to the community, to other officers, and to the agency. For the agency to be successful and for its officers to grow in their profession, agency leadership and line-level officers must maintain strong relationships. Incentive structures and positive organizational climates lead to greater job satisfaction and organizational commitment.² Like in any profession, employees who feel valued are more likely to be committed to staying with their organization and performing their job well.

The quality and nature of the training their staff receives through the duration of their law enforcement career has a direct impact on effectiveness of a law enforcement agency. Of the approximately 650 different training academies and 18,000 local law enforcement agencies in the United States, focus area requirements and mandated training hours vary, leaving knowledge gaps and a lack of standardized skills across the field. Research shows that engaging local labor unions, professional associations, and representative organizations enhances an agency's ability to recruit, retain, and train officers.³

2.1 Recruitment

Background

Many agencies have struggled with a growing number of recruitment problems during the past decade, even as changing economic conditions have led to temporary fluctuations in the number

¹ Lombardo, Regina. Business Meeting Statement. February 26, 2020.

² Espinoza, Fidel. Presentation to Working Group. April 1, 2020.

³ U.S. Department of Justice. 1996. Task Force in Excellence in State and Local Government Study. <u>https://earn.us/pubs/EARN-RJones%20Collective%20Bargaining%20can%20Reduce%20Turnover%20and%20Improve%20Public%20Services%20in%20Colorado.pdf</u>

of recruits.⁴ Law enforcement leaders have concluded changing generational preferences for law enforcement duties, an increasing number of disqualifications (e.g., tattoos, facial hair), and a growing competition from other organizations (e.g., private security, corporations, and other law enforcement agencies) can lead to increased interest in potential candidates.⁵ Recruitment efforts are further complicated by the fragmented approach many agencies take when recruiting. Recruitment strategies should be improved and enhanced to increase the number of people interested in careers in law enforcement.

Current State of the Issue

One of the most important challenges facing the law enforcement field today is sustaining staffing levels. As attrition increases and officers pursue careers elsewhere, the demand for qualified officers exceeds the supply of people who enter the law enforcement profession at the local, state, and federal levels. While the economy grows and other industries flourish, the law enforcement field currently faces its greatest competition with recruitment.⁶ As policing changes and becomes more complex with new types of crimes, an increased demand to manage social problems, and a growth in technology, law enforcement officers must to do more without the expertise or training to adequately confront these new realities.

Recruitment Challenges

Finding the right people to fill open positions generally requires a sound recruitment strategy, even for small agencies. In response to the dynamic set of conditions that affect the labor pool, law enforcement agencies should develop a comprehensive recruitment program based on a written recruitment strategy. Rather than "selecting out" officers based on undesirable background or characteristics, agencies should "select in" officers based on desirable traits.

Law enforcement faces a daunting list of challenges when trying to recruit new employees, including

- competition between agencies
- shift hours, overtime, burnout, and officer well-being
- agency culture
- a negative public perception in some quarters of law enforcement
- policies and procedures that limit the recruitment of women
- policies related to appearance

[CROSS-REFERENCE RESPECT OF LAW ENFORCEMENT]

- policies related to prior drug use
- a lack of a recruitment strategy and branding aimed at new generations that realistically portrays the work of law enforcement
- a lack of partnerships with the communities they serve
- lengthy application processes that use old technology

⁴ Police Executive Research Forum. 2019. The Workforce Crisis, and what Police Agencies are Doing About it. Washington, DC. https://www.policeforum.org/assets/WorkforceCrisis.pdf.

 ⁵ <u>https://sanduskyregister.com/news/21417/beards-tattoos-help-to-humanize-police-officers/</u>
⁶ Ibid.

Diverse workforces have been found to be more effective, creative, and resilient than homogenous workforces, and teams with broader perspectives are better at making decisions and solving problems.⁷ According to data from the U.S. Census Bureau, racial and ethnic minorities accounted for 31 percent of the U.S. population in 2000. By 2010, this number increased to 36 percent, and data suggest that minorities will account for 50 percent of the population by 2045.⁸ These demographic changes highlight the need for internal career paths that support diversity in all ranks.

Additionally, officers should have a strong sense of community, and the communities they serve should feel that their officers are responsive to its needs.⁹ An agency can ensure success, engender trust, and develop good relations within their communities if these efforts are transparent and accountable to their communities and cultures. Law enforcement agencies can support this effort to bridge relationships with their communities by recruiting officers who look like community members and are fluent in multiple languages.¹⁰

Furthermore, law enforcement agencies should bring more women into the field, which could also support efforts to improve police-community relations. Women rely more on communication skills than on force in their policing style.¹¹

Women in Federal Law Enforcement, a membership organization of female federal law enforcement officers, said "in a highly competitive and increasingly fractious world, women possess the kind of critical problem-solving skills that are urgently needed to break down barriers, build understanding, and create the best conditions for law enforcement to effectively address its jurisdictional responsibilities, as well as contribute to the future of law enforcement."¹²

To meet this goal, agencies should improve their recruitment strategies to target women who possess these critical interpersonal communications skillsets. Women apply to law enforcement agencies at a much lower rate than men. Agencies can attract more women applicants if they understand the factors that dissuade women from applying.¹³ To intentionally address deficits in diversity in recruitment, law enforcement agencies must first examine their policies, procedures, culture, and specific barriers that deter and prevent women from applying and entering the field.

Agency Approaches

¹⁰ <u>https://www.lep.gov/sites/lep/files/resources/vera_translating_justice_final.pdf</u>, "Overcoming Language Barriers: Solutions for Law Enforcement"

¹¹ https://www.ncjrs.gov/App/Publications/abstract.aspx?ID=195786,

⁷ Morison, Kevin P. 2017. Hiring for the 21st Century Law Enforcement Officer: Challenges, Opportunities, and Strategies for Success. Washington, DC: Office of Community Oriented Policing Services.

https://cops.usdoj.gov/RIC/ric.php?page=detail&id=COPS-W0831.

⁸ McCullough, Debra R. and Deborah L. Spence, American Policing in 2022: Essays on the Future of a Profession (Washington, DC: Office of Community Oriented Policing Services, 2012).

⁹ International Association of Chiefs of Police. Mobilizing the Community for Minority Recruitment and Selection. Alexandria, VA: IACP, 2003.

[&]quot;Equality Denied: The Status of Women in Policing", 2001, NCWP

 ¹² WIFLE (Women in Federal Law Enforcement). Transforming Law Enforcement by Changing the Face of Policing: 21st Century Policing: Guide to Recruiting, Hiring, Retaining and Promoting Women and Minorities. Arlington, VA: Women in Federal Law Enforcement (WIFLE), 2016. https://docs.wixstatic.com/ugd/39a8e7_9f395ae47c254bdea74ac89574d7307e.pdf.
¹³ Muhlhausen, David B. Ph.D. WOMEN IN POLICING: BREAKING BARRIERS AND BLAZING A PATH. National Institute of Justice. July 2019. https://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/252963.pdf

While recruitment is critical in any law enforcement organization, it is of particular importance in small agencies.¹⁴ A single hire in a smaller agency could have a greater impact than 10 new hires in a larger agency. Although the costs of sound recruiting and screening processes can burden an agency with a smaller budget, this expense should be viewed as a critical, long-term investment. Not only does such an investment meet the community expectations of professionalism, it also saves money by increasing retention. When one employee chooses to leave an agency, costs associated with recurring hiring, training, and equipment increase. In addition, immediate budget shortfalls may occur through unexpected overtime costs to maintain minimal shift coverage.

The law enforcement field attracted previous generations who desired to serve for long periods in excess of 20 to 30 years; however, current recruits are often motivated by professional growth and career development, pay, and benefits. Current recruits are also less likely to remain in the same job for longer periods.¹⁵ Some law enforcement leaders interpret this as a lack of commitment, but others hypothesize that current job seekers change jobs or professions because job security in the same profession is never assured the way it was when previous generations entered the work force.

Recruitment efforts should start in the community, and law enforcement agencies should seek out youth programs to attract younger generations. Explorer programs, internships through local schools, cadet academies, university partnerships, and youth mentorship programs foster special relationships between young adults and departments.¹⁶ Not only do these programs open the door for career development at a young age, they also acquaint law enforcement agencies with a newer perspective of those younger generations, including their work–life preferences, expectations, and career visions, which can help shape an agency's policies and procedures and lead to more informed recruiting strategies.¹⁷

[CROSS REFERENCE RESPECT FOR LAW ENFORCEMENT]

As technology changes, law enforcement must change with it. Old recruitment methods, such as advertising in newspapers and on television, are not the best ways to reach younger generations. Instead, recruitment efforts targeted toward younger generations should account for the social and consumer behaviors of their target recruitment demographic and leverage the most appropriate method, technology, and platforms.

Another recruitment issue stems from the increase in competition among other law enforcement agencies. Many officers move to other jurisdictions for better salaries, benefits, and work–life balance. Additional factors that influence an officer's decision to stay or transfer include shift hours, overtime, burnout, and personal well-being. Agencies should develop a recruitment

https://cops.usdoj.gov/RIC/ric.php?page=detail&id=COPS-W0831.

¹⁷ Wilson, Jeremy M., Erin Dalton, Charles Scheer, and Clifford A. Grammich. Police Recruitment and Retention for the New Millennium - The State of Knowledge. Washington, DC: Office of Community Oriented Policing Services, 2010

¹⁴ U.S. Department of Justice. 2019. Law Enforcement Best Practices: Lessons Learned from the Field. Washington, DC: Office of Community Oriented Policing Services.

¹⁵ Wilson, Jeremy M., Erin Dalton, Charles Scheer, and Clifford A. Grammich. Police Recruitment and Retention for the New Millennium - The State of Knowledge. Washington, DC: Office of Community Oriented Policing Services, 2010

¹⁶ Morison, Kevin P. 2017. Hiring for the 21st Century Law Enforcement Officer: Challenges, Opportunities, and Strategies for Success. Washington, DC: Office of Community Oriented Policing Services.

strategy that highlights the benefits and incentives that officers will receive, which will keep agencies competitive and help drive interest in their job vacancies.

Agencies should also take advantage of the perspective of the labor or representative organization's perspective. These organization can help steer potential recruits to the agency in both a formal and informal role. According to Chief Will Johnson, the local labor organization plays an important role during the pre-hiring process. The union is very involved in a formal role by working to keep the agency competitive in terms of pay, benefits and maintaining the high standards of the agency.¹⁸

2.1.1 Law enforcement agencies should organize a working group of command staff and rank-and-file officers to address recruitment needs within the department. Where appropriate, the working group should also include the leadership of local labor unions or representative organization, civil organizations, and community members.

The working group should begin with the end in mind, meaning that it should consider what the agency looks for in a candidate over the course of an entire career. The working group should use data, including data profiles from its local Equal Employment Opportunity Commission, to determine how the department currently reflects the diversity of the community it serves. The working group should examine barriers to recruitment, such as residency requirements, education, background checks, grooming policies, and physical standards or training and academy requirements that might exclude potential recruits. The working group should assess if those requirements are necessary for a law enforcement officer in the twenty-first century. The working group should also identify the values and characteristics of the ideal recruit for the local community. Values can be complex and should include the voices of officers, the community, and other key stakeholders.¹⁹

Agencies should also take advantage of the perspectives found in the local labor union or community organizations. Some organizations may take an informal or formal role to help steer potential recruits to the agency. According to Chief Will Johnson of the Arlington, Texas, police department, the local labor organization plays a critical role during the pre-hiring process by taking a formal role to keep the agency competitive regarding pay, benefits, and maintaining high agency standards.²⁰

2.1.2 Law enforcement agencies, in partnership with their local labor or representative organization, should redefine the critical characteristics and traits of individuals recruited into the field and ensure job descriptions match those characteristics to better align career aspirations with the work they will be tasked to perform.²¹

The 1967 U.S. President's Commission on Law Enforcement and Administration of Justice (Johnson commission) recommended that all police candidates be tested to determine "moral character" and "emotional fitness."²² The Johnson commission noted that these tests should

¹⁸ Testimony by Chief Will Johnson, Arlington (TX) Police Department, at the Commission Hearing on Recruitment. May 12, 2020.

¹⁹ U.S. Department of Justice. 2019. Law Enforcement Best Practices: Lessons Learned from the Field. Washington, DC: Office of Community Oriented Policing Services. https://cops.usdoj.gov/RIC/ric.php?page=detail&id=COPS-W0875.

²⁰ Arlington, TX field visit

²¹ Working Group Recommendation. February 26, 2020. Business Meeting.

²² U.S. President's Commission on Law Enforcement and Administration of Justice. 1967. The Challenge of Crime in

a Free Society. Washington, DC: U.S. Government Printing Office. <u>https://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/42.pdf</u>

identify and measure personality characteristics. Personality assessments remain the most popular choice for pre-employment psychological evaluations.²³ These assessments of candidate traits serve one of two functions, either "screening in" desirable characteristics or "screening out" undesirable qualities.²⁴ There is a body of research demonstrating the relationship between personality assessments and police performance.²⁵

However, the dominance of personality screening has overlooked the importance of assessing other important "soft skills" in policing.²⁶ "It is important to note that certain skills that are likely necessary to effectively work in law enforcement, such as communication and dispute resolution, are generally not part of pre-employment testing. This speaks to the greater issue that the attributes tested for in current hiring processes do not align well with those needed to effectively practice law enforcement."²⁷ A number of the skills that are not currently screened for in pre-employment were highlighted by during a 2016 joint forum with the Office of Community Oriented Policing Services (COPS Office) and Police Executive Research Forum (see TEXTBOX).

[BEGIN TEXT BOX]

The Department of Justice Office of Community Oriented Policing Services (COPS Office) forum highlighted traits for an ideal recruit²⁸:

- analytical
- a skilled communicator
- streetwise and possessing common sense
- a problem solver

- culturally competent
- a strong advocate for human rights
- well-educated
- compassionate
- a visionary

- a change maker
- adaptable

[END TEXT BOX]

Not only are soft skills essential for policing but so is adequate representation among certain groups, specifically women and Native Americans. Law enforcement should make the profession more desirable for women. According to the Bureau of Labor Statistics, women hold the majority of jobs in the nation's workforce, yet they are not equally represented in state, local,

Century Perspective. Springfield, IL: Charles C. Thomas Publishers.

²⁵ Aamodt, M. (2004). Research in Law Enforcement Selection. Boca Raton, FL: BrownWalker
²⁶ Pittaro, M. (2018). The importance of soft skills for criminal justice professionals.

²³ Weiss, P. & Inwald, R. (2010). A brief history of personality assessment in police

psychology. In P. Weiss (ed). Personality Assessment in Police Psychology: A 21st

²⁴ Detrick, D. and Chibnall, J. (2006). NEO PI-R personality characteristics of high-performing entry-level police officers. *Psychological Services*, *3*(*4*): 274-285.

https://inpublicsafety.com/2018/09/the-importance-of-soft-skills-for-criminal-justice-professionals/

²⁷ Kringen, Anne Li, Ph.D. Associate Professor of Criminal Justice and Assistant Dean Henry C. Lee College of Criminal Justice and Forensic Sciences. Publically submitted testimony. April 30, 2020.

²⁸ Police Executive Research Forum. 2019. The Workforce Crisis, and what Police Agencies are Doing About it. Washington, DC. https://www.policeforum.org/assets/WorkforceCrisis.pdf.

tribal, or federal law enforcement.²⁹ For federal law enforcement, "In 1996, women held about 14 percent of the country's federal law enforcement jobs; today, women represent just 15 percent."³⁰ In 2016, 12 percent of full-time sworn officers in local police departments³¹ and 14 percent in sheriffs' offices³² were female. The current methods to recruit women are not increasing the hiring rate to more accurately represent the population of women in the United States, and "it will be 700 years before women hold half of these jobs."³³ If women's representation in law enforcement does not mirror their proportion of the population, communities may lose trust in law enforcement as a result of the lack of equal representation.³⁴

The Madison, Wisconsin, police department is one of the country's leading agencies and women account for 28 percent of its staff. When asked how the agency achieved that percentage and what steps it is taking to continue to grow the female percentage in the department, Officer Chanda Dolsen said that it stems back to the 1970s when Madison was purposeful in creating a department with a mission of diversity.³⁵ She noted that the mission must be deliberate, purposeful, and have clear objectives. Diversity, combined with transparency in equality, must be part of the department's culture and mission to recruit and retain female officers.

Tribal law enforcement agencies face many of the same issues and problems as small and rural agencies. Most are small, employing fewer than ten sworn officers; are located in nonmetropolitan areas serving jurisdictions with fewer than 20,000 residents; and engage in primary police functions that are similar to those of comparably sized agencies. 36 According to a 2002 census of tribal law enforcement agencies, 165 tribal agencies employ at least one full-time sworn officer with arrest powers: 93 tribal agencies reported being recognized by a state as police officers, and 84 tribes had a cross-deputization agreement with a neighboring non-tribal authority. Tribal law enforcement agencies must assess how to work effectively with smaller staffs, fewer officers, smaller budgets, and often less-formalized organizational structures.

[CROSS-REFERENCE RURAL AND TRIBAL CHAPTER]

It is necessary to strengthen tribal police departments, and especially tribal agencies³⁷. Native officers can (1) improve community support; (2) be valuable mentors to both non-Native officers and new Native officers; and (3) help recruit new candidates from the community, leveraging word of mouth and tribal news sources to announce job opportunities.

²⁹ WIFLE (Women in Federal Law Enforcement). Transforming Law Enforcement by Changing the Face of Policing: 21st Century Policing: Guide to Recruiting, Hiring, Retaining and Promoting Women and Minorities. Arlington, VA: Women in Federal Law Enforcement (WIFLE), 2016.

³⁰ Ripley, Amanda. Federal Law Enforcement Has a Woman Problem. Politico. November 14, 2017. https://www.politico.com/story/2017/11/14/women-federal-law-enforcement-male-dominated-244649

³¹ Hyland, Shelley S. and Davis, Elizabeth. (2019). "Local Police Departments, 2016: Personnel," U.S. Department of Justice. <u>https://www.bjs.gov/content/pub/pdf/lpd16p.pdf</u>

³² Brooks, Connor. (2019). "Sheriffs' Offices, 2016: Personnel," U.S. Department of Justice. <u>https://www.bjs.gov/content/pub/pdf/so16p.pdf</u>

³³ Ibid.

³⁴ Muhlhausen, David B. Ph.D. *Women in Policing: Breaking Barriers and Blazing a Path*, National Institute of Justice July 2019, p. 3.

³⁵ Officer Chanda Dolsen. Madison (WI) Police Department. Presentation to Working Group. 4/30/2020.

³⁶ Wells and Falcone, 2008

³⁷ International Association of Chiefs of Police. 2016. Promising Practices in Tribal Community Policing. Washington, DC: Office of Community Oriented Policing Services. https://cops.usdoj.gov/RIC/ric.php?page=detail&id=COPS-P359.

The commission recommends that pre-employment testing should include assessments of other important soft skills, such as those identified in the textbox, for officer candidates. Additionally, hiring should target specific groups that have been underrepresented in law enforcement, specifically women across all law enforcement agencies and Native Americans' for tribal agencies.

2.1.3 Law enforcement agencies should understand the perspectives of those who are under-represented in the field through open dialogue that informs policies, procedures, operations, and culture in the agency.³⁸

These open dialogues will show communities and potential applicants that their law enforcement agency values transparency, allows for community voice in policies and procedures, and promotes respect both inside and outside of the organization.

In recent years, the Chattanooga, Tennessee, police department had trouble recruiting officers who were African American, so the agency not only prioritized meeting with members of the African American community but also sent postcards to the black community that included messaging about the challenging nature of police work and meaningful career opportunities. Both messages resonated with the black community in a way that previous recruiting strategies had not. The agency reported that through these efforts, there were four times as many African American recruits applying to the agency.³⁹

The Madison, Wisconsin, police department started the #WeAre28Campaign to spotlight the 28 percent of female staff.⁴⁰ The campaign features individual female officers and teams with highlights about their professional careers and personal lives. The agency intends for its message to resonate with and attract females who have never considered a career in law enforcement. The campaign presents three sets of sisters who have sworn positions within the agency, showing a band of sisterhood to counterbalance the notion that law enforcement is a band of brotherhood. See the short video here: <u>https://youtu.be/JBBJVJ1DPHo</u>

Similarly, ATF has a She is ATF recruitment campaign for federal law enforcement. See the short video here: https://cdn2.webdamdb.com/md_2z2enPMvjU22.mp4?1588183046

[BEGIN TEXT BOX]

"The Hispanic American Police Command Officers Association (HAPCOA) believes that the future of law enforcement is one where our law enforcement officers (and the leadership of these agencies) are reflective of the communities that they serve. Officers who are well-trained and knowledgeable of their communit[y's] needs, issues and problems, are more apt to be successful as they are vested in the community that they serve."41

[END TEXT BOX]

2.1.4 Law enforcement agencies should leverage partnerships and relationships with external organizations and other agencies to help build recruitment strategies.⁴²

³⁸ Working Group Recommendation. February 26, 2020. Business Meeting.

³⁹ COPS Office. Recruitment and Retention in Law Enforcement Forum. Reno, NV. December 10, 2019.

⁴⁰ Vang, Lore and Sergeant Meg Hamilton. Information provided to the Recruitment and Training Working Group. April 30, 2020.

⁴¹ The Hispanic American Police Command Officers Association. Publically submitted testimony. April 30, 2020.

⁴² Working Group Recommendation. March 4, 2020. Bi-Weekly Meeting.

Law enforcement agencies must continuously seek and employ creative recruiting methods to maintain healthy staffing levels. Agencies can broaden their applicant pool by reaching out to veteran and non-veteran career fairs, high schools, and university classrooms. Troopers in King County, Washington, actively communicate with the in-state athletic programs, using current employees and former athletes from those programs to increase recruitment and provide job opportunities to recent and future graduates.⁴³ Many local labor and representative organizations have existing relationships with local sports leagues or the Police Athletic League (PAL) program.

[CROSS REFERENCE RESPECT FOR LAW ENFORCEMENT]

Agencies should also participate in small and large-scale community events to spread the word about recruitment efforts. Law enforcement agencies can enhance diversity by specifically targeting their efforts at youth and young adults from underrepresented groups and building partnerships with historically black colleges and universities. Agencies may consider transitional workers, such as cadets who do not yet qualify for the police academy or promising students who have not yet completed educational or age requirements, to serve in a civilian position until they meet the qualifications for a sworn personnel position.

[CROSS REFERENCE JUVENILE JUSTICE CHAPTER]

[BEGIN TEXT BOX]

The Nez Perce Tribe in Idaho collaborated with its tribal police department to create the Indian Youth Explorer's Police Academy (IYEPA). The program stresses the principles of community policing and public service, and encourages teenagers to consider a career in law enforcement by introducing them to police work through a variety of engaging activities.⁴⁴ Topics include tracking, firearms operations, officer safety, building clearing, tactical medical procedures, and court testimony. Drills, swimming, and competitive sports emphasize physical fitness.

[CROSS REFERENCE RURAL AND TRIBAL]

[END TEXT BOX]

2.1.5 Law enforcement agencies should engage the community to increase community trust and enhance the hiring process. Efforts should solicit community input, especially through interviews, and invite community leaders and representatives to participate as panel members during oral board interviews.

By soliciting community input, it allows the community to be invested in the law enforcement agencies and create partnerships with the agency. "An agency's image and reputation, especially within minority communities, is a significant factor with the organization's ability to recruit minority applicants."⁴⁵ To help recruit those applicants, agencies should work with community groups to ensure the hiring process is fair, transparent, and relatable to minority applicants.

⁴³ Batiste, John. Information provided to the Recruitment and Training Working Group. March 23, 2020.

⁴⁴ https://cops.usdoj.gov/html/dispatch/03-2019/raising_tipis_solving_crimes.html

⁴⁵ Dillard, V. Harrison. Civil Rights & Diversity Committee Chairperson. NOBLE New Jersey Chapter. Publically submitted testimony. April 30, 2020.

2.1.6 Law enforcement agencies should include information on officer wellness in their recruitment efforts.⁴⁶

[PULL QUOTE] Officer Nicole Juday of the Indianapolis, Indiana, police department stated at the Commission Hearing on Officer Safety and Wellness, "That by encouraging communication early in an officer's career, it will normalize the long-term sustainability of the officer talking about his or her stress."⁴⁷

By providing information on officer wellness during recruitment, an agency displays that their officers' well-being is at the forefront of its mission. In the Indianapolis, Indiana, police department

"officer wellness is now formally and informally entrenched in every aspect of an officer's career: it begins through introduction to a formally assigned mentor the first week of the academy, continues throughout their career and culminates by walking the officer through the retirement process with someone from the Office of Professional Development and Wellness (OPDW). By marketing officer wellness in recruitment efforts, it informs potential applicants that talking about experiences and feelings is supported in the agency."⁴⁸

[CROSS REFERENCE HEALTH AND WELLNESS]

The Tucson, Arizona, police department had a psychologist on staff who conducted pre-hire evaluations as early as the1980s. This became the Behavioral Sciences Unit (BSU), which engages with new recruits and continues engagement throughout an officer's career. The department psychologist provides a summary overview of pre-employment reports to the training academy staff about a month into the academy and identifies specific areas where recruits need to address weaknesses and strengths. This step aims to maximize the value of the psychological profile and provides opportunities for early interventions to increase the success and retention of recruits.⁴⁹

2.1.7 Law enforcement agencies should develop a comprehensive marketing strategy for recruitment. $^{50}\,$

The marketing strategy should include creating branding; using the agency's mission to create a clear understanding of career satisfaction and advancement; advertising the strengths and benefits of the agency to entice recruits; creating an introduction video from the chief or sheriff that welcomes potential recruits and invites them to learn more about opportunities in the agency; and using testimonials from officers, sergeants, lieutenants, and other positions to describe the equipment, training, and culture. Local labor and representative organizations can

⁴⁶ Working Group Recommendation. February 26, 2020. Business Meeting.

⁴⁷ Testimony by Officer Nicole Juday, Indianapolis (IN) Police Department, at the Commission Hearing on Officer Safety and Wellness. February 27, 2020.

⁴⁸ Testimony by Officer Nicole Juday, Indianapolis (IN) Police Department, at the Commission Hearing on Officer Safety and Wellness. February 27, 2020.

⁴⁹ Copple, Colleen, James Copple, Jessica Drake, Nola Joyce, Mary-Jo Robinson, Sean Smoot, Darrel Stephens, and Roberto Villaseñor. 2019. Law Enforcement Mental Health and Wellness Programs: Eleven Case Studies. Washington, DC: Office of Community Oriented Policing Services. https://cops.usdoj.gov/RIC/Publications/cops-p371-pub.pdf

⁵⁰ Working Group Recommendation. February 26, 2020. Business Meeting.

complement these efforts by demonstrating that new recruits will have a voice at the agency. These organizations give potential recruits assurances that their rights will be protected as employees.

[CROSS-REFERENCE RESPECT FOR LAW ENFORCEMENT]

The Washington State Patrol established a partnership with Virtual Job Shadow to produce and publish realistic job preview videos to be shown in high schools. These videos feature a both commissioned and non-commissioned jobs and focus on diversity using minority and female voices and stories throughout.⁵¹

2.1.8 Law enforcement agencies should create position advertisements on online jobposting websites and employ proactive rather than passive recruiting methods.⁵²

Agencies should use online recruitment websites to increase the visibility of job postings. Agencies should develop accurate job descriptions that can be maintained as staffing requirements change. In addition to the agency's website, agencies should use mainstream and social media to tell their story, advertise recruiting efforts, and report out. Agencies should also create applications that are smartphone friendly.

Additionally, some agencies are using the Interview Now app to recruit applicants, a text-based service that uses artificial intelligence to interact with applicants. In the Washington, DC, Metropolitan Police Department, the app resonates with applicants in younger generations while also reducing recruitment costs.⁵³

Members of the public that visit the New York Police Department (NYPD) career pages have the opportunity to chat with a recruiter from 7:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. on Monday through Friday. Any career or exam questions they have are answered by recruiters in a one-on-one environment.⁵⁴ The NYPD also uses Instagram Live for virtual question-and-answer sessions. These live chats enables questions to be answered immediately and provide for a more connective and personal approach in an online environment.⁵⁵

Many applicants find that the process of applying for law enforcement positions is complicated and lengthy compared to other industries. This means that agencies should maintain regular contact with applicants, mentor applicants throughout the recruiting process, and talk to candidates about the agency's culture, pay, and benefits. It also means that law enforcement personnel should engage with the community, both in-person and virtually, while recruiting. The Colorado State Patrol has quick-response codes on their agency cars that any smartphone can scan. The codes go directly to the agency's recruiting site where potential applicants can talk with a recruiter.

Regarding burnout, the working group discussed the importance of constantly engaging the applicants, especially considering that hiring processes are lengthy. Texting is an ideal way to keep in touch with applicants. Chief Billy Grogan of the Dunwoody, Georgia, police department said that he asked an applicant who received offers from more than one agency why he chose to

⁵¹ Batiste, John. Information provided to the Recruitment and Training Working Group. March 23, 2020.

⁵² Working Group Recommendation. February 26, 2020. Business Meeting.

⁵³ Baldwin, Shannon. Interview with the Washington, D.C. Metropolitan Police Department. March 17, 2020.

⁵⁴ Lombardo, Regina. Information received from NYPD. March 10, 2020.

⁵⁵ Lombardo, Regina. Information received from NYPS. March 10, 2020.

accept the offer from Dunwoody, and the applicant said, "Because your agency kept in touch with me and kept me informed throughout the entire process."⁵⁶

2.1.9 Law enforcement agencies should assure the validity of—and periodically audit—all testing instruments.

[CROSS-REFERENCE DATA AND REPORTING]

Law enforcement agencies should conduct a validation study whenever jobs and job requirements change significantly. They should consult with either police-testing specialists, college- or university-based psychologists, or private professional industrial psychologists regarding test validation. Agencies can minimize errors associated with the subjective interview process by providing a candidate with the specific wording of the questions (structured interview) and putting the interviewer in a position to clarify the meaning of a question when necessary (limited probing questions).

[BEGIN TEXT BOX]

- Agencies should invest in face-to-face interviews that include scenario-based questions.
- Agencies should have candidates go on ride-alongs with officers and involve them in community engagement activities.
- States and individual agencies should adopt physical fitness standards that are job-related and research- and evidence-based.
- Agencies should embrace physical fitness as a priority throughout officers' careers.
- Agencies should check candidates' social media accounts for any indicators or warning signs of explicit bias.

Agencies should advise candidates about the role of the local labor or representative organization and how the organization engages with agency leadership.

[END TEXT BOX]

Law enforcement agencies must assure that each applicant is assessed in a manner that is valid, reliable, fair, and legally defensible.

2.1.10 Law enforcement agencies should offer recruitment and retention incentives.

Recruitment incentives help applicants offset the cost of entering the law enforcement field. A 2019 Police Executive Research Forum (PERF) study analyzed the recruitment incentives for 412 new recruits across the United States. The most common recruitment incentive involved paying a recruit's salary while they attended the academy, followed by offering free training at the academy, a college tuition reimbursement, health and fitness opportunities, or a stipend for fluency in a language other than English. The study also found that offering childcare assistance to a new recruit would better meet the needs of working families.⁵⁷

[BEGIN TEXT BOX]

⁵⁶ Grogan, Billy. Working Group Discussion. March 18, 2020.

⁵⁷ Police Executive Research Forum. 2019. The Workforce Crisis, and what Police Agencies are Doing About it. Washington, DC. https://www.policeforum.org/assets/WorkforceCrisis.pdf.

In the Dunwoody, Georgia, police department, a new hire receives a \$4,000 hiring bonus: \$2,000 at their one-year anniversary and \$2,000 at their two-year anniversary. Additionally, an employee receives a \$1,000 bonus for each referral who is hired. The department also offers a monthly housing stipend of \$700 for employees who live in the city of Dunwoody.⁵⁸

[END TEXT BOX]

2.1.11 Law enforcement agencies should offer recruitment incentives for bilingual and multilingual applicants.

Applicants who fluently speak languages other than English help diversify the agency and may also help the agency better reflect the communities that they serve. By offering an incentive for proficiency in one or more languages beyond English, the agency demonstrates that it values all spoken and non-spoken (i.e., sign language) languages in the communities they serve. Having police officers who speak the common languages of their community helps to avoid unnecessary delays associated with waiting for translators, which is especially important during critical or rapidly incidents. Also, officers can better communicate with our citizens when they share the same language and the message is less likely to be confused.

2.1.12 Law enforcement agencies should develop family support programs.

Examples of family support programs include moving assistance, home locator programs, financial planning, school district information, physician finders, spousal training and support groups, mindfulness retreats, and family CPR training.

[CROSS-REFERENCE HEALTH AND WELLNESS]

The Arlington, Texas, police department hosts a family night during their academy training. During the family night, they share a book about how to care for and live with a police officer.⁵⁹

2.1.13 Law enforcement agencies should redefine their prior drug use policies.⁶⁰

Many agencies are proactively reexamining their policy on prior drug use to remove the number of prior uses as an automatic disqualifier. Instead, agencies should focus on if drugs were used one year prior to hiring and the type of drug, the totality of prior drug use, and potential impacts to the agency after hiring. In light of the recent changes to state and local laws related to cannabis (marijuana) possession and usage, the Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms and Explosives (ATF) has taken a broader view regarding applicant use of cannabis and derivative products to ensure continued employability of a diversified and talented applicant pool.

As United States Attorney Mike Stuart of the Southern District of West Virginia said during his testimony to the President's Commission on Law Enforcement, "In places like West Virginia, an incredibly high percentage of youth make tenable decisions and get involved in drugs. People make mistakes in life. We need to provide opportunities and hope for those who seek a second chance by creating pathways for careers in law enforcement." By redefining prior drug use policies, it allows for those who have made mistakes in their past to be considered for careers in law enforcement.

⁵⁸ Espinoza, Fidel. Presentation to Working Group. April 1, 2020.

⁵⁹ Johnson, Will. Presentation to Working Group. April 15, 2020.

⁶⁰ Working Group Recommendation. February 26, 2020. Business Meeting.

[CROSS-REFERENCE JUVENILE JUSTICE]

The Madison, Wisconsin, police department takes a liberal approach to prior drug use. As Acting Chief Vic Wahl said, "We look at prior drug use on a case-by-case basis."⁶¹ Flags for the agency include self-disclosed use within the past year; the type of drug used; and if the applicant fails to self-disclose but has used. The last flag is significant to the agency for honesty and integrity of applicants and officers.

2.1.14 Law enforcement agencies should redefine their grooming policies.⁶²

Law enforcement agencies should examine policies related to facial hair, nail polish, women's hair (especially policies related to minority women), tattoos, and general appearance. Policies that are overly restrictive or prohibitive reduce the size of the potential applicant pool.

[SIDEBAR] Does it discredit the agency, interfere with essential job functions, or affect officer safety?

The Norfolk, Virginia, police department has changed its marketing policies to convey that it supports diversity in grooming.⁶³

⁶¹ Wahl, Vic. Presentation to Working Group. April 30, 2020.

⁶² Working Group Recommendation. February 26, 2020. Business Meeting.

⁶³ <u>https://www.13newsnow.com/article/news/local/mycity/norfolk/norfolk-police-department-allows-full-beards-tattoos-on-officers/291-84194168-5a24-438e-943b-2751a08d6602</u>

AMAZING CITIES CREATE AMAZING COPS



2.1.15 Law enforcement agencies should create an Employee Referral System.

Research has consistently found that officers who are recruited through employee referral systems are more likely to succeed in the selection process and be retained by the agency. Referred candidates have a more realistic view of the job, having learned about the agency firsthand from an officer. The local labor or representative organization can also be a resource.

2.1.16 Law enforcement agencies should market professional development opportunities for officers.

Professional development attracts applicants who are interested in self-improvement and personal growth.

[CROSS REFERENCE RECRUITMENT AND TRAINING]

2.1.17 Law enforcement agencies should hold one-on-one meetings between new recruits and the chief or sheriff.⁶⁴

⁶⁴ Working Group Recommendation. February 26, 2020. Business Meeting.

Accessible leadership helps officers feel supported, heard, and valued, and also it helps leadership identify problems early in the process. The Arlington, Texas, police department holds weekly brown-bag lunches with new recruits and command staff to show recruits that the culture of the agency is steeped in regular and open communication.⁶⁵ Rank-and-file organizational leaders can provide a "street level" view of the department and inform the candidate about their role in protect their rights and their future at the agency, and informal opportunities are just as important as formal interactions for this exchange.

2.1.18 Law enforcement agencies should annually research other agencies to look for promising practices and adoptable strategies and to ensure their agency is recruiting competitively.⁶⁶

Regularly researching other agencies ensures relevancy and competitiveness in the field. It also allows agencies to learn from each other and ensure salary and benefit packages are comparable.

2.1.19 Law enforcement agencies and local and national law enforcement organizations should create partnerships to share recruitment resources and advice.⁶⁷

[CROSS-REFERENCE RURAL AND TRIBAL]

Creating a collaboration of local, state, federal, and tribal law enforcement agencies with law enforcement organizations allows for peer-to-peer learning (e.g., federal task forces) and practice sharing. Sharing recruitment events across this spectrum draws more potential applicants and can increase recruitment potential.

2.1.20 Law enforcement agencies should ensure that the recruiting messages reflect the reality of police work, emphasizing service rather than excitement or adventure.⁶⁸

For many years, agencies have highlighted fast-paced, adrenaline pumping images in their recruiting videos and flyers. This does not represent the typical day-to-day policing that officers encounter on the job. Also, research indicates that these images do not resonate with the population currently entering the labor market who are more service oriented.⁶⁹

[PULL QUOTE] "Incoming recruits envision high speed chases, hostage rescues, surveillance missions, SWAT units, and apprehending the bad guy; they only see the excitement of the job. As a way to better prepare recruits for the reality of life as a LEO, Florida's law enforcement training re-write will focus on this from day one in the academy. Moving forward, recruits will learn law enforcement is a profession; an occupation requiring extensive education or specialized training, not just a job."⁷⁰

⁶⁵ Johnson, Will. Presentation to Working Group. April 15, 2020.

⁶⁶ Working Group Recommendation. March 4, 2020. Bi-Weekly Meeting.

⁶⁷ Working Group Recommendation. March 4, 2020. Bi-Weekly Meeting.

⁶⁸ Working Group Recommendation. February 26, 2020. Business Meeting.

⁶⁹ Wilson, Jeremy M. "Strategies for Police Recruitment: A Review of Trends, Contemporary Issues, and Existing Approaches." Law Enforcement Executive Forum 14, no. 1 (2014). https://www.semanticscholar.org/paper/Strategies-for-Police-Recruitment-%3A-A-Review-of-%2C-%2C-Wilson/81ac32280f57ce0d08470322a253abaa49c9a6e5.

⁷⁰ Swearingen, Richard L. Commissioner Florida Department of Law Enforcement. Publically submitted testimony. April 30, 2020.

Dwayne Orrick notes, "Even though the individual has the knowledge, skills, and abilities to perform the job, many do not like the work or fit within the agency. Several states have found that at least 25 percent of officers leave their department within the first 18–36 months on the job. Field training officers or supervisors often hear the officer say, 'This job is not what I thought it was.'"⁷¹

2.1.21 Law enforcement agencies should research new and innovative ways to do work instead of relying on what has been done in the past.⁷²

[PULL QUOTE] "It is important for the policing profession to be flexible and open-minded about changes that will help police agencies to serve their communities in new ways, while ensuring that officers feel valued and respected."⁷³ - Police Executive Research Forum

Law enforcement agencies must rethink long-held assumptions about organizational culture and structure to address new staffing and meet community needs.

2.1.22 Law enforcement agencies should use School Resource Officers as a recruitment strategy to create positive outlooks on law enforcement during the course of their daily duties.⁷⁴

[CROSS-REFERENCE JUVENILE JUSTICE]

SRO's should mentor and encourage students to become involved in programs that could lead to law enforcement employment. The National Association of School Resource Officers (NASRO) Triad model for SRO's suggests the responsibilities should focus on three main areas: teacher, counselor, and law enforcement officer.⁷⁵

[PULL QUOTE] "This can also create additional respect for the profession and encourage individuals to pursue the same type of career as their mentor."⁷⁶ - Erik Bourgerie

2.1.23 Law enforcement agencies should reduce the time it takes to apply for and receive an offer from an agency, including the background screening.⁷⁷

With a wide range of applications processes (from six weeks to nine months or longer), law enforcement agencies are losing candidates to other job offers. To curb this recruiting issue, agencies should consider how they can reduce the hiring timeframe, specifically focusing on background screenings. One method is to outsource background screens to the private sector while still maintaining integrity. Lieutenant Colonel Barry Bratt of the Colorado State Patrol said that, "The Colorado State Patrol is looking into privatizing background screenings for all non-sworn personnel to help reduce the backlog, freeing up time for the sworn personnel's' screenings to be processed more efficiently".⁷⁸

⁷¹ Orrick, Dwayne. Best Practice Guide: Recruitment, Retention, and Turnover in Law Enforcement. 2007. International Association of Chiefs of Police.

⁷² Working Group Recommendation. February 26, 2020. Business Meeting.

⁷³ Police Executive Research Forum. 2019. The Workforce Crisis, and what Police Agencies are Doing About it. Washington, DC. https://www.policeforum.org/assets/WorkforceCrisis.pdf.

⁷⁴ Working Group Recommendation. March 24, 2020.

⁷⁵ https://www.nasro.org/main/about-nasro/

⁷⁶ Bourgerie, Erik. Training and Recruitment Working Group Member. March 24, 2020.

⁷⁷ Working Group Recommendation. March 18, 2020. Bi-weekly Meeting.

⁷⁸ Bratt, Barry. Recruitment and Retention Presentation to the Recruitment and Training Working Group. March 18, 2020.

2.1.24 The Department of Justice should create and implement a National Recruitment Program for Law Enforcement.⁷⁹

A National Recruitment Program could be instrumental in identifying the skill sets needed in modern-day policing. It would also help highlight the critical importance of diversity in law enforcement, especially related to women and minorities.⁸⁰

2.1.25 The Department of Justice should implement grant programs that allows for more funding to small agencies in recruiting.⁸¹

Most small agencies do not have the recruitment budget or resources to competitively recruit officers, including registration fees for recruiting events, funds for promotional materials, or the ability to pay academy expenses.

2.1.26 Congress should increase the Office of Community Oriented Policing Services budget annually to allow for the COPS Office Hiring Program in fiscal year 2021 and subsequent years to recruit, hire, and retain officers across the country to fill the officer deficit.⁸²

The COPS Office was established in response to rising violent crime in the 1990s, and evaluations have repeatedly found the hiring program has been successful in reducing crime.⁸³ CHP funding exceeded \$1 billion from 1995 through 1999, but dropped considerably in the 2000s. Less than \$200 million was allocated for the program in 2003 and 2004, and less than \$20 million was allocated in each year from 2005 to 2008. In the wake of the 2008 recession, funding was increased for the CHP and brought back up to \$1 billion.84

A 2007 study by Professors William Evans and Emily Owens found that additional police hired with COPS funding "generated statistically significant reductions in auto thefts, burglaries, robberies, and aggravated assaults."⁸⁵ Additionally, a 2019 study by Steven Mello analyzed CHP funding and found that departments that received COPS grant money saw a 3.2 percent increase in police staffing and a 3.5 percent reduction in crime compared to similar departments that did not receive the grant money.⁸⁶

More police leading to reductions in crime has become a well-established fact.87 In 2002, criminologists from the University of Alabama at Birmingham found that "a 10 percent increase in police levels lowered crime rates by 1.4 percent over time."⁸⁸ A September 2000 evaluation from the Heritage Foundation's Center for Data Analysis sought to measure the actual impact of COPS on the hiring of new officers. From 1993 to 1998, the total number of full-time sworn

⁷⁹ Working Group Recommendation. February 26, 2020. Business Meeting

⁸⁰ WIFLE (Women in Federal Law Enforcement). Transforming Law Enforcement by Changing the Face of Policing: 21st Century Policing: Guide to Recruiting, Hiring, Retaining and Promoting Women and Minorities. Arlington, VA: Women in Federal Law Enforcement (WIFLE), 2016.

⁸¹ Working Group Recommendation. February 26, 2020. Business Meeting.

⁸² Crawford, Josh. Interim Director, Pegasus Institute. Presentation to Working Group. April 29, 2020.

⁸³ Crawford, J. (2020). *The Case for Cops 3.0*. Louisville, Kentucky: Pegasus Institute.

⁸⁴ Mello, S. (2019). More COPS, less crime. *Journal of Public Economics*, 172, 174–200.

⁸⁵ Evans, W. N., & Owens, E. G. (2007). COPS and crime. *Journal of Public Economics*, 91(1-2), 181–201.

⁸⁶ Mello, S. (2019).

⁸⁷ <u>https://www.brookings.edu/research/more-cops/</u>

⁸⁸ Kovandzic, T. V., & Sloan, J. J. (2002). Police levels and crime rates revisited: A county-level analysis from Florida (1980–1998). *Journal of Criminal Justice*, 30(1), 65–76.

police officers in the United States grew from 553,773 to 641,208, an increase of 87,435 officers. Using various growth projections from the past 5, 10, and 19 years, the authors of the Heritage report found that an increase of between 6,231 and 39,617 in new officers could be attributed to the COPS program.⁸⁹

The 2007 study by Professors Evans and Owens found that through 2001, \$5 billion in federal funds had been used to hire around 64,000 new officers.⁹⁰ Adjusting for inflation, "\$5 billion in 1994 would be roughly \$8.71 billion in 2020."⁹¹

2.1.27 The federal government should develop national guidance on a standard for physical abilities testing.⁹²

[CROSS REFERENCE HEALTH AND WELLNESS CHAPTER]

Physical readiness is an important part of the law enforcement profession. All too often, existing physical standards are not reasonably related to actual job performance standards and create an unnecessary hurdle to women applicants. By conducting research and developing job based physical standards which individual agencies can decide to use, or not, the federal government can reduce the use of non-job related subjective physical testing.

2.1.28 Police Officer Standards and Training-type agencies should be considered law enforcement entities under the FBI's Office of General Council.⁹³

Police Officer Standards and Training (POST)-type agencies should receive full criminal history or protection order information when vetting if an applicant for police officer certification is statutorily eligible to become certified. Currently, this is not available to POSTS because they are not recognized as law enforcement entities.

In Colorado, the POST Board is statutorily required to conduct a fingerprint-based criminal history check on all police officer certification applicants. Due to this federal limitation, the POST cannot receive information on previous entry into a deferred judgement and sentence agreement for assault or domestic violence, even though this would disqualify an applicant per their statutes. The same issue applies to protection orders. If a person has an active, valid protection order prohibiting them from possessing firearms, POST agencies cannot see this information and would allow the police officer applicant to attend a law enforcement training academy, where they would be allowed to possess firearms. This applies to current police officers who may have committed an offense in another state that would have resulted in decertification.⁹⁴

2.2 Retention

Background

⁸⁹ Davis, G., Muhlhausen, D. B., Ingram, D., & Rector, R. (2000). *The Facts about Cops: A Performance Overview of the Community Oriented Policing Services Program.* Washington, D.C.: The Heritage Foundation.

⁹⁰ Evans, W. N., & Owens, E. G. (2007).

⁹¹ Crawford, Josh. Interim Director, Pegasus Institute. Statement to Working Group. April 29, 2020.

⁹² Grogan, Billy. Working Group Recommendation. March 27, 2020.

⁹³ Bourgerie, Erik. Working Group Recommendation. April 9, 2020.

⁹⁴ Bourgerie, Erik. Paragraph is a direct quote example. April 9, 2020.

Some turnover in an organization can be a positive to allow the organization and individuals to advance, facilitate change, become more diverse, and reduce poor performance. However, continual voluntary turnover (e.g., people leaving to pursue other careers) can be detrimental to law enforcement agencies. Reducing agency attrition saves money through lowered recruiting and hiring costs and often leads to a more effective and efficient organization. Improving retention can help alleviate the ongoing need to recruit.

Current State of the Issue

A number of items lead to attrition in law enforcement: changing career expectations and job duties, the work environment, competitive salaries, benefit packages, and the focus on employee well-being. People also leave the field because of staff poaching, which often happens when an employee will serve on a task force, work closely with a contract company, or become an expert in a product and then be offered a non-competitive job. Other reasons that negatively impact staffing retention include a lack of organizational transparency or culture, insufficient training or professional development, a frequently changing workforce, and differences between expectations and realities. Often, staff leave because law enforcement agencies lack collective bargaining rights or effective representation in the labor-management relationship, have restrictive policies on grooming and appearance, fail to accommodate family needs, lack diversity, and do not place enough focus on officer safety and wellness.

[CROSS-REFERENCE TO OFFICER HEALTH AND WELLNESS]

Agencies can adopt many initiatives to improve retention or to minimize the detrimental effects of attrition, including planning and analyzing employees' needs, reducing the financial impact of attrition, enhancing compensation and non-traditional incentives, engaging employees in ways to improve the agency, and improving organizational effectiveness through open communication and fair and transparent practices.⁹⁵ Additionally, agencies should analyze who is likely to leave, when, and why.

Agencies that have a thorough understanding of employee needs can better understand why some employees leave, particularly when a reason is not evident.⁹⁶ Agencies must maintain officer morale and build a sense of commitment to the community, to other officers, and to the agency; support strong relationships between agency leadership and line-level officers; and create positive incentive structures and organizational climates that foster greater job satisfaction and organizational commitment. Employees who feel valued are more likely to be committed to stay with the organization and perform their job well instead of seeking employment elsewhere.

2.2.1 Law enforcement executives should conduct an evidence-based analysis of agency retention needs.

Law enforcement agencies should examine data that conveys the reasons people stay and leave to ensure that their work environment and culture facilitate officer retention. Agencies should conduct periodic job satisfaction surveys to identify areas where they risk losing staff due to dissatisfaction. Agencies should develop these satisfaction surveys with input from rank-and-file

⁹⁵ Ibid.

⁹⁶ Wilson, Jeremy M., Erin Dalton, Charles Scheer, and Clifford A. Grammich. Police Recruitment and Retention for the New Millennium - The State of Knowledge. Washington, DC: Office of Community Oriented Policing Services, 2010

officers to increase transparency. They should also regularly communicate what the agency is doing to address those deficiencies.

[CROSS-REFERENCE DATA AND REPORTING]

Law enforcement agencies should also develop "stay" interviews to identify reasons why employees are committed to the agency. Similar to job satisfaction surveys, stay interviews identify what employees value about their agencies plans and provide leadership the opportunity to view the agency from the line officers' points of view. They also help leadership ensure that employees value the core elements of the agency's mission and vision.

2.2.2 Law enforcement agencies should develop a comprehensive onboarding process.⁹⁷

Agencies should develop an onboarding checklist that ensures that new hires spend time in each department of the agency, attend court, and schedule appointments with the command staff and chief or sheriff. Comprehensive onboarding should incorporate both a portal that serves as a repository of information for new hires (e.g., the FBI's New Employees webpage⁹⁸) and inperson support from human resources and mentors. They should also be afforded the opportunity to meet with the leadership of the local labor or representative organization to familiarize them with the role this organization will play in protecting their rights and their future with the agency.

2.2.3 Law enforcement agencies should increase staff engagement in the agency, allowing for both top-down and bottom-up input into policies, procedures, and operations.

Allowing everyone to have a voice in agency policies, procedures, and activities fosters a synergy of ideas and broader discussions. It also demonstrates that respect can be fostered at all levels of the agency. Employees who feel they have a voice in their agency are more satisfied with their job than those who do not feel they have that voice.⁹⁹ Agencies should leverage their relationship with the local labor or representative organization and make it clear to those members the role of their organization is respected and their voice is heard on workplace issues.

2.2.4 Law enforcement agencies should develop formal procedures for exit interviews to identify reasons for leaving.¹⁰⁰

Exit interviews can help identify where an agency's retention efforts fall short.¹⁰¹ Exit interviews are cost effective (i.e., easy to conduct and take little time with minimal investment), obtain honest information delivered without fear of retaliation, and provide insight into the actual work environment. Such insights may include comments on leadership style and ways to improve the agency, and increased future retention once negative practices are corrected.¹⁰²

2.2.5 Law enforcement agencies should offer incentives for professional development and offer time for staff to enhance their knowledge, skills, and abilities.¹⁰³

⁹⁷ Grogan, Billy. Working Group Member Recommendation. 27 March 2020.

⁹⁸ https://www.fbi.gov/about/new-employees

⁹⁹ Rogers, Kristie. "Do Your Employees Feel Respected?" Harvard Business Review. July-August 2018 Issue.

¹⁰⁰ Working Group Recommendation. February 26, 2020. Business Meeting.

¹⁰¹ "Making Exit Interviews Count," Harvard Business Review, April 2016 issue

¹⁰² Four Benefits of Conducting Exit Interviews, Kevin Mason, 7/27/2015, Genesis HR Solutions

¹⁰³ Working Group Recommendation. February 26, 2020. Business Meeting.

Employees feel valued in their organization when the organization offers time for employees to seek professional development opportunities.¹⁰⁴ The agency benefits when it allows employees to become more proficient and increase their promotion potential within the organization. Agencies that encourage professional development retain officers more than agencies that do not.¹⁰⁵ When officers feel that their agency invests in their professional development, they are less likely to look to other agencies that encourage learning and training. Agencies could offer incentives to encourage officers to complete trainings and certifications, including increased pay, bonus pay, or compensatory time. Agencies should consult with their local labor or representative organization to gain their perspective about what types of incentives would be most effective.

[BEGIN TEXT BOX]

The Metropolitan Police Department in Washington, DC, (MPDC) recently expanded its Tuition Reimbursement Program. Those in law enforcement may seek reimbursement of up to \$800 per semester or session for two undergraduate courses or one graduate course at any accredited college or university. The maximum tuition allowed is \$2,400 per academic year, totaling six undergraduate or three graduate courses. While students are responsible for all up-front tuition payments, those who receive a "C" or better are eligible for reimbursement. Classes do not have to be directly related to an employee's present position or a specific promotional opportunity; however, the courses must relate to the mission or a critical function of the MPDC and District of Columbia government.¹⁰⁶

[END TEXT BOX]

2.2.6 Law enforcement agencies should allow for greater variation in work tasks and assignments.

Offering variation allows officers to rotate into different areas and take on new responsibilities at regular intervals, which could benefit their career development. Research indicates that adding variety also reduces job burnout.¹⁰⁷

For small agencies where it might be more difficult to vary work tasks and assignments, officials may consider setting time limits on special assignments and assessing if the person in that position should stay there or rotate to a new position.¹⁰⁸

2.2.7 Law enforcement agencies should establish a mentoring program that extends beyond new hires.¹⁰⁹

Many officers seek mentors within law enforcement agencies to identify avenues for advancement. The lack of a mentoring program may reduce long-term retention of officers, especially the younger generations who thrive on continual growth, strong relationships, and open dialogue.¹¹⁰ When developing a mentoring program, leadership should recognize the

¹⁰⁴ Rogers, Kristie. "Do Your Employees Feel Respected?" Harvard Business Review. July-August 2018 Issue.

¹⁰⁵ https://www.policeforum.org/assets/WorkforceCrisis.pdf

¹⁰⁶ https://becomempd.com/benefits/

¹⁰⁷ Walker, Shawn. "Three Areas of Consideration for Solving Recruitment Challenges" Police Chief Magazine. October 24, 2018. https://www.policechiefmagazine.org/three-areas-of-consideration-recruitment-challenges/

¹⁰⁸ Bourgerie, Erik. Recommendation enhancement. April 1, 2020.

¹⁰⁹ Working Group Recommendation. February 26, 2020. Business Meeting.

¹¹⁰ U.S. Department of Justice. 2019. Law Enforcement Best Practices: Lessons Learned from the Field. Washington,

difference between forced mentoring relationships and the flexibility of allowing mentors to selfidentify potential mentees, as forced mentoring relationships may adversely affect retention efforts.

2.2.8 Law enforcement agencies should institute policies and procedures that allow supervisors to advocate for their staff.¹¹¹

Supervisors should go beyond simply knowing the employees within their agency. They should strive to build a level of trust and respect with their officers. At the Summit County, Colorado, sheriff's office, Sheriff John Minor required at least one member of the command staff to advocate for an employee whenever there are discussions around job performance.

2.2.9 Law enforcement agencies should formalize their promotional process to ensure transparency.

When promotion processes are clear, transparent, and fair, employees are more satisfied with the promotion outcome even if they were not selected.¹¹² This does not mean that confidential information should be shared with staff; instead, the policies, procedures, and expectations of the position should be easily accessible and clearly articulated. Staff feel validated when leadership provides (1) a clear justification for why an applicant was not selected and (2) ways they could enhance their chance of a promotion in the future. The agency builds trust when leadership follows up with unselected candidates, and leadership should clearly communicate ways that these candidates can increase their chances for future promotional opportunities. This emphasizes that the agency cares about the success of its members and encourages positive relationships between line-level staff and supervisors.

2.2.10 Law enforcement agencies should assign new hires to their duty location during the hiring phase instead of at the completion of the academy.¹¹³

Many state and federal law enforcement agencies hire officers for positions across their entire jurisdictions. Placements may be hours or states away from an officer's home base, and retention issues result when applicants pursue positions closer to home.

2.2.11 Law enforcement agencies should examine their salary and benefit packages and incentive programs to ensure that they are competitive in the field.

A recent study by the National Institute on Retirement Security shows that retirement and health benefits are closely tied to job satisfaction. "Cities that have downgraded their pension plans or switched to defined contribution plans have seen qualified, trained officers leave for other jurisdictions who provide defined benefit plans. They also find it harder to recruit new officers to replace those who have left."¹¹⁴ Agencies should consult with their local labor or representative organization for their perspective, both informally and formally through the labor-management process.

DC: Office of Community Oriented Policing Services.

¹¹¹ Working Group Recommendation. February 26, 2020. Business Meeting.

¹¹² International Association of Chiefs of Police, Building Trust between the Police and the Citizens They Serve: An Internal Affairs Promising Practices Guide for Local Law Enforcement (Washington, DC: Office of Community Oriented Policing Services, 2009).

¹¹³ Working Group Recommendation. March 18, 2020. Bi-weekly Meeting.

¹¹⁴ National Association of Police Organizations. Priorities for the President's Commission on Law Enforcement. 10 March 2020.

Agencies should determine the optimal flex-time, shift rotation, and secondary employment authorization options that produce the best work-life balance. Changes in these benefit packages could not only save the agency money, but also affect the longevity of staff retention.

As Ted Hesson notes, "Border patrol agents receive less lucrative overtime pay than other federal law enforcement officers, a common gripe for the National Border Patrol Council, a union that represents 14,000 agents."¹¹⁵ This negatively affects the retention of border patrol agents, as they seek employment at other federal agencies that have better salary and benefit packages.

2.2.12 The Department of Education should reexamine the Student Loan Forgiveness Program.

The Public Service Loan Forgiveness (PSLF) program offers student loan forgiveness options. Law enforcement officers who make 120 on-time payments while working for a qualifying organization can have their debt forgiven; however, only 1.1 percent of people received student loan forgiveness for law enforcement as of June 2019. ¹¹⁶ In addition, life and career changes affect eligibility, and people may not have paid off their student loans by the time they qualify.

PULL QUOTE: "Loan forgiveness should be offered starting on day one of working for a law enforcement agency, and continue for either the length of their career, or for a specified length of time. For example, if you work for a law enforcement agency for the month of January, you don't have to make your January loan payments. When a person leaves employment at a law enforcement agency, they would be required to pay any remaining balance on their loan on the normal monthly installments. – Erik Bourgerie, Colorado POST Director¹¹⁷

2.2.13 The federal government should reestablish an education assistance program for law enforcement.

This program should reimburse state and local law enforcement personnel up to 75 percent of the cost of tuition for undergraduate or graduate course work from any accredited college or university.

2.2.14 States should recognize the right of public safety employees to bargain collectively with their employers.

2.2.15 Congress should enact legislation that encourages States to recognize the right of public safety employees to bargain collectively with their employers.¹¹⁸

According to the National Association of Police Organizations, "History shows that denying workers the right to bargain collectively causes poor morale, the waste of resources, unsafe and inadequate working conditions, and low productivity."¹¹⁹ The Public Safety Employer–

https://www.politico.com/story/2019/02/10/border-patrol-recruitment-crisis-1157171

¹¹⁵ Hesson, Ted. *The Border Patrol's Recruiting Crisis*. Politico February 10, 2019.

¹¹⁶ "The Ultimate Guide to Student Loan Forgiveness for Law Enforcement," <u>Elyssa Kirkham</u>, Lending Tree, November 28, 2019

https://studentloanhero.com/featured/student-loan-forgiveness-law-enforcement-guide/#police

¹¹⁷ Bourgerie, Erik. Working Group Recommendation. March 24, 2020.

 ¹¹⁸ National Association of Police Organizations. Priorities for the President's Commission on Law Enforcement. 10 March 2020.
¹¹⁹ Ibid.

Employee Cooperation Act provides a framework for discussing workplace issues between employers and employees that could effectively retain officers.

[BEGIN TEXT BOX]

Benefits when local governments collectively bargained with their public safety officers include $^{\rm 120}$

- more community services using the same workforce
- increased responsiveness
- greater crime and fire prevention activity
- shared resources and talents for specific needs
- increased coverage to problem areas
- reduced incidents
- better vehicle investments
- better costs for special events
- more equitable pay system
- less confrontational bargaining

[END TEXT BOX]

2.2.16 Congress should enact legislation that supports first responders.

The first responder's relief package should include the Supporting America's First Responders Act, Putting First Responses First Act, and the Public Safety Retirees Healthcare Protection Act.¹²¹ These acts would support retention by allowing personnel to deduct out- of-pocket costs for uniforms, maintenance, and training; making service-connected disability compensation exempt from federal income taxes; and increasing the amount that public safety retirees can withdraw from their pensions tax-free to pay for health insurance premiums.¹²²

2.2.17 Law enforcement agencies should allow staff to work part-time.

Female officers who plan to give birth and adopting parents especially appreciate the flexibility that part-time work offers.¹²³ Law enforcement agencies with short- and long-term part-time work policies increase the likelihood that officers who need to care for young or aging family members retain their positions. Often, these officers revert to full-time work within the agency after the need for part-time work is complete. Pregnancy should stop being treated as a problem. Many policies support work-life balance, and having children is often part of that formula.

[PULL QUOTE] "It is an obvious benefit to society as a whole for police officers to be parents, which undoubtedly make them better police officers as well." – Karen J. Kruger¹²⁴

¹²⁰ <u>https://digitalcommons.ilr.cornell.edu/key_workplace/252/</u>, (Page 36 of the report)

 ¹²¹ National Association of Police Organizations. Priorities for the President's Commission on Law Enforcement. 10 March 2020.
¹²² Ibid.

¹²³ Ibid.

¹²⁴ Work, Family & Equality LAW 889-001, Spring 2006 "Pregnancy & Policing: Are They Compatible? Karen J. Kruger

2.2.18 Law enforcement agencies should offer non-traditional benefits.¹²⁵

Non-traditional benefits could be monetary: reimbursement for gym memberships, massages, or meal services. They could also be non-monetary: casual dress days or no-shave November. Non-traditional benefits could also be a combination of the two: on-site dry cleaners, a recreation or game room, or a meditation room.

Non-traditional benefits bolster morale and contribute to a positive organizational culture when law enforcement agencies apply them fairly and transparently across the organization. They can also be a cost-effective way to show staff that they are valued. Agencies may also be able to leverage or promote existing benefits offered by the local labor or representative organization.

2.2.19 Law enforcement agencies should extend traditional and non-traditional benefits to the families of their officers.

Law enforcement agencies create a holistic approach to valuing employees when they include their families. Examples of these traditional and non-traditional benefits include stipends for child care, lists to local physicians and health care facilities, family support groups, home relocation services, family training in emergency procedures, opportunities for family members to connect with leadership, family luncheons, holiday events, sporting events, and service awards for family members who volunteer and serve in the community. Agencies may also be able to leverage or promote existing benefits offered by the local labor or representative organization.

2.2.20 Law enforcement agencies should create a strong dedication to officer safety and wellness and promote that dedication throughout the agency.¹²⁶

[CROSS-REFERENCE HEALTH AND WELLNESS]

[PULL QUOTE] "We need to protect the people who protect us. We need to encourage the mentality to reach out for assistance, and it is our responsibility for providing that service and assistance."¹²⁷

Officers and their families need to know that law enforcement agencies prioritize their safety and well-being, and these needs greatly affect retention. Across the nation, officers are leaving agencies that do not embed policies, programs, and initiatives that promote safety and wellness for agencies that do. First responders are five times more likely to experience post-traumatic stress disorder and depression than civilians,¹²⁸ and the rate of suicide among officers is 54 percent higher than the rate for the general public.¹²⁹

Law enforcement personnel have begun to weigh these statistics when determining their career path. After an internal study to assess stress experienced by law enforcement officers, the Bend, Oregon, police department implemented a more family-friendly schedule, hired an in-house psychologist, allowed officers more input on vehicle design and purchases, and incorporated the following: on-duty workout teams, on-duty yoga, mental and physical health surveys, on-duty

¹²⁵ Working Group Recommendation. February 26, 2020. Business Meeting.

¹²⁶ Commission Hearing on Officer Safety and Wellness. February 27, 2020.

¹²⁷ Opening Remarks from the Commissioners. February 27, 2020.

¹²⁸ Testimony by Stephanie Samuels, Founder of COPLINE, at the Commission Hearing on Officer Safety and Wellness. February 27, 2020.

¹²⁹ Testimony by Master Sergeant Corey Nooner, Oklahoma City (OK) Police Department, at the Commission Hearing on Officer Safety and Wellness. February 27, 2020.

mindfulness programs, financial planning services, spousal support programs, spousal and family training, mindfulness retreats, and on-duty restorative rest rooms.¹³⁰

[BEGIN TEXT BOX]

The Bend, Oregon, police department conducted a study to examine wellness stresses their officers face.

Top five physical health stress responses associated with department operations:

- 54% Fatigue
- 50% -Trying to stay fit
- 48% -Shift work
- 47% -Lack of family time
- 46% -Nutrition issues

Top five mental health stress responses associated with department operations:

- 22% -Irrational, angry, or aggressive behavior
- 23% -Repeated disturbing and unwanted memories
- 31% -Feeling cut off or distant
- 35% -Hyper alertness
- 38% -Trouble falling asleep

Officer mental health screening:

- 4 in 45 participants had contemplated suicide while employed by the police department
- 1 in 45 participants had attempted suicide

[END TEXT BOX]

2.3 Training

Background

The quality, regularity, and consistency of training opportunities prominently influence the effectiveness of everyday police work. There are approximately 650 different training academies and 18,000 local law enforcement agencies in the United States, and they lack consistent, nationwide training standards.¹³¹

Some—but not all—agencies require training in de-escalation, infuse officer wellness components into training, and ensure adult learning principles complement tactical skills. Some also allow officers to "try out" the profession or shadow another officer for up to a year and begin policing without prior attendance at an academy.

¹³⁰ Jim Porter. COPS Office. Recruitment and Retention in Law Enforcement Forum Presentation. Reno, NV. December 10, 2019.

¹³¹ <u>https://www.bjs.gov/index.cfm?ty=tp&tid=77</u>

The number of required training hours varies; some agencies have no annual training requirements, while others require 100 hours or more. States also have different requirements to maintain POST certification. Some states have no annual requirement, some have annual requirements, and others have bi-annual requirements. According to a survey completed by IADLEST in 2015, this ranged from no annual in-service training requirement in New York, Rhode Island, Montana and Alaska, to 40 hours annually in Utah, Tennessee, Massachusetts, Kentucky, and Kansas.¹³²

The varied education levels of officers who enter the agency further complicate the issue. Some agencies require a high school education, some require a number of continuing education credits, and others require an associate's degree or a bachelor's degree. The wide-ranging inconsistencies across the county can be a point of confusion and contention in law enforcement.

Current State of the Issue

The quality, regularity, and consistency of training opportunities directly relate to officer retention. Many officers want professional development throughout their careers to advance in the field and stay relevant in their knowledge, skills, and abilities. Within their first three years in the profession, many officers struggle with the mixed messaging between training academies and the agencies that employ them.¹³³ Other officers pursue another agency with training opportunities that more closely align with the officer's goals, motivations, well-being, and career aspirations. Many law enforcement agencies are losing officers because of the lack of consistency in training. This loss equates to an increase in recruitment costs and an organizational budget loss stemming from the money spent to recruit, hire, and train those officers leaving the agency.

Giving command, rank-and-file, and other staff the opportunity to participate in professional development enhances the quality of the employees and the organization. According to the Law Enforcement Bulletin, law enforcement officers need to stay aware of the latest crime trends; maintain proficiency in the use of tools, weaponry, and tactics; and become familiar with more advanced topics during their tenure. Officers must also learn the lessons left behind by fallen officers while performing the same duties.

The responsibility for growth rests on the individual, not the department, and officers must take charge of their development. With support from their supervisors, officers should create a plan with short- and long-term goals, then identify and pursue training opportunities to meet their professional needs.

A number of departments would like to attract and retain officers who have superior communications skills and higher education. Given the range of people who officers encounter in their communities, it is vitally important for officers to communicate effectively, exhibit compassion, and understand and accept people of different ethnicities and cultures.

2.3.1 Law enforcement agencies and academies should develop training that is researchand evidence-based.¹³⁴

¹³² CITATION NEEDED

¹³³ Working Group Discussion. March 18, 2020.

¹³⁴ Working Group Recommendation. February 26, 2020. Business Meeting.

Agencies must incorporate evidence-based training that focuses on successful instructional methodologies. Successful training programs usually evolve from four steps:

- 1. establish training objectives
- 2. conduct a baseline (i.e., pre-test) to determine basic comprehension prior to training
- 3. conduct a post-assessment to gauge the level of learning that occurred during training
- 4. transition to practical application in the field

Instructors must continually evaluate their teaching strategies to ensure they are meeting their students' needs and maximizing learning.

[PULL QUOTE] "It is important to develop training that is research and data-based. Trainings backed by evidence add transparency, which encourages buy-in and compliance, and are easier to track for accountability/reporting and impact. Money, resources, and personnel must be justified to support reinvestment or expansion requests. Therefore, agencies should be able to show that training has an impact and to what degree. Data-based training also can help to motivate better work, can help with community outreach, and will provide continuous quality improvements necessary to keep ensuring that efforts matter."135 – Didi Nelson. Law Enforcement Coordinator and Special Assistant for Intergovernmental Affairs, U.S. Attorney's Office, Northern District of Georgia

All too often, the training conducted by law enforcement agencies and training academies is taught through lectures and does not include strategies to apply the knowledge being presented. The law enforcement field inherently requires that its staff possess the necessary critical thinking skills, the ability to have successful interpersonal interactions, and the capability of making sound decisions while under stress. While lecture-based instruction may be appropriate for certain topic areas, it does not address or increase these vital skills for law enforcement officers.

Transitioning from lecture-based to discussion-based instruction helps to increase critical thinking skills, as does problem-based learning. Scenario-based learning allows students to experience different situations in a safe, controlled training environment, where making a mistake will not be deadly. This type of training allows students to gain firsthand situational experience and allows the instructor to provide immediate feedback, which can increase student confidence and result in better field performance. If scenario-based training is conducted in a high-stress environment, it can also provide stress inoculation that allows for better self-regulation in a high-stress environment and better decision making under stress.¹³⁶ Law enforcement agencies and academies should continue to find advances in research- and evidence-based adult learning practices to keep law enforcement training current and relevant.

2.3.2 Law enforcement agencies should develop an advisory committee that includes rankand-file officers as well as representatives from the local labor or representative organization, and community members to inform an agency's training needs.¹³⁷

¹³⁵ Nelson, Didi. Law Enforcement Coordinator and Special Assistant for Intergovernmental Affairs, US Attorney's Office Northern District of Georgia.

¹³⁶ Dave Grossman, On Combat

¹³⁷ Mike Becar, Executive Director of IADLEST. Interview with Melissa Bradley, Commission Federal Program Manager. 6 February 2020.

The advisory committee helps ensure that the training requirements meet the needs of the agency and the community it serves. The committee should research national training trends and policies that should be included in the training plan. Advisory committees benefit from including community members, as they may illuminate potential blind spots regarding what an agency does well and what it should improve.

[CROSS-REFERENCE RESPECT FOR LAW ENFORCEMENT]

[BEGIN TEXT BOX]

The Arlington, Texas, police department has a training advisory board that consists of citizens and law enforcement personnel. The advisory board determined that officers must have 24 hours of annual discretionary training to meet the needs of the agency and the community. The agency also requires that an officer must have an additional 16 hours of annual training to meet standard law enforcement, legal, and ethical requirements.

[END TEXT BOX]

2.3.3 Law enforcement agencies should train their officers on the history of their jurisdiction.

Officers must understand the communities they serve and the role the agency plays in that history. In addition, officers should understand the history of law enforcement. Understanding the history of law enforcement, and that of the agency, can help connect the new officer with the profession as a whole, increase morale, identify traditions and create a dedication to a mission larger than "self". By educating officers on previous missteps, new officers better understand the importance of their relationship with the community they serve.

[BEGIN TEXT BOX]

The Rapid City, South Dakota, police department partners with the Center for American Indian Research and Native Americans to train their staff in their local history that highlights both the trauma of community members and the historical and current roles of law enforcement in their community.

[END TEXT BOX]

2.3.4 The Department of Justice should work with The International Association of Directors of Law Enforcement Standards and Training, The International Association of Chiefs of Police, the National Fraternal Order of Police, and the National Sheriffs' Association to develop national standards for online and in-person courses that have clear guidance, objectives, and goals.¹³⁸

At a minimum, national standards for in-person courses should include

- scope statement
- course overview
- course purpose
- central course topics

- terminal learning objectives
- established learning objectives
- course duration
- target audience

¹³⁸ Working Group Recommendation. February 26, 2020. Business Meeting.

- eligibility requirements
- instructor-to-participant ratio
- number of instructors
- instructional delivery method
- prerequisites
- adult learning strategies and principles
- procedural notes that specify teaching strategies
- practical exercises
- instruction preparation

- identified time for self-reflection
- evaluation strategy
- course progression
- modules
- references
- audio/visual support materials
- instructor guide
- presentation slides
- participant guide
- course certificates

National standards allow for a common process to develop law enforcement training. They help manage quality control through a series of requirements and checkpoints, and they also establish clear outcome expectations of in-person training initiatives. National standards ensure that courses are current, relevant, and applicable and have comprehensive instructor and facilitator guides, methodologies, and tools. National standards also help prepare law enforcement courses for accreditation through national law enforcement training accreditation programs. "Agencies must show that they are utilizing best practices set forth by subject matter experts. Departments do not want to show a pattern of practice of negligent training or policies."¹³⁹

At a minimum, national standards for online courses should include

- scope statement
- course overview
- course purpose
- central course topics
- terminal learning objectives
- established learning objectives
- course duration
- target audience
- eligibility requirements
- prerequisites
- course materials that cannot be skipped

- introductory instructions
- logical and consistent interface design and navigation features
- interactive courses with various mediums of information sharing
- clear directions on how to proceed through the course
- help features throughout the course that are specific to the training materials
- the ability to save, exit, and start working where the participant left off
- well-organized, clearly readable text and visual layout

¹³⁹ Gleason, Bill. Sargent. Prince George's County Maryland Police Department. Working Group Presentation. April 29, 2020.

- course materials accessible using Internet Explorer, Chrome, Safari, and Firefox
- pre-course assessment
- final course exam
- feedback on incorrect answers

- course certificates
- presentations using realistic scenarios
- course storyboards prior to developing an online course
- references

2.3.5 The Department of Justice should work with The International Association of Directors of Law Enforcement Standards and Training, The International Association of Chiefs of Police, the national Fraternal Order of Police and the National Sheriffs' Association to develop national standards to require subject matter experts to peer review and pilot courses prior to delivering courses.¹⁴⁰

Including subject matter experts in the course development allows the course to be vetted for content and applicability to the law enforcement field. National standards should guide implementation efforts to ensure courses are relevant, comparable on a national level, and free from discriminatory language and actions. Subject matter experts both within and outside of ATF review ATF's training courses to ensure the courses are evidence-based, relatable to the field, and include the most up to date promising and best practices.¹⁴¹ Sheriff Michael J. Bouchard of Oakland County notes, "The incorporation of SME's in the development and review of training course should be a standard practice. It reduces liability."142

2.3.6 The Department of Justice should develop a national minimum standard for annual training hours.¹⁴³

While this is a matter for each state to determine, a national minimum standard for training would provide a baseline of education for law enforcement officers nationwide. Agencies could require additional hours beyond the minimum standard; however, all officers would be required to meet the minimum requirements, ensuing that officers across the nation have the same threshold to maintain their professional knowledge, skills, and abilities.

2.3.7 The International Association of Directors of Law Enforcement Standards and Training, with funding from the Department of Justice, should develop a national model for academy training hours based on best and promising practices. This national model would be used by law enforcement training academies or POST organizations nationally.¹⁴⁴

[LINK TO HEALTH AND WELLNESS CHAPTER]

Training hours for law enforcement academies vary depending on the state, and they can be significantly lower than other industry academy hours. A national model based on best practices that determines the ideal number of instructional hours on specific topic areas could guide

¹⁴⁰ Mike Becar, Executive Director of IADLEST. Interview with Melissa Bradley, Commission Federal Program Manager. 6 February 2020.

¹⁴¹ Forcelli Peter J., Deputy Assistant Director, Training & Professional Development, ATF. April 29, 2020.

¹⁴² Bouchard, Michael J., C.H.P.P. Sheriff Oakland County. President Emeritus, Major County Sheriffs of America. May 5, 2020.

¹⁴³ Working Group Recommendation. February 26, 2020. Business Meeting.

¹⁴⁴ Working Group Recommendation. February 26, 2020. Business Meeting

academy instruction and delivery. While these standards would not mandate a specific number of hours to be taught, it would create a universal metric of comparison.

[PULL QUOTE] "In Colorado, one must have a minimum of 1,500 hours of instruction to become a licensed cosmetologist. In contrast, police officer certification only requires a minimum of 556 hours of training to enter into the only profession in the criminal justice system that has the authority to make split-second life or death decisions. Even those states with this highest minimum requirements, about 1,000 hours, still far less than a cosmetologist." – Erik Bourgerie

2.3.8 The Department of Justice should require all officers must go to an academy before being allowed to patrol.¹⁴⁵

Some states allow police officers to work in the field for up to one year (and sometimes longer with a waiver) before attending a basic law enforcement training academy.¹⁴⁶ This practice is more often found in rural states where law enforcement leadership believes the practice assists with recruitment and prevents wasting resources on a person who enters an academy but does not remain in the profession after graduation. It also helps mitigate delays caused by waitlists at the academy. One POST director for a state with this allowance stated that recruits at their academy whom had worked patrol for the year prior often commented that they discovered actions they had taken in the field were not allowable.

[PULL QUOTE] "Well-trained officers equate to better cases and safer communities. And by 'better cases,' I refer to investigative means that protects the constitutional rights of citizens while achieving the ends of incapacitating a culpable violent offender, predator, or thief so as to prevent new victims. Communities expect sworn law enforcement officers to make split second decisions with long lasting consequences, often when their own lives and livelihoods hang in the balance. We dishonor the badges of lawmen and women when we send them to protect us without not only adequate training but the most practical yet data-informed training that money can buy."¹⁴⁷

2.3.9 Law enforcement agencies and academies should develop and require training that is substantial and impactful for the beginning and during employment.¹⁴⁸

Proper training is essential for any policing strategy to be successful. Officers who lack training or who receive poor training will perform poorly in the field. Training must be meaningful, current and ongoing. An officer's training should not end at the academy; instead, it should be a regular part of every officer's professional life. Officers need to be trained to effectively interact with the public, which includes using de-escalation and interviewing strategies. Officers also need to be trained in the use of force continuum, new technology, basic tactics, driving, and firearms.

[PULL QUOTE] "The amount of time available to the training of law enforcement officers varies by state, by county, and by agency. Therefore, law enforcement training should be

¹⁴⁵ Working Group Recommendation. February 26, 2020. Business Meeting.

¹⁴⁶ CITATION NEEDED

¹⁴⁷ U.S. Attorney for the Western District of Kentucky Russell Coleman. Working Group Statement. May 5, 2020.

¹⁴⁸ Working Group Recommendation. February 26, 2020. Business Meeting.

substantial and impactful, and not just provided to check the box. Training should be developed to allow officers to use what was learned and to see it work in their day-to-day operations. This will help officers to develop skills to meet and respond to typical situations and issues they encounter in the field. It will better prepare them to deal with the real world challenges they face, which in turn will allow officers to better serve their communities."149 - Didi Nelson, Law Enforcement Coordinator and Special Assistant for Intergovernmental Affairs, US Attorney's Office Northern District of Georgia

[CROSS-REFERENCE TECHNOLOGY]

Law enforcement leaders should leverage what training works, what training needs to be improved, and what training hinders the public safety mission. The local labor or representative organization should be included in this training strategy. This labor-management partnership will result in better policing, better relationships with the community, and the improved safety of both the officers and the community. Training programs should offer an opportunity for transparency and allow the public to see what officers are taught to do while in the field.

[CROSS-REFERENCE RESPECT FOR LAW ENFORCEMENT]

2.3.10 Law enforcement agencies and academies should use different instructional delivery methods for training based on the subject matter.¹⁵⁰

Not every training course requires the same approach. Teaching statute or ordinance may require an instructor to assign online homework to gain fundamental knowledge, then use classroom time to facilitate a more in-depth discussion to help increase understanding and provide context. A more complex course, such as domestic violence response and investigation, may incorporate actors to train the officer how to compassionately respond to victims of domestic violence. The ability to duplicate real life as much as possible, with the added ability to escalate or de-escalate the situation based on the actions of the officer, creates a learning-rich environment that provides immediate feedback and better prepares officers for the situations they will encounter in the field.¹⁵¹

[CROSS REFERENCE VICTIM SERVICES]

ATF uses a number of different methods to deliver training to their employees. ATF is mindful of the principles of adult learning and makes sure that it factors this into curriculum development. Some courses that were once delivered in-person are now often delivered online. Courses that require students to be more engaged or to perform functions manually to achieve comprehension are delivered in person.¹⁵² Commissioner Lombardo, "Being a federal law enforcement organization with a nationwide footprint, we are mindful of the importance of networking, both to establish trust across a large, spread-out organizations; and so that our employees can see first-hand, regional differences in how criminal organizations operate and in how our federal, state and local partners approach reducing crime."¹⁵³

¹⁴⁹ Nelson, Didi. Didi Nelson, Law Enforcement Coordinator and Special Assistant for Intergovernmental Affairs, US Attorney's Office Northern District of Georgia.

¹⁵⁰ Working Group Recommendation. February 26, 2020. Business Meeting.

¹⁵¹ Lt. Col. (Ret) Dave Grossman, On Combat, Sec III, Chapter Two, "Stress Inoculation and Fear" pg 132-137.

¹⁵² Forcelli Peter J., Deputy Assistant Director, Training & Professional Development, ATF. April 29, 2020.

¹⁵³ Lombardo, Regina. Business Meeting Statement. February 26, 2020

The Idaho POST strongly believes that scenario-based, practical exercises provide both the best reinforcement to classroom concepts and maximum training retention. The POST constantly reviews their curriculum to determine how different training methods can be used. Currently, they have integrated 64 hours of scenario based training into basic training topics.¹⁵⁴

2.3.11 Law enforcement academies should incorporate adult learning strategies and problem-based learning processes into the tactical skills portion of the academy.

Adult learning strategies convey that instructional decisions and practice must be focused on the needs and experience of the student.¹⁵⁵ Most retention takes place at the beginning and end of the learning session.

The Idaho POST follows Malcom Knowles principles to ensure their training is based on adult learning principles.¹⁵⁶ Specifically, the Idaho POST focuses in on Knowles' theory of andragogy, which emphasizes that adults are self-directed and take responsibility for their decisions. As Director Brad Johnson of the Idaho POST states,

"Andragogy makes the following assumptions about the design of learning:

- 1. Adults need to know why they need to learn something.
- 2. Adults need to learn experientially.
- 3. Adults approach learning as problem-solving.
- 4. Adults learn best when the topic is of immediate value.
- 5. The students are motivated to learn."¹⁵⁷

Like many students, adults have a strong need for periodic feedback, encouragement, and learning in an atmosphere where there is a high degree of safety, mutual commitment, and choice.¹⁵⁸ Adults need a good balance between tight, well-paced, and content-oriented presentations and the time needed for learning integration. They also need to know why they should learn something. One of the first tasks of the adult educator is to develop the "need to know" by explaining the value of their learning and its application to their career.

Adults have a greater volume and different quality of experience than younger learners. Each adult learner brings a wealth of positive and negative experiences with them to class; adults define themselves based on their unique experiences. Experiential learning techniques, including discussion methods, simulation exercises, and problem-solving exercises that tap into the accumulated knowledge and skills of the learners, provide the learners a frame of reference that helps them learn through analysis.¹⁵⁹

¹⁵⁴ Johnson, Brad. Director, Idaho POST. Presentation to Working Group. April 29, 2020

¹⁵⁵ Knowles, M. (1975). Self-Directed Learning. Chicago: Follet.

¹⁵⁶ Johnson, Brad. Director, Idaho POST. Presentation to Working Group. April 29, 2020

¹⁵⁷ Johnson, Brad. Director, Idaho POST. Presentation to Working Group. April 29, 2020

¹⁵⁸ Knowles, M. (1975). Self-Directed Learning. Chicago: Follet.

¹⁵⁹ Knowles, M. (1984). The Adult Learner: A Neglected Species (3rd Ed.). Houston: Gulf Publishing.

2.3.12 Law enforcement agencies should incorporate training modules that develop and reinforce oral and written communication skills for officers.¹⁶⁰

[PULL QUOTE] "The most important aspect of policing in the United States is the ability to communicate effectively whether with victims, witnesses, community members, stakeholders, and suspects. Every police function fundamentally relies upon communication skills. Without competent communication skills, which can welcome participation, the police cannot serve their most basic functions. Effective communication yields accurate information, reduces errors, and garners the trust and support of the community." - George Cronin and Marissa Bluestine¹⁶¹

Police departments should recruit officers who are capable of responding to a dangerous incident, but who also have the problem-solving and communication skills required to diffuse a situation and gain compliance. Academies should teach problem-solving and oral and written communication skills.

[BEGIN TEXT BOX]

The Washington State Patrol provides bias training starting at the cadet level, so they are aware that everyone has biases and learn how to communicate through those biases. Cadets receive training on the history of the agency and rules and regulations, which helps them understand the culture and professionalism that leadership expects from personnel. Throughout their cadet training, they learn how to perform their duties as they interact with people on a daily basis.

Their training is not limited to the classroom environment. It also includes practical exercises in a controlled environment to become proficient in their communication skills, control tactics, violator stops, collision investigations, and understanding of laws and case laws. These exercises provide the cadets the opportunity to not only demonstrate their proficiency, but also expose them to different scenarios where the agency can observe their responses and interactions, thereby identifying and addressing potential concerns in a controlled environment prior to the cadets being commissioned. Throughout the agency, the Washington State Patrol trains its personnel to professionally interact with people to appropriately resolve or address situations through communication.¹⁶²

[END TEXT BOX]

2.3.13 Law enforcement agencies should provide individual training funds to all employees to encourage profession development beyond the agency's required training hours.

ATF partners with a number of programs and universities to assist ATF personnel who possess a bachelor's degree from an accredited university who wish to achieve a master's degree. Examples include a master's degree in strategic studies from the U.S. Army War College, a master's degree program at the National Defense Intelligence University, and a master's degree in safety, security, and leadership studies from George Washington University. These programs are covered in full by ATF, and the policy mandates that any employee who attends a training course that consists of over 80 hours of study must sign a Continued Service Agreement for three years. This ensures that the cost of the training will benefit both ATF and the employee.

¹⁶⁰ Cronin, George and Marissa Bluestine. The Quattrone Center for the Fair Administration of Justice. Public Submitted Testimony.

¹⁶¹ Ibid.

¹⁶² Batiste, John. Working Group Statement. March 24, 2020.

For all its employees, ATF has a number of available courses that are focused on meeting career development needs, most of which are managed by the Leadership and Professional Development Division. These courses allow employees to take in-person and online training related to leadership and personal development beyond the mandatory required training hours. There are no charges for these courses, but supervisors should approve the use of official time to attend.

2.3.14 Agencies should move away from "stress-based" academies that model a militaristic approach to training and incorporate methods that align with a guardian mindset.

[PULL QUOTE] "The warrior concept is associated with the idea of militarizing policing and is consistent with the traditional view of police work—to search, chase and capture. However, the newer concept of guardian policing emphasizes social service, valuing community partnerships and establishing positive contacts." – Kyle McLean¹⁶³

Many academies model military training strategies where recruits march in line and training officers act as drill sergeants. Police cadets are not soldiers going into battle. While they should be trained to seek and pursue violators and armed with both tools and training to subdue violence, those skills are not the only ones necessary to police a community.

More focus should be on treating all individuals with human dignity and respect, including those who break the law. Training academies should incorporate scenario-based training that uses role-players to emphasize de-escalation skills through human influence. Academies should also be teaching officers to incorporate empathy into their interactions, which can lead to a positive outcome and minimize the propensity for violence.

This training method often claim that it is too "soft," yet these skills (combined with tactical proficiency) reduce the amount of violent incidents.

The Bureau of Justice Statistics conducted a study of academies with a predominantly stressbased military model (e.g., paramilitary drills, intensive physical demands, and public disciplinary measures), female recruits had a 68 percent completion rate compared to 81 percent for male recruits.¹⁶⁴ In academies with a predominantly non-stress model (e.g., emphasizes academic achievement, physical training, and a supportive instructor-trainee relationship), female and male recruits both had a completion rate of 89 percent.¹⁶⁵

PULL QUOTE: "Policing is as much of an art as it is a science. That means using all the tools given to you (including your human influence) to achieve the best possible outcome. Identifying and predicting human behavior patterns and choosing a course of action within the confines of the United States Constitution is not easy. It's the opposite of easy. But you do it with excellence every day." – Kristen Ziman¹⁶⁶

¹⁶³ Kyle McLean, Florida State University. (2019, February 26). Data-driven evidence on warrior vs. guardian policing. *ScienceDaily*. Retrieved April 30, 2020 from www.sciencedaily.com/releases/2019/02/190226155011.htm

¹⁶⁴ <u>https://he.kendallhunt.com/sites/default/files/heupload/Gardiner_1e_Chapter6.pdf</u>

¹⁶⁵ Muhlhausen, David B. Ph.D. WOMEN IN POLICING: BREAKING BARRIERS AND BLAZING A PATH. National Institute of Justice. July 2019. https://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/252963.pdf

¹⁶⁶ Ziman, Kristen. Chief's Blog. Aurora Police Department. April 17, 2016. http://www.kristenziman.com/2016/04/embrace-warriorship.html

PULL QUOTE: "Warriors are warriors not because of their strength, but because of their ability to apply strength to good purpose." – Eric Greitens¹⁶⁷

Academies must also be careful to instill a strong sense of "mission over self" along with the self-discipline required to avoid ethics downfalls, and place oneself between danger and the community they serve. It is vital to the law enforcement profession that police officers be willing to run into the gunfire when needed.¹⁶⁸

Methodology

Resource, Document, and Recommendation Outreach

The working group conducted outreach to the following organizations and agencies: International Association of Chiefs of Police, National Sheriffs Association, Fraternal Order of Police, International Association of Directors of Law Enforcement Standards and Training, International Law Enforcement Educators and Trainers Association, National Organization of Black Law Enforcement Executives, Women in Federal Law Enforcement, FLETC, Police Executive Research Forum, National Association of Women Law Enforcement Executives, National Police Foundation, Major City Chiefs Association, Major County Sheriffs Association, Montgomery County (MD) Police Department, New York City Police Department, Washington State Criminal Justice Training Center, and . Outreach included providing information about the Commission, discussing recommendations and suggestions the organizations and agencies had for the chapter, and asking for resources, publications, and information the organizations and agencies could provide to the Commission.

Presentations to the Working Group

The presentations occurred during virtual, bi-weekly working meetings and included strategies, recommendations, and policies the organization or agency would like the Commission to consider.

March 18, 2020 Colonel Matthew Packard, Colorado State Patrol

• Discussed recruitment and retention

April 1, 2020 Executive Director Bill Johnson, National Association of Police Organizations

• Discussed recruitment and retention

April 1, 2020 Lieutenant Fidel Espinoza, Dunwoody (GA) Police Department

• Discussed recruitment, retention, and training

April 24, 2020 Baltimore Police Commissioner Michael Harrison with the Respect for Law Enforcement Working Group

April 29, 2020 Interim Executive Director Josh Crawford Pegasus (KY) Institute and Director Brad Johnson, Idaho Peace Officer Standards and Training

May 6, 2020 Chief Mike More Los Angeles (CA) Police Department; 1st Sargent of the

¹⁶⁸ CITATION NEEDED

¹⁶⁷ The Heart and the Fist: The Education of a Humanitarian, the Making of a Navy SEAL

Specialized Training Unit Bill Gleason, Prince George's County (MD) Police Department

Field Visits

The Law Enforcement Recruitment and Retention Working Group conducted two virtual field visits to Arlington (TX) Police Department on April 15, 2020 and the Madison (WI) Police Department on April 30, 2020. These field visits allowed the working group an in-depth look into the recruitment, retention, and training strategies of these agencies through interviews and panel discussions with the agencies.

Business Meetings

February 19, 2020

February 26, 2020 (in-person)

March 4, 2020

March 18, 2020

April 1, 2020

April 29, 2020

May 6, 2020

Hearings

So far the Commissioners and FPM has participated in all hearings. The working group attended the Officer Health and Safety, Reduction of Crime, and Reentry hearings to-date.

Literature search

Google, COPS Office, BJA, BJS, ATF, WIFFLE, NCJRS, IACP archives, PERF archives, Federal IG Reports on recruitment and retention, FBI Training Academy resource library, Federal Law Enforcement Training Accreditation resource library, Federal Law Enforcement Training Centers resource library, The National Police Foundation resource library