National Commission on Forensic Science Meeting

# The Role of Forensic Science in Mass Fatality Management

Frank DePaolo, PA-C

Assistant Commissioner of Forensic Operations NYC Office of Chief Medical Examiner

# National Academy of Sciences Report (2009)

#### STRENGTHENING FORENSIC SCIENCE IN THE UNITED STATES

A PATH FORWARD

NATIONAL RESEARCH COUNCIL of the national academies "In its charge to the committee, Congress raised the question of the role of forensic science in homeland security." (p 279)

"Homeland security and disaster response would be well served by universal improvement in ME/C office to manage mass fatality events such as the multistate Hurricane Katrina tragedy and the World Trade Center attacks..." (p 260)

### **Mass Fatality Management**



### **Mass Fatality Management**



### Mass Fatality Incidents in the U.S. (2000-Present)

97 U.S. Mass Fatality Incidents\*7,887 Deaths

#### Top 4 Mass Fatality Incident Types

- 1. Tornado 23 Incidents (45 deaths per incident)
- 2. Aviation 16 Incidents (38 deaths per incident)
- 3. Hurricane 12 Incidents (206 deaths per incident)
- 4. Mass Shootings 10 incidents (15 deaths per incident)

#### **Open Population Incidents**

- 85% (82) open population
- 15% (15) closed population

#### **Top 4 Mass Fatality Incidents (# Fatalities):**

- 1. Attack on the World Trade Center (2,753)
- 2. Hurricane Katrina (1,836)
- 3. April 2011 Tornado Outbreak (344)
- 4. American Airlines Flight 587 Aviation Accident (265)

## **Who Are The Victims?**

#### **Closed Population**



Flight 587

- Decedent list known
- More rapid acquisition of AM data
- Morphoscopic ID methods primary
- Minimal DNA required / corroborative role
- Re-association not required

#### **Open Population**



- Reported/actual missing
- Increased reliance on DNA IDs
- Lesser role for morphoscopic IDs

WTC

- ID all fragments vs. all victims
- Re-association required
- Group remains management

# COMPLEXITY –

# **Disaster Victim Identification (DVI)**

#### **ANTEMORTEM DATA**

Unified Victim Identification System				
A REPORT OF A REPORT OF A REPORT	NAO6 HTA Bus Explosi		Report Data/Time: 4/28/2006 4:32 PF	
2/1/2005-9:49 84 Please	entries of callers to stay over			
Reporter's Information		Reported Missing Person's Information		
Salocta:		Reported Missing: 1 Add Additional Apr		
General late		General Infe		
REPORT NO. (New report)		REPORT NO: (New report)		
-Cheve Ø Suffe Ø rives	ane Ø Mittle Same Ø	Lat Lette @ Suffit @ Fest	tarte Ø Piccle Sarae Ø	
Taktan Senter Gaint Davy Claint Dav Annary Hens (22,005-000 ect) Claint Dav		Austrick Streams 2010 0 Case on a grant of Sirk 1 Case 2000 2 Case		
Contacts Address		Castacte Address		
Additional Contact Info Ø		Additional Contact Info O		
cisist (res -		claint Ones a		
diag trate		-Select Ones +		
<selett live=""> +</selett>	Remor	<selett #<="" orex="" td=""><td></td></selett>		
<5488 (782 2)	Renave .	<select at<="" ones="" td=""><td></td></select>		
-Selection - 3	tenave.	-Sales (into a		

### Data Input: Call Center and FAC

٠

- Interviews •
- Photos
- X rays
- Dental
- DNA Contextual
  - Information

Fingerprints

#### RECONCILIATION

**Postmortem Data Antemortem Data Comparisons Laboratory Analysis** 

#### **POSTMORTEM DATA**

<b>(</b>	Unified Victim Identification System Job Static in lager in an Remain Management Supervisor
Pathology - Aut	topsy Examination Incident: UVI:
Hame Update	Casol Print
General	
Specimen No:	MA07-0000001
Medical Examiner	: Charles Hirsch Serbe: Select One'
Dete: 30/7/2007 🔚	Time 7 + 25 + 40 + Add Number
Development / Nourishment: 6	
Overall Appearance : 😡	
Height:	t k
Weight:	Cita Ope
Approx, Age:	C Years C Norths C Weeks C Days C Hours C Minutes C Mus
Skin Celor:	Fields Fibron Fiblick Fibriented Fibility Rightented Fibblication Fibble
Sec:	Rate Cifemate Cuticown
Races	E White E Black E American Native E Acian/Pacific E Hispanic E Utilingwin E Other
Rigor Plantis:	Esigt E Muderate E Marked E Other
Livor Mortis:	Floaterier Flerk Flught Fload Flat Food Flater
Temperature:	Cool DiNem Direbert Dither
	Etare ESkin slapage Eliterating Elicating Efoul Oder
	Munification Estatemization Estatemization
Head	
Read Hair	
	Estraight F Wavy F Curly F Tightly sured F Rine F Ublinavin F Other
	Ellak Ellond Elbrare Elber Elblanen Elblar
Length:	A

### Data input: Scene and Morgue

٠

- PM Exam •
- Photos
- X Rays
- Contextual

DNA

- Dental
- Information

Fingerprints

26 May 2015

# **DVI Process**

#### **POSTMORTEM OPERATIONS** ANTEMORTEM OPERATIONS **Disaster Missing Persons Call Recover Remains/Personal Effects Center Reports Investigate Missing Persons Conduct Post Mortem Reports & Develop Manifest Examinations Conduct Targeted** Submit Fingerprints, DNA **Antemortem Interviews Acquire/Analyze Other Post** Acquire/Analyze Ante Mortem **Mortem Data (Dental)** Data

#### **Reconciliation Information**

#### **Establish Forensic Identification**

26 May 2015

# **DVI Process**



**Establish Forensic Identification** 

# **DVI Process**



**Establish Forensic Identification** 

26 May 2015

# Why is a Disaster Missing Persons Call Center Necessary?



### **Disaster Missing Persons Call Center**

- A centralized, structured process for collecting disaster missing persons reports and communicating with the public
- To decompress 911 system volume
- To enable investigative efficiencies:
  - Automated data comparisons
  - Call grading schema
- To enable the efficient gathering of antemortem data for use in disaster victim forensic identifications



## **An Exercise in Identification**

Fatalities

Injured – Hospitalized

Injured – Treated & Release (Hospital)

Injured – Treated & Release (scene)

Uninjured

# **Efficient Antemortem Data Workflow**



# **Efficient Antemortem Data Workflow**



### Primary Factors Influencing Antemortem Data Collection

- Accurate Victim Manifest
- Population impacted:
  - Open vs. Closed
  - Local vs. International
    - Language barriers
    - Religious considerations
  - Socioeconomic considerations
  - AM Availability/Accuracy
  - Interview Data Reliability



# **Incident Considerations**



World Trade Center Attacks 9/11/2001 American Airlines Flight 587 11/12/2001 Hudson River Mid-Air Collision 8/8/2009

# **Victim Distribution**



World Trade Center





### **Disaster Missing Persons Call Centers**



### **UK Casualty Bureau:**

- Has maintained a robust national disaster missing persons call center capability since World War II
- Police based system
- July 7, 2005:
  - 42,000 reports within the first hour of operation
  - 121,000 total reports made
  - 85% of victims captured in grade one calls

[NYC re-modeled it's Call Center app on the London system]

### **Disaster Missing Persons Call Centers**



### New York City UVIS/311:

- A call center did not exist on September 11, 2001.
- Investigative effort: More than a year to reconcile 30,000 missing persons reports/88 countries
- Unified Victim Identification System (UVIS) established in 2004
  - System now operational in other jurisdictions, including: New Jersey and Nevada

## New York City 311 Call Center

### Unified Victim Identification System is Activated by the Mayor or Police Commissioner

Following activation, a message is broadcast from the Mayor directing the public to call **311** or **212-NEW YORK** 



 System runs dormant at the NYC 311
 Call Center and can be activated instantaneously

NYC 311

- 311 becomes the single, centralized,
   call center for reporting persons
   potentially involved in an incident
- Reports typically handled by agencies such as American Red Cross are directed to 311

### **Data Management System - UVIS**

The Unified Victim Identification System (UVIS) is a browser-based application that resides at NYC's Centralized data center and provides an integrated platform to manage missing persons and victim information

- The centralized call center 311- UVIS Missing Persons Module collects data from the public, law enforcement, etc:
  - Automates all processes into a single,
     central repository
  - Allows the efficient investigation of missing persons reports through a report comparison engine and prioritization schema

Unified Victim Identification System 311 Operator is logged in as Call Center Operator					
Report for Incident: <a>Select One&gt;</a>	Report Date/Time: 8/30/2011 10:49	9 АМ			
Caller/Reporter's Information Caller/Reporter:	Reported Missing Person's Information Reported Missing Person: 1 Add Additional Reported Missing Person				
General Information REPORT NO: (New report) Caller ID @ 9172287389 Last Name © Suffix © First Name © Middle Name © Salutation Gender <select one=""> &lt; &lt;&gt;</select>	General Information     Subm       REPORT NO: (New report)     Last Name ©       Last Name ©     Suffix © First Name © <select one="">     of RM Person       <select one="">     Suffix © Suffix © Caller/Reporter's Relationship To RM ©       <select one="">     Suffix © Suffix © Age @ Age Unit       <select one="">     Suffix © Probable Destination ©       Scial Security Number © Probable Destination ©     Select One&gt;       Varial Status     Sace       <select one="">     Select One&gt;       Primary Contact @     Cellular</select></select></select></select></select>	nit			
Contacts Address Additional Contact Information	Contacts Address Employment Additional Contact Information				
<select one=""> ¥         Remove           <select one=""> ¥         Remove           <select one=""> ¥         Remove</select></select></select>	<select one="">         Remove           <select one="">         Remove           <select one="">         Remove</select></select></select>				
                         	Select One>      Remove     Add Additional Contact				

### **GAP: Disaster Missing Call Center Capability**



### Hurricane Katrina (2005):

- "The ad-hoc creation of a missing persons systems collection system created confusion and compromised public safety."
- They were "highly inaccurate," they "did not collect the right data"

- Brent Woodworth (as quoted in Post-Disaster Missing Persons Process: San Francisco 311 Customer Service Center; Goldman School of Public Policy May2, 2014)

### **Boston Marathon Bombing (2013):**

- The Mayor's 24 Hour Constituent Service was expecting to receive around 80 calls the day of the marathon
- Received 8,600 calls in 24 hours (1,000% increase)
- Only 28 matches of missing people
- Many people experienced delays/busy signals for 10 20 minutes before they were able to speak to an operator



### STRENGTHENING FORENSIC SCIENCE IN THE UNITED STATES

A PATH FORWARD

"With the exception of some large city, county, and state systems, the level of preparedness of ME/C jurisdictions is generally very low." (page 9-15)

NATIONAL RESEARCH COUNCIL OF THE NATIONAL ACADEMIES

### **National Disaster Missing Persons Call Center**

A National Disaster Missing Persons Cell Center would serve to assist local jurisdictions with any incident in the US or abroad which might include American disaster victims.

- Serve small jurisdictions unable to fund, equip and staff a disaster missing persons call center.
- Greatly improve the nations response to a large scale incident
- Ensure reliability of collected disaster missing persons data
- Improve post-incident coordination amongst missing persons stakeholders.

JOHN BURKHART SCHWARTZ JAMES GREGORY SMITH EDWAY ANDREW IRA ROSENBLU LE KOUSOULIS JOSEPH ATTHEW DOLLARD

Photo: upi.com

Entration in

. . .

CARRENT AND AND AND AND A DAME SAFETY AND AND

LANCH DAVID ROBIEL MUTER

TOSTER REAS ALLON LAUTISCE DAMAS CONTA J CETTERNY RICHARD H STEWARD IN PRICE With M. POCHER JAMES JOHNS SUCCED

TRONICO JOSTEM PLUMITALLO GARISTO

# **QUESTIONS?**

Frank DePaolo, PA-C Assistant Commissioner, Forensic Operations Office of Chief Medical Examiner, City of New York 212-447-2738 FDePaolo@ocme.nyc.gov