Exemption 7
Exemption 7: The Basic Framework

- 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7) contains (1) a threshold requirement and (2) six subparts ((A) - (F))

- To withhold records pursuant to Exemption 7, both the threshold and one of the six subparts must apply
Exemption 7 Threshold

Statutory Language: “records or information compiled for law enforcement purposes”

Three requirements to meet this threshold:
1) Records or Information
2) Compiled
3) Law Enforcement Purposes
Records or Information

- Congress extended the protection of Exemption 7 to include both investigatory records and non-investigatory records compiled for a law enforcement purpose.

- The Freedom of Information Reform Act of 1986 focused the inquiry on the purpose for which records or information compiled.
Compiled

- Information originally compiled for a law enforcement purpose

- The Supreme Court in 1990 clarified that information *not* originally compiled for a law enforcement purpose can still meet the threshold if later *recompiled* for a law enforcement purpose
Law Enforcement Purposes

- Criminal, Civil, or Administrative enforcement (courts require some detail)

- State or foreign law enforcement purposes also valid

- Can include National Security / Homeland Security-related records
Law Enforcement Purposes

- Criminal Law Enforcement agency

  - (1) Per se rule (inherently compiled) (1st, 2nd, 6th, 8th, 10th, and 11th Cir.); or

  - (2) Rational nexus test (connected to violation of law) (DC, 3rd, and 9th Cir.)
    - Pratt v. Webster, 673 F.2d 408, 420-21 (D.C. Cir. 1982)
Law Enforcement Purposes

➢ Mixed-Function agency (not traditional criminal law enforcement agency)

• The agency is enforcing a statute within its authority
• E.g., IGs, HHS, USPS
Law Enforcement Purposes

- Personnel Investigations

  - Specific and potentially unlawful activity by particular employees

  - Not general monitoring of employees
Exemption 7(A)

Statutory Language: Withholding of “records or information compiled for law enforcement purposes” (remember your threshold) where disclosure “could reasonably be expected to interfere with enforcement proceedings”
Exemption 7(A) Analysis

Two Steps:

• A specific enforcement proceeding either pending, prospective, or preventative; and

• A cognizable harm caused by release
Exemption 7(A) enforcement proceedings

- Criminal law enforcement proceeding
- Civil, regulatory, and administrative enforcement proceeding
- State or foreign enforcement proceeding
For how long does Exemption 7(A) apply?

- Exemption 7(A) applies for as long as:
  - proceeding remains pending;
  - proceeding is “reasonably anticipated” (prospective); or
  - record or information is preventative
What types of harm are covered under 7(A)?

√ Standard: Proceeding would be harmed by premature release (e.g.,):

- Reprisals against witnesses
- Loss of control of investigation
- Release of strategy or evidence
- Suppression of evidence or evasion of detection by target
7(A) Categorical Approach

➢ In litigation an agency may justify withholding a category of records if it:
  • Provides “functional” description of the category of records; and
  • Explains how release interferes with enforcement proceedings for each category of records
General disclaimer: Congress created a mechanism to protect particularly sensitive national security and law enforcement matters where even acknowledging the existence of such records would harm an interest protected by the FOIA’s exemptions.
(c)(1) Exclusion Requirements

- Records otherwise satisfy requirements of Exemption 7(A) to be withheld in full and:
  - Such records pertain to a pending criminal investigation; and
  - Agency has reason to believe that the subject of the investigation is unaware of its pendency; and
(c)(1) Exclusion Requirements (continued)

• Agency disclosure of the very existence of the records could reasonably be expected to interfere with the investigation

ALWAYS consult with an OIP exclusion expert before invoking
Exemption 7(B)

Statutory Language: Withholding of “records or information compiled for law enforcement purposes” (remember your threshold) where disclosure “would deprive a person of a right to a fair trial or an impartial adjudication”
When would agency use Exemption 7(B)?

Purpose: Exemption 7(B) applies to prevent prejudicial pretrial publicity that could impair a court proceeding.
Two-Part Test for Exemption 7(B)

An agency must show that:

• a trial or adjudication is pending or truly imminent; and

• it is more probable than not that disclosure of records or information would seriously interfere with the fairness of those proceedings

- Washington Post Co. v. DOJ, 863 F.2d 96 (D.C. Cir. 1988)
Government-wide Ex. 7 Usage in FY 2017

Source: Agency FY 2017 Annual FOIA Reports, as located on FOIA.Gov
Exemption 7(D)

Statutory Language: “Could reasonably be expected to disclose the identity of a confidential source, including a state, local, or foreign agency or authority or any private institution which furnished information on a confidential basis, and in the case of a record or information compiled by a criminal law enforcement authority in the course of a criminal investigation or by an agency conducting a lawful national security intelligence investigation, information furnished by a confidential source.”
Purpose of Exemption 7(D)

• To encourage individuals/entities to come forward to law enforcement entities and provide information.

• To ensure confidential sources are not lost through retaliation against sources for past disclosure or because of fear of future disclosure.
What constitutes a source?

This term may include both individuals and institutions (e.g., a local law enforcement agency such as a local police department)
What constitutes a Confidential Source?

Confidentiality can be:

- Express; or
- Implied
Implied Confidentiality

Factors to consider:

• Nature of the crime; and

• Source’s relation to the crime
What information may be withheld?

Category 1: Identity of a confidential source
What information may be withheld?

Category 2: Information furnished by a confidential source

- compiled by a criminal law enforcement authority in the course of a criminal investigation or

- by an agency conducting a lawful national security intelligence investigation
The (c)(2) exclusion

- Removes from the requirements of the FOIA records concerning an informant requested by a third party under the informant’s name or identifier.

- If the informant’s status as an informant has been officially confirmed, you cannot use the (c)(2) exclusion.
Statutory Language: Exemption 7(E) allows an agency to withhold records if disclosure “would disclose techniques and procedures for law enforcement investigations or prosecutions, or would disclose guidelines for law enforcement investigations or prosecutions if such disclosure could reasonably be expected to risk circumvention of the law.”
First Clause of Exemption 7(E)

“Techniques and Procedures”

- Criminal or Civil
- Limited to unknown techniques
- Unknown ways/circumstances in which known techniques are used
  - E.g., polygraphs, BOP surveillance videos
First Clause of Exemption 7(E)

➢ “Investigations or Prosecutions”
  • Not as broad as the Exemption 7 threshold (law enforcement purpose)
➢ Circumvention harm requirement
  • Courts are split on whether an agency is required to show that disclosure of a law enforcement technique or procedure could risk circumvention of the law
Second Clause of Exemption 7(E)

“Guidelines for law enforcement investigations or prosecutions if such disclosure could reasonably be expected to risk circumvention of the law”

• Ex. IRS prosecution thresholds
Exemption 7(F)

Statutory Language: Withholding of information that “could reasonably be expected to endanger the life or physical safety of any individual.”
Who can be protected?

- Note that this exemption allows us to withhold information that could endanger any individual. This need not be an American citizen, or even a law abiding one.

- Often used to protect law enforcement personnel who deal directly with dangerous criminals. Also used to protect inmates from one another.
Questions?