Case: 3:19-cv-02953 Doc #: 1 Filed: 12/23/19 1 of 10. PageID #: 1

#### IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT NORTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO WESTERN DIVISION

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

CASE NO.: 3:19-cv-2953

Plaintiff,

v.

**JUDGE** 

ANTHONY HUBBARD, JEFFERY HUBBARD, ANN HUBBARD, and PAYUP, LLC,

COMPLAINT OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

**JURY TRIAL DEMANDED** 

Defendants.

For its Complaint, the United States of America alleges as follows:

1. This action is brought by the United States to enforce the provisions of Title VIII of the Civil Rights Act of 1968 (the Fair Housing Act), as amended, 42 U.S.C. §§ 3601, et seq.

#### **JURISDICTION AND VENUE**

- 2. This court has jurisdiction over this action under 28 U.S.C. § 1331 and 42 U.S.C. § 3614(a).
- 3. Venue is proper in this district under 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b) because the actions and omissions giving rise to the United States' allegations occurred in the Northern District of Ohio, and Defendants reside or do business in the Northern District of Ohio.

#### FACTUAL ALLEGATIONS

- 4. Defendants Anthony Hubbard, Jeffery Hubbard, and Ann Hubbard, are residents of Toledo, Ohio.
- 5. Defendant PayUp, LLC, is an Ohio limited liability company whose principal place of business is in and around the city of Toledo, Ohio.

#### **DEFENDANT ANTHONY HUBBARD**

- 6. Since at least 2000, Defendant Anthony Hubbard served as agent, co-owner, business partner, officer, and/or property manager for at least thirty-five (35) properties owned and/or co-owned by one or more of the following: his brother Jeffery Hubbard, his mother Ann Hubbard, his business partner Rick Vermilyea, and his companies No Joke Properties Inc., and PayUp, LLC.
- 7. These properties include, but are not limited to, the following addresses in Toledo, Ohio: 1614 Macomber St., 1805 Macomber St., 1626 Macomber St., 1624 Macomber St., 1656 Macomber St., 1011 Alldays, and 909 Vance St. (the "subject properties").
- 8. The rental homes at the subject properties described above are "dwellings" within the meaning of the Fair Housing Act (FHA) (42 U.S.C. § 3602(b)).
- 9. At all times relevant to this action, Defendant Anthony Hubbard performed management duties at the subject properties including, but not limited to, advertising vacancies, accepting or rejecting prospective tenants, setting rates for rent and security deposits, collecting rent, accepting requests for repairs, making repairs, and evicting tenants.
- 10. At all times relevant to the action, Defendants Jeffery Hubbard, Ann Hubbard, and/or PayUp, LLC, engaged Anthony Hubbard to act as their agent to manage the subject properties and provided him with the actual or apparent authority to receive applications for tenancy; to accept or reject prospective tenants; to bind tenants to landlord/tenant contracts by signing leases; to use keys to access tenants' housing; to collect rents and fees; to make repairs in tenants' housing; to make adjustments to the amounts of rent, fees, or security deposits; and to evict tenants or otherwise enforce lease provisions for the subject properties.
- 11. On repeated occasions from at least 2007 and continuing through the present,
  Defendant Anthony Hubbard has subjected multiple female tenants of the subject properties to

discrimination on the basis of sex, including severe, pervasive, and unwelcome sexual harassment, on multiple occasions. Such conduct has included, but has not been limited to the following categories of severe, pervasive and unwelcome sexual harassment:

- Making unwelcome sexual comments, making unwelcome sexual advances,
   and sending unwanted sexual text messages, videos, and photos to female tenants;
- Offering to grant tangible housing benefits—such as making repairs and/or reducing the rent or security deposit and overlooking or excusing late or unpaid rent or utilities—in exchange for sex or sex acts;
- Taking adverse housing actions, such as eviction or refusing to make repairs,
   or threatening to take such actions, against female tenants who objected to
   and/or refused sexual advances;
- d. Expressing a preference for renting to single female tenants, and taking adverse housing actions against female tenants upon learning that they were not single; and
- e. Entering the homes of female tenants without their consent.
- 12. For example, from approximately 2007-2008, Anthony Hubbard repeatedly harassed a female tenant who lived in one of the subject properties by making unwelcome sexually inappropriate comments to her, in person and through text message, about her body; requesting that she have sex with him; commenting on her sexual preferences and ability; requesting pictures of her breasts in exchange for a picture of his penis; offering to exchange sex for rent; and entering her home without her permission or any notice.
- 13. In another example, on multiple occasions from 2013-2017, Anthony Hubbard pressured a female tenant, who lived in one of the subject properties and was unable to pay the full

amount of rent, to have sex with him in exchange for reducing her rent and utility bills, and for making repairs to her property. He also sent this tenant unwelcome sexually explicit text messages throughout her tenancy; for example, he requested pictures of her genitals via text and asked for oral sex in exchange for payment of late fees.

- 14. In another example, on multiple occasions from 2013-2014, Anthony Hubbard sexually harassed a female tenant who lived in one of the subject properties. He offered to reduce the amount of her security deposit in exchange for sex, saying: "we can settle the rest with no clothes on" or words to that effect. He also entered the home of this tenant without her permission in an effort to see her naked and sexually harassed her via text message on multiple occasions, sometimes sending sexually explicit text messages in the middle of the night asking her what she was wearing and for pictures of her body.
- 15. In yet another example, in 2015, Anthony Hubbard continuously pressured a female tenant who lived at one of the subject properties for sex, sent her pictures of naked women and videos of people engaging in sex and sex acts via text message, and asked her via text message whether she was home alone. He texted her unwelcome messages such as: "do you need a massage" and sexually suggestive messages. On a number of occasions, when he came to pick up her rent in person, he made unwelcome inappropriate sexual comments about her breasts and body.
- 16. The experiences of these four women described above in paragraphs 12-15 were not isolated instances; nor were they the only instances of Hubbard's sexual harassment. Rather, these instances were part of Anthony Hubbard's longstanding pattern and practice of illegal sexual harassment of multiple female tenants between 2007 and the present.
- 17. Many of Defendant Anthony Hubbard's discriminatory housing practices, as described above in paragraphs 11-16, occurred within the scope of his agency relationship with Defendants Jeffery Hubbard, Ann Hubbard, and/or PayUp, LLC, or were aided by the existence

of that agency relationship.

#### **DEFENDANT JEFFERY HUBBARD**

- 18. Since at least 2014, Defendant Jeffery Hubbard served as co-owner, business partner, and/or property manager for the following subject properties: 1011 Alldays, and 1624 Macomber St.
- 19. At all times relevant to the action, Defendant Jeffery Hubbard engaged Anthony Hubbard to act as his agent to manage the subject properties listed in Paragraph 18 above, and provided him with the actual or apparent authority to receive applications for tenancy; to accept or reject prospective tenants; to bind tenants to landlord/tenant contracts by signing leases; to use keys to access tenants' housing; to collect rents and fees; to make repairs in tenants' housing; to make adjustments to the amounts of rent, fees, or security deposits; and to evict tenants or otherwise enforce lease provisions for those subject properties.
- 20. At least some of the discriminatory housing practices of Defendant Anthony Hubbard, as described above in paragraphs 11-16, occurred within the scope of his agency relationship with Defendant Jeffery Hubbard, or were aided by the existence of that agency relationship. Defendant Jeffery Hubbard knew or should have known of these discriminatory housing practices and failed to take prompt action to correct and/or end them.

#### **DEFENDANT ANN HUBBARD**

- 21. Since at least 2000, Defendant Ann Hubbard served as co-owner, business partner, and/or property manager for the following subject properties: 1626 Macomber St., 909 Vance St., 1011 Alldays, and 1624 Macomber St.
- 22. At all times relevant to the action, Defendant Ann Hubbard engaged Defendant Anthony Hubbard to act as her agent to manage the subject properties listed in Paragraph 21 above, and provided him with the actual or apparent authority to receive applications for tenancy; to

accept or reject prospective tenants; to bind tenants to landlord/tenant contracts by signing leases; to use keys to access tenants' housing; to collect rents and fees; to make repairs in tenants' housing; to make adjustments to the amounts of rent, fees, or security deposits; and to evict tenants or otherwise enforce lease provisions for those subject properties.

23. At least some of the discriminatory housing practices of Defendant Anthony Hubbard, as described above in paragraphs 11-16, occurred within the scope of his agency relationship with Defendant Ann Hubbard, or were aided by the existence of that agency relationship. Defendant Ann Hubbard knew or should have known of these discriminatory housing practices and failed to take prompt action to correct and/or end them.

#### **DEFENDANT PAYUP, LLC**

- 24. Defendant PayUp, LLC is an Ohio limited liability company, formed in 2014, that owns, rents, or manages some of the subject properties in Toledo, Ohio. Upon information and belief, the only employees and officers of PayUp, LLC are Rick Vermilyea and Anthony Hubbard; Rick Vermilyea serves as CEO and President; Anthony Hubbard serves as Secretary and Vice President.
- 25. PayUp, LLC, has an ownership interest in the following subject property owned by the company: 1805 Macomber St.
- At all times relevant to the action, Defendant PayUp, LLC engaged Anthony Hubbard to act as its agent to manage the subject property, and provided him with the actual or apparent authority to receive applications for tenancy; to accept or reject prospective tenants; to bind tenants to landlord/tenant contracts by signing leases; to use keys to access tenants' housing; to collect rents and fees; to make repairs in tenants' housing; to make adjustments to the amounts of rent, fees, or security deposits; and to evict tenants or otherwise enforce lease provisions for those subject properties.

- 27. At least some of the discriminatory housing practices of Defendant Anthony Hubbard, as described above in paragraphs 11-16, occurred within the scope of his agency relationship with Defendant PayUp, LLC, or were aided by the existence of that agency relationship.
- 28. The above-described actions and conduct of Defendants Anthony Hubbard, Jeffery Hubbard, Ann Hubbard, and PayUp, LLC caused female tenants to suffer physical harm, fear, anxiety, emotional distress, and inhibited their ability to secure housing for themselves and their families.

#### **CAUSE OF ACTION**

- 29. By the actions and statements described above, Defendants have:
  - Denied dwellings or otherwise made dwellings unavailable because of sex, in violation of 42 U.S.C. § 3604(a);
  - b. Discriminated in the terms, conditions, or privileges of the rental of dwellings, or in the provision of services or facilities in connection therewith, because of sex, in violation of 42 U.S.C. § 3604(b);
  - c. Made statements with respect to the rental of dwellings that indicate a preference, limitation, or discrimination based on sex, in violation 42 U.S.C. § 3604(c); and
  - d. Coerced, intimidated, threatened, or interfered with persons in the exercise or enjoyment of, or on account of their having exercised or enjoyed, their rights granted or protected by Section 804 of the Fair Housing Act, in violation of 42 U.S.C. § 3617.
- 30. Defendants' conduct constitutes:
  - a. A pattern or practice of resistance to the full enjoyment of the rights granted by the Fair Housing Act, 42 U.S.C. §§ 3601, *et seq.*, and

- b. A denial to a group of persons of rights granted by the Fair Housing Act, 42 U.S.C. §§ 3601, *et seq.*, which denial raises an issue of general public importance.
- 31. Female tenants and persons associated with them have been injured by Defendants' discriminatory conduct. Such persons are aggrieved persons as defined in 42 U.S.C. § 3602(i), and have suffered damages as a result of Defendants' conduct.
- 32. Defendant Anthony Hubbard's conduct was intentional, willful, and/or taken in reckless disregard of the rights of others.

#### PRAYER FOR RELIEF

WHEREFORE, the United States requests that the Court enter an Order that:

- a. Declares that Defendants' discriminatory practices violate the Fair Housing Act, as amended, 42 U.S.C. §§ 3601, et seq.;
- b. Enjoins Defendants, their agents, employees, and successors, and all other persons in the active concert or participation with them from:
  - Discriminating on the basis of sex, including engaging in sexual harassment, in any aspect of the rental of a dwelling;
  - ii. Interfering with or threatening to take any action against any person engaged in the exercise or enjoyment of rights granted or protected by the Fair Housing Act, as amended;
  - iii. Failing or refusing to take such affirmative steps as may be necessary to restore, as nearly as practicable, Defendants' victims of past unlawful practices to the position they would have been in but for the discriminatory conduct; and
  - iv. Failing or refusing to take such affirmative steps as may be necessary to prevent the recurrence of any discriminatory conduct in the future and to

eliminate, as nearly as practicable, the effects of Defendants' unlawful practices;

- Awards monetary damages to each person aggrieved by Defendants' c. discriminatory conduct, pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 3614(d)(1)(B);
- d. Assesses civil penalties against Defendants in order to vindicate the public interest, pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 3614(d)(1)(c); and
- Awards such additional relief as the interests of justice may require. e.

#### **JURY DEMAND**

The United States hereby demands a trial by jury of all issues so triable pursuant to Rule 38 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.

Dated: December 23, 2019

Respectfully submitted,

JUSTIN E. HERDMAN United States Attorney Northern District of Ohio

s/Angelita Cruz Bridges

Angelita Cruz Bridges (0072688) Assistant U.S. Attorney United States Attorney's Office Northern District of Ohio Four Seagate, Suite 308 Toledo, Ohio 43604-2624 Tel: (419) 259-6376

Fax: (419) 259-6471

Angelita.Bridges@usdoj.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff United States of America WILLIAM P. BARR Attorney General

s/ Eric Drieband

ERIC DRIEBAND

**Assistant Attorney General** Civil Rights Division

s/ Sameena Shina Majeed

SAMEENA SHINA MAJEED

Chief

s/ Timothy Moran

TIMOTHY MORAN Deputy Chief CHARLA JACKSON

Trial Attorney

Housing and Civil Enforcement Section Civil Rights Division U.S. Department of Justice 950 Pennsylvania Avenue NW Northwest Building, 7th Floor Washington, DC 20530

Phone: (202) 514-4713 Fax: (202) 514-1116

E-mail: <a href="mailto:charla.jackson@usdoj.gov">charla.jackson@usdoj.gov</a>

Case: 3:19-cv-02953 Doc #: 1-1 Filed: 12/23/19 1 of 2. PageID #: 11

JS 44 (Rev. 02/19)

#### **CIVIL COVER SHEET**

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. (SEE INSTRUCTIONS ON NEXT PAGE OF THIS FORM.)

- Purpose of initiating the civil to	OCKEL SHEEL. (SEE HVS1KO)		FIHISFO	)RM.)					
I. (a) PLAINTIFFS				DEFENDANTS	8				
United States of America	a			Anthony Hubbard, Jeffery Hubbard, Ann Hubbard, and PayUp, LLC					
(b) County of Residence of First Listed Plaintiff (EXCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES)				County of Residence of First Listed Defendant Lucas  (IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES ONLY)  NOTE: IN LAND CONDEMNATION CASES, USE THE LOCATION OF THE TRACT OF LAND INVOLVED.					
(c) Attorneys (Firm Name, Address, and Telephone Number)  Angelita Cruz Bridges, Office of the United States Attorney, 433 Summit, Suite 308, Toledo, OH 43604			l.	Attomeys (If Known) Jennifer Dawson & Anthony Hubbard	& Krysten	Beech, Marsha			ys for
II. BASIS OF JURISD	ICTION (Place an "X" in (	One Box Only)	III. CI	TIZENSHIP OF P	RINCIPA	AL PARTIES	(Place an "X" in (	One Box i	for Plainti
→ 1 U.S. Government  Plaintiff	☐ 3 Federal Question (U.S. Government)			(For Diversity Cases Only) <b>P</b>	TF DEF	Incorporated or Proof Business In T	and One Box for		
☐ 2 U.S. Government Defendant	☐ 4 Diversity (Indicate Citizens)	nip of Parties in Item III)	Citize	en of Another State	2 🗖 2	Incorporated and of Business In	Principal Place Another State	<b>5</b>	□ 5
		;		en or Subject of a  reign Country	3 🗇 3	Foreign Nation		□ 6	□ 6
IV. NATURE OF SUIT					Click	here for: Nature	of Suit Code Des	scription	ıs.
CONTRACT		ORTS		DRFEITURE/PENALTY		NKRUPTCY	OTHER S		ES
□ 110 Insurance □ 120 Marine □ 130 Miller Act □ 140 Negotiable Instrument □ 150 Recovery of Overpayment ∞ Enforcement of Judgment □ 151 Medicare Act □ 152 Recovery of Defaulted Student Loans (Excludes Veterans) □ 153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits □ 160 Stockholders' Suits □ 190 Other Contract □ 195 Contract Product Liability □ 196 Franchise □ REAL PROPERTY □ 210 Land Condemnation □ 220 Foreclosure □ 230 Rent Lease & Ejectment □ 240 Torts to Land □ 245 Tort Product Liability □ 290 All Other Real Property	PERSONAL INJURY  310 Airplane  315 Airplane Product Liability  320 Assault, Libel &	PERSONAL INJURY    365 Personal Injury -   Product Liability     367 Health Care/     Pharmaceutical     Personal Injury     Product Liability     368 Asbestos Personal     Injury Product Liability     PERSONAL PROPER     370 Other Fraud     371 Truth in Lending     380 Other Personal     Property Damage     385 Property Damage     385 Property Damage     70 Abril 10 Ab	7	LABOR  O Fair Labor Standards Act Labor/Management Relations O Railway Labor Act Family and Medical Leave Act O Other Labor Litigation Employee Retirement Income Security Act  IMMIGRATION Naturalization Application Other Immigration Other Immigration Other Immigration Other Immigration	422 Appe	eal 28 USC 158 drawal JSC 157  RTY RIGHTS vrights at t - Abbreviated Drug Application emark JSECURITY (1395ff) k Lung (923) C/DIWW (405(g))	375 False Cla   376 Qui Tam   3729(a))   400 State Rea   410 Antitrust   430 Banks an   450 Commerc   460 Deportati   470 Racketeer   Corrupt C   480 Consume   485 Telephon   Protectio   490 Cable/Sat   850 Securities   550 Securities   891 Agricultu   893 Environm   895 Freedom   Act   896 Arbitratio   899 Administr   Act/Revie   Agency D   950 Constituti   State Stat	ims Act (31 USC) pportionr d Banking ee on r Influence Organizati r Credit e Consum n Act c TV c/Commod e uttory Act ral Acts eental Mat of Inform n rative Pro wo or App eecision onality of	ment g ced and cions ner dities/ tions atters nation
	moved from	Appellate Court	4 Reins Reop	ened Another (specify)	r District	☐ 6 Multidistr Litigation Transfer	- I	Multidist Litigation Pirect File	n -
VI. CAUSE OF ACTIO	14/ U.S.C. 66/360	use:	filing (D	o not cite jurisdictional stati	utes unless di	versity):			
VII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT:	<u>_</u>	IS A CLASS ACTION	DF	EMAND \$		HECK YES only:	if demanded in c	omplain	ıt:
VIII. RELATED OR R CASE(S) IF ANY	<b>EFILED</b> (See instructions):	JUDGE			DOCKE	T NUMBER			
DATE 12/23/2019		SIGNATURE OF ALTO	ORNEY O	FRECORD					
FOR OFFICE USE ONLY		750	1117	70					
RECEIPT# AM	OUNT	APPLYING IFP		JUDGE		MAG. JUD	GE		

Case: 3:19-cv-02953 Doc #: 1-1 Filed: 12/23/19 2 of 2. PageID #: 12

# UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT NORTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO

I.	Civil Categories: (Please c	heck one category only).	
		al Civil	
	The state of the s	istrative Review/Social Security	
	3. Habea	s Corpus Death Penalty	
	*If under Title 28, §2255, name the S	SENTENCING JUDGE:	
		CASE NUMBER:	
II.	and assigned to a District Judge after subsequently refiled, it shall be assi the place of holding court in which the	LR 3.1 which provides in pertinent part: "If an action is filed er which it is discontinued, dismissed or remanded to a Signed to the same Judge who received the initial case assithe case was refiled. Counsel or a party without counse of the Court by responding to the questions included on the	tate court, and ignment without regardfor I shall be responsible for
	This action: is <b>RELATED</b> to ano	other <b>PENDING</b> civil case is a <b>REFILED</b> case wa	s PREVIOUSLY REMANDE
If app	olicable, please indicate on page 1 in se	ection VIII, the name of the Judge and case number.	
III.	divisional offices therein. Actions in	3.8, actions involving counties in the Eastern Division sh volving counties in the Western Division shall be filed at t vision, and for statistical reasons, the following information	the Toledo office. For the
	ANSWER ONE PARAGRAPH ONLY. PARAGRAPH APPLIES TO YOUR CA	ANSWER PARAGRAPHS 1 THRU 3 IN ORDER. UPON FI SE, ANSWER IT AND STOP.	NDING WHICH
	(1) Resident defendant. If the documty COUNTY: Lucas	efendant resides in a county within this district, please se	et forth the name of such
		vering the above, a corporation is deemed to be a reside in that district.	nt of that county in which
	(2) Non-Resident defendant. If wherein the cause of action COUNTY:	no defendant is a resident of a county in this district, p arose or the event complained of occurred.	lease set forth the county
	place of business within the	t is a resident of this district, or if the defendant is a corpora district, and the cause of action arose or the event compl the county of the plaintiff's residence.	ation not having a principle lained of occurred outside
V.	The Counties in the Northern District determined in Section III, please chec	of Ohio are divided into divisions as shown below. After the k	he county is
	EASTERN DIVISION		
	AKRON (C	ounties: Carroll, Holmes, Portage, Stark, Summit, Tusc ounties: Ashland, Ashtabula, Crawford, Cuyahoga, Geau	arawas and Wayne) uga, Lake,
	YOUNGSTOWN (C	Lorain, Medina and Richland) counties: Columbiana, Mahoning and Trumbull)	
	WESTERN DIVISION		
	. Н	ounties: Allen, Auglaize, Defiance, Erie, Fulton, Hancock, uron, Lucas, Marion, Mercer, Ottawa, Paulding, Putnam, anWert, Williams, Wood and Wyandot)	, Hardin, Henry, , Sandusky, Seneca

Northern District of Ohio						
United States of	America, ) )					
Plaintiff(s V.  Anthony Hub Jeffery Hub Ann Hubba and PayUp,  Defendant	) bbard, ) card, ) ard, ) LLC )	Civil Action No.				
	SUMMONS IN A C	CIVIL ACTION				
To: (Defendant's name and address)	To: (Defendant's name and address) Anthony Hubbard 2681 Sherbrooke Rd Toledo, OH 43606-3742					
A lawsuit has been file	d against you.					
are the United States or a United P. 12 (a)(2) or (3) — you must	ed States agency, or an officer of serve on the plaintiff an answer	(not counting the day you received it) — or 60 days if you or employee of the United States described in Fed. R. Civ. It to the attached complaint or a motion under Rule 12 of must be served on the plaintiff or plaintiff's attorney,				
	United States Attorney's Office 433 N. Summit, Suite #308 Toledo, OH 43604					
If you fail to respond, You also must file your answer		ered against you for the relief demanded in the complaint.				
		SANDY OPACICH, CLERK OF COURT				
Date:		Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk				
		Signature of Cierk of Deputy Cierk				

Civil Action No.

#### PROOF OF SERVICE

(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 4 (l))

	This summons for (na	me of individual and title, if any)		
was re	ceived by me on (date)		· -	
	☐ I personally served	d the summons on the indivi	dual at (place)	
			on (date)	; or
	☐ I left the summons	at the individual's residence	e or usual place of abode with (name)	
		, a	person of suitable age and discretion who res	ides there,
	on (date)	, and mailed a cop	by to the individual's last known address; or	
	☐ I served the summ	ons on (name of individual)		, who is
	designated by law to	accept service of process or	n behalf of (name of organization)	
			on (date)	; or
	☐ I returned the sum	mons unexecuted because		; or
	☐ Other (specify):			
	My fees are \$	for travel and \$	for services, for a total of \$	0.00
	I declare under penalt	ty of perjury that this inform	nation is true.	
Date:				
Date:			Server's signature	
			D I	
			Printed name and title	
			Server's address	

Northern District of Ohio				
United States of	America, ) )			
Plaintiff(s v. Anthony Hub Jeffery Hubl Ann Hubba and PayUp, Defendant(	) bbard, ) pard, ) ard, ) LLC )	Civil Action No.		
	SUMMONS IN A	CIVIL ACTION		
To: (Defendant's name and address)	Anthony Hubbard c/o Jennifer Dawson Marshall Melhorn Four Seagate, Eighth Floor Toledo, OH 43604			
A lawsuit has been file	d against you.			
are the United States or a United P. 12 (a)(2) or (3) — you must	ed States agency, or an officer serve on the plaintiff an answer			
	433 N. Summit, Suite #308 Toledo, OH 43604			
If you fail to respond, you also must file your answer		tered against you for the relief demanded in the complaint.		
		SANDY OPACICH, CLERK OF COURT		
Date:				
		Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk		

Civil Action No.

#### PROOF OF SERVICE

(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 4 (l))

	This summons for (name	e of individual and title, if any)					
was rec	ceived by me on (date)	·					
	☐ I personally served t	he summons on the individua	1 at (place)				
			on (date)	; or			
	☐ I left the summons at the individual's residence or usual place of abode with (name)						
			son of suitable age and discretion who res	sides there,			
	on (date)	, and mailed a copy to	o the individual's last known address; or				
	☐ I served the summor		Laife af control of the control of t	, who is			
	designated by law to ac	ecept service of process on be	half of (name of organization)  on (date)	; or			
	☐ I returned the summer	ons unexecuted because		; or			
	☐ Other ( <i>specify</i> ):						
	My fees are \$	for travel and \$	for services, for a total of \$	0.00			
	I declare under penalty	of perjury that this information	on is true.				
Date:							
			Server's signature				
			Printed name and title				
			Server's address				

Northern District of Ohio					
United States of	America, ) )				
Plaintiff(s V.  Anthony Hub Jeffery Hub Ann Hubba and PayUp,  Defendant	) bbard, bard, ) ard, ) LLC )	Civil Action No.			
	SUMMONS IN A	CIVILACTION			
To: (Defendant's name and address) Ann Hubbard 4949 Macklyn Dr. Toledo, OH 43615					
A lawsuit has been file	ed against you.				
are the United States or a United P. 12 (a)(2) or (3) — you must	ed States agency, or an officer of serve on the plaintiff an answer	(not counting the day you received it) — or 60 days if you or employee of the United States described in Fed. R. Civ. or to the attached complaint or a motion under Rule 12 of must be served on the plaintiff or plaintiff's attorney,			
	United States Attorney's Offic 433 N. Summit, Suite #308 Toledo, OH 43604				
If you fail to respond, You also must file your answer		tered against you for the relief demanded in the complaint.			
		SANDY OPACICH, CLERK OF COURT			
Date:		Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk			
		Signature of Clerk of Deputy Clerk			

Civil Action No.

#### PROOF OF SERVICE

(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 4 (l))

	This summons for (na	me of individual and title, if any)		
was re	ceived by me on (date)		· -	
	☐ I personally served	d the summons on the indivi	dual at (place)	
			on (date)	; or
	☐ I left the summons	at the individual's residence	e or usual place of abode with (name)	
		, a	person of suitable age and discretion who res	ides there,
	on (date)	, and mailed a cop	by to the individual's last known address; or	
	☐ I served the summ	ons on (name of individual)		, who is
	designated by law to	accept service of process or	n behalf of (name of organization)	
			on (date)	; or
	☐ I returned the sum	mons unexecuted because		; or
	☐ Other (specify):			
	My fees are \$	for travel and \$	for services, for a total of \$	0.00
	I declare under penalt	ty of perjury that this inform	nation is true.	
Date:				
Date:			Server's signature	
			D I	
			Printed name and title	
			Server's address	

Northern District of Ohio				
United States of	America,			
Plaintiff(s	)	Civil Action No.		
Anthony Hub Jeffery Hubl Ann Hubba and PayUp,	pard, ard, LLC			
Defendant(	) (1)			
	SUMMONS IN A	CIVIL ACTION		
To: (Defendant's name and address)	PayUp, LLC c/o Jennifer Dawson Marshall Melhorn Four Seagate, Eighth Floor Toledo, OH 43604			
A lawsuit has been file	d against you.			
are the United States or a United P. 12 (a)(2) or (3) — you must	ed States agency, or an officer serve on the plaintiff an answ	or employee of the United States described in Fed. R. Civ. Fer to the attached complaint or a motion under Rule 12 of must be served on the plaintiff or plaintiff's attorney,		
whose name and address are.	Angelita Cruz Bridges, Assis United States Attorney's Offi 433 N. Summit, Suite #308 Toledo, OH 43604			
If you fail to respond, j You also must file your answer		ntered against you for the relief demanded in the complaint.		
		SANDY OPACICH, CLERK OF COURT		
Date:				
		Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk		

Civil Action No.

#### PROOF OF SERVICE

(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 4 (l))

	This summons for (na	me of individual and title, if any)		
was re	ceived by me on (date)		· -	
	☐ I personally served	d the summons on the indivi	dual at (place)	
			on (date)	; or
	☐ I left the summons	at the individual's residence	e or usual place of abode with (name)	
		, a	person of suitable age and discretion who res	ides there,
	on (date)	, and mailed a cop	by to the individual's last known address; or	
	☐ I served the summ	ons on (name of individual)		, who is
	designated by law to	accept service of process or	n behalf of (name of organization)	
			on (date)	; or
	☐ I returned the sum	mons unexecuted because		; or
	☐ Other (specify):			
	My fees are \$	for travel and \$	for services, for a total of \$	0.00
	I declare under penalt	ty of perjury that this inform	nation is true.	
Date:				
Date:			Server's signature	
			D I	
			Printed name and title	
			Server's address	

Northern District of Ohio					
United States of	America,				
Plaintiff(s)	<del></del> (				
v.		Civil Action No.			
Anthony Hub Jeffery Hubb Ann Hubba and PayUp,	pard, ) ard, ) LLC )				
Defendant(	s)				
	SUMMONS IN A	CIVIL ACTION			
To: (Defendant's name and address) James E. Morgan Statutory Agent for PayUp, LLC 6912 Spring Valley Dr., Ste. 203 Holland OH 43528					
A lawsuit has been file	d against you.				
are the United States or a Unite P. 12 (a)(2) or (3) — you must	ed States agency, or an officer serve on the plaintiff an answ	or employee of the United States described in Fed. R. Civ. Fer to the attached complaint or a motion under Rule 12 of must be served on the plaintiff or plaintiff's attorney,			
	Angelita Cruz Bridges, Assis United States Attorney's Offi 433 N. Summit, Suite #308 Toledo, OH 43604				
If you fail to respond, j You also must file your answer		ntered against you for the relief demanded in the complaint.			
		SANDY OPACICH, CLERK OF COURT			
Date:					
		Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk			

Civil Action No.

#### PROOF OF SERVICE

(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 4 (l))

	This summons for (na	me of individual and title, if any)		
was re	ceived by me on (date)		· -	
	☐ I personally served	d the summons on the indivi	dual at (place)	
			on (date)	; or
	☐ I left the summons	at the individual's residence	e or usual place of abode with (name)	
		, a	person of suitable age and discretion who res	ides there,
	on (date)	, and mailed a cop	by to the individual's last known address; or	
	☐ I served the summ	ons on (name of individual)		, who is
	designated by law to	accept service of process or	n behalf of (name of organization)	
			on (date)	; or
	☐ I returned the sum	mons unexecuted because		; or
	☐ Other (specify):			
	My fees are \$	for travel and \$	for services, for a total of \$	0.00
	I declare under penalt	ty of perjury that this inform	nation is true.	
Date:				
Date:			Server's signature	
			D I	
			Printed name and title	
			Server's address	

Northern District of Ohio					
United States of <i>i</i>	America, ) )				
Plaintiff(s)  V.  Anthony Hubl  Jeffery Hubb  Ann Hubba  and PayUp,  Defendant(s	) bard, ) ard, ) rd, ) LLC	Civil Action No.			
SUMMONS IN A CIVIL ACTION					
To: (Defendant's name and address)	Jeffery Hubbard 2154 Maplewood Ave. Toledo, OH 43620				
A lawsuit has been filed against you.					
Within 21 days after service of this summons on you (not counting the day you received it) — or 60 days if you are the United States or a United States agency, or an officer or employee of the United States described in Fed. R. Civ. P. 12 (a)(2) or (3) — you must serve on the plaintiff an answer to the attached complaint or a motion under Rule 12 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. The answer or motion must be served on the plaintiff or plaintiff's attorney, whose name and address are:  Angelita Cruz Bridges, Assistant United States Attorney United States Attorney's Office 433 N. Summit, Suite #308 Toledo, OH 43604					
If you fail to respond, judgment by default will be entered against you for the relief demanded in the complaint. You also must file your answer or motion with the court.					
		SANDY OPACICH, CLERK OF COURT			
Date:		Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk			

Civil Action No.

#### PROOF OF SERVICE

(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 4 (l))

was re	This summons for (nan ceived by me on (date)	ne of individual and title, if any)				
was ic	·					
	☐ I personally served	the summons on the individual	at (place) on (date)			
	☐ I left the summons	at the individual's residence or u		=		
	, a person of suitable age and discretion who resides there,					
	on (date)	, and mailed a copy to	nd mailed a copy to the individual's last known address; or			
	☐ I served the summons on (name of individual) , who					
	designated by law to a	designated by law to accept service of process on behalf of (name of organization)  on (date)				
	☐ I returned the sumn	nons unexecuted because				
	☐ Other (specify):					
	My fees are \$	for travel and \$	for services, for a total of \$	0.00		
	I declare under penalty of perjury that this information is true.					
Date:						
			Server's signature			
			Printed name and title			
			Server's address			