

Australian Government

**Refugee Review Tribunal** 

Country Advice Zimbabwe Zimbabwe – ZWE37147 – Illegal Currency Trading – Imputed MDC support – House Detention – ZANU-PF Children Studying in Australia – Tsvangirai Daughters – Returnees

09 August 2010

1. Please provide information regarding how a person might be treated where they are related to and living with a person accused of black market currency crimes, including whether they would be detained and then placed under de facto house arrest indefinitely. Is such an accused crime likely to result in such an extreme response? Would detention also result in the person being forced to confess to being pro-MDC?

Since 2005 there have been periodic crackdowns on unauthorised foreign currency traders. In 2004 the law in relation to unauthorised currency traders was strengthened, allowing authorities to detain suspects for up to 28 days without charge, however most detentions appear to last no more than three days. Persons charged and found guilty of illegally buying and selling currency have been sentenced for up to six months in prison. No reports have been located that indicate that family members of unauthorised currency traders are placed in home detention for any length of time. Furthermore, there is no evidence that authorities impute unauthorised currency traders with political sympathies for either of the two factions of the Movement for Democratic Change (MDC). Most traders appear to be economic opportunists in a country with an unemployment rate estimated to be between eighty and ninety five percent. Indeed, it is reliably reported that factions within the ZANU-PF party use the black market to raise funds and that some traders are ZANU-PF operatives. The Central Bank has a ZANU-PF operative in charge of both legal and illegal currency exchanges.

A number of sources indicate that there are thousands of unauthorised currency traders in Zimbabwe. Since the government legalised the use of US dollars, South African rand and Botswana's pula as legal tender, the number of dealers has grown further. However, prior to the formation of the unity government there were a number of regular crackdowns on unauthorised traders, primarily designed to force ordinary Zimbabweans to exchange hard currency with the Reserve Bank at highly unfavourable rates and thereby supplying the ZANU-PF regime with hard currency. In order to facilitate such crackdowns, the law relating to authorised foreign currency transactions was strengthened in February 2004. The new law reportedly allowed authorities to detain persons arrested in relation to such matters for up to seven days before they must appear before a court. Under the previous law a person could only be detained for a maximum of 48 hours. The 2004 law also allows a judge or magistrate to order the detention of those arrested for a further twenty one days "if he or she is satisfied there are prima facie grounds for the charge." Once such an order has been made, a person cannot be released on bail until a minimum of fourteen days extra detention has been served.<sup>1</sup> It is not legal to detain suspects beyond 28 days without charge, nor is it legal to detain family members for any period of time.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> 'Mugabe clamps down on corruption but.....' 2004, *The Insider*, March <u>http://www.insiderzim.com/mar04lead.html</u> – Accessed 3 August 2010 – Attachment 1

Between 2005 and 2008 a number of crackdowns on unauthorised foreign currency dealers in Zimbabwe were reported. In 2005 the ZANU-PF government launched Operation Murambatsvina ('Sweep Away the Rubbish') which, according to Europa, "targeted black market trading – principally in foreign currency and fuel – and 'general lawlessness'." According to the UK Home Office, the MDC claimed that the operation was simply "punitive action against the urban poor who had voted against ZANU-PF in the elections in March."<sup>2</sup> The operation made international headlines when it included the wholesale destruction of shanty towns, leaving thousands of people homeless. The operation indicates that many so-called black market currency traders are perceived to support the MDC on the grounds that they generally tend to be members of the urban poor rather than on the basis of their occupation. In 2008 a typical street trader reportedly made US\$8 a day.<sup>3</sup>

In June 2007 a 'clampdown' was reported in Zimbabwe's *Financial Gazette*, however most people caught up in the police sweep were small-time street traders. The report indicates that those arrested typically spent two or three days in police detention and were fined 2500 Zimbabwe dollars.<sup>4</sup> There is no suggestion in the report that the traders are considered to be MDC supporters or that politics had anything to do with the clampdown.

Prior to the legalisation of foreign currency as a tender of exchange there were a number of high profile cases in which sellers and traders were given prison sentences. In 2006 Del Barrio Thomas, a priest at Saint Kizito Church, Victoria Falls, was charged for changing 1000 Euros for 540 million Zimbabwe dollars with a local unauthorized currency dealer upon his return from abroad. According to *The Herald*, Father Thomas pleaded guilty to "section 4 (1) (a) (i) of the Exchange Control Act (illegally dealing in foreign currency)." It is not clear what sentence Father Thomas received.<sup>5</sup> Such a high profile prosecution is unusual and therefore it is likely that the regime used the opportunity to prosecute Father Thomas in a showtrial, sending a message to regime critics within the various religious denominations. The Catholic Church had been particularly critical of the Mugabe government.

In the same *The Herald* report, two Victoria Falls foreign currency dealers, Taurai Wutete and Esli Muswere, were fined 17 million Zimbabwe dollars for illegal trading. According to the report, persons unable to pay the fine are given a four month gaol sentence. One trader, Taurai Wutete, was given an additional sentence of six months in prison, supposedly for pleading not guilty.<sup>6</sup> It is more likely, however, that Wutete was given a harsh sentence on the grounds that he effectively stole the hard currency from Muswere and fled to neighbouring Botswana, violating the prohibition on removing hard currency from Zimbabwe.

No reports suggest that unauthorised currency traders are imputed with MDC sympathies. Rather, traders have been targeted as part of a wider campaign to shutdown the parallel economy, outside state control. Indeed, at least one report indicates that some traders are ZANU-PF operatives and that the various factions within ZANU-PF use the black market to buy foreign currency and raise funds for their faction's operations. In 2008 it was reported that sixteen soldiers were executed for allegedly beating up illegal foreign currency traders in Harare. However, *The Zimbabwe Mail* reported that the real reason for the soldiers' execution

Herald, 31 July http://allafrica.com/stories/200607311069.html - Accessed 3 August 2010 - Attachment 5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> UK Home Office 2009, *Country of Origin Information Report – Zimbabwe*, 23 December, section 3.17 – Attachment 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Van Gelder, E. 2008, 'Zimbabwe: Black market thriving', *Africa News.com*, 15 January

http://www.africanews.com/site/Zimbabwe\_Black\_market\_thriving/list\_messages/14694 – Accessed 3 August 2010 – Attachment 3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Kwenda, S. 2007, 'Zimbabwe: Forex Traders Defy Clampdown', *All Africa Global Media*, source: *Financial Gazette*, 13 June <u>http://allafrica.com/stories/200706140923.html</u> – Accessed 3 August 2010 – Attachment 4

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> 'Zimbabwe: Catholic Priest Convicted Of Illegal Forex Dealing' 2006, All Africa Global Media, source: The Herald, 31 July <u>http://allafrica.com/stories/200607311069.html</u> – Accessed 3 August 2010 – Attachment 5
<sup>6</sup> 'Zimbabwe: Catholic Priest Convicted Of Illegal Forex Dealing' 2006, All Africa Global Media, source: The

was ZANU-PF factional politics. The currency dealers were reportedly ZANU-PF members "working for the country's Central Bank to finance party activities against internal Zanu PF factions." Indeed, ZANU-PF appointed former police Commissioner Henry Mukurazhizha to the Reserve Bank to manage "clandestine foreign currency operations with the assistance of CIO [Central Intelligence Office] officers." *The Zimbabwe Mail* argues that the soldiers were ordered to round up the dealers by "certain Senior Army officers believed to be aligned to retired General Solomon Mujuru".<sup>7</sup> The round up of the dealers and the execution of the soldiers were allegedly attempts by different factional leaders to control ZANU-PF.

In 2006 a Mr Joseph Chipunza was taken to the Zimbabwean High Court by a white farmer, Mr Dirk Connelius Odendaal, who claimed that he had leased land from Mr Joseph Chipunza in order to graze cattle. Mr Odendaal states that soon after placing his cattle on the leased land a number began to disappear. Mr Odendaal filed an application with the court to allow him to remove the cattle from Mr Chipunza's farm.<sup>8</sup>

In 2004 a High Court of Zimbabwe case revealed that a Mr Joseph Chipunza had acquired a significant parcel of land by dubious means, attempting to defraud the state of tax revenue. Mr Chipunza entered into a property deal with the owner, a Mr George Parafin Chibindi, to officially purchase land at a significantly undervalued price in order to reduce the liable stamp duty for the purchaser and the capital gains tax for the seller. This fact was inadvertently disclosed during the case which involved Mr Chipunza attempting to force Mr Chibindi's son to transfer the title of second parcel of land purchased but not transferred before Mr Chipunza's premature death.<sup>9</sup>

## 2. Please provide details of the relevant Ministers whose children are studying in Australia.

A number of children of senior ZANU-PF party figures, including government ministers, have undertaken tertiary education in Australia. In 2007 the Australian Federal Government revoked the visas of eight Zimbabwean students whose parents were senior leaders in the then ZANU-PF dominated government.<sup>10</sup> In 2008 *The Australian* reported that a further three Zimbabwean students in Australia were under investigation for allegedly being the children of high ranking ZANU-PF officials.<sup>11</sup> It is possible more children of ZANU-PF ministers and officials remained in Australia, completing their studies. In 2007 there were 1,512 Zimbabweans in Australia on student visas.<sup>12</sup>

In 2009 the *New Zimbabwean* named several children of ZANU-PF ministers and officials who had been deported from Australia, including:

- Sylvester Chihuri, son of Police Commissioner, Augustine Chihuri
- Tendai Nguni, son of the Minister of Economic Planning, Sylvester Nguni
- Kudzai Muchena, son of the Minister for Science and Technology, Olivia Muchena
- Thelma Chombo, the daughter of Local Government Minister, Ignatius Chombo

<sup>11</sup> Laurie, V. 2008, 'Morgan Tsvangirai's daughter Rumbidzai speaks out', *The Australian*, 20 June http://www.theaustralian.com.au/news/tsvangirais-daughter-speaks-out/story-e6frg6uf-1111116684857 – Accessed 3 August 2010 – Attachment 10

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Chigumira, A. 2008, 'Robert Mugabe executes rioting soldiers', *The Zimbabwe Mail*, 2 December
<u>http://www.thezimbabwemail.com/zimbabwe/1021.html</u> – Accessed 3 August 2010 – Attachment 6
<sup>8</sup> 'Zimbabwe: White Farmer in Cattle Ownership Wrangle' 2006, *All Africa Global Media*, source: *The Herald*, 9

January <u>http://allafrica.com/stories/200601090809.html</u> – Accessed 5 August 2010 – Attachment 7 <sup>9</sup> High Court Of Zimbabwe 2004, *Joseph Chipunza Versus J.C. Muzangaza N.O.*, Uchena J., Harare, 24, 25 March and 28 April – Attachment 8

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Kruger, P. 2007, 'Zimbabwe student visas cancelled 'for sins of their fathers'', *ABC News*, 17 August http://www.abc.net.au/news/stories/2007/08/17/2008468.htm – Accessed 4 August 2010 – Attachment 9

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> 'Gono, Chihuri children face Aussie deportation' 2007, The Zimbabwe Situation, source: *Zim Standard*, 19 August <u>http://www.zimbabwesituation.com/aug19\_2007.html</u> – Accessed 6 August 2010 – Attachment 28

- Taona Karimanzira, the son of Harare Provincial Governor, David Karimanzira
- Emmerson Mnangagwa Jnr, the son of the Minister for Rural Housing, Emmerson Mnangagwa
- Pride, Praise, and Passion Gono, three children of Reserve Bank governor Gideon Gono.<sup>13</sup>

In 2007 independent online journalism website Crikey reported that Pride and Praise Gono studied at Latrobe University in Melbourne, while their brother Passion was "said to be working in Sydney."<sup>14</sup> ZWNews states that Passion Gono was studying music in Sydney and also names Reason Wafawarova, a student at Macquarie University, as "a key official in the Ministry of Youth in Zimbabwe responsible for the training youth militias to torture in camps around the country", also known as the Green Bombers.<sup>15</sup> ZWNews drew most of its information from the Australian Broadcasting Corporation's Background Briefing program, which broadcast a story on the children of ZANU-PF officials in Australia in 2007. The Background Briefing report stated that "until recently Reason worked with Australians for the UN High Commission on Refugees, and he is studying for an MA in International Relations at Macquarie University in Sydney...Reason writes regular opinion pieces for the Zimbabwean government controlled Herald in Harare."<sup>16</sup> Reason's articles for *The Herald* are extremely pro-Mugabe and any negative comments made to him would likely result in adverse treatment upon return to Zimbabwe. Pride and Praise Gono have no political profile, other than to be the privileged children of the Reserve Bank Governor. It is uncertain if remarks made to these persons would result in ramifications for the critic (or his family).

One former La Trobe student Tonderai Pasipamire is the son of the Zimbabwean defence minister. However, the only senior Pasipamire associated with ZANU-PF is Christopher Pasipamire, the head of the so-called 'war veterans'' Revolutionary Council and ZANU-PF candidate for the constituency of St Mary's.<sup>17</sup> According to his online resume, Tonderai Pasipamire studied at La Trobe University between 2003 and 2010, completing a Bachelor of Economics.<sup>18</sup> No information has been located connecting Tonderai Pasipamire with ZANU-PF; however a 2008 article in *The Herald* reveals him to be a wealthy member of the Harare elite, suggesting a close connection with ZANU-PF.<sup>19</sup> The details of his resume also add weight to his membership of Zimbabwe's privileged elite that have thrived under Mugabe.

Emmerson Mnangagwa, the father of a former student studying in Australia, has recently been appointed Zimbabwe's Defence Minister. According to the International Crisis Group, Emmerson Mnangagwa is a powerful and well-known "presidential hopeful".<sup>20</sup> Publicly available sources have not revealed precisely where Emmerson Mnangagwa Jnr studied in Australia. However, as Emmerson Mnangagwa Snr is emerging to be the most likely rival to Morgan Tsvangirai for the Presidency in the post-Mugabe era, any anti-ZANU-PF comments

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Chimhashu, T. 2009, 'Chihuri accosts Tsvangirai at airport', *New Zimbabwe.com*, 13 November
<u>http://www.newzimbabwe.com/pages/aussies10.16877.html</u> – Accessed 4 August 2010 – Attachment 11
<sup>14</sup> Nethercote, J. 2007, 'Zimbabwe leaders' children in Australia: who's here', Crikey.com, 16 April
<u>http://www.crikey.com.au/2007/04/16/zimbabwe-leaders-children-in-australia-whos-here/</u> – Accessed 4 August

<sup>2010 –</sup> Attachment 12

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> 'ABC radio report on family of ZPF in Australia, alleged militia leader' 2007, *ZWNews.com*, 29 May <u>http://www.zwnews.com/issuefull.cfm?ArticleID=16703</u> – Accessed 5 August 2010 – Attachment 13

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Carlisle, W. 2007, 'Children of Zimbabwe', Australian Broadcasting Corporation, 27 May <u>http://www.abc.net.au/rn/backgroundbriefing/stories/2007/1929733.htm</u> – Accessed 5 August 2010 – Attachment 14

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Nzou, C. 2008, 'Hardline war veterans say Mugabe must stay on', ZimOnline, 6 June
<u>http://www.zimonline.co.za/Article.aspx?ArticleId=3272</u> – Accessed 5 August 2010 – Attachment 15
<sup>18</sup> 'Tonderai Pasipamire' (undated), Linked In <u>http://zw.linkedin.com/pub/tonderai-pasipamire/21/651/117</u> –

Accessed 5 August 2010 – Attachment 16 <sup>19</sup> 'Upmarket Pubs Blacklist Clients' 2008, *All Africa Global Media*, source: *The Herald*, 2 February <u>http://allafrica.com/stories/200802040252.html</u> – Accessed 6 August 2010 – Attachment 31

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> International Crisis Group 2010, *Zimbabwe: Political and Security Challenges to the Transition*, Crisis Group Africa Briefing N°70, 3 March, p.5 – Attachment 17

made to Emmerson Mnangagwa Jnr while he was studying in Australia were likely to be relayed back to his father and ZANU-PF officials.

Anti-ZANU-PF or Mugabe remarks made to the children of the ZANU-PF elite would appear to be the acme of foolishness, particularly from an person who wrote in a statutory declaration to the Department of Immigration and Citizenship that he was taught by his parents to be extremely cautious about to whom he disclosed his political sympathies to.

## **3.** Please provide details of any pro-MDC rallies or events attended by Morgan Tsvangirai's daughter. Please also comment on the likelihood of a person facing persecution for their attendance at such an event.

Two of Morgan Tsvangirai's daughters currently reside in Australia: Rumbidzai lives in Perth and is an economics graduate of Murdoch University; her older sister Vimbai lives in Sydney and reportedly works for Sydney City Council.

In 2008 Rumbidzai appeared at a Perth rally in support of her father before Zimbabwe's elections.<sup>21</sup> Despite this action, *New Zimbabwe* reported that Rumbidzai has publicly stated that she is not a political activist and only rarely addresses political gatherings. The Perth rally was small, with approximately only 150 people in attendance.<sup>22</sup> *The Australian* reported on the eve of the Perth rally that it would be the first time Rumbidzai would publicly address a political rally.<sup>23</sup>

In 2009 Vimbai appeared on *Australian Broadcasting Corporation (ABC)* television, discussing her father's decision not to contest the controversial second round of the 2008 Presidential election.

Footage of both Rumbidzai's attendance at the Perth rally and Vimbai's appearance on the *ABC* is publicly available on *Reuters*. The footage of the Perth rally includes film of numerous people in attendance. The rally was widely reported in the Zimbabwean state controlled media and Zimbabweans in attendance could be easily identified by the Central Intelligence Office (CIO) from the footage.<sup>24</sup>

No information has been located that indicates that either Vimbai or Rumbidzai have attended meetings in Melbourne. It is unclear as to whether attendance at small, pro-MDC meetings in Australia would be reported to the CIO and result in harm upon return to Zimbabwe.

## 4. Please provide information relating to the risk of harm faced by a person upon his return simply due to being a returnee from Australia.

While there is a significant corpus of sources that indicate that many within ZANU-PF view the Zimbabwean diaspora as opponents of the party and returnees from Western states as spies, there is no compelling information that indicates that returnees from such states, including Australia, experience harm simply for having lived in the West. There is one report of a returnee killed by ZANU-PF thugs for apparent political reasons. Zimbabweans with a

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> 'Perth mercy dash to Tsvangirai' 2009, *The Age*, source: *AP/AFP/AAP*, 8 March
<u>http://www.theage.com.au/world/perth-mercy-dash-to-tsvangirai-20090308-8s4g.html?page=-1</u> – Accessed 3
August 2010 – Attachment 18

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> 'Mugabe regrets missing Tsvangirai wedding: spokesman' 2010, New Zimbabwe, 19 July <u>http://www.newzimbabwe.com/showbiz-2879-Mugabe+regret+over+Tsvangirai+wedding/showbiz.aspx</u> – Accessed 3 August 2010 – Attachment 19

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Laurie, V. 2008, 'Morgan Tsvangirai's daughter Rumbidzai speaks out', *The Australian*, 20 June
<u>http://www.theaustralian.com.au/news/tsvangirais-daughter-speaks-out/story-e6frg6uf-1111116684857</u> – Accessed 3 August 2010 – Attachment 10

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> 'Zimbabwe's opposition leader Morgan Tsvangirai is doing fine, says his daughter' 2008, *Reuters*, source: *Australian Broadcasting Corporation*, 25 June – Attachment 26

significant political profile abroad would be at greater risk of detection upon return and therefore at risk of harm.

A June 2008 opinion piece in *The African Executive* argues that the Zimbabwean diaspora is seen by the state (ZANU-PF) as "a security threat...a source of political and economic competition" who are "working against the ruling party".<sup>25</sup> However, given that the diaspora is estimated to be any where between three and four million<sup>26</sup>, it is highly unlikely that Zimbabwe's Central Intelligence Office (CIO) has monitored the political activities of most of this population. Since the formation of the unity government following the 2008 elections, the Prime Minister Morgan Tsvangirai has called for the diaspora to return to Zimbabwe and help rebuild the economy and the democracy.<sup>27</sup> This indicates a confidence on behalf of the MDC that returnees will not be exposed to harm.

Prior to the formation of the unity government a number of agencies believed that there was a significant risk of harm to returnees, especially those from the United Kingdom. In 2006 *BBC News* reported that a judge in a 2005 case before the UK Asylum and Immigration Tribunal stated that "it was clear that Zimbabwean security services believed returning asylum seekers were British spies" and that "such was the political paranoia in the Robert Mugabe regime in Zimbabwe, the very act of seeking asylum in Britain, even if there were no grounds for protection, meant that a Zimbabwean could be a marked man on return."<sup>28</sup> As a consequence of this ruling, the United Kingdom suspended the deportation of some ten thousand failed Zimbabwean asylum seekers.

In 2009 the United Kingdom Border Agency sought to recommence deportation of these Zimbabweans on the basis that the political situation in Zimbabwe had significantly improved since the formation of the unity government and Morgan Tsvangirai's call to the Zimbabwean diaspora to return.<sup>29</sup> The UK-based Zimbabwe Association, however, opposed the UK Border Agency move, arguing that at least one returnee from South Africa, Edwin Chingami, was murdered by ZANU-PF youths in 2009 "for being a 'sell-out".<sup>30</sup> One source describes Mr Chingami as an MDC activist, with a high political profile, indicating that he was both an election observer with the MDC and an active campaigner.<sup>31</sup>

People with high political profiles abroad remain at risk of being detected by the CIO upon return to Zimbabwe, particularly if they return via Harare International Airport. A December 2009 UK Home Office report states that that anyone who returns to Zimbabwe through Harare airport has their details fed into a "central system as part of Zimbabwe's paranoia to detect undesirables, like journalists, or trade unionists".<sup>32</sup> In 2007 the Department of Foreign Affairs (DFAT) stated that officers from Zimbabwe's Central Intelligence Organisation (CIO) are known to work as undercover Immigration Officers at Harare International Airport. However, the same report also stated that they were "not aware of difficulties by

http://www.zwnews.com/issuefull.cfm?ArticleID=21304 – Accessed 4 January 2009 – Attachment 23 <sup>30</sup> 'Concern Raised as UK Threatens Deportations' 2009, *All Africa Global Media*, source: *SW Radio Africa*, 31

http://www.zimonline.co.za/Article.aspx?ArticleId=5056 – Accessed 6 august 2010 – Attachment 27

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Kundishora, H. 2008, 'Zimbabwe Must not Persecute its Diaspora', *The African Executive*, 11-18 June <u>http://www.africanexecutive.com/modules/magazine/articles.php?article=3211#</u> – Accessed 30 October 2009 – Attachment 20

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Matibe, P. 2009, 'Zimbabwe Diaspora hold the key to Economic revival', *The Zimbabwe Telegraph*, 4 December <u>http://www.zimtelegraph.com/?p=4722</u> – Accessed 5 August 2010 – Attachment 21

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> 'Tsvangirai urges exiles to return to Zim' 2009, ZWNews, 1 August 2009 http://www.zwnews.com/issuefull.cfm?ArticleID=21304 – Accessed 4 January 2009 – Attachment 23

http://www.zwnews.com/issuefull.cfm?ArticleID=21304 – Accessed 4 January 2009 – Attachment 23 <sup>28</sup> 'Q and A: Zimbabwe asylum ruling' 2006, *BBC News*, 11 April

http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/uk\_news/4901202.stm – Accessed 4 November 2009 – Attachment 22 <sup>29</sup> 'Tsvangirai urges exiles to return to Zim' 2009, *ZWNews*, 1 August 2009

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> 'Concern Raised as UK Threatens Deportations' 2009, *All Africa Global Media*, source: *SW Radio Africa*, 31 October – Attachment 24

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> 'MDC activist killed by ZANU PF youths' 2009, *ZimOnline*, 3 September

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> UK Home Office 2009, Country of origin information report: Zimbabwe, 23 December, p49 – Attachment 2

Zimbabweans returning from study from overseas in countries critical of the Government of Zimbabwe (GOZ) such as Australia, the United States, Canada and the United Kingdom." Furthermore, they saw "no evidence that the simple fact of studying in those countries would attract punitive action by the GOZ." However, if an "individual student was active in organisations subject to harassment by the GOZ, such as the Movement for Change (MDC), trade unions or civil society organisations, it is possible that she might be identified on arrival at Harare Airport."<sup>33</sup>

Since the 2007 deportation of the children of ZANU-PF officials and ministers, Australia has been heavily demonised by Zimbabwe's state-controlled press and some senior ZANU-PF ministers. A Mugabe spokesperson, George Charamba, told Zimbabwean media that the real reason why Australia deported these students was to cover up the 'fact' that "many Zimbabwean students" had already left Australian institutions "mostly because of racial attitudes".<sup>34</sup> The ZANU-PF controlled *The Herald* also quoted Charamba as stating that "[t]he new sanctions against the little boys and girls who were fully paying for their education in Australia was white Australia's big welcome to Tsvangirai. Is it not ironic that descendants of criminals are the first ones to invoke the moral principle that sins of fathers are visited upon their children?...Their blood is tainted by their forebears' criminal past."<sup>35</sup> It is plausible, therefore, that returnees from Australia (apart from those children of ZANU-PF officials deported by authorities) are held in greater suspicion by the CIO than returnees from states less critical of the Mugabe regime. However, since the formation of the unity government following the signing of the Global Political Agreement (GPA) on 15 September 2008, Australia has been criticised by Human Rights Watch for providing "financial assistance to the power-sharing government in the absence of meaningful progress with the GPA."<sup>36</sup> Criticism of Australia for engaging with the unity government is likely to result in a reduction of the anti-Australian rhetoric of ZANU-PF officials. This may in turn affect the perception of returnees from Australia.

## Attachments

- 1. 'Mugabe clamps down on corruption but.....' 2004, *The Insider*, March <u>http://www.insiderzim.com/mar04lead.html</u> Accessed 3 August 2010.
- 2. UK Home Office 2009, *Country of Origin Information Report Zimbabwe*, 23 December.
- 3. Van Gelder, E. 2008, 'Zimbabwe: Black market thriving', *Africa News.com*, 15 January <u>http://www.africanews.com/site/Zimbabwe\_Black\_market\_thriving/list\_messages/1469</u> <u>4</u> – Accessed 3 August 2010.
- Kwenda, S. 2007, 'Zimbabwe: Forex Traders Defy Clampdown', All Africa Global Media, source: Financial Gazette, 13 June <u>http://allafrica.com/stories/200706140923.html</u> – Accessed 3 August 2010.
- 'Zimbabwe: Catholic Priest Convicted Of Illegal Forex Dealing' 2006, *All Africa Global Media*, source: *The Herald*, 31 July <u>http://allafrica.com/stories/200607311069.html</u> – Accessed 3 August 2010.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade 2007, *DFAT Report No. ZWE32420 – Zimbabwe: RRT Information Request: ZWE32420*, 23 October – Attachment 25

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Gono, Chihuri children face Aussie deportation' 2007, The Zimbabwe Situation, source: *Zim Standard*, 19
August <u>http://www.zimbabwesituation.com/aug19\_2007.html</u> – Accessed 6 August 2010 – Attachment 28
<sup>35</sup> Tsvangirai Back In Harare As Deported Children Arrive' 2007, Association of Zimbabwe Journalists, 3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> 'Tsvangirai Back In Harare As Deported Children Arrive' 2007, Association of Zimbabwe Journalists, 3 September <u>http://www.zimbabwejournalists.com/story.php?art\_id=2842&cat=2</u> – Accessed 6 August 2010 – Attachment 29

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Human Rights Watch 2010, *Country Summary: Zimbabwe*, January, p.4 – Attachment 30

- Chigumira, A. 2008, 'Robert Mugabe executes rioting soldiers', *The Zimbabwe Mail*, 2 December <u>http://www.thezimbabwemail.com/zimbabwe/1021.html</u> – Accessed 3 August 2010.
- 'Zimbabwe: White Farmer in Cattle Ownership Wrangle' 2006, *All Africa Global Media*, source: *The Herald*, 9 January <u>http://allafrica.com/stories/200601090809.html</u> Accessed 5 August 2010.
- High Court Of Zimbabwe 2004, Joseph Chipunza Versus J.C. Muzangaza N.O., Uchena J., Harare, 24, 25 March and 28 April, Law & Justice Zimbabwe website <u>http://www.law.co.zw/downloads/judgements/hc2004/HH098-04%20Joseph%20Chipunza%20vs%20J%20C%20Mazangaza%20N.O..pdf</u> – Accessed 5 August 2010.
- Kruger, P. 2007, 'Zimbabwe student visas cancelled 'for sins of their fathers'', ABC News, 17 August <u>http://www.abc.net.au/news/stories/2007/08/17/2008468.htm</u> – Accessed 4 August 2010.
- Laurie, V. 2008, 'Morgan Tsvangirai's daughter Rumbidzai speaks out', *The Australian*, 20 June <u>http://www.theaustralian.com.au/news/tsvangirais-daughter-speaks-out/story-e6frg6uf-1111116684857</u> – Accessed 3 August 2010.
- Chimhashu, T. 2009, 'Chihuri accosts Tsvangirai at airport', *New Zimbabwe.com*, 13 November <u>http://www.newzimbabwe.com/pages/aussies10.16877.html</u> – Accessed 4 August 2010.
- 12. Nethercote, J. 2007, 'Zimbabwe leaders' children in Australia: who's here', Crikey.com, 16 April <u>http://www.crikey.com.au/2007/04/16/zimbabwe-leaders-children-in-australia-whos-here/</u> Accessed 4 August 2010.
- 'ABC radio report on family of ZPF in Australia, alleged militia leader' 2007, ZWNews.com, 29 May <u>http://www.zwnews.com/issuefull.cfm?ArticleID=16703</u> – Accessed 5 August 2010.
- Carlisle, W. 2007, 'Children of Zimbabwe', *Australian Broadcasting Corporation*, 27 May <u>http://www.abc.net.au/rn/backgroundbriefing/stories/2007/1929733.htm</u> – Accessed 5 August 2010.
- 15. Nzou, C. 2008, 'Hardline war veterans say Mugabe must stay on', ZimOnline, 6 June <u>http://www.zimonline.co.za/Article.aspx?ArticleId=3272</u> Accessed 5 August 2010.
- 16. 'Tonderai Pasipamire' (undated), Linked In <u>http://zw.linkedin.com/pub/tonderai-pasipamire/21/651/117</u> Accessed 5 August 2010.
- 17. International Crisis Group 2010, *Zimbabwe: Political and Security Challenges to the Transition*, Crisis Group Africa Briefing N°70, 3 March.
- 'Perth mercy dash to Tsvangirai' 2009, *The Age*, source: *AP/AFP/AAP*, 8 March <u>http://www.theage.com.au/world/perth-mercy-dash-to-tsvangirai-20090308-8s4g.html?page=-1</u> Accessed 3 August 2010.
- 19. 'Mugabe regrets missing Tsvangirai wedding: spokesman' 2010, New Zimbabwe, 19 July <u>http://www.newzimbabwe.com/showbiz-2879-</u> <u>Mugabe+regret+over+Tsvangirai+wedding/showbiz.aspx</u> – Accessed 3 August 2010.
- 20. Kundishora, H. 2008, 'Zimbabwe Must not Persecute its Diaspora', *The African Executive*, 11-18 June <a href="http://www.africanexecutive.com/modules/magazine/articles.php?article=3211#">http://www.africanexecutive.com/modules/magazine/articles.php?article=3211#</a> Accessed 30 October 2009

- Matibe, P. 2009, 'Zimbabwe Diaspora hold the key to Economic revival', *The Zimbabwe Telegraph*, 4 December <u>http://www.zimtelegraph.com/?p=4722</u> Accessed 5 August 2010.
- 22. 'Q and A: Zimbabwe asylum ruling' 2006, *BBC News*, 11 April <u>http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/uk\_news/4901202.stm</u> Accessed 4 November 2009.
- 23. 'Tsvangirai urges exiles to return to Zim' 2009, *ZWNews*, 1 August http://www.zwnews.com/issuefull.cfm?ArticleID=21304 – Accessed 4 January 2009.
- 24. 'Concern Raised as UK Threatens Deportations' 2009, *All Africa Global Media*, source: *SW Radio Africa*, 31 October. (FACTIVA)
- 25. Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade 2007, *DFAT Report No. ZWE32420 Zimbabwe: RRT Information Request: ZWE32420*, 23 October.
- 26. 'Zimbabwe's opposition leader Morgan Tsvangirai is doing fine, says his daughter' 2008, *Reuters*, source: *Australian Broadcasting Corporation*, 25 June <u>http://reuters.viewdle.com/video/Zimbabwes+opposition+leader+Morgan+Tsvangirai+is</u> <u>+doing+fine%2C+says+his+...?vid=reuters-307-AUSTRALIA-TSVANGIRAI\_DAUGHTER-1214368180.mpg&pid=e8bcb24fad8c03fb9a97d42db98a3f3c</u> – Accessed 6 August 2010.
- 27. 'MDC activist killed by ZANU PF youths' 2009, *ZimOnline*, 3 September http://www.zimonline.co.za/Article.aspx?ArticleId=5056 – Accessed 6 august 2010.
- 28. 'Gono, Chihuri children face Aussie deportation' 2007, The Zimbabwe Situation, source: *Zim Standard*, 19 August <u>http://www.zimbabwesituation.com/aug19\_2007.html</u> Accessed 6 August 2010.
- 29. 'Tsvangirai Back in Harare as Deported Children Arrive' 2007, Association of Zimbabwe Journalists, 3 September <u>http://www.zimbabwejournalists.com/story.php?art\_id=2842&cat=2</u> – Accessed 6 August 2010.
- 30. Human Rights Watch 2010, Country Summary: Zimbabwe, January.
- 31. 'Upmarket Pubs Blacklist Clients' 2008, *All Africa Global Media*, source: *The Herald*, 2 February <u>http://allafrica.com/stories/200802040252.html</u> Accessed 6 August 2010.