International Crisis Group
WORKING TO PREVENT CONFLICT WORLDWIDE

Policing Urban Violence in Pakistan

Asia Report N°255 | 23 January 2014

International Crisis Group
Headquarters
Avenue Louise 149
1050 Brussels, Belgium
Tel: +32 2 502 90 38
Fax: +32 2 502 50 38
brussels@crisisgroup.org

Table of Contents

Executive Summary i

Recommendations iii

I. Introduction 1

II. Peshawar: The Militant Gateway 3
- A. Demographics, Geography and Security 3
- B. Post-9/11 KPK 5
- C. The Taliban and Peshawar 6
- D. The Sectarian Dimension 9
- E. Peshawar's No-Man's Land 11
- F. KPK's Policy Response 12

III. Quetta: A Dangerous Junction 14
- A. Geography and Demographics 14
- B. The Baloch Insurgency 17
- C. Sectarian Violence 18
- D. The Taliban in Quetta 20
- E. The Military's Role 21
- F. Impact on Law Enforcement and Justice 23

IV. Karachi: Violence in Pakistan's Mega-City 24
- A. Ethnicity, Politics and Violence 24
- B. Governance and Criminality 27
- C. The Case of Lyari 29
- D. Religious Extremism 30
- E. Islamabad's Response 32

V. Lahore: The Sectarian Heartland 34
- A. Criminality and Extremism 34
- B. Sectarian Violence 35
- C. Enforcing the Law 36

VI. Urban Policing 38

VII. Conclusion 42

APPENDICES

A. Map of Pakistan 43

B. Glossary of Terms 44

C. About the International Crisis Group 45

D. Crisis Group Reports and Briefings on Asia since 2011 46

E. Crisis Group Board of Trustees 48

Executive Summary

Endemic violence in Pakistan's urban centres signifies the challenges confronting the federal and provincial governments in restoring law and order and consolidating the state's writ. The starkest example is Karachi, which experienced its deadliest year on record in 2013, with 2,700 casualties, mostly in targeted attacks, and possibly 40 per cent of businesses fleeing the city to avoid growing extortion rackets. However, all provincial capitals as well as the national capital suffer from similar problems and threats. A national rethink of overly militarised policy against crime and militancy is required. Islamabad and the four provincial governments need to develop a coherent policy framework, rooted in providing good governance and strengthening civilian law enforcement, to tackle criminality and the jihadi threat. Until then, criminal gangs and jihadi networks will continue to wreak havoc in the country's big cities and put its stability and still fragile democratic transition at risk.

Some of the worst assaults on religious and sectarian minorities in 2013 occurred in Quetta and Peshawar, including the 10 January suicide and car bomb attack that killed over 100, mostly Shias, in Quetta; the 16 February terror attack that killed more than 80, again mostly Shias, in Quetta's Hazara town; and the 22 September bombing of a Peshawar church that killed more than 80 people, mostly Christians.

The provincial capitals of Peshawar, Quetta, Karachi and Lahore are bases of operations and financing for a range of extremist groups and criminal gangs that exploit poor governance and failing public infrastructure to establish recruitment and patronage networks. As urban populations grow, the competition over resources, including land and water, has become increasingly violent.

Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK)'s capital, Peshawar, and Balochistan's capital, Quetta, are hostage to broader regional security trends. The conflict in Afghanistan and cross-border ties between Pakistan and Afghan militants have undermined stability in KPK and the Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA). Military-dictated counter-insurgency policies, swinging between indiscriminate force and appeasement deals with tribal militants have failed to restore the peace, and instead further empowered violent extremists. Police in Peshawar, which has borne the brunt of militant violence and where violence is at an all-time high, lack political support and resources and appear increasingly incapable of meeting the challenge. Indeed, while militants and criminals frequently target that city, the force is powerless to act when they then seek haven in bordering FATA agencies, because its jurisdiction, according to the Frontier Crimes Regulation (FCR) 1901, does not extend to these areas.

Balochistan's location, bordering on southern Afghanistan, the Afghan Taliban's homeland, and longstanding Pakistani policies of backing Afghan Islamist proxies are partly responsible for the growth of militancy and extremism that now threatens Quetta. Aided by a countrywide network, Sunni extremists have killed hundreds of Shias there, while their criminal allies have helped to fill jihadi coffers, and their own, through kidnappings for ransom. Civilian law enforcement agencies cannot counter this rising tide of sectarian violence and criminality, since they are marginalised by the military and its paramilitary arms. Continuing to dictate and implement security policy, the military remains focused on brutally supressing a province-wide Baloch insurgency, fuelled by the denial of political and economic autonomy. The

end result is more Baloch alienation and more jihadi attacks undermining peace in the provincial capital.

In Karachi, Pakistan's largest city, which generates around 70 per cent of national GDP, much of the violence is driven by the state's failure to meet the demands of a fast growing population and to enforce the law. Over the past decade, the competition over resources and turf has become increasingly violent. Criminals and militant groups attempt to lure youth by providing scarce services, work and a purpose in life. Demographic changes fuel ethno-political tensions and rivalries, accentuated by the main political parties: the mostly Sindhi Pakistan Peoples Party (PPP), the Muttahida Qaumi Movement (MQM) representing mohajirs and the predominately Pashtun Awami National Party (ANP) forging links with criminal gangs.

Like Quetta and Peshawar, Karachi is a major target of violent sectarian groups such as the Lashkar-e-Jhangvi (LeJ), which has its home base in Punjab. Since the LeJ and other major jihadi groups such as the Lashkar-e-Tayyaba/Jamaat-ud-Dawa (LeT/JD) and the Jaish-e-Mohammed conduct operations within and outside the country from bases in Punjab, the provincial government and police are central to any comprehensive counter-terrorism effort. It is imperative that both be reformed if the threat is to be addressed effectively. Countering jihadi networks also requires coordination and collaboration between the federal and provincial governments and law enforcement institutions.

Pakistani policymakers must acknowledge and address the socio-economic disparities that lead to crime and militancy in the urban centres. Stemming the spread of urban violence also requires efficient, accountable, civilian-led policing. Yet, the forces in all four provincial capitals are hampered by lack of professional and operational autonomy, inadequate personnel and resources and poor working conditions. Instead of relying on the military or paramilitary forces to restore order, the provincial governments should guarantee security of tenure for police officers, end all interference in police operations and raise police morale, including by acknowledging and supporting a force that has been repeatedly targeted by terrorists. It is equally important for all four provinces to reform and modernise the urban policing system to meet present needs.

Above all, the state must adopt a policy of zero tolerance toward all forms of militancy. Proposed plans by the federal and KPK governments to negotiate with the Tehreek-e-Taliban Pakistan (TTP), without preconditions or a roadmap, are unwise. Such a strategy is bound to fail, as have successive military-devised peace deals with tribal militants in recent years that only expanded the space for jihadi networks in FATA, KPK and countrywide.

Recommendations

To reorient the state toward zero tolerance for all violent groups

To the Federal and Provincial Governments:

1. Withdraw the offer of any talks, absent preconditions that tribal militants renounce violence and abide by the constitution, and instead develop a coherent policy framework to tackle the jihadi threat that is rooted in strengthening civilian law enforcement institutions.
2. Prevent any banned militant jihadi organisation, including the Lashkar-e-Jhangvi, the Lashkar-e-Tayyaba and Jaish-e-Mohammed, from fundraising, recruiting and otherwise operating freely in all four provinces and FATA.

To the Political Parties:

3. End all links with criminal gangs in Karachi and jihadi groups in Punjab.

To expand the jurisdiction of police and bolster their law enforcement mandate

To the Federal and Provincial Governments:

4. Reverse the militarisation of law enforcement in urban centres by:
   a) withdrawing all orders granting paramilitary units shoot-to-kill authority; ensure that any such actions adhere strictly to conditions specified in the Criminal Procedure Code; and hold any security personnel who violate the law to account;
   b) withdrawing paramilitary units from policing duties, confining their mandate to border areas; and
   c) investigating all reported cases of extrajudicial killing, torture and abduction by state actors, assigning responsibility and holding all officials involved to account.
5. Empower the KPK police to tackle militant and criminal safe havens by repealing the Frontier Crimes Regulation (FCR) 1901 in its entirety, incorporating the Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA) into the constitutional and legal mainstream and incorporating Peshawar's Frontier Region (FR Peshawar) into the rest of the district, thus ending its status as part of FATA.
6. Restore the state's monopoly over the use of force by:
   a) disbanding all state-supported militias; and
   b) ending all links between political parties and criminal gangs or militant sects and taking action against party members, paramilitary personnel and others providing logistical, financial or other support to such groups.

To boost police effectiveness in the urban centres

To the Provincial Governments:

7. Make the protection of all police officers closely involved in terrorist and major criminal cases a top policy priority.
8. In the case of Sindh and Balochistan:
   a) abolish the 1861 Police Act and pass a new police order that ensures operational autonomy and effectiveness; and
   b) abolish the status of "B" areas, streamlining all rural and urban areas, and extending the jurisdiction of the police to the entire province.
9. Revamp policing in the provincial capitals by:
   a) establishing the subdivision as the basic policing unit, headed by an additional or district superintendent of police;
   b) improving the subdivision's ability for rapid response and multiple actions by providing adequate transport and other logistical resources, as well as forensics and other technological resources; and
   c) increasing personnel to maintain a ratio of one officer for every 260 residents.
10. Establish provincial and district public safety commissions and complaints authorities, along the lines of Police Order 2002, to oversee police functioning.
11. Give police the necessary operational autonomy by:
    a) making senior appointments subject to approval by a provincial public safety commission;
    b) guaranteeing senior officers and the rank and file secure tenure and requiring that any premature transfer or dismissal be subject to approval by a provincial public safety commission;
    c) giving the inspector general of police authority to appoint the senior district police officials, subject to approval by the provincial public safety commission; giving these officials secure tenure; and requiring the same process for a premature transfer or dismissal; and
    d) giving district-level superintendents authority to appoint their subordinates, subject to approval by a district public safety commission, with secure tenure and any premature transfers or dismissals being subject to approval by the district public safety commission.

To the Federal Government:

12. Devote the necessary resources to enable the National Counter-Terrorism Authority (NACTA) to function, as intended, as a central data bank on terrorist groups, including voice matching, fingerprinting, DNA analysis and other forensic-related information.

Islamabad/Brussels, 23 January 2014

International Crisis Group
Asia Report N°255 **23 January 2014**

Policing Urban Violence in Pakistan

I. Introduction

Although militancy and criminality are rampant in Pakistan's tribal belt and rural hinterlands,[1] urban violence threatens the stability of the provincial governments and undermines public confidence in the federal government's ability to enforce the state's writ. In the four provincial capitals, Peshawar, Quetta, Karachi and Lahore, ethno-political and sectarian divisions are deepening as competition over power and access to resources intensifies. Violence in these cities is shaped by geography, ethnic divisions and socio-economic tensions, but it is largely the product of inappropriate security policies, including decades of neglected police reform, and poor governance.

Criminality has thrived for decades in the urban centres, but the convergence of criminal and militant networks has raised the stakes. Kidnappings for ransom and bank robberies have become integral to militant fundraising. Sectarian extremists such as the Lashkar-e-Jhangvi (LeJ) operate in all four cities, threatening religious and sectarian minorities, state institutions and citizens.[2] Simultaneous militant attacks on 10 October 2013 in all four provincial capitals symbolise the national scale of the problem.[3] While the spread of jihadi militancy is a common threat, each city also faces a unique set of challenges.

With the Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA) surrounding it from all sides except the east and the Khyber Pass connecting Pakistan with Afghanistan located to its west, Peshawar, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa's (KPK) capital, is exposed to tribal, sectarian and regional militancy. Bordering on Afghanistan, the security of Balochistan's capital Quetta is undermined by the military's support of anti-Afghanistan jihadi proxies as well as military-led operations against Baloch insurgents fighting for their political, economic and social rights.[4]

Ethno-political tensions lie at the heart of Sindh capital Karachi's high levels of violence. With demographics rapidly transforming its ethnic landscape, political competition has become increasingly violent, as criminal gangs exploit their links to competing, largely ethnic-based parties. Since Punjab's capital, Lahore, is the home base of many of the major Sunni extremist groups that operate countrywide, it is central to containing conflict in the urban centres and beyond.

This report will examine the nature and directions of violence in Pakistan's provincial capitals, which reflect the broader security challenges confronting the federal and provincial governments in the second phase of a fragile democratic transition.

---

[1] See Crisis Group Asia Reports N°247, *Drones: Myths and Reality in Pakistan*, 21 May 2013; N°242, *Pakistan: Countering Militancy in PATA*, 15 January 2013; N°178, *Pakistan: Countering Militancy in FATA*, 21 October 2009; N°164, *Pakistan: The Militant Jihadi Challenge*, 13 March 2009; and N°125, *Pakistan's Tribal Areas: Appeasing the Militants*, 11 December 2006.

[2] Crisis Group Asia Report N°95, *The State of Sectarianism in Pakistan*, 18 April 2005; and *The Militant Jihadi Challenge*, op. cit.

[3] "Bomb blasts kill 10 in all four provinces", *Dawn*, 11 October 2013.

[4] Crisis Group Asia Report N°119, *Pakistan: The Worsening Conflict in Balochistan*, 14 September 2006; and Asia Briefing N°69, *Pakistan: The Forgotten Conflict in Balochistan*, 22 October 2007.

While these challenges require a policy mix of political and economic solutions, the report will focus on the more immediate challenge of improving urban policing. It is based on extensive interviews in the four cities and the federal capital Islamabad with political leaders, police officials, judges, economists, journalists and civil society activists.

II. Peshawar: The Militant Gateway

A. *Demographics, Geography and Security*

Pashtuns are the largest ethnic and linguistic group in Peshawar, followed by Hindko speakers, commonly referred to as Hindkowans. While the vast majority are Muslims, some Hindus and Sikhs remain, although most left for India after Pakistan's independence in 1947. The Pashtun population has increased because of the influx of the predominately Pashtun Afghan refugees. Peshawar's population has also swollen because of conflict in KPK and FATA, resulting in the influx of relatively well-off migrants from KPK's rural areas and small towns as well as internal displaced persons (IDPs) from the FATA agencies.[5] Peshawar likewise attracts economic migrants from the under-developed tribal belt and KPK's villages and towns.[6]

These demographic shifts have not resulted, as in Karachi (discussed below), in ethnic strife. The majority Pashtu and minority Hindko speakers have seldom competed over resources, and there is no Hindkowan political party. Nevertheless, the province's change of name, through the April 2010 eighteenth constitutional amendment, from Northwest Frontier Province (NWFP) to Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (the land of the Pashtuns) has proved a source of discord. Some Hindkowans now demand a separate Hindko province.[7]

Rather than ethnicity, it is Peshawar's location that is critical to its security challenges. The Khyber Pass, which connects Afghanistan and Pakistan and is a historical gateway for armies and traders from Central Asia and Afghanistan to the plains of the Indian subcontinent, is to the city's west. Peshawar is surrounded by FATA, a no-man's land, from all sides except the east. To its west also lies Khyber Agency and to the north, Mohmand Agency; Orakzai Agency is to the south, as are the Frontier Regions (FRs) of Peshawar and Kohat.[8] Cross-border and FATA-based militancy and criminality have, therefore, an impact on security. Areas like Dara Adam Khel in FR Kohat, on Peshawar's southern border, for instance, which is subject to the Frontier Crimes Regulation (FCR) 1901 and thus lacks regular police or court jurisdiction, have long been safe havens for criminals seeking to escape the reach of the law.[9] FR Peshawar, which serves as buffer between the "settled" areas of the provincial capital and the tribal agencies, is similarly subject to the FCR, not regular law.

---

[5] Peshawar's population, 2.2 million according to the last (1998) census, is currently estimated at around 3.4 million, based on a projected annual growth rate of 3.6 per cent. "Peshawar District at a Glance", Census of Pakistan, Population Census Organisation, Government of Pakistan, 1998. Crisis Group telephone interview, Peshawar-based census official, 11 December 2013.

[6] Describing how migratory patterns have evolved, a researcher said, "in the past, a person would come to Peshawar from Dera Ismail Khan [a city in southern KPK] to settle administrative tasks; now he will have relatives in Dera Ismail Khan but lives in Peshawar". Crisis Group interview, Islamabad, April 2013.

[7] Crisis Group interviews, journalists, NGO workers and other local civil society actors, Islamabad and Peshawar, April-May 2013.

[8] For militancy's roots in FATA, see Crisis Group Reports, *Countering Militancy in FATA*; and *Pakistan's Tribal Areas: Appeasing the Militants*, both op. cit. FRs, formally part of FATA, act as buffer zones between its agencies and KPK's "settled" districts after which they are named.

[9] The FCR is a colonial-era body of law that denies FATA residents basic constitutional rights of freedom, expression, assembly, dignity and full political representation. It concentrates draconian powers in an unaccountable bureaucracy, headed in each tribal agency by a political agent. Crisis Group Report, *Countering Militancy in FATA*, op. cit.

Peshawar is also inextricably linked to Pakistan's military-devised Afghan policy. Perceiving Pakistan as inheritor of the British Empire's frontiers with Afghanistan, the military considers that country to be within its sphere of influence. Kabul's refusal to accept the Durand Line, the British-drawn boundary that included parts of Afghanistan's historical Pashtun-majority regions in British India, as the international border and Afghan claims over part of what is now Khyber Pakhtunkhwa have also influenced Islamabad's policy toward its neighbour.

Perceptions that pan-Pashtun nationalism across the Durand Line could sever Peshawar and much of the Pashtun belt from Pakistan might have partly motivated military support for Islamist (Pashtun and non-Pashtun) proxies since the 1970s.[10] That fear has since receded, because there is little, if any, support among Pakistani Pashtuns for separation and merger with Afghanistan or for an independent Pashtun homeland, Pashtunistan. Interventionist policies are now primarily driven by belief that Pakistan has the right to control its Afghan backyard. Yet, Afghanistan's continued rejection of the Durand Line provides the military with a justification for intervention and a bargaining chip in dealings with Kabul.

The military's policy of supporting Afghan jihadi proxies paid major dividends for Zia-ul-Haq's military regime following the 1979 People's Democratic Party of Afghanistan (PDPA) coup in Kabul. Having convinced Washington even before the Soviet Union intervened to support its besieged Afghan allies, that the so-called communist takeover in Kabul was one step further to Soviet expansion in this strategic region, General Zia, much like his successor, Musharraf, two decades later, became the major beneficiary of billions of dollars of U.S. military and economic assistance. While diplomatic and fiscal support helped Zia to perpetuate his regime throughout the 1980s, the military was also given an opportunity to dictate Afghanistan's fate.

As Pakistan enhanced its support to Islamist proxies during the anti-Soviet jihad in Afghanistan, Peshawar became the headquarters for local, regional and transnational jihadi groups. It was the home base of militants who later became major players in global jihadi networks, including Osama bin Laden, Abdullah Azzam, al-Qaeda's spiritual founder, and the current al-Qaeda leader, Ayman al-Zawahiri.[11] This influx of Arab and African Salafi ideologues and fighters contributed to the spread of radical Islam in Peshawar.

According to Awami National Party (ANP) leader and former provincial minister Iftikhar Hussain, his secular Pashtun nationalist party had for decades been blamed for seeking to blur or erode Pakistan's boundary with Afghanistan in the name of Pashtunistan. Yet, during "General Zia's time, the border (with Afghanistan) was used freely for cross-border movement" of Afghan and Pakistani Pashtun militants, with the Pakistan military's active support.[12] While local recruitment for the Afghan jihad helped to create and expand many of the militant groups that now threaten

[10] Afghan Islamists were supported because, in the military's perception, they believed in the *Ummah*, the collective Islamic community, and not the nation state.

[11] Sabir Shah, "Dr Ayman Al-Zawahiri to fit into Osama's shoes?", *The News*, 3 May 2011.

[12] Crisis Group interview, Iftikhar Hussain, Peshawar, 29 April 2013. Hussain was information minister in the ANP-led government (2008-2012). The ANP is the renamed National Awami Party (NAP) the Zulfikar Ali Bhutto government banned in 1975, ostensibly because it was plotting NWFP's secession. NAP leader Khan Abdul Wali Khan participated in the non-violent Khudai Khidmadgar movement of his father, Khan Abdul Ghaffar Khan, against British rule. He then joined the Indian National Congress in undivided India and opposed NWFP's merger with Pakistan. In the 1950s, he was repeatedly imprisoned for efforts on behalf of Pashtun political and economic rights.

Peshawar's security, the Afghan jihad also fed into the black economy. With money pouring into the jihad enterprise, the city was flush with arms, including from neighbouring Dara Adam Khel, a major base for indigenous arms production in FR Kohat. Narcotics, an important source of income for jihadi factions, also poured into Peshawar from Afghanistan, including though neighbouring Barra town in FATA's Khyber Agency.

After the Soviet withdrawal in 1989, Peshawar remained the base of the military's Afghan proxies, such as Gulbuddin Hekmatyar's Hizb-e Islami. Pakistan continued to shape Afghanistan's political and security landscape during the following decades of civil war, making and unmaking governments in Kabul.[13] Many in Peshawar described Afghanistan as Pakistan's "'fifth province".[14] After Pakistan's backing of Mullah Omar's southern, Kandahar-based Taliban, Peshawar lost some of its centrality to Balochistan's capital, Quetta. However, it remained the base of Islamist proxies from eastern and northern Afghanistan, such as Hekmatyar. Proximity to FATA also made it a valuable intelligence base, a role that was reinforced after the October 2001 U.S.-led intervention in Afghanistan.

B. *Post-9/11 KPK*

General Pervez Musharraf's regional security policies after the September 2001 terrorist attacks in the U.S. converged with his domestic political ambitions, much as Zia's did after the Soviet intervention in Afghanistan. In return for assurances of cooperation with Washington in ousting the Afghan Taliban regime and countering al-Qaeda, Musharraf gained diplomatic and fiscal support that helped consolidate his military regime. Yet, he also allowed scores of Afghan Taliban and al-Qaeda-linked Arab and Uzbek leaders and fighters to cross the border and take sanctuary in NWFP and FATA. Many sectarian and military-backed Kashmir-oriented jihadi groups from Punjab and Azad Jammu and Kashmir (AJK) also established bases in KPK, including in districts such as Swat.[15]

Simultaneously, the regime helped form a six-party Islamist alliance, the Muttahida Majlis-e-Amal (MMA), to counter its moderate political rivals, the Awami National Party (ANP) and PPP that had dominated earlier NWFP governments. Winning rigged polls in October 2002, the MMA formed the government in Peshawar. In return for supporting Musharraf's constitutional reforms, it was allowed to launch an Islamisation drive in the province, creating an enabling environment for Islamist hardliners.[16] Fazlur Rehman's Jamiat Ulema-e-Islam (JUI-F), the MMA's largest constituent party, helped broker brief peace deals between the military and FATA-based militants that gave them even more space in which to operate. In Swat, for example, the MMA ordered local officials to allow militant groups to set up in the Peochar area after being displaced from their original bases in AJK by the October 2005 earthquake.[17] The

[13] Pakistan was instrumental in the creation of mujahidin coalition governments in Kabul through the Peshawar accord, November 1992, and the Islamabad accord, March 1993.
[14] Crisis Group interviews, political leaders, civil society activists, Peshawar, April-May 2013.
[15] Crisis Group Reports *Countering Militancy in PATA*; *Countering Militancy in FATA*; and *The Militant Jihadi Challenge*, all op. cit.; Asia Briefing N°46, *Pakistan: Political Impact of the Earthquake*, 15 March 2006.
[16] This included bans on music in public transport, restrictions on women and enforcement of public morality.
[17] Crisis Group Report, *Countering Militancy in PATA*, op. cit.

combination of these factors created large areas within the province and surrounding tribal belt virtually under militant control. Militancy and sectarianism soon spilled into Peshawar.

The ANP and PPP routed the MMA in the 2008 election, forming a coalition government in Peshawar. The PPP also led the coalition government in Islamabad, of which the ANP was a partner. Since their victory was perceived as a vote against Islamisation, there were hopes that the tide of religious extremism would be stemmed. In April 2009, however, facing growing militancy in Swat, Islamabad and Peshawar endorsed a military-devised accord to impose Sharia (Islamic law) in the Malakand region through the Nizam-e-Adl 2009. The accord backfired, as emboldened militants launched a reign of terror in Swat and moved into neighbouring Buner district, a few hours' drive from Islamabad. Facing domestic pressure and international criticism, the military responded with a poorly coordinated operation reliant on indiscriminate force that displaced millions, destroyed infrastructure and shattered the region's economy. Many of the displaced moved to Peshawar, joining the IDPs from FATA, where military operations had also displaced hundreds of thousands, particularly from Khyber Agency.[18]

C. *The Taliban and Peshawar*

Three major attacks in quick succession in September 2013 demonstrated the extent of the militants' reach in Peshawar: the 22 September bombing of a church that killed more than 80 people, mostly Christians; the 27 September attack on a bus carrying bureaucrats that killed nineteen; and the 29 September bombing of a major market-place that claimed at least 40 lives.

Security officials often blame the spike in Peshawar's violence to the presence of Afghan refugees, who are harassed by the police. Even those Afghans who cross the border for medical help are targeted. A legal adviser to a private hospital said that many Afghan patients avoided leaving the premises for fear of mistreatment by local authorities. This tendency to scapegoat Afghans is decried by some law enforcement agents; one said, "we ate their food, used them for cheap labour, exploited their women – and then blamed them for every crime".[19]

Along with animosity towards Afghanistan, blaming the refugees is also aimed at deflecting criticism of Pakistan's failure to curb cross-border militancy. For instance, responding to Afghan claims that the killer of Afghan High Peace Council chief Burhanuddin Rabbani came from Pakistan, then-Foreign Minister Hina Rabbani Khar said, "we are not responsible if Afghan refugees crossed the border and entered Kabul, stayed in a guest house and attacked Professor Rabbani".[20]

As IDPs from the KPK's conflict-hit zones now replace Afghans in the province's refugee camps, they are similarly accused of spreading crime and violence. On 21 March 2013, a car bomb killed seventeen people at the food distribution site in Jalozai camp, which hosted 12,590 families, mostly IDPs from Khyber Agency.[21] Some offi-

[18] Crisis Group Asia Report N°237, *Pakistan: No End to Humanitarian Crises*, 9 October 2012; Asia Briefings N°111, *Pakistan: The Worsening IDP Crisis*, 16 September 2010; and N°93, *Pakistan's IDP Crisis: Challenges and Opportunities*, 3 June 2009.
[19] Crisis Group interviews, Peshawar, May and April 2013.
[20] "Pakistan blames Afghan refugees for Rabbani's murder", *The Express Tribune*, 14 December 2011.
[21] Jalozai earlier hosted Afghan refugees. Muhammad Ibrar, "Heightening security fears: terror strikes Jalozai refugee camp", *The Express Tribune*, 22 March 2013.

cials characterised the attack as evidence of the nexus between IDPs and militants, accusations strongly refuted by IDP representatives.[22]

Migration from the tribal areas has brought tribal conflicts and vendettas to Peshawar, often settled through tit-for-tat killings. According to a well-informed observer, however, while "traditional tribal rivalries [exist] in small pockets of Peshawar", the city has been "overwhelmed by the spate of militancy".[23] In fact, militancy in FATA and KPK blurs tribal divisions; most senior Pakistani Taliban commanders have overtly sectarian agendas, even if there is overlap with historic tribal rivalries.

Militancy in Peshawar is far too broad, organised and well resourced to pin on refugees, IDPs or tribal rivalries. Militant groups have increasingly sophisticated arsenals, including automatic weapons and heavy explosives, and Peshawar is an attractive target. Militant networks based in Khyber, Kurram and Orakzai agencies, along with parts of Malakand, can conduct high-profile attacks on state targets, often in retaliation for military operations elsewhere in KPK and FATA. Peshawar is also an attractive target because it is KPK's financial hub. The land mafia, competing over valuable Peshawar real estate, includes Sunni extremists. Extremist groups have even grabbed graveyard land to use for recruiting people in need.[24]

The adjoining tribal belt is equally attractive, with Khyber-based militants, for instance, competing for control over a range of activities, from taxing trucks to cultivating poppy in the agency's Tirah Valley.[25] Controlling access to the Khyber Pass is particularly lucrative. Violent clashes between the Deobandi Lashkar-e-Islam and rival militant groups in Khyber Agency (discussed later) often spill over into Peshawar. Countering these threats will remain difficult so long as the FATA agencies that ring Peshawar are a no-man's land, governed by the FCR without police jurisdiction or a formal justice system.[26]

The FATA-based TTP groups targeting Peshawar are closely affiliated with al-Qaeda. For instance, Omar Khalid, heading the TTP's Mohmand faction, was previously associated with Harkat-ul-Jihad Islami, a banned anti-India sectarian organisation headquartered in Punjab and with close ties to al-Qaeda. Khalid rose as TTP's Mohmand commander in 2007, vowing to avenge the military's operation that July on Islamabad's Lal Majid (Red Mosque). KPK security officials believe he has retained his links with al-Qaeda. Following the 2 May 2011 U.S. raid that killed Osama bin Laden, Khalid vowed to take revenge on Pakistani and U.S. targets and said, "our war against America is continuing inside and outside of Pakistan". His group claimed responsibility for several incidents in Peshawar's northern sections, bordering on Mohmand Agency, including the August 2011 attack by a female suicide bomber on a police checkpost.[27]

---

[22] A police official, for instance, said refugee camps were used as hideouts by militants. "Deadly car bomb hits Pakistan's Jalozai refugee camp", BBC News, 21 March 2013. Crisis Group interview, Gul Baat Khan, head of IDP shura (local council), Jalozai camp, Peshawar, April 2013.

[23] Crisis Group interview, senior Pashtun journalist, Islamabad, April 2013.

[24] Crisis Group interviews, Shia leaders, real estate agents, Peshawar, April-May 2013. Mohammad Ashfaq, "Walls to be built around graveyards in Peshawar", *Dawn*, 4 December 2012.

[25] Crisis Group interview, ANP leader and former provincial minister Iftikhar Hussain, Peshawar, 29 April 2013.

[26] Crisis Group Report, *Countering Militancy in FATA*, op. cit.

[27] Crisis Group interviews, Peshawar, May 2013; "Pakistani Taliban vow revenge attacks on U.S. targets", *Dawn*, 6 June 2011; "Pakistani Taliban claim female suicide attack in Peshawar", *Dawn*, 12 August 2011.

Following Bin Laden's killing and in retaliation for Dr Shakil Afridi's involvement in identifying the Abbottabad compound, attacks against polio vaccination workers have become routine in Peshawar. On 18 December 2012, six were killed in apparently coordinated attacks in Peshawar and Karachi. On 7 October 2013, two people were killed in an attack on a police van escorting a polio vaccination team in Peshawar's Badaber village.[28] Other targets include Peshawar's schools, CD and DVD shops and marketplaces. Militants have warned shopkeepers that "selling sex drugs, vulgar films and obscene movies are against Sharia". In October 2009, a car bomb at a women's and children's market killed more than 130 people and injured around 200. On 29 September 2013, an attack on another Peshawar market killed more than 40 and injured over 100.

TTP groups have also frequently attacked state targets in Peshawar. On 15 December 2012, militants struck Peshawar airport; all five fighters, reportedly Uzbeks and possibly members of the banned Islamic Movement of Uzbekistan, were killed.[29] Less than two weeks later, a suicide bomber killed KPK's senior minister and ANP leader Bashir Bilour. In February 2013, an attack killed four policemen, reportedly to avenge the death of al-Qaeda leader Badar Mansoor in a U.S. drone strike. In March 2013, militants hit Peshawar's judicial complex, killing four people.[30] According to an Islamabad-based think-tank, the Pakistan Institute of Peace Studies (PIPS), between 1 January and 12 May 2013 alone, 100 people were killed in terrorist violence in Peshawar, including twelve election-related attacks that claimed 22 lives. From May to December, 239 people were killed in terrorist attacks in the city.[31]

Law enforcement agencies have especially been targeted in Peshawar's southwestern villages of Badaber and Mattani, which lead to FATA. Police checkposts, stations and patrolling parties have been attacked with sophisticated arms, including rockets. Aftab Ahmed Khan Sherpao, a former interior minister and currently the president of Qaumi Watan Party (QWP), then a coalition partner in Imran Khan's Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI)-led KPK government, said that the province's best officers have been "cherry picked" by the militants.[32] In March 2012, a suicide bomber killed the superintendent of police (SP) (rural), Kalam Khan, who had overseen police operations in Mattani. In October 2012, militants killed his successor, SP (rural) Khurshid Khan and a Frontier Constabulary officer; their severed heads were found the next morning in a market place.[33] On 25 May 2013, a police convoy was attacked in Mattani, killing seven policemen.

According to data compiled by KPK police, 46 police personnel were killed in 2011 and 36 in 2012. In 2013, 49 police were killed in terror attacks.[34] Targeted strikes on

[28] "Six polio workers shot dead in Pakistan: police", *The Express Tribune*, 18 December 2012; Ali Hazrat and Ashfaq Yusufzai, "Polio team attacked near Peshawar; 2 dead", *Dawn*, 8 October 2013.
[29] Riaz Ahmad and Umer Farooq, "Three people killed, 46 injured as attack on Peshawar airport repelled", *Dawn*, 15 December 2012. "Uzbek militants behind Peshawar Airport attack", *Nation*, 17 December 2012.
[30] Ali Hazrat Bacha, "Suicide bombers kill 4 policemen in Peshawar", *Dawn*, 25 February 2012; "Suicide bombing at Peshawar Judicial Complex kills four", *The Express Tribune*, 18 March 2013.
[31] Statistics provided to Crisis Group by PIPS; "Elections 2013: Violence against Political Parties, Candidates and Voters", Pakistan Institute for Peace Studies, May 2013.
[32] Crisis Group interview, Islamabad, 23 July 2013. The QWP resigned from the coalition on 14 November 2013.
[33] Ali Hazrat Bacha, "Severed heads of SP, FC man found in Matani", *Dawn*, 19 October 2012.
[34] Crisis Group telephone interview, KPK police, 13 December 2013. Earlier statistics provided by KPK police, Peshawar, May 2013.

the police continue, with two killed and five wounded in three separate attacks in Peshawar on 6 January 2014 and another killed two days later. The Intelligence Bureau (IB), which tracks sectarian outfits, has also been targeted, including a July 2013 killing of two former IB officials in Peshawar.[35]

D. *The Sectarian Dimension*

Punjab-based sectarian outfits increasingly shape the agenda of TTP groups. As a result, sectarian conflict has become endemic, particularly in those regions of KPK and FATA with large Shia populations. The Sunni extremist and southern Punjab-based Lashkar-e-Jhangvi (LeJ), which was instrumental in the TTP's formation, continues to be a major player in and around Peshawar. By early 2008, the town of Dara Adam Khel, located between Peshawar and Kohat, had become a LeJ stronghold. TTP chief Hakimullah Mehshud, killed in the 1 November 2013 drone attack, had close ties to LeJ and targeted Shias in FATA. Other senior LeJ-affiliated TTP commanders include former spokesmen Azam Tariq and Ehsanullah Ehsan.[36] As mentioned earlier, Mohmand-based militant leader Omar Khalid was an activist of the sectarian Harkat-ul-Jihad Islami.[37]

The TTP's Dara Adam Khel chapter, founded by Tariq Afridi, also espouses an overtly sectarian agenda. Afridi was previously an LeJ activist. Since 2008, his group has stopped cars on the Dara Adam Khel road and killed Shia passengers. According to a tribesman, militants stopped his car on the way to South Waziristan, asking him to remove his shirt to see if he had welts on his back from Shia self-flagellation rituals. In August 2012, the Afridi faction claimed responsibility for the August 2012 attack in KPK's Mansehra district during which twenty Shias were pulled from a bus and shot dead.[38]

In the 1980s, the Shia Turis, colloquially known as "Kurmi Shias", the dominant clan in Kurram agency's administrative centre Parachinar, refused to support the anti-Soviet jihad in Afghanistan. As a result, they were targeted by Sunni extremists. Responding to attacks from Sunni militants, the leader of the Shia Tehreek-Jafria Pakistan, Allama Ariful Husseini, a Parachinar-based Turi, called for a militant Shia response. He was killed in Peshawar in 1988. After the U.S. intervention in Afghanistan, the Turis also refused to provide shelter to al-Qaeda and Taliban forces fleeing that country. Sectarian conflict escalated in April 2007, when an attack on a Shia procession killed over 50 people. By September 2008, more than 1,500 had been killed and 5,000 injured.[39] Many Shias from Kurram Agency have since migrated to Peshawar, some joining or supporting Shia groups that draw on Husseini's doctrine for a strong

[35] E. Javed Aziz Khan, "Cop killed, 3 injured in Peshawar attacks", *Dawn*, 9 January 2014. Riaz Ahmad, "'Second killing': Former IB official shot dead", *The Express Tribune*, 12 July 2013

[36] An observer described Mehsud as the "scourge of Shias in Kurram". "Hakimullah as Taliban leader", *Daily Times*, 24 August 2009. M. Ilyas Khan, "Formidable power of Pakistan's anti-Shia militants", *Dawn*, 2 January 2013.

[37] Iqbal Khattak, "'Mohmand Agency now under Taliban's control'", *Daily Times*, 24 July 2008.

[38] Crisis Group interview, Peshawar, June 2013. During Muharram, the first month of the Islamic calendar, Shias commemorate the Battle of Karbala with public displays of mourning. Amir Mir, "Intra-TTP rift led to commander Afridi's murder", *The News*, 17 February 2013; "Shia killing: TTP claims responsibility for Mansehra attack", *The Express Tribune*, 16 August 2012.

[39] Crisis Group Report, *The Militant Jihadi Challenge*, op. cit., p. 15.

Shia response, including retaliation against sectarian threats. A Shia leader warned that if the community arms itself for revenge, "the bloodshed will not stop".[40]

Sunni extremists have established themselves within many Peshawar neighbourhoods, particularly around Rasheed Garhi, Wazir Bagh, one of the oldest parts of the city. "These people are getting property in the middle of our areas", said a Shia leader.[41] In August 2013, the U.S. imposed sanctions on a Lashkar-e-Tayyaba/Jamaat-ud-Dawa (LeT/JD)-linked madrasa in the Wazir Bagh area for training and financing al-Qaeda and other militants.[42]

Dozens of Shias were murdered in Peshawar in 2013, including in the 21 June attack on a Shia mosque and seminary on the city's outskirts that killed fifteen.[43] Sunni extremists maintain "hit lists" of prominent Shias in Peshawar and often outsource to hired guns, usually "young men riding motorcycles, whose major activity is to kill Shias", according to a Peshawar-based Shia elder. A security official said guns-for-hire are paid 20,000 rupees (roughly $200) per hit. In March 2013, when a bureaucrat, Khwaja Imran Ali, a Shia, was assassinated, Shias rejected media reports that he was targeted because he worked for the government. They believed it was because he was a well-known *marsia khwa* (reciter of the Shia elegy). Many Shias in Peshawar fear that they are being monitored by sectarian outfits, including at Shia forums. "When the extremists come to know that any Shia is too assertive, they kill him", said a Shia activist. "Even a crockery seller was killed after he was too vocal in one of our internal meetings".[44]

If Sunni religious leaders are critical of the Sunni Deobandi Taliban, they are often depicted as apostates and Shia supporters. For instance, after former Jamaat-i-Islami (JI) chief Qazi Hussain Ahmed made a distinction between militancy in FATA as *fasaad* (disorder) and militancy in Afghanistan as jihad (holy war), TTP leader Hakimullah Mehsud issued a video message that Qazi "prays behind Shias, and allies and unites with them".[45] Qazi survived a militant attack in November 2012.

An extremist Sunni alliance, the Muttahida Deeni Mahaz (MDM), fielded candidates from Peshawar for the 11 May 2013 polls, including one whose alias, Babu Muwaiya Mauvia, was a reference to a sixth-century Arab ruler who fought against the Prophet Mohammed's cousin and son-in-law, Ali, the central religious figure for Shias. According to the MDM's manifesto, all key state officials, including "the president, prime minister, chief justice, senate chairman, national assembly speaker, all forces' chiefs, provincial governors, chief ministers and heads of intelligence agencies will have to be male Sunni Muslims". The party's convener announced that "non-Muslims and apostates will be banned from main public office jobs in Pakistan".[46]

---

[40] Crisis Group interview, Peshawar, July 2013.
[41] Crisis Group interview, Peshawar, May 2013.
[42] Zulfiqar Ali, "Peshawar seminary on US terrorist list: Wanted man a frequent international traveller", *Dawn*, 22 August 2013.
[43] "Bomber targets Shias in Peshawar; 15 killed", *Daily Times*, 22 June 2013.
[44] Crisis Group interviews, Peshawar, April-May 2013.
[45] Hakimullah Mehsud's video message (Pashto language) at www.youtube.com/watch?v=6Y948P7I8vY. See also "Khaled Ahmed, "Our pathology of fear", *The Express Tribune*, 24 November 2012; and "Former JI chief Qazi Hussain escapes suicide attack in Mohmand", *Dawn*, 19 November 2012.
[46] Umer Nangiana, "Upcoming elections: ASWJ, JUI-S, three others form alliance", *The Express Tribune*, 26 March 2013.

The MDM formed an alliance with the Pakistan Rah-e-Haq Party (PRHP), a political front for the banned Lashkar-e-Jhangvi and its parent organisation, the Sipah-e-Sahaba Pakistan (SSP, subsequently renamed the Ahle Sunnat Wal Jamaat) in Peshawar. Although the leader of a Shia organisation filed a petition with the Election Commission of Pakistan (ECP) to bar PRHP members from contesting the election, they were allowed to participate.[47] PRHP founder Qazi Saifullah Khan contested from Peshawar. The party's president, Ibrahim Qasmi, who had earlier held a provincial assembly seat from Peshawar as an independent, gained the second highest number of votes.[48]

Intra-Sunni tensions have also sparked sectarian conflict in and around Peshawar. Some of the fiercest clashes in Khyber Agency and surrounding areas, including the city, have been between the TTP's Khyber faction, the Lashkar-e-Islam and a Barelvi militant group, the Ansar-ul-Islam. Corpses of their commanders and foot soldiers are often found in Peshawar and its outskirts. In January 2012, an Ansar-ul-Islam commander, Haji Akhunzada, was killed in a suicide attack there, reportedly by the Lashkar-e-Islam. The Laskhar is also suspected of bombing the Jalozai refugee camp in March 2013, targeting IDPs who had fled the fighting in Khyber Agency.[49]

E. *Peshawar's No-Man's Land*

Badaber, Mattani and other rural outskirts of Peshawar are infested with criminal gangs. Some of these outlying areas are considered out of bounds – "'no-go areas" for locals and security personnel since as early as the 1970s.[50] This is partly due to their location. Badaber and Mattani connect FR Kohat and Khyber Agency with Peshawar. Drugs and guns in FR Kohat's Dara Adam Khel and smuggled goods from Khyber Agency end up in the lawless parts of FR Peshawar, where police cannot pursue criminals for lack of jurisdiction.[51]

As in the rest of FATA, criminals in FR Peshawar are closely linked to militant groups – with the TTP's Dara Adam Khel faction and the Lashkar-e-Islam and Ansar-ul-Islam in Khyber agency. According to a FATA Secretariat official, this convergence of militant and criminal networks was largely responsible for the "quantum leap of violence" in Peshawar's outlying areas.[52] Most terrorist attacks in Peshawar between 2011 and 2012 took place in Badaber and Mattani, which were also the venues of terror attacks in 2013. The Badaber market, lying between Dara and Peshawar, has been bombed several times. Militants have also targeted schools and polio vaccination workers in the area.[53]

[47] "Sipah-e-Yazid terrorists attack Imamia Jirga leader for objection to their candidatures", Shite-News (www.shitenews.com), 7 April 2013.
[48] He won around 10,000 votes. Election Commission of Pakistan (ECP), www.ecp.gov.pk.
[49] "Aman Lashkar leader among 4 killed in Peshawar", *The News*, 27 June 2012. Suhail Kakakhel, "Car bomb kills 17 in Jalozai camp", *Dawn*, 22 March 2013.
[50] Crisis Group interviews, Peshawar, May 2013.
[51] Crisis Group interview, police official, Peshawar, May 2013.
[52] Crisis Group interview, Peshawar, May 2013.
[53] For instance, on 16 December, four bomb disposal squad officers were killed in a terror attack in Badhabar. "Four BDS men killed in Peshawar bomb blast", *Daily Times*, 17 December 2013. Javed Aziz Khan, "Polio volunteer killed in Peshawar attack", *The News*, 29 May 2013.

Kidnappings-for-ransom and other lucrative crimes are rampant.[54] Criminals often sell an abducted person, especially a high-profile individual, to militant groups due to their "higher retaining capacity". They also exploit the blurred lines between criminality and religious militancy. According to a senior Peshawar-based police official, "groups involved in extortion and kidnappings are doing so primarily for themselves but use the Taliban's name" to provoke more fear in both the victims and the state and so extract more money.[55]

F. *KPK's Policy Response*

Political parties in KPK that are averse to Pakistan's partnership with the U.S.-led "war against terrorism" and particularly the U.S.-led intervention in Afghanistan tend to depict the challenge of violent extremism in Peshawar as externally driven. They also emphasise that militancy in FATA is a primary driving factor for violence in Peshawar and advocate a military or paramilitary response. FATA authorities, however, argue that Peshawar's violence is internally driven, with the KPK government blaming FATA-based actors to defer responsibility.[56] Although military support for Afghan and selected Pakistani jihadi proxies in FATA has contributed to the growth of violent extremism in Peshawar, militant violence predates the U.S. intervention in Afghanistan. While there are close links between FATA-based and Peshawar-based militant and local criminal networks, primary responsibility to counter militancy in the province belongs to the KPK government and police. This is not to deny the need for a nationally integrated counter-terrorism approach, which includes mainstreaming FATA.

The PTI-led government and its JI coalition partner blame militancy squarely on the U.S. military presence in Afghanistan and the CIA's drone strikes in FATA. Chief Minister Pervez Khattak echoed this in a July 2013 letter to Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif.[57] The party blames Islamabad for not forcing the U.S. to halt the drone attacks that it claims are the primary driving force behind militant recruitment. It is also the most vocal proponent of negotiating with the militants, without their cessation of violence and adherence to the constitution. In September 2013, Imran Khan suggested that Islamabad allow the TTP to open an office, though the party subsequently said that was his personal view.[58] The PTI has also tried engaging the militants through Samiul Haq, who heads his faction of the Jamiat Ulema-e-Islam (JUI-S) and is commonly called the "godfather of the Taliban", since many Afghan Taliban leaders, including Mullah Omar, are graduates of his madrasa, Darul Uloom Haqqania, in KPK's Akora Khattak town.[59]

---

[54] According to official statistics, at least 52 kidnap-for-ransom cases were reported in Peshawar in 2013; another 82 involved financial disputes. "192 kidnaped in Peshawar during 2013", *The News*, 16 December 2013.

[55] Crisis Group interviews, law enforcement officials, Peshawar, April-May 2013.

[56] Crisis Group interviews, FATA Secretariat, Peshawar, May 2013.

[57] According to PTI chairman Imran Khan, while fanaticism was at its peak in Pakistan, "in the next six months, after the exit of the U.S. from Afghanistan, fanaticism would start subsiding". "Imran opposes U.S. drone, Indian Kashmir policies", *The News*, 9 December 2012. "Instead of APC, KP wants talks with army", *Dawn*, 26 July 2013.

[58] "Tehreek-e-Taliban should open an office: Imran Khan", *The Express Tribune*, 25 September 2013; "PTI distances itself from Imran's Taliban office statement", *Dawn*, 27 September 2013.

[59] Iftikhar Firdous, "Consensus building: the politics of peace talks", *The Express Tribune*, 5 July 2013. "They (the Taliban) are my students", said Samiul Haq, "In our tradition, a teacher is like a

The QWP, PTI's coalition partner until it quit the KPK government in November 2013, is sceptical about appeasing the militants. According to party president Sherpao, establishing the state's writ in Peshawar's periphery should be the first step toward achieving peace in the city. Instead of futile attempts to influence the militants, he said, the priority should be "to secure the provincial capital, so as to send a message to the militants that the government means business". He also criticised the provincial government for only privately sympathising with families of victims of terror attacks while refusing to condemn the perpetrators publicly.[60]

Peshawar-based police, who have borne the brunt of militant violence, are concerned about the KPK government's disinclination to confront the militants. They also resent that it has either failed or been slow to condemn terrorist attacks and that PTI leaders rarely attend the funerals of slain officers. On 1 October, the provincial legislature unanimously condemned the September 2013 attacks in Peshawar but also renewed calls for dialogue with extremists, sending mixed messages that will likely further demoralise the police. A Peshawar-based officer said, "give the police a policy: are we friends or enemies with [militants]?"[61]

father, like a spiritual leader", also describing Mullah Omar as "an angel-like human being". "Mullah Omar is angel-like human: Samiul Haq", Reuters, 15 September 2013.

[60] Crisis Group interview, Islamabad, 23 July 2013.

[61] Crisis Group interview, senior police officer, Peshawar, August 2013. "KP Assembly wants early talks with Taliban", *Dawn*, 2 October 2013.

III. Quetta: A Dangerous Junction

A. *Geography and Demographics*

Urban violence in Quetta is driven by its geostrategic location, ethno-regional politics and the legacy of military rule. The city lies at the junction of Balochistan's two main ethno-linguistic regions. Pashtuns, its largest ethnic group, inhabit the city's north, which forms part of a broader Pashtun belt comprising Balochistan's northern region, KPK and eastern Afghanistan. Balochistan's Pashtun belt is labelled by the Pashtun nationalist Pakhtunkhwa Milli Awami Party (PKMAP) as "southern Khyber Pakhtunkhwa".[62] The second-largest ethnic group, the Baloch, inhabit the city's south, which connects to majority Baloch areas in the province's centre and south and regions bordering on the Iranian province of Sistan-Balochistan. Other ethnic groups include the Brahui, largely in Quetta's predominately Baloch areas, and Punjabis, mohajirs, and Sindhis, commonly referred to as "settlers", in the urban centre.[63] Many of the latter have taken refuge in Quetta from other parts of the province to evade Baloch insurgents' attacks.[64]

The predominately Shia Hazaras live in the city's eastern and western parts. They have migrated there from Afghanistan for over a century to escape persecution by Sunni Pashtuns, whether under King Abdur Rahman Khan (1880-1901), known as "Iron Amir" for his authoritarian methods, or the Taliban in the 1990s. They were granted citizenship rights by General Ayub Khan's regime in the 1960s. A Hazara, General Musa Khan became Ayub's army commander-in-chief; Hazaras presently fill almost 50 per cent of Balochistan's army officer quota.[65]

Quetta's population is officially estimated at 1.3 million, including 500,000-600,000 Pashtun, 450,000-550,000 Baloch and 250,000 Hazaras. All three ethnic groups claim higher numbers.[66] The PKMAP says the 1998 census grossly under-counted Pashtuns, since they boycotted it, anticipating a Baloch nationalist-led provincial government would deliberately "under-report" them.[67]

The Afghan refugee issue has become subsumed in Quetta's ethnic politics. While the PKMAP seeks a flexible policy towards the predominately Pashtun refugees, Baloch

[62] Crisis Group interview, Abdur Rahim Mandokhel, PKMAP senior vice chairman, National Assembly member, Islamabad, June 2013. The other major Pashtun parties in Balochistan include the ANP and the JUI-F. Major Baloch nationalist parties include the Balochistan National Party-Mengal (BNP-M) and the National Party (NP).

[63] Brahuis, as here, are usually included in the Baloch ethnic category. The "settlers", descendants of migrants, resist this label, pointing to decades-long presence in and contribution to the province. Baloch critics contend they migrated to exploit its resources at the cost of locals. Crisis Group interviews, Islamabad, Quetta, July-August 2013. According to Sardar Akhtar Jan Mengal, BNP-M president, many Baloch describe Balochistan's first provincial constituency, PB-1, as the "settlers' constituency". Crisis Group interview, Islamabad, 10 July 2013.

[64] After the killings of Punjabis in other parts of the province, many moved to Quetta. Others left the province. "Settlers – caught in crossfire", *Dawn*, 28 June 2011.

[65] Amir Mateen, "Hazaras at history's crossroads", *The News*, 1 June 2012.

[66] The groups' claims appear valid, since the last provincial budget made allocations for 2.5 million people in Quetta. Amir Mateen, "Eyewitness Balochistan – cloud of 'censusgeddon' in the offing", *The News*, 11 June 2012.

[67] Haris Gazdar, Sobia Ahmad Kakar, Irfan Khan, "Buffer Zone, Colonial Enclave or Urban Hub? Quetta: Between Four Regions and Two Wars", Collective for Social Science Research, London School of Economics, February 2010.

leaders believe that the influx of Afghans has tipped the scale towards Pashtuns.[68] According to the UN High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR), 337,000 mostly Pashtun Afghan refugees (11 percent of the total number of Afghan refugees) resided in Quetta in 2005. As of 2013, there were 173,645 registered Afghan refugees there.[69] They are relatively better integrated than in Peshawar, with many establishing businesses and many, as in KPK, illegally acquiring Pakistani national identity cards. While Pashtun leaders are confident that the next census should reflect a larger percentage of Pashtuns, Baloch parties are concerned that migration from Punjab and elsewhere, including for large development projects such as in the southern port of Gwadar, could turn the Baloch into a minority in their own province. They also insist that the Pashtuns are favoured in official appointments at the cost of the Baloch.[70]

Despite these tensions, there is little conflict between the Baloch and Pashtun. PKMAP leaders acknowledge the Baloch have just grievances.[71] Mainstream Baloch and Pashtun parties cooperated in opposing Musharraf's military rule and have jointly protested the smaller provinces' marginalisation. Moreover, the Baloch and Pashtuns have developed conflict-resolution mechanisms to address local grievances and have adopted during Pakistan's infrequent democratic interludes a Lebanese-style power-distribution model whereby the top two posts, chief minister and governor, are shared between the Pashtun and Baloch leaderships.

During Musharraf's regime, mainstream Baloch nationalist parties boycotted the 2002 election to protest the denial of Baloch rights. Following a brutal military operation in which major Baloch leaders were killed, including former Balochistan governor Nawab Akbar Bugti, this alienation sparked a province-wide insurgency, discussed below. As military operations continued, the Baloch parties boycotted the 2008 polls that brought the PPP to power in the centre. In his maiden speech to parliament after the restoration of democracy, Prime Minister Yousaf Raza Gilani committed his government to address Baloch grievances. A special aid package was announced, the province's share in the federal divisible funding pool was increased, and the eighteenth constitutional amendment was adopted, which, by devolving powers from the federal to the provincial level, addressed many longstanding Baloch grievances against Islamabad.[72]

Yet, continuing military operations, including enforced disappearances and extrajudicial killings (discussed below) undermined the prospects for reconciliation.[73] According to Senator Mir Hasil Khan Bizenjo, senior vice president of the National Party (NP), a Baloch nationalist party and coalition partner in Balochistan's provincial government, the announcement of the reconciliation package coincided with the discovery of mutilated bodies in various parts of the province. Other Baloch nationalist

[68] Crisis Group interview, Senator Mir Hasil Khan Bizenjo (NP), Islamabad, June 2013.
[69] The 2005 figure is based on a UNHCR census of Afghan refugees; the more recent figure is based on a registration exercise begun in 2006. Many Afghans, seeking to stay on in Pakistan, do not register as refugees and are regarded by authorities as illegal immigrants.
[70] Crisis Group interviews, PKMAP, BNP-M and National Party members, Quetta, June 2013. Also, Crisis Group Report N°119, *The Worsening Crisis in Balochistan*, 14 September 2006.
[71] Crisis Group interview, PKMAP leader Abdur Rahim Mandokhel, Quetta, June 2013.
[72] Crisis Group Asia Report N°249, *Parliament's Role in Pakistan's Democratic Transition*, 18 September 2013.
[73] Statement of Ali Dayan Khan, Pakistan Director, Human Rights Watch, to the U.S. House Committee on Foreign Affairs subcommittee on oversight and investigations' hearing on Balochistan, 8 February 2012.

leaders were sceptical that the eighteenth amendment's provisions for provincial autonomy or additional constraints on authoritarian interventions would yield tangible results. The Balochistan National Party (Mengal) (BNP-M) president, Akhtar Jan Mengal, drew comparisons to earlier constitutional clauses that prohibit coups on paper but fail to do so in practice: "Isn't there already Article 6 [a treason provision] on paper that is supposed to stop military coups?"[74]

The continuing democratic transition nevertheless provides opportunities to address Baloch grievances through the political process. In September 2012, Mengal ended his self-imposed exile and, before the Supreme Court, identified six points to resolve the conflict, including an end to the military's "overt and covert operations against the Baloch"; the presentation of all missing persons before a court; and disbanding "death squads" allegedly run by the military's intelligence agencies, the Inter-Services Intelligence Directorate (ISI) and Military Intelligence (MI). He also called for an end to ISI and MI interference in Baloch political affairs; accountability of those responsible for torture and extrajudicial killings; and rehabilitation of thousands of conflict-displaced Baloch.[75]

Along with the National Party, the BNP-M decided to contest the 2013 polls. The Balochistan national and provincial assembly elections were, however, deeply flawed.[76] Hindered in its ability to campaign and mobilise its supporters, the BNP-M won only three of 65 seats in the Balochistan assembly, the result, even an Islamist opponent acknowledged, of its unwillingness to "agree to the terms of the military". The announcement of the returns from Mengal's constituency was delayed two days, contradicting electoral norms.[77] Rejecting the results, the party initially refused to take part in the provincial legislative.

Despite the flawed process, Balochistan still has possibly its most credible provincial government since the 1990s. With the NP, PKMAP and the PML-N forming a broad coalition, the key to ensuring ethnic harmony – the Baloch-Pashtun executive formula mentioned earlier – has been restored. NP leader Dr Abdul Malik Baloch is now chief minister, and PKMAP's Mohammed Khan Achakzai is governor.[78]

[74] Crisis Group interviews, Islamabad, June, 10 July 2013.
[75] Azam Khan, "A province in crisis: fiery Mengal presents six points for building trust in Balochistan", *The Express Tribune*, 28 September 2012.
[76] Unlike for other provinces, the ECP did not put a final polling scheme on its website. According to its statistics, Balochistan was the only province whose turnout dropped from 2008, by 67,000 votes (5 per cent). One constituency's turnout was just over 1 per cent. According to the EU's Election Observation Mission (EOM) turnout in southern Baloch-dominated districts was reportedly less than 10 per cent, "in part due to blockades". The EOM did not, however, observe polling, due to security concerns, and private TV channels were blacked out in several areas. Absent oversight by international and most national observers and with the civil administration and ECP forced to rely on the military for security and access, there were some implausible results, including the poor showing of the BNP-M, which has considerable local support but whose agenda is considered too radical by the civil and military bureaucracies. "Final report, Pakistan 2013: EU EOM, July 2013; ECP website, www.ecp.gov.pk.
[77] Crisis Group interview, JUI-F leader, Quetta, June 2013; Akhtar Mengal, Islamabad, 10 July 2013.
[78] Mohammad Khan is the elder brother of PKMAP chief Mahmood Khan Achakzai.

B. *The Baloch Insurgency*

As in KPK, Musharraf rigged the 2002 elections to sideline political opposition – in this case Baloch and Pashtun secular parties – in favour of the MMA, which formed a provincial coalition government with the military-backed Pakistan Muslim League-Quaid-i-Azam (PML-Q).[79] Several Islamist militants were released from prison as a MMA precondition for cooperation. While the PML-Q obtained the chief minister's slot, the Deobandi JUI-F, with ideological and historical links to the Afghan Taliban, acquired several important and lucrative ministries. Many Taliban leaders found refuge in Quetta's affluent neighbourhoods after the October 2001 U.S.-led intervention in Afghanistan. The Deobandi madrasa network expanded under the Islamist-dominated government.[80]

While the Pashtun Islamists and their allies flourished under the Musharraf regime, Baloch alienation reached new heights. Hundreds, if not thousands, of Baloch nationalists and sympathisers were reportedly abducted, tortured or killed by the military or paramilitary Frontier Corps, resulting in a Baloch insurgency that has spread province-wide.[81]

The most prominent insurgent groups include the Balochistan Liberation Army (BLA), led by Nawab Khair Bakhsh Marri's son, Hybariar Marri, and the Baloch Liberation Front (BLF). The BLA has increasingly rejected mainstream politics for armed struggle. A veteran politician and leader of the radical Baloch nationalist movement, Khair Bakhsh Marri has criticised the mainstream Baloch political parties for focusing their struggle on Balochistan, an administrative unit, rather than the Baloch cause, an ethnic struggle.[82] A BLA-affiliated unit claimed responsibility for the November 2011 suicide attack in Quetta, the first carried out by a Baloch insurgent group.[83] The BLA has likewise been blamed for killing Punjabi "settlers" in Balochistan, including Quetta. It was also the first to strike in Balochistan's Pashtun belt, with the August 2013 bombing of the building in Ziarat where Pakistan's founder, Mohammad Ali Jinnah, spent his last days.[84]

The Allah Nazar-led faction of the BLF, active in the province's southern belt, has targeted not only the security forces but also mainstream nationalist parties, particularly the NP. The BLF's fighters include many professionals who participated in student politics, including on Quetta's campuses. Balochistan University in Quetta is thought to have many members and sympathisers of the BLF student wing, the Baloch Students Organisation (BSO) (Azad). The university is heavily guarded and monitored by the Frontier Corps.[85]

---

[79] Crisis Group Report, *The Worsening Crisis in Balochistan*, op. cit.
[80] Crisis Group Asia Report N°102, *Authoritarianism and Political Party Reform in Pakistan*, 28 September 2005; Crisis Group Report, *The Mullahs and the Military*, op. cit.
[81] Crisis Report, *The Worsening Conflict in Balochistan*; and Briefing, *The Forgotten Conflict in Balochistan*, both op. cit.
[82] Blog post, Malik Siraj Akbar, "EXCLUSIVE: Interview with Nawab Khair Baksh Marri", 14 June 2008, http://gmcmissing.wordpress.com/2008/06/14/exclusive-interview-with-nawab-khair-baksh-marri/. Marri's son, Balach, was killed in the 2007 military operation. Marri now lives in Karachi.
[83] "BLA claims responsibility of the blast in Quetta: 13 killed", *Dawn*, 31 November 2011.
[84] Also known as the Ziarat residency, it was the summer residence of the British governor general's agent.
[85] Crisis Group interviews, politicians and journalists, Quetta, June 2013.

C. *Sectarian Violence*

Sunnis are the majority sect in Quetta. Estimates of the city's mostly Hazara Shia population range between 10 and 15 per cent.[86] There are also some Hindus and followers of the Sunni minority Zikri sect. Ultra-orthodox Sunnis have called for the Zikris to be declared non-Muslim.[87] Hazaras are prominent in the trading community and provincial bureaucracy, including the police. Their sect, ethnicity and distinct physical appearance make them particularly vulnerable to attacks from Sunni extremist groups such as the Lashkar-e-Jhangvi. Fearing Sunni extremists and resentful of the state's failure to protect, they refuse to allow non-Hazaras into Hazara-majority sections such as Mehrabad and Hazara Town.[88]

More than 550 Hazaras have been killed in terror attacks since the 4 July 2003 suicide bombing of a Hazara mosque in Quetta that killed over 50. Reportedly, 100 Shias were killed in Balochistan in 2012 alone, mostly Hazaras in Quetta as well as Shias travelling by road to neighbouring Iran. Hazara traders and Shia pilgrims use the south-western route to Iran, and many are accused of spying for Tehran.[89]

The LeJ is responsible for the majority of attacks on Balochistan's Shias. Its parent organisation, the Sipah-e-Sahaba Pakistan, which emerged under the Zia regime, was backed by the Saudis to counter Iran's influence after the 1979 revolution. Because Balochistan borders on Iran, the province and its capital became a major SSP base, with LeJ leader Haq Nawaz Jhangvi moving to Quetta in the mid-1980s. The LeJ is now the most powerful sectarian organisation in the city and province.

In mid-July 2011, the Supreme Court released the present LeJ leader, Malik Ishaq, on bail after the prosecution failed to produce sufficient evidence for a single conviction in 44 cases involving 70 alleged homicides.[90] Subsequently heading rallies inciting sectarian violence, Ishaq further galvanised his group's Balochistan faction. This was evident in the sharp spike in Shia killings in Quetta that soon followed and which many law enforcement officials attributed to his anti-Shia exhortations after his release.[91] In 2011, these included the 29 July attack on a bus terminal targeting travellers to Iran, killing seven; the suicide bomb on 31 August that killed eleven Shias celebrating Eid-ul-Fitr; and the 4 October gun attack on a bus that killed twelve Hazaras. On 20 September, LeJ gunmen forced 29 Shia pilgrims off a bus to Iran in Mastung and executed them. Two of the deadliest attacks occurred in early 2013: the 10 January suicide and car bomb attack on the Hazara-populated Alamdar Road that killed over

[86] Crisis Group telephone interview, former population census official, December 2013. Since these estimates are based on a 2011 household survey, the actual numbers could be higher.
[87] "International Religious Freedom Report: Pakistan", U.S. Department of State, 2004.
[88] Crisis Group interviews, Quetta, June 2013.
[89] "World Report 2013: Pakistan", Human Rights Watch, 2013. Saleem Javed, "A brief history of Hazara persecution", *The Friday Times*, 2-8 March 2012. On 1 January 2014, one person was killed and 34 wounded in Quetta in a suicide attack on a bus carrying Shia pilgrims returning from Iran. Saleem Shahid, "Suicide blast hits pilgrims' bus", *Dawn* 2 January 2014.
[90] He had been detained since 1997. He was acquitted in 34 cases and given bail in the rest. In an interview with an Urdu language daily in October 1997, Ishaq had admitted involvement in the killing of 102 people. In prison he allegedly continued to plan terror operations. "Lashkar-e-Jhangvi leader Malik Ishaq released", *Daily Times*, 15 July 2011; "Lashkar-e-Jhangvi and the 'lack of evidence'", *Dawn*, 17 July 2011.
[91] Crisis Group interviews, Quetta, Karachi and Lahore, June-October 2013.

100; and the 16 February bomb attack that killed more than 80, mostly Shias, in Hazara town.[92]

In its pamphlets, the LeJ's Quetta branch cites activities in other parts of the country, including FATA's Kurram Agency, to demonstrate the organisation's strength and thus draw local recruits.[93] It also relies on a countrywide network of militant groups for financing and other resources. Guns are obtained in KPK and FATA, and explosives used in LeJ attacks, such as for the January 2013 Alamdar Road incident, have been traced to Punjab. According to a veteran journalist, sectarian violence in Quetta is "remote-controlled" from the Punjab headquarters.[94] The LeJ has drawn on foreign fighters linked to al-Qaeda, including Uzbeks, who have similar facial characteristics, to infiltrate and conduct attacks in Hazara-populated sections of Quetta city where non-Hazaras are denied entry. It has also used veiled female suicide bombers, who more easily evade checks by law enforcement agencies.[95]

Speaking in the Senate after the Alamdar Road attack, then-Interior Minister Rehman Malik described a nexus between LeJ, al-Qaeda and the BLA but gave no evidence regarding the BLA. Earlier, in 2012, he had asserted that BLA and LeJ had a five-year relationship.[96] In a preliminary statement following a fact-finding mission to Balochistan in June 2013, the Human Rights Commission of Pakistan (HRCP) reported conflicting and unconfirmed reports of the LeJ-BLA connection; one member described the evidence as "circumstantial" at best.[97]

A former senior Balochistan police official insisted that the two outfits have a common target, the Hazaras, but for different reasons; the LeJ as a Shia target, the BLA as a non-Baloch ethnic group with a major economic and administrative role in the provincial capital.[98] Yet, the attacks on Hazaras are clearly sectarian in nature; there is scant evidence of BLA involvement, and there are vast differences between BLA and LeJ targets. The former's attack on the Ziarat residency and the LeJ attack on a Bolan Medical Complex bus might have taken place the same day (16 June 2013), but the first targeted Jinnah's last resting place, which symbolises the Pakistani state, while the latter specifically targeted Hazara Shias. The same was the case on 10 July, when the BLA attacked a Frontier Corps vehicle in Quetta, and the LeJ attacked Shia Hazaras on Alamdar Road.

The response to attacks against and threats to Shias in Quetta has been lackadaisical. After the deadly January and February 2013 incidents described above, families of Hazara victims refused to bury their dead for several days to protest government inaction. Hazaras were also angered by the National Assembly resolution that condemned the Ziarat attack but not the Shia killings.[99]

---

[92] Shehzad Baloch, "Sectarian atrocity: 29 killed in Mastung, Quetta ambushes", *The Express Tribune*, 20 September 2011. Saleem Shahid, "At least 93 lives lost in Quetta explosions", *Dawn*, 11 January 2013. "Death toll from Quetta blast reaches 80", *The Express Tribune*, 17 February 2013.

[93] Zia Ur Rehman, "Lashkar-e-Jhangvi behind Hazara killings in Quetta", *The Friday Times*, 5-11 August 2011.

[94] Crisis Group telephone interview, Quetta-based journalist, June 2013. "Chemicals for Quetta bombing obtained from Lahore: report", *The Express Tribune*, 20 February 2013.

[95] Syed Ali Shah, "Female suicide bomber responsible for Quetta attack", *Dawn*, 16 June 2013.

[96] "Terror acts will occur in Quetta, Karachi and Peshawar, Malik tells Senate", *The News*, 21 February 2013. "BLA, LeJ responsible for Balochistan unrest: Malik", *Dawn*, 2 August 2012.

[97] Crisis Group interview, Islamabad, June 2013.

[98] Crisis Group interview, Quetta, April 2013.

[99] Crisis Group interviews, Shia community leaders, Quetta, June 2013.

As elsewhere, Shia political parties seek to highlight the threats to their community. Formed in 2008 in response to anti-Shia extremism, the Majlis-e-Wahdatul Muslimeen (MWM) gained prominence in 2012-2013 by leading demonstrations in Quetta against the killings of Shias. It won a provincial assembly seat from a predominately Hazara constituency in Quetta in the 2013 election.

D. *The Taliban in Quetta*

After the 2001 U.S.-led intervention, many of Mullah Omar's key commanders fled across the border to Quetta, where they were reportedly given sanctuary by the Musharraf regime. In 2009, after almost a decade of military denials, the defence minister acknowledged the Quetta Shura's existence in an interview to a private TV channel but added that it did not pose a threat, as the military had degraded its capabilities.[100] Given its proximity to Mullah Omar's home base, Kandahar, Quetta provides the Afghan Taliban a hub from which to monitor developments in Afghanistan as well as to plan cross-border attacks, including on senior Afghan officials.[101] Kabul, for instance, holds Quetta-based insurgents responsible for the assassination of former President Burhanuddin Rabbani and for an attempt on Asadullah Khalid, the head of the National Directorate of Services (NDS), Afghanistan's main intelligence agency.[102]

Attempting to justify their presence, a member of the JUI-F, the Islamist party with closest ties to the Afghan Taliban, said, "if Raymond Davis [the CIA agent responsible for the deaths of two Pakistanis in 2011] can roam around Lahore, the presence of Afghan Taliban [in Quetta] shouldn't be so surprising".[103] Also attempting to justify the insurgents' presence, a senior Pakistani security official said they were merely "dormant"; another emphasised that they would return to Afghanistan once international forces withdraw. Dismissing these claims, a Baloch nationalist leader said, "if they are not active now, imagine what would happen when they became active".[104] The Baloch leadership is equally concerned about the increased presence of Pakistani Taliban groups in their province.

TTP attempts to woo Baloch dissidents, including by condemning the state's failure to recognise Baloch rights, have found no takers within Baloch nationalist circles.[105] But TTP factions are active in Pashtun areas in and around Quetta. In December 2011, they were held responsible for abductions in Pishin district, just north of the city, and in September 2013, they attacked a police convoy there. The militants were also responsible for the 28 April 2013 attack on an election meeting that killed two, and the bombing of a Balochistan Constabulary's Repeat Response Group vehicle that killed twelve, the following month. In May 2013, the TTP and the Islamic Movement of Uzbekistan reportedly jointly planned the attack by an Uzbek suicide bomber

[100] "Quetta shura exists: Mukhtar", *Nation*, 12 December 2009.
[101] A Baloch nationalist politician said, "whenever any Taliban leader is killed in Afghanistan, Afghan Taliban [from Quetta] go to Kandahar to attend the funeral". Crisis Group interview, Islamabad, June 2013.
[102] Naveed Husain, "'Documentary proof': Kabul blames Quetta Shura for ex-president's assassination", *The Express Tribune*, 2 October 2011; "Karzai says attack on Afghan intelligence chief planned in Pakistan", Reuters, 8 December 2012.
[103] Crisis Group interview, Senator Hafiz Hamdullah (JUI-F), Islamabad, 18 June 2013.
[104] Crisis Group interviews, Quetta, Islamabad, June 2013.
[105] Crisis Group interview, Baloch politicians, Quetta and Islamabad, June-July 2013.

on Quetta's inspector general of police, killing him and nine others and injuring 75.[106] Despite the sharp spike in sectarian violence and militancy in Quetta, however, the military, which controls security policy in Balochistan, remains focused on countering the Baloch insurgency.

E. *The Military's Role*

Most Baloch view the military's overwhelming presence, including in Quetta, which has a large base and several paramilitary-controlled security checkposts, as more of threat than protection. Since Musharraf entrenched the role of the Frontier Corps (FC) in policing the province, that paramilitary force has become the public face of the military's control over Balochistan. Heavily deployed in Baloch areas, the majority of its personnel are Pashtuns, many from KPK, with little understanding of or sympathy for Baloch grievances.[107]

Theoretically, the FC falls under the federal interior ministry's authority; in practice, it answers to military command. Since the restoration of democracy in 2008, jurisdictional questions have become a political football. In March 2012, then army chief Ashfaq Pervez Kayani said that the FC was under the provincial government's control. On 1 June 2013, a high-level FC official told the BBC Urdu service that his force acted on the provincial government's orders.[108] In a July 2012 Supreme Court hearing on enforced disappearances in Balochistan, the FC's counsel said, "if the representatives of Balochistan sitting in assemblies and Senate did not want FC, then they should withdraw the force from the province".[109] But the provincial government is in no position to do so. Chief Minister Abdul Malik Baloch denied that the FC was under his control and said he would avoid "confrontation" with the military-controlled agency.[110] His party's acting president, Senator Hasil Bizenjo, admitted that the NP had the government in Balochistan but no power.[111]

The FC's arbitrary actions are largely responsible for the spread of the Baloch insurgency. It is accused of extrajudicial killings, arbitrary arrests, torture and enforced disappearances throughout Balochistan.[112] According to Bizenjo, the NP accepted

[106] Shahzada Zulfiqar, "Six NGO workers abducted in Pishin", *Pakistan Today*, 14 December 2011; Saleem Shahid, "Three police personnel among six killed in Pishin blast", *Dawn*, 24 September 2013; Syed Ali Shah, "Blast on Quetta's Sariab road kills child, several injured", *Dawn*, 28 April 2013; Bari Baloch, "Taliban bomb kills 12 BC troops in Quetta", *Nation*, 24 May 2013; and Amir Mir, "Uzbek bomber carried out Quetta suicide attack", *The News*, 15 May 2013.

[107] Hassan Abbas, "Transforming Pakistan's Frontier Corps", *Terrorism Monitor*, vol. 5, 29 March 2007.

[108] Muhammad Saleh Zaafir, "Kayani decries military bashing", *The News*, 15 March 2012. "Subai Hukumat Ke Order Par Action Hota Hay" ["Actions are taken on provincial government orders"], Crisis Group translation, BBC Urdu, 21 June 2013.

[109] Mohammad Zafar, "FC directed to produce missing person today", *Daily Times*, 13 July 2012.

[110] Crisis Group interview, Quetta, 24 June 2013. "Exclusive interview: Dr Baloch speaks his mind on challenges", *The Express Tribune*, 1 July 2013

[111] Mohammad Zafar, "FC directed", op. cit. Qaisar Butt, Bizenjo in "We have govt, no power in Balochistan", *The News*, 10 December 2013.

[112] A Human Rights Commission of Pakistan (HRCP) fact-finding mission concluded in June 2013 that there were "credible reports of continued serious human rights violations, including disappearances of people, arbitrary arrests, torture and extra judicial killings", by security personnel in Balochistan, echoing earlier HRCP findings that specifically cited FC conduct. "HRCP fact-finding mission to Balochistan issues observations", HRCP, 25 June 2013; "Balochistan: Blinkered slide into chaos", report of an HRCP fact-finding mission, June 2011.

Prime Minister Sharif's offer to form the provincial government on the condition extra-judicial killings would end, but they continued even in his village. The Sharif government seemed to publicly admit its failure to rein in the FC when then-Attorney General Munir Malik, describing enforced disappearances as a legacy of military rule in July 2013, said it would take decades to resolve the issue.[113]

Police personnel regularly direct relatives of missing persons to contact the FC and the military's main security agencies, ISI and MI. The FC denies, as it did in its June 2012 written submission to the Supreme Court, that they are in its custody; explanations of enforced disappearances range from claims that the disappeared had moved to other areas to fight the state to allegations that imposters in FC uniforms committed crimes to defame it. The FC has also said that "90 per cent" of the disappeared are involved in criminal activities and have been killed by rival Baloch groups such as the BLA.[114]

In a July 2012 hearing, Supreme Court Chief Justice Iftikhar Chaudhry asserted that there was evidence of FC involvement in "every third missing person". In another hearing, he likened MI and ISI to "an arsonist" who has "set Balochistan on fire". In March 2013, the deputy inspector general of Balochistan's Criminal Investigation Department (CID) told the Supreme Court that "six army officers are involved in the abduction of missing persons in Balochistan".[115] Despite threats to arrest such offenders, however, the Supreme Court has yet to act when specific allegations are made against paramilitary or military officials.

There are reports that militias composed of Baloch guns-for-hire from various tribes and allied with extremist outfits such as LeJ are targeting Baloch dissidents. These gangs are also responsible for the rise in criminality and violence in Quetta and elsewhere in the province.[116] Calling them "death squads", BNP leader Akhtar Mengal compared them with al-Shams and al-Badr, military-supported militias that killed thousands of Bengali dissidents in East Pakistan in 1971. He contended that they had been granted "land routes, ammunition and the licence to kill the Baloch. Their task is to kill Baloch intellectuals like their predecessors killed Bengali intellectuals". Baloch nationalists in government and opposition consider these gangs as a major obstacle to restoring law and order in Quetta.[117]

---

[113] "We have govt, no power in Balochistan", op. cit. Hasnaat Malik, "Missing persons' issue might take decades to solve: AGP", *Daily Times*, 2 July 2013.

[114] "Sister of missing person blames security agencies for her ordeal", *Daily Times*, 22 May 2011. "Balochistan security: FC says no missing persons in custody", *The Express Tribune*, 24 July 2012; Mohammad Zafar, "'90pc of missing Baloch killed by their own groups'", *Daily Times*, 14 December 2011.

[115] Mohammad Zafar, "Every third missing person in Balochistan abducted by FC: SC", *Daily Times*, 10 July 2012; Azam Khan, "Missing persons: Fiery SC lays down the law for spy agencies", *The Express Tribune*, 2 March 2012. "Six army officers involved in abductions: DIG CID Balochistan", *Daily Times*, 21 March 2013.

[116] They include the Baloch Mussala Difa Tanzeem, the Sipah-e-Shuhada-e-Balochistan and the Tehreek-e-Nifaz-e-Aman Balochistan. Mir Mohammad Ali Talpur, "Subtle lies and strident truths", *Daily Times*, 4 August 2013.

[117] Crisis Group interviews, Akhtar Mengal, Islamabad, 10 July 2013; NP and BNP-M members, Islamabad and Quetta, June 2013.

F. *Impact on Law Enforcement and Justice*

On 14 January 2013, in response to the Alamdar Road attack, Islamabad imposed governor's rule in Balochistan for two months, officially giving the FC policing powers, including arrest and detention. Police contend, however, that the FC continued to exercise those powers after the expiration of governor's rule in mid-March. Even FC proponents agree that its presence in Quetta has almost completely marginalised the police role, except for traffic management.[118]

Balochistan's policing system is in any case ineffective and dysfunctional. The province is divided into two jurisdictions: "A" areas, mostly urban, fall under the police; the tribal Levies Force is responsible for maintaining security in the "B", mostly tribal or rural areas that are 95 per cent of the province. The limited jurisdiction undermines police effectiveness. At any given location, said a senior officer, "police jurisdiction doesn't stretch beyond a 2 to 4km radius. Even in Quetta, we don't have complete jurisdiction over the entire district".[119] The distinction between "A" and "B" areas resembles that between KPK's settled areas and Frontier Regions. As in the KPK FRs, criminals and militants in Quetta evade the police by retreating to areas where the force has no jurisdictional control.

The flow of information and different chains of authority also undermine coordination between the law enforcement agencies and foster mutual mistrust. Moreover, the police often violate their jurisdictional authority by pursuing and apprehending criminals in the "B" areas, thereby creating procedural problems for the courts. A trial court judge said, "the moment an accused says that he was caught from an area outside of the police's jurisdiction, the courts set him free". The FC's expanded authority has further reduced police jurisdiction. Some officers said it would take at least two years to sufficiently enhance the force's capacity, so FC deployment was necessary in the interim.[120] Nevertheless, the longer the FC retains control over law enforcement, the longer the police are likely to be starved of resources, personnel and political backing needed to gain that capacity.

[118] The governor represents the federal government. "Governor Rule imposed in Balochistan", *The News*, 14 January 2013. Crisis Group interviews, Quetta, June 2013.
[119] Crisis Group interviews, including police officials, Quetta, June 2013. Crisis Group Report, *The Worsening Crisis in Balochistan;* and Briefing, *The Forgotten Conflict in Balochistan*, both op. cit.
[120] Crisis Group interviews, judge, police officials, Quetta, June 2013.

IV. Karachi: Violence in Pakistan's Mega-City

Sindh's capital Karachi is Pakistan's most populous city and the lifeline of its economy.[121] Generating around 70 per cent of national GDP, it attracts migrants from all over the country. It is also possibly the world's most violent megacity, according to an influential U.S. publication citing a murder rate of 12.3 per 100,000 residents, 25 per cent higher than any other.[122] There were 2,174 reported killings in 2012, and with over 2,700, 2013 was the deadliest year on record.[123]

A. *Ethnicity, Politics and Violence*

Language and ethnicity are critical to understanding Karachi politics and conflict. According to the 1941 population census regarding its three largest ethnic groups, the city was 60 per cent Sindhi, 6 per cent Mohajir and 3 per cent Pashtun. After independence, as Pakistan's financial hub and federal capital until 1960, it attracted migrants from India who, with their descendants, are known as mohajirs (refugees, also known as Urdu-speakers). Dominating the ruling party, the Pakistan Muslim League, and over-represented in the powerful bureaucracy, the mohajirs became the city's governing elite, marginalising the native Sindhis. As the mohajir influx continued, according to the 1951 census, the population changed to 50 per cent mohajir, 14 per cent Sindhi, a "demographic convulsion" that fuelled Sindhi alienation.[124]

Responding to its predominately Sindhi constituents, Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto's PPP government introduced quotas in the 1970s for the under-represented Sindhis in government jobs and higher educational institutions. The PPP's policies were deeply resented by its mohajir opponents, and the ethno-political divide widened further, with political and security ramifications still felt more than 40 years later.[125]

Subsequent waves of internal migration of Pashtun and Punjabi workers and the influx of Afghan refugees and illegal immigrants swelled the population further.[126]

---

[121] A 2011 official housing survey put Karachi's population at around 21.14 million, a 114.5 per cent increase since the 1998 census (roughly 9.86 million). Abdul Sattar Khan, ""Sindh population surges by 81.5 pc, households by 83.9 pc", *The News*, 2 April 2012.

[122] Taimur Khan, "Cooking in Karachi", *Foreign Policy* (online), 3 September 2013. The cited rate is for 2012.

[123] Citizen-Police Liaison Committee (CPLC) statistics on killings in Karachi, 1 January 1994-31 December 2013, provided to Crisis Group. The prior largest number of violent deaths, 1,742, was in 1995. The 2013 figure is based on Sindh police and Rangers records, provided to Crisis Group. Also, Faraz Khan and Gibran Ashraf, "Karachi 2013: the deadliest year of all", *The Express Tribune*, 6 January 2014; and "Target killings remain most used tool to silence opposition", *Daily Times*, 6 January 2014.

[124] Statistics provided by Sindh government official. See also Kaiser Bengali (former chief adviser to Sindh government), "Anatomy of violence", *Dawn*, 8 September 2013. Crisis Group interview, Kaiser Bengali, Karachi, 5 September 2013.

[125] The adoption of Sindhi as the official province language by the PPP government in 1972 sparked violent Mohajir-Sindhi riots, in which at least 55 were killed and thousands injured. Exploiting these cleavages, Zia's military regime backed the Mohajir Qaumi Movement (later renamed the Muttahida Qaumi Movement), established in 1984 to represent the mohajirs, under Altaf Hussain's leadership.

[126] Of Pakistan's roughly three and a half million illegal immigrants, including from Bangladesh and Myanmar, 2.5 million live in Karachi. Irfan Aligi, "75 per cent of illegal immigrants are living in Karachi, reveals survey", *The Express Tribune*, 31 December 2010. Crisis Group Asia Report N°130, *Pakistan: Karachi's Madrasas and Violent Extremism*, 29 March 2007.

The 1981 census showed mohajirs as 54 per cent of Karachi's population, though down to 41 per cent according to the 1998 census. With no subsequent census, it is nearly impossible to acquire accurate data on the city's ethnic composition. Yet, the influx of large numbers of Pashtuns from militant-hit KPK and FATA and of Sindhis after floods in 2010 and 2011 has changed ethnic and hence political dynamics. A well-informed political economist and former chief adviser to the Sindh government projected that Pashtuns will outnumber mohajirs 31 per cent to 29 per cent by 2025.[127]

Ethnic competition and tensions thus shape Karachi's politics. As Sindh's capital, it is still ruled by the PPP, which has won successive provincial elections due to its rural Sindhi base.[128] The mohajir-dominated Muttahida Qaumi Movement (MQM), led by Altaf Husssain, remains the city's largest party; and the Pashtun-dominated Awami National Party is fast becoming an important player.

After the 2002 elections, Musharraf's PML-Q and MQM allies formed the provincial government. His alliance with MQM to counter the PPP took a particularly dangerous form when it supported MQM-allied gangs in Lyari, one of Karachi's eighteen towns and a PPP stronghold. Observers suspected collusion between the military regime and the MQM when party supporters allegedly killed over 40 people on 12 May 2007 during a mass demonstration in Karachi against Musharraf's ouster of the Supreme Court chief justice. According to Musharraf, his government "had warned [the protesters] against going to Karachi but they did not listen to the advice ... we ... then decided to show our strength".[129] The MQM has denied involvement, stressing that it also suffered casualties.[130]

In a bid to contain ethno-political violence after the February 2008 elections, the PPP included the MQM in the provincial coalition government along with the ANP, which won two provincial seats from Karachi for the first time. Yet, even as they sat in the same cabinet, the coalition partners often worked at cross purposes. "Departments with a Sindhi [PPP] minister would lock away the file for any development project in Karachi and Hyderabad", said a former cabinet member. "MQM-run ministries would do the same thing [for rural areas]. So both parties would sabotage each other. You can't have the writ of the state with this kind of divided government". Meanwhile, the ANP used its control of the labour and transport ministries to weaken MQM's political hold over the city.[131]

With the PPP repeatedly succumbing to MQM demands, the risk of a return to earlier levels of Sindhi-mohajir violence subsided, but mohajir-Pashtun violence increased dramatically. The ANP's victories in 2008, though small given Karachi's 40-seat share in the Sindh Assembly, provoked MQM fears that the increase in the Pashtun population could redraw Karachi's political map. Subsequently, a senior Sindh police official said, the MQM characterised the influx of the predominately Pashtun IDPs fleeing military operations in Swat and South Waziristan, particularly since 2009, as "the Taliban coming to Karachi".[132] Clashes between the two parties are now among the most violent, although there is also a high death toll because of intra-Mohajir and MQM-PPP conflict.

[127] Crisis Group interview, Kaiser Bengali, Karachi, 5 September 2013.
[128] Rural Sindh, predominately Sindhi, has around 50 per cent of the province's population.
[129] "People are with me: Musharraf", *Daily Times*, 13 May 2007.
[130] See MQM website, www.mqm.org.
[131] Crisis Group interviews, ex-cabinet member, senior police official, Karachi, September 2013.
[132] Crisis Group interview, Karachi, September 2013.

Karachi has had an annual increase in targeted political killings since 2006. According to HRCP, there were 220 such victims in 2010, including 61 from the MQM, 40 from the ANP, 39 from the MQM splinter group MQM-Haqiqi (MQM-H) and 29 from the PPP.[133] 77 of the 490 victims in the first half of 2011 alone were from the MQM, 29 from the ANP and 26 from the PPP. In the first six months of 2013, over 1,700 were killed, with June (more than 300) the deadliest month; by year's end the total surpassed 2,200.[134]

The impact of Sindhi migration also has the potential of reshaping Karachi politics. After the 2010 floods, as mentioned, thousands from rural Sindh moved to Karachi and have remained. These migrants contribute to the workforce, many now driving rickshaws, thus impacting the Pashtun monopoly over the lucrative transport sector.[135] Migration from southern Punjab is also increasing, since many peasants, unemployed because of the trend toward corporate farming, seek work in Karachi.[136] It may be only a matter of time before Punjabi migrants become more politically assertive.

Karachi's unsustainable population growth will continue as long as it is seen as an attractive, and at times only, option for employment and services. To ease the burden on the city, the Sindh government and its international partners should support job creation and other economic development programs there but also promote development in other potentially vibrant parts of the province, such as neighbouring Hyderabad and the semi-urban areas of the north.

They should, however, learn from past mistakes. In the mid-1990s, the PPP government launched an initiative to create an industrial zone in interior Sindh, tax-free for ten years, with road networks and job opportunities. It failed, not for lack of infrastructure but, according to a senior Sindh government official, because deteriorating law and order discouraged investors and businesses. As with other such projects in Pakistan, businesses often exploited the tax breaks but failed to make a tangible contribution to industrial growth in the intended zone. For instance, exploiting the absence of penalties, some Punjab businesses bought duty-free machinery ostensibly for the Sindh-based industrial zone but moved it to factories in Punjab.[137]

There have been recent proposals to develop an industrial hub in northern Sindh, including by linking Larkana, Shikarpur and Sukkur districts through an improved road network; and a similar one in southern Sindh, by expanding and improving road links between Hyderabad, its surrounding towns and the south-eastern district of Mirpurkhas. They were defeated by provincial legislators who feared that industrialisation and urbanisation would cost them influence in their rural constituencies, according to a former adviser closely linked to the proposed projects.[138] The Sindh

[133] "Targeted killings claimed 490 lives in six months: HRCP", Pakistan Press Foundation, 6 July 2011. The MQM-H, the MQM's breakaway faction, headed by Afaq Ahmed, was set up in 1991 with the military's backing. Ahmed was arrested in 2004 on multiple counts of murder and released by the Sindh High Court in 2011.

[134] Statistics provided to Crisis Group by the CPLC. "Target killings statistics: MQM hardest hit, ANP close behind", *The Express Tribune*, 12 December 2010; "June was Karachi's deadliest month with 313 killings: HRCP", *The Express Tribune*, 16 July 2013. "2013 in focus: target killing remains most used tool to silence opposition", *Daily Times*, 6 January 2014.

[135] Crisis Group interviews, economists, police officials, and politicians, Karachi, September 2013. Rickshaws are motorised tricycles, a cheap and common form of transport.

[136] Crisis Group interview, Kaiser Bengali, Karachi, 5 September 2013.

[137] Crisis Group interview, Sharifuddin Memon, adviser on home affairs, Sindh government, Karachi, 6 September 2013.

[138] Crisis Group interview, Karachi, 5 September 2013.

government and PPP political leadership stand to gain if the province's semi-urban areas become economically vibrant. They should not allow political expediency or vested interests to hinder such development.

B. *Governance and Criminality*

Karachi boasts the best and worst of a megacity. While Karachi's wealthy residents live in six cantonment areas[139] and the old South district, the poor live in clusters of poorly serviced, overcrowded residential communities, many of which are ethnically homogenous. Almost half the population is in unplanned squatter settlements (*katchi abadis*) that often lack electricity, sewers and running water. Infrastructure is inadequate to absorb the growing population, and the state has failed to meet the challenge.

The deterioration of law and order should be examined in the context of a general breakdown of civil administration. According to a senior Karachi-based police official, "if you say crime is out of your control, okay – but garbage collection is also out of control".[140] The state's failure to provide basic public amenities, combined with widespread unemployment and poverty, promotes crime and violent competition over meagre resources.

The criminal underworld provides alternative routes to accumulating wealth. Collusion between the authorities and criminals has allegedly created mafias of every stripe, whose control of scarce and lucrative resources, from land to timber to water, yields enormous profits. Several police and other government officials said that the failure to check even petty crime signalled a legally permissive environment that emboldened criminals. "Without zero tolerance, you cannot control this", a former Sindh police chief noted. A serving deputy inspector general (DIG) of Sindh police wrote in mid-September 2013, "[t]he war against militancy cannot be won if the fight against conventional crime is lost in the street".[141]

The civil administration's failure to prevent encroachment of public and private land has major ramifications for law and order. Slums and *katchi abadis* have multiplied exponentially and become permanent. It is difficult to demolish large unplanned settlements such as in Orangi and Korangi that encroach on public land, since local laws favour occupancy. Even where the government has tried, litigants win stay orders from the courts, and final decisions may take decades. Unresolved land disputes are often settled by force, turning civil cases into criminal ones. Crowded and irregular settlements are difficult to oversee and provide sanctuaries for petty criminals and organised criminal gangs, with the latter often becoming patrons to residents, particularly unemployed youth. Overcrowded apartment buildings in the poorer areas, with monthly rents as low as 10,000 rupees (under $100), have become "dens of criminality", according to a senior police official.[142] This urban landscape provides fertile recruiting grounds for criminal gangs as well as extremist groups.

Karachi's black economy amounts to 830 million rupees (over $8 million) daily. With the bulk generated by the land mafia, police corruption, illegal gambling and the water mafia (discussed below), it sustains organised crime and militancy in Karachi and beyond. Extortion and kidnapping for ransom are rampant, further undermining

[139] These are managed by the military but with a majority of civilian homeowners and residents.
[140] Crisis Group interview, Karachi, September 2013.
[141] Crisis Group interviews, Islamabad and Karachi, September 2013. Abdul Khalique Shaikh, "Police's task in Karachi", *Dawn*, 17 September 2013.
[142] Crisis Group interview, Karachi, September 2013.

the formal economy, as businesses move capital to safer venues in the country and abroad. A businessman, currently holding a senior Sindh government position, estimated that around 40 per cent of Karachi-based businesses had moved capital out.[143]

Since 2000, extortion rackets, once identified with the MQM, have multiplied, becoming more competitive, demanding and violent. "Where before the MQM roughed you up, today extortionists kill you when you don't pay up", said a police official. Businesses claim they had an understanding with the MQM: payment bought "protection" and also provided political access, since the MQM controlled key ministries in provincial coalition governments and the city government under Musharraf's military regime. The business community considered such payments a kind of "forced political donation". But police believed this submissiveness was also partly to blame for extortion rackets spiralling out of control.[144]

According to a leader of the business community, the police and the Citizen Police Liaison Committee (CPLC) successfully tackled extortion rackets in the 1990s, but this is no longer the case, due to the "CPLC's politicisation", and "both the police and the CPLC should be taken to task".[145] As lawlessness has increased, criminal networks dominate the extortion racket. The reported numbers of kidnappings for ransom continue to increase – 112 in 2010, 113 in 2011, 134 in 2012 and 166 in 2013, but many go unreported.[146]

According to the Sindh police, many victims end up in KPK and FATA, passed on by criminal gangs to militant outfits or kidnapped by militant networks operating in Karachi. A retired police official still involved in the security sector maintained that 70 per cent of extortion incidents could be attributed to criminal gangs; 20 per cent to militant groups; and 10 per cent to criminals with links to political parties.[147] A 2013 Supreme Court inquiry found that some kidnapping rings also had strong links with security officials in the police and paramilitary Rangers, as well as private guards in banks. A Rangers spokesperson denied this.[148] In August 2013, the navy opened an investigation of three naval intelligence personnel, including two assistant directors, for alleged involvement in a kidnapping gang.[149]

Karachi's mafias allegedly derive their strength from collusion with personnel in all branches of government – from the police to the civil administration, from the military to the political parties. Such collusion reportedly enables criminal mafias, militant groups and politically-backed gangs to operate with impunity.[150] While examples are countless, the water mafia is particularly illustrative. As part of a "water crisis management plan" in 1999, the Rangers were given control of the nine official

[143] "Karachi's black economy generates Rs830 million every day", *The News*, 3 September 2013. Crisis Group interview, Karachi, September 2013.
[144] Crisis Group interviews, business community, government and police officials, Karachi, September 2013.
[145] Crisis Group interview, Karachi, 4 September 2013.
[146] While the Sindh police and Rangers claim to have arrested over 250 extortionists in 2013, the practice continues unabated. Khan and Ashraf, op. cit. CPLC statistics on kidnapping for ransom, 1 January 2003-30 November 2013, provided to Crisis Group. There were 28 reported such kidnappings in 2006, 64 in 2007.
[147] Crisis Group interviews, Karachi, September 2013.
[148] Javed Mirza, "Kidnapping for ransom big business in Karachi", *The News*, 1 September 2013.
[149] The navy is investigating the crime. Sikander Shaheen, "Pakistan navy launches probe", *The Nation*, 31 August 2013.
[150] Crisis Group interviews, serving and retired police officials, government officials and NGO activists, Karachi, September 2013.

hydrants maintained by the Karachi Water and Sewage Board. These provide free water to water-deficient areas, with the rest sold to businesses and other consumers at a fixed official rate. It is distributed by tankers, and the Rangers are authorised to charge the tanker suppliers a fixed-per-gallon sum that is higher for industrial than residential use. Allegedly, the tanker suppliers, in collusion with some Rangers, illegally siphon off over 40 per cent of the water and sell it at inflated rates.[151]

C. *The Case of Lyari*

Karachi's Lyari town, historically a PPP stronghold,[152] demonstrates how socio-economic and political factors have interacted to create a law and order crisis. Until the late 1980s, many labourers there had daily wage jobs, mainly in the Karachi Port Trust and the Karachi Municipal Corporation. Following its victory in the 1987 local and 1988 provincial elections, the MQM gave its supporters full-time jobs in these public enterprises, leaving large numbers of Lyari youth jobless. Many ended up working for criminal gangs.[153] These became politically influential as Lyari politics became more contentious following Musharraf's coup. The military regime allegedly supported MQM-allied gangs to break the PPP's voter strength in Lyari. As the town's ethnic Baloch community was targeted by anti-PPP gangs, most prominently the reportedly MQM-backed Arshad Pappu gang, Baloch residents resisted violently.[154]

The PPP reportedly responded by aligning with armed militias, particularly Arshad Pappu's main rival, the People's Aman (Peace) Committee (PAC), which emerged in 2008 and targeted rival gangs, the MQM and the businesses that bankrolled it. PAC's second-in-command, Zafar Baloch, was a former local PPP leader, general secretary of its Karachi South chapter. He was killed on 18 September 2013 in Lyari.[155] PPP leaders, however, insist there is no relationship with the PAC. "The PAC supported PML-N candidates in PPP strongholds in the last election", said Taj Haider, the party's Sindh general secretary.[156] Independent observers believe that ties between the two have frayed. The police say peace will only be restored once the PPP and MQM pressure their allied gangs to disarm.[157]

Gang members operate much like warlords, controlling and charging for access to Lyari's roads, which are major thoroughfares for commercial transport, including to Karachi's port. Clashes between gangs have included the use of mortars and other heavy weapons. Hundreds have been killed or displaced since 2009. Periodic clean-up operations by the Rangers and police have resulted in days of armed clashes, disrupting civilian life but not ending the violence. About one such operation, in April-May 2012, a HRCP statement said:

---

[151] Hajra Mumtaz, "Tanker mafia behind Karachi's water woes", *Dawn*, 1 April 2008; and Jamil Khan, "Artificial water shortage boosts tanker mafia", *Daily Times*, 6 May 2007.

[152] Benazir Bhutto contested her first election from Lyari, in 1988. Her husband, the future president, Asif Ali Zardari, won the same seat in 1990.

[153] Crisis Group interview, Kaiser Bengali, Karachi, 5 September 2013.

[154] Pappu was killed in March 2013; his family accused PAC head Uzair Baloch of the murder. In December 2013, a Karachi anti-terrorism court declared Baloch and an alleged co-conspirator proclaimed offenders in the case, while indicting five others. Baloch has evaded arrest. "Arshad Pappu murder: ATC declares Baba Ladla, Uzair Baloch POs", *Daily Times*, 27 December 2013.

[155] Crisis Group interviews, police, government, civil society actors, Karachi, September 2013. Hasan Mansoor, "Zafar Baloch – a profile", *Dawn*, 19 September 2013.

[156] Crisis Group interview, Karachi, 4 September 2013.

[157] Mansoor, op. cit. Crisis Group interviews, senior police officials, Karachi, September 2013.

> Reports have emerged of shortage of essentials and of Lyari residents having no access to electricity, water and other basic provisions, including milk for children. The fact that many people have been forced to migrate amid clashes between law enforcement personnel and their targets and that there are no arrangements to provide them shelter is intolerable. The education of children has been completely disrupted. It is regrettable that the problems of the people that could not have been too difficult to imagine beforehand have not received due attention.[158]

In July 2013, at least 1,500 people from the Kutchi community, Lyari's second largest and mainly MQM supporters, were displaced to Sindh's districts of Badin and Thatta. Many feared to return home but did so out of concern their property would be seized by criminal gangs. Since houses in many Lyari neighbourhoods are connected wall to wall, residents escape gang fighting through their neighbours' homes. Gangsters also use these routes, including through houses abandoned by fleeing residents, to evade security agencies or rival gangs.[159]

Even if the law enforcement agencies manage to end Lyari's criminal and ethno-political violence, peace in Karachi will remain elusive unless the far more serious challenge of religious extremism is tackled effectively.

D. *Religious Extremism*

Current problems reflect to a significant extent the Zia regime's legacy, particularly its backing for the anti-Soviet jihad in Afghanistan that resulted in a flood of weapons in Pakistani cities and towns, accompanied by unchecked growth of the Deobandi madrasa sector, the nursery of jihadi groups.[160] Sectarian conflict in Karachi, with its large Shia minority, was inevitable as the regime patronised Deobandi extremist groups both to buttress its Islamisation program and to counter Shia political mobilisation that was spurred by the 1979 Iranian revolution. Sectarian tensions escalated in the 1980s and exploded into violence in the 1990s. The city has since experienced repeated bouts of religious violence.

Soon after the 11 September 2001 attacks in the U.S., Karachi's jihadi infrastructure came under renewed domestic and international attention. The kidnapping and killing of *Wall Street Journal* reporter Daniel Pearl in early 2002 was emblematic of the terrorist threat in the city. In a January 2002 televised address to the nation, Musharraf pledged to dismantle extremist groups and regulate the madrasa system. Several of the former were banned but then allowed to regroup under new names. The military also continued to support Kashmir- and India-oriented jihadi groups such as the Laskhar-e-Tayyaba and Jaish-e-Mohammed.[161]

As jihadi groups continued to operate with impunity, expanding their madrasa and mosque networks in Karachi, they also became stakeholders in the competition over turf and resources. The spike in sectarian killings was, therefore, unsurprising if

[158] "HRCP concerned over Lyari situation", *Daily Times*, 1 May 2012.
[159] Crisis Group interviews, police and government officials, Karachi, September 2013. Hasan Mansoor, "Kutchi families back in Lyari, unsure about fate", *Dawn*, 26 August 2013. Ayesha Mir, "War strategies: Lyari residents use holes in the wall to escape, gangsters use them to occupy", *The Express Tribune*, 10 July 2013.
[160] Crisis Group Reports, *The Militant Jihadi Challenge*; *The State of Sectarianism in Pakistan*; *The Mullahs and the Military*; and *Karachi's Madrasas and Violent Extremism*, all op. cit.
[161] Crisis Group Asia Report N°73, *Unfulfilled Promises: Pakistan's Failure to Tackle Extremism*, 16 January 2004.

not inevitable. On 11 April 2006, 47 people were killed and over 100 injured in a suicide attack attributed to the LeJ on the Barelvi Sunni Tehreek's congregation in Karachi's Nishtar Park. On 21 July 206, a suicide bomber killed Allama Hasan Turabi, president of the Pakistan Islami Tehreek, Pakistan's largest Shia political party.[162]

As noted above, the Supreme Court released LeJ leader Malik Ishaq on bail in mid-2011, after the prosecution was unable to produce evidence for a single conviction in 44 cases involving 70 alleged homicides.[163] His rallies countrywide, including in Karachi, emboldened the LeJ further and unleashed a flood of sectarian violence. According to HRCP, there were 104 sectarian killing cases in 2012, a more than 350 per cent increase from 2011. LeJ attacks led to retaliatory violence by Shias and Barelvi groups. Between early September 2012 and late February 2013 alone, more than 80 Shias were the victims of targeted killings in Karachi, and some 70 LeJ members died in retaliatory attacks.[164]

The sectarian killing spree continues in Karachi. In one of the worst attacks, on 2 March 2013, 40 died in the predominately Shia Abbas Town. From 4-6 November, just before the start of Muharram, sectarian clashes killed seventeen Shias and Sunnis. On 13 November, three bombs near two Shia mosques injured sixteen. On 3 December, sectarian violence claimed at least thirteen lives, including the deputy secretary general of the Shia Majlis-e-Wahdutul Muslimeen.[165]

Sunni extremist violence hits not only Shias, but also moderate Barelvis and practices considered heretical, such as worship at shrines. On 7 January 2014, police held the Tehreek-e-Taliban Pakistan responsible for the killing of six devotees at a Sufi shrine in Karachi's Gulshan-i-Maymar neighbourhood.[166] Military operations in KPK as well as in FATA agencies have failed to apprehend the TTP's leadership and dismantle militant networks. Instead, they have relocated, including to Karachi, which has become a sanctuary and funding source for Pakistani militants and their Afghan allies.[167]

Pakistani Taliban groups are attempting to consolidate their hold over Karachi's Pashtun-majority areas through force, killing local ANP leaders and activists, extorting and intimidating residents and businesses and establishing their own courts to mediate disputes. Police and other informed observers believe the ANP is threatened far more by Islamist militants from KPK and FATA than by gangs backed by its main political rival, the MQM.[168] Pashtuns – Pakistani and Afghan – also dominate Karachi's madrasas, which are mainly controlled by the JUI-F and JUI-S. The problem is not one of Pashtun migration but the state's failure to check crime, militancy and a mushrooming jihadi madrasa sector.

---

[162] Crisis Group Reports, *Karachi's Madrasas and Violent Extremism*; *The Militant Jihadi Challenge*; and *The State of Sectarianism in Pakistan*, all op. cit.

[163] See fn. 90 above.

[164] "Sectarian killings increased by 352 pc last year: HRCP", *The News*, 30 January 2013. "Spiral of Karachi killings widens Pakistan's sectarian divide", *Daily Times*, 25 February 2013.

[165] "40 dead in twin Karachi blasts", *The Express Tribune*, 3 March 2013; "Extremism Watch", Jinnah Institute, 4-10 November 2013; Faraz Khan, "13 dead as Karachi violence spirals out of control", *The Express Tribune*, 3 December 2013.

[166] This was the second such attack on a Sufi shrine in Karachi. On 7 October 2010, militants struck the Abdullah Shah Ghazi shrine, killing eight and wounding 60. Imtiaz Ali, "Six devotees slaughtered at shrine in Gappap", *Dawn*, 8 January 2014.

[167] Taliban commander Mullah Baradar was arrested in Karachi in 2010. He is now reportedly detained there in a security agency's safe house. Maria Golovnina and Asim Tanveer, "Released Taliban leader awaits fate in Karachi safe house", Reuters, 22 September 2013.

[168] Crisis Group interviews, police, government officials, criminal lawyers, Karachi, September 2013.

Karachi also has other sources of conflict that do not divide neatly along ethnic or sectarian lines. For example, the MQM and the Barelvi Sunni Tehreek both oppose the Deobandi LeJ, but also allegedly contest each other for political space, since like the MQM, mohajirs form the Sunni Tehreek's core support base. The MQM similarly competes with the MWM. The transfer of the political loyalties of thousands of Shias from mainstream parties to the MWM has cut into the MQM's Shia support. Yet, the MQM has also been targeted by Sunni extremists. Thus, in August 2010, the LeJ allegedly killed MQM parliamentarian Raza Haider, an advocate of the Shia community who often condemned attacks against it.[169]

E. *Islamabad's Response*

On 4 September 2013, the federal cabinet decided on a series of measures to enforce law and order in Karachi. A targeted operation, led by the paramilitary Rangers but ostensibly under Sindh government supervision, would target a range of violent groups, including those linked to political parties, sectarian organisations and criminal gangs. The government identified 450 terrorists, target killers, kidnappers and extortionists as the focus. Four committees would oversee the operation: a weekly federal committee comprising the interior minister and representatives of the Sindh government, Rangers, the National Database and Registration Authority (NADRA), the National Alien Registration Authority (Nara) and the federal intelligence agencies; a daily operational committee headed by the Rangers' director general and including civilian and military intelligence officials; a legislative committee to devise a legal framework for expanding the Rangers' powers in the operations; and a citizens committee comprising respected civil society activists to oversee Rangers conduct.[170]

The decision to give the paramilitary force the lead resembled Islamabad's reliance on the military to tackle Karachi's law and order crisis in the 1990s. The military's 1992 operation primarily targeted Altaf Hussain's MQM. It then withdrew, transferring its law enforcement role to the Rangers, an arrangement that appears to have become permanent. "A paramilitary role should always be temporary", a retired senior police official said. "A permanent Rangers role contravenes international best practices and principles".[171]

Ahead of the Karachi operation that began in September, the federal cabinet proposed giving the Rangers investigation powers. This was not done but can be revived later. In late September 2013, the cabinet approved a proposal to give Rangers shoot-to-kill powers against suspected terrorists, with few constraints. The Criminal Procedure Code only allows the police to fire on suspects if they face an armed threat. Such unbridled powers are particularly dangerous, since some Rangers have abused their authority. In June 2011, a mobile phone camera captured footage of Rangers shooting an unarmed man in a Karachi public park. An anti-terrorism court sentenced one to death. In July 2013, a Ranger fatally shot a taxi driver who failed to stop when ordered, sparking protests and eventually a trial. "This is what happens you take a

[169] Usman Manzoor, "How MPA Raza Haider was killed by Lashkar men", *The News*, 14 April 2011.
[170] Hafiz Tunio, "Karachi law and order: Rangers to launch operation in two days", *The Express Tribune*, 5 September 2013.
[171] Crisis Group interview, Karachi, September 2013.

man who is meant to police a border, to fight an enemy, and give him urban policing duties", said a former Sindh IG.[172]

Extrajudicial killings amid a law and order crisis, with the criminal justice process failing to convict culprits, might have a dangerous appeal. However, they would breed more violence. A former police inspector general said, "the criminal doesn't fear arrest; he fears death, so he has to be armed and he has to come out shooting".[173]

The Rangers' role also undermines the provincial government's primary responsibility for law enforcement. The paramilitary force regularly flouts the provincial government's orders.[174] Although there are 11,000 Rangers in Karachi, very few support Sindh police operations. A senior police official said, "in our operations when we ask for their support, we get 3,000 of them. What are the other 8,000 doing?"[175]

Scepticism about the ongoing paramilitary-led operation is reinforced by the rising levels of violence. While almost 10,000 suspects have reportedly been arrested and more than 15,600kg of explosives recovered, target killings claimed more than three dozen lives in the first week of December alone. A well-formed journalist commented: "The players and faces of executioners change, and new brutal forces join in the game of death, pushing lawlessness to the next higher level. But what doesn't change is the state's inability and unwillingness to deal with the challenge".[176]

[172] Crisis Group interview, Afzal Ali Shigri, Islamabad, 3 September 2013. "Shooting at Karachi park: Ranger sentenced to death", *Dawn*, 12 August 2011. For footage of the park shooting, see www.youtube.com/watch?v=XXufrHvXZJU.

[173] Crisis Group interview, Shaukat Javed, former IG Punjab, Lahore, 9 October 2013.

[174] Thus, in June 2013, the Sindh chief minister, PPP's Qaim Ali Shah, issued an order to establish Ranger checkposts in four of Lyari's union councils. Months later, the Rangers had yet to comply. Crisis Group interview, PPP Sindh General Secretary Taj Haider, Karachi, 4 September 2013.

[175] Crisis Group interview, Karachi, September 2013.

[176] Sindh IG Police's statistics in a report for 5 September-6 December, provided to Crisis Group; "Karachi operation: 15,653 kgs of explosives recovered, police claim", *The Express Tribune*, 8 December 2013. Amir Zia, "Delusion versus reality", *The News*, 9 December 2013.

V. Lahore: The Sectarian Heartland

Lahore, Punjab's capital and home base of the PML-N, which governs the province as well as the centre, is a predominately Punjabi city of around 10 million, with small pockets of Pashtuns from FATA, KPK and Afghanistan. While it might not appear to face the same levels as the other three provincial capitals, it is no stranger to extremist violence. Violent jihadis have repeatedly targeted its police, religious minorities and their sectarian rivals. Moreover, the provincial government's security policies are central to combating terrorism and criminality nationwide because of the links between Punjab-based jihadi networks and extremist groups throughout the country.

A. *Criminality and Extremism*

Lahore has about an eighth of Punjab's estimated 80 million population but accounts for 25 per cent of the province's reported crimes.[177] As elsewhere, lucrative crime such as kidnapping for ransom and armed robbery are blamed on Pashtuns migrants and Afghan refugees. As elsewhere, too, there is a close nexus between criminal networks and local, regional and transnational jihadis. Three kidnappings symbolise that link.

On 27 August 2010, Amir Aftab Malik, a wealthy trader and son-in-law of General Tariq Majid, the then chairman of the Joint Chiefs of Staff Committee, was kidnapped from his home in Lahore, reportedly by the LeJ, and then transferred to TTP custody in FATA's North Waziristan agency. He was released in March 2012 after a large ransom was reportedly paid.[178] With kidnappings for ransom becoming one of the most lucrative sources of income for the entire jihadi enterprise in the city, from the common criminals who do surveillance to the kidnappers and go-betweens who do the bargaining, such incidents will likely continue to increase in Lahore, as they have in Quetta, Peshawar and Karachi.

Money, however, is not always the sole motive. In some cases, the kidnapping has a dual purpose: financial gain and to publicise the jihadi cause. On 13 August 2011, a U.S. government contractor, Warren Weinstein, was kidnapped from his home in Lahore by the LeJ and transferred to TTP control in FATA. Claiming credit in a video message, al-Qaeda leader Ayman al-Zawahari said, "just as the Americans detain whomever they suspect may be connected to al-Qaeda or the Taliban even in the slightest of ways, we have detained this man who has been involved with U.S. aid to Pakistan since the 1970s". He then demanded an end to U.S. strikes on Somalia and Yemen and release of al-Qaeda and Taliban suspects around the world in return for Weinstein's release. In a video message released by al-Qaeda in December 2013, Weinstein, called on the U.S. to release al-Qaeda prisoners in its custody and negotiate his release with his captors.[179]

[177] Crisis Group interview, Shaukat Javed, ex-IG Punjab police, Lahore, 9 October 2013.

[178] The Taliban sent a video to his family and security agencies. "Taliban free son-in-law of former JCSC chief," *Dawn*, 16 March 2012; "Kidnapped trader returns home after 19 months", *The Express Tribune*, 16 March 2012.

[179] Al-Zawahiri said President Obama had the power to get Weinstein released but was "dodging his responsibility." "Al-Qaeda says it kidnapped Warren Weinstein in Pakistan", BBC News, 1 December 2011. Declan Walsh, "Taliban gaining more resources from kidnapping", *The New York Times*, 20 January 2012. Ernesto Londono, "Kidnapped American asks U.S. to negotiate with al-Qaeda for his release", *The Washington Post*, 25 December 2013.

On 26 August 2011, Shahbaz Taseer, son of Punjab Governor Salman Taseer, who had been killed for his opposition to discriminatory Islamic legislation six months earlier, was kidnapped. According to his brother, the family had been "receiving threats from the Taliban and other extremist groups". In July 2011, in the first official confirmation of contacts with the kidnappers, Punjab Law Minister Rana Sanaullah disclosed that the militants had demanded a large ransom, and the ISI was negotiating. Shahbaz remains missing, amid concerns that the nexus between Lahore-based criminal and extremist groups countrywide will further encourage such kidnappings of high-profile and wealthy targets in Lahore.[180]

B. *Sectarian Violence*

On the surface, Lahore appears more stable than its provincial counterparts but only because terror attacks are more sporadic, though no less deadly. Even that was not the case in 2010, which witnessed successive incidents, including in May, when 80 worshippers were killed at an Ahmadi mosque; July, when at least 40 were killed at a Sufi shrine; and September, when around 40 were killed during a Shia procession. The violence against religious minorities is endemic. On 9 March 2013, a mob of thousands burned some 180 houses in a mostly Christian neighbourhood of the Badami Bagh area, provoked by accusations a Christian resident blasphemed during an argument with a Muslim friend.[181] Ahmadi graves are regularly vandalised.[182] Militants have also targeted state symbols: in March 2009, the police academy was attacked, killing five trainees, two instructors and a bystander; in July 2012, gunmen stormed a police hostel, killing nine officers.[183]

Sectarian violence subsided somewhat in mid-2011, possibly because of pledges of good behaviour reportedly made to the Punjab government by LeJ leader Malik Ishaq when released on bail in July.[184] However, as noted above, Ishaq proceeded to lead anti-Shia rallies, delivering inflammatory speeches that provoked sectarian attacks in Quetta. He was then repeatedly detained by the Punjab government and released on bail by the courts. For instance, following a sectarian attack that killed eighteen in southern Punjab's Rahimyar Khan district in January 2012, he was arrested for violating laws against hate speech but released by the Lahore High Court.[185]

Perhaps to justify the failure to convict extremists like Ishaq, the police have tended to place all blame on the PML-N government in Lahore. A Lahore-based retired senior

[180] Admitting that the kidnappers of Malik, Weinstein and Taseer had demanded huge ransoms, Lahore's police chief said, "they also have separate demands". These reportedly included release of militant commanders. "Abductors want high ransom: IG", *The Nation*, 24 January 2012. "Multiple efforts underway to recover Shahbaz Taseer", *Dawn*, 21 August 2012; Asad Kharal, "Shahbaz Taseer abducted from Lahore", *The Express Tribune*, 27 August 2011. Also, Khaled Ahmed, "Who kidnapped Shahbaz Taseer?", *The Friday Times*, 2-8 September 2011.

[181] Zohra Yusuf, chairperson, "Joseph colony incident: HRCP holds police, administration responsible", Human Rights Commission of Pakistan (HRCP), press release, 13 March 2013

[182] Crisis Group interviews, serving and retired police officials, Lahore, October 2013.

[183] Rameez Khan, "Terror in Lahore: nine killed in attack on police hostel", *The Express Tribune*, 13 July 2012.

[184] Ishaq agreed not to align with militant groups in FATA or to use anti-Shia slogans at rallies. Crisis Group interviews, retired senior Punjab law enforcement officials, Lahore, October 2013.

[185] The court ruled that the Punjab government had failed to produce any incriminatory material against Ishaq. "In Rahim Yar Khan: Bomb attack on mourners kills 18", *The Express Tribune*, 15 January 2012; "Court releases Malik Ishaq", *The News*, 21 January 2012.

official insisted that, at least since 2010, it had generally appeased Punjab-based jihadi groups. "The provincial policy [is] 'Punjab is relatively peaceful, so why rattle the cage?'". A provincial minister agreed his government's failure to tackle Punjab-based militant groups could be attributed to "a carrot approach", absent sticks.[186] Given the links between LeJ headquarters in Punjab and its operations elsewhere, effective action against sectarian violence in Punjab would help to counter extremist groups countrywide. Lahore and the Punjab police must be central to such an effort, but it can only succeed if law enforcement and intelligence agencies cooperate across provincial borders. An ex-CPLC chief said, "terrorism cannot be fought simply city-wise. It needs to be combated through a national network with massive data sharing on movement, operational activities, the money trail, voice matching and case-building".[187]

According to a recently retired intelligence official, Lahore is at a high-threat level, due to intelligence reports about militant plans to attack sites using explosive-laden vehicles. "Terrorist groups", he said, "feel they have to show they can strike at the home base of the federal and Punjab government". Another said, "the writing is already on the wall".[188] Sectarian violence has spiked. On 6 December 2013, the Punjab president of the Ahle Sunnat Wal Jamaat, the renamed Sipah-e-Sahaba, was killed in Lahore, provoking large protests by Sunni hardliners there and in Rawalpindi. On 15 December, the leader of the Shia MDM was also killed in Lahore.[189] These apparently sectarian tit-for-tat killings will continue so long as the Punjab government fails to counter militancy.

It is also in the interest of the PML-N governments in Lahore and Islamabad to prevent banned anti-India oriented jihadis from operating freely under changed names. The headquarters of the military-backed Lashkar-e-Tayyaba, Jamaat-ud-Dawa (LeT/JD) is in Muridke, virtually a Lahore suburb. Operating freely countrywide and inciting jihad against India, LeT leader Hafez Saeed lives in Lahore.[190] Another major anti-India group, the Jaish-e-Mohammed, is headquartered in the southern Punjab district of Bahawalpur and has a nationwide network similar to Lashkar-e-Jhangvi's. Not only could these jihadi groups turn their attentions inward to demonstrate their strength, but another terrorist attack on India would put an end to PML-N efforts to normalise relations with New Delhi and might even trigger war between the nuclear-capable neighbours.

C. *Enforcing the Law*

The Punjab government has taken some steps to reorient the civilian law enforcement apparatus toward counter-terrorism. It established a modern forensics science lab in Lahore that is now fully functional and receives samples from across the country. By early 2011, Punjab's Criminal Investigation Department was revamped into a Counter-

[186] Crisis Group interviews, Lahore, October 2013.
[187] Crisis Group interview, Jamil Yusuf, Karachi, 5 September 2013.
[188] Crisis Group interviews, Lahore, October 2013.
[189] "ASWJ Punjab president gunned down in Lahore", *Dawn*, 6 December 2013; "Religious leader shot dead in Lahore", *The News*, 16 December 2913.
[190] In addition to attacks in India-administered Kashmir and major Indian cities such as the 2008 Mumbai attacks, LeT/JD cadres have been involved in attacks in Afghanistan and terrorist plots in the West, eg, a 2006 attempt to blow up transatlantic flights from the UK. Stephen Tankel, *Storming the World Stage: The Story of Lashkar-e-Taiba* (Gurgao, India), 2011.

Terrorism Department (CTD), with better-trained personnel and upgraded equipment, and reoriented to intelligence agency functions. The counter-terrorism strategy also included a policy board, headed by the chief minister; an implementation board, headed by the chief secretary, the province's top bureaucrat; and a de-radicalisation board. However, all were still-born because of lack of planning.

The Punjab government is now attempting to replicate Turkey's policing model, based on a centralised command structure, after Chief Minister Shahbaz Sharif visited Ankara in January 2010. "We saw enormous potential; we saw what a real counter-terrorism department looks like, what real traffic management looks like, what a friendly but effective police looks like. We wanted to implement this in Punjab", said a provincial minister and member of the chief minister's law and order team. The provincial government also seeks to emulate the Scotland Yard model, and visits by law enforcement delegations to the UK as well as Turkey have been frequent since 2010.[191] The Punjab government has signed several memorandums of understanding with Ankara on policing, including to train police trainers. The Turkish and Punjab police have run ten courses – six in Turkey, four in Pakistan – with fifteen to twenty Pakistani participants each. Yet, graduates often receive regular rather than training duties.[192]

Since the PML-N assumed office at the centre in June 2013, there is greater convergence on law enforcement policy between Lahore and Islamabad. Areas of cooperation include counter-terrorism, information technology and telecommunication, crime scene investigation and forensics. There is also cooperation, with Turkish support, among other areas on traffic management, riot policing and police training. The PML-N aims for progress on all areas by the end of 2014.[193] The Punjab government is also introducing annual third-party audits to review police performance against yearly targets set by the provincial cabinet. These would be presented at year's end to the cabinet, which would provide them to the provincial legislature for debate and to recommend follow-on action.[194]

Yet, these efforts will be hampered without a zero tolerance policy toward all forms of militancy. The PML-N government in Islamabad has proposed negotiating with militants. On 9 September 2013, political parties and senior military leaders, meeting at an all-parties conference, supported a negotiated settlement with the Pakistani Taliban without a specific roadmap or preconditions.[195] If the central government follows Musharraf's lead in appeasing the militants, it would undermine police functioning and morale countrywide, including in Lahore.

[191] Crisis Group interview, Colonel (r) Shuja Khanzada, Lahore, 10 October 2013.
[192] Crisis Group interview, senior government official, Lahore, October 2013
[193] Ibid.
[194] Crisis Group interview, Colonel (r) Shuja Khanzada, Lahore, 10 October 2013.
[195] "Resolution of the all-parties conference on Sept 9, 2013", *Dawn*, 9 September 2013.

VI. Urban Policing

Notwithstanding the importance of addressing socio-economic disparities that lead to violence and militancy, Pakistan will be unable to confront its law and order challenges without fundamental police reforms. Unlike other South Asian countries, policing in urban and rural areas has largely remained unchanged since independence. Before August 1947, the Metropolitan Police Act of 1856 applied to British India's three largest cities, Bombay, Madras and Calcuttta, along the lines of the London metropolitan police, which had broad autonomy and authority, with a police commissioner answerable to judicial authorities. After the so-called Indian Mutiny, however, the 1861 Police Act was adopted.[196] Based on the Irish Constabulary model, it turned the police in the rest of British India into a coercive arm of the state under the bureaucracy's control, aimed at forcefully imposing the colonial state's writ.

After independence, the Indian government retained the more liberal metropolitan police model in place in Bombay, Madras and Calcutta and gradually extended it so that at least 60 Indian cities now have a metropolitan police.[197] In Pakistan, the Sindh Assembly passed a bill in 1948 for a metropolitan police in Karachi, then the national capital, which required the governor general's signature to come into force. An ailing Mohammed Ali Jinnah did not sign it before his death in September 1948. The bureaucracy then blocked it from becoming law and, like the colonial authority, used a coercive police force to quell dissent and maintain order.[198] Ayub Khan's military regime further militarised policing and also turned the civil armed force – para-military units – into a virtual army appendage that it increasingly relied on to maintain order in urban centres.

In 1989, after sending delegations to examine urban policing in other South Asian countries, Benazir Bhutto's government sought to establish a metropolitan policing model in Islamabad and the four provincial capitals.[199] Bureaucratic resistance and, subsequently, President Ghulam Ishaq Khan's dismissal of the government at the military's behest ended such efforts.

Musharraf's Police Order of 2002 revived the concept of a metropolitan police, supposedly independent from bureaucratic interference. Each provincial capital had a capital city police officer (CCPO), who was to be of at least additional inspector general rank. Yet, while the Police Order abolished the local bureaucracy's supervisory role over the police, it transferred that authority to indirectly elected *nazims* (mayors), the military regime's local clientele.[200] The Police Order's accountability bodies, including federal, provincial and district public safety commissions and complaints authorities were not established. After the Police Order expired on 31 December 2009, the provincial governments had the authority to create their own policing systems.

[196] The mutiny of sepoys (soldiers) of the East India Company's army in 1857 is commonly referred to as a war of independence in Pakistan and India.
[197] Bangladesh has a metropolitan police model in five cities; Sri Lanka in Colombo; and Nepal in Kathmandu.
[198] Crisis Group interviews, serving and retired senior police officials, Islamabad, Karachi and Lahore, September-October 2013.
[199] Several visiting commissions and delegations were told that Pakistan should adopt the metropolitan model for its provincial capitals. Crisis Group interviews, retired senior police officials, Lahore, October 2013.
[200] Crisis Group Asia Reports N°157, *Reforming Pakistan's Police*, 14 July 2008; and N°77, *Devolution in Pakistan: Reform or Regression?*, 22 March 2004.

Sindh and Balochistan revived the dysfunctional 1861 act in 2011. In September 2013, KPK and Punjab revived Police Order 2002, with some amendments in Punjab's case. However, the basic policing structure remains more or less the same in all provincial capitals, with an inadequately-resourced force and poorly integrated and supervised stations serving as the public face of law enforcement.

Many respected senior serving and retired officers strongly support the metropolitan police model, based on a more unified command and support structure and capable of rapid response and multiple activities, from registering complaints to operations and investigations. Station numbers, they believe, should be cut. The subdivision should be the basic unit, led by an additional or district superintendent of police (ASP or DSP), reporting to a senior officer of additional inspector general (AIG) or inspector general (IG) rank. Existing subdivisions should be cut to twenty to 25 in each provincial capital. Rather than interface with exploitative stations, complainants should be able to register cases directly at a subdivision that would send an operational/investigation team to file a report. Some stations could become reporting cells to facilitate information flow to subdivisions. The model would reduce physical infrastructure and overhead in favour of technical and human resources. Stretched resources make countrywide replication hard, so federal and provincial capitals should be the initial focus.[201]

There are compelling arguments for such a model. Urban centres require more sophisticated human and technical resources to track criminals than rural areas. Such efforts will fail, however, unless the police are protected from political interference, including in appointments, and given secure tenure. For example, political interference in the working of stations, including demands for release of suspects, undermines effectiveness and morale. Inspectors general have the formal authority to make senior appointments, but in practice they often serve as rubberstamps for political appointees regarding the most senior posts to the lowest, from DIGs to DSPs to Station House Officers (SHOs).[202]

A retired IG described the Senior Superintendents of Police (SSPs) as "crime controllers", within their jurisdiction. "The problem is that they are selected out of turn" because of nepotism. As a result, "the good people get left behind". Another police official said, "if the police have failed, the IG should certainly take responsibility. But the home and chief secretaries also need to take responsibility because they're the ones making the bad appointments".[203] The provincial police leadership should be allowed to make appointments to the superintendent level, subject to approval by provincial public safety commissions.

The lack of secure tenure also makes the police susceptible to political interference. The Sindh police DIG Abdul Khalique Shaikh said:

> IG Sindh and Karachi's police chief must establish their writ within the department before they embark on the demanding task of bringing order to the city. The Sindh police chief has to be in control and his time and attention needs to be spent on reorganising his 100,000-plus force and not in a survival struggle.[204]

[201] Crisis Group interviews, Islamabad and Karachi, September 2013.
[202] Crisis Group interviews, serving and retired police and government officials, PPP and PML-N members, countrywide, June-October 2013; Report, *Reforming Pakistan's Police*, op. cit.
[203] Crisis Group interviews, Karachi, September 2013.
[204] Shaikh, op. cit.

According to police, government and political party officials, the average tenure for a Karachi SHO is 40 days.[205] In the run-up to the May 2013 elections, Karachi saw the transfers and appointments of four police superintendents in two days.

Reliance on paramilitary entities to enforce the law, such as in Karachi, is particularly problematic. They often illegally detain suspects for weeks or even months before handing them over to police for processing. The police have to produce a suspect before a magistrate within 24 hours of arrest, or when they officially assume custody from the Rangers or FC. They must have sufficient evidence for detention, after which the suspect is placed under judicial remand. Paramilitary personnel, however, seldom give the police the necessary evidence or even basic information of the arrest, such as the circumstances leading to it. Individual Rangers or FC officials may also rotate out, leaving the police with no contact person on a case.

Some Karachi police believe that giving the Rangers investigation and prosecution powers would spare the police responsibility for cases doomed to fail for lack of evidence. A senior Sindh police official said, "we are always given the blame for letting some guys go, even though the Rangers give us nothing. So we've said, give the Rangers investigation and prosecution powers and see how they do".[206] While the frustrations are understandable, giving the Rangers these new powers would set a dangerous precedent that would be difficult to reverse and further marginalise civilian law enforcement agencies.

Rather than sidelining the police, the federal and provincial governments should make its modernisation the focus of law enforcement reform. Other civilian agencies like the provincial CIDs, the Federal Investigation Agency and the Intelligence Bureau should continue to gather data, while the National Counter-Terrorism Authority (NACTA) should function as the central data bank on terrorist groups, including voice matching, fingerprinting, DNA analysis, and other forensic-related information.[207]

In Punjab, Chief Minister Sharif must give the police the lead if counter-terrorism efforts are to succeed. Reported plans to set up a separate counter-terrorism force under the home ministry and outside police administrative control could see the province facing the same problems as Karachi: parallel entities operating without collaboration and coordination, thus undermining efforts to build strong cases that stand up in court.[208]

Resource allocation should prioritise personnel and technology over bricks and mortar. Karachi has one policeman for 600 citizens, Balochistan one for 450; the international mean is one to around 260.[209] Constables are on duty for fourteen hours,

[205] Crisis Group interviews, Karachi, September 2013.

[206] Crisis Group interview, Karachi, September 2013.

[207] NACTA was established in December 2009 but was ineffective due to political turf battles, and lack of resources, authority and a legal framework. Parliament endorsed its creation only in March 2013. Crisis Group Reports, *Parliament's Role in Pakistan's Democratic Transition*; and *Reforming Pakistan's Criminal Justice System*, both op. cit.

[208] Police officers have reportedly strongly opposed the proposal. Muhammad Faisal Ali, "Cops join hands for IG's powers", *Dawn*, 19 December 2013; Muhammad Faisal Ali, "Counter terrorism force under IGP yet to be notified", *Dawn*, 30 December 2013.

[209] Crisis Group interview, Sharfuddin Memon, home affairs adviser, Sindh government, Karachi, 6 September 2013; Shehzad Baloch, "'Policing isn't easy in Quetta'", *The Express Tribune*, 26 November 2010. Stefan Harrendorf and Paul Smit, "Attributes of criminal justice systems – resources, performance and punitivity", in Stefan Harrendorf, Markhu Heiskanen, Steven Malby (eds.), *International Statistics on Crime and Justice*, European Institute for Crime Prevention and Control and UN Office on Drugs and Crime, 2010, pp. 113-152.

with limited access to facilities, even toilets. Their benefits, including health care and rewards for good performance or dangerous assignments are far from adequate.[210]

Poor pay and working conditions can make police vulnerable to recruitment by gangs and extremist groups. In 2012, three senior Balochistan police were suspended for involvement in kidnapping a resident of Dalbandin town. Jihadi groups have infiltrated the force at some levels, due less to ideology than bribery or intimidation. Visiting Quetta in July 2013, Prime Minister Sharif warned of "black sheep" in the police department. In May 2013, DIG Operations, Balochistan, Fayyaz Sumbal said a constable and an assistant sub-inspector were in close contact with LeJ leadership. Two months later, he and some 30 other police were killed in a suicide attack while attending a colleague's funeral in Quetta.[211]

The force has competent and honest officers. If the right persons are appointed to leadership positions and given the necessary powers, it would be far more effective. In September 2013, as the Rangers operations were underway in Karachi, the Sindh government conducted a major police reshuffle with new appointments to seventeen senior posts, including a respected officer to head the Karachi police.[212] If given operational autonomy and the required tools and authority, this leadership may have a chance to halt Karachi's spiral of violence.

Under the IG, a beginning has been made to restore police morale in that city. Over 200 officers involved in operations to restore law and order in the 1990s were killed in retaliation. The culprits were never caught, and families were not compensated. As a result, according to a former senior Sindh police official, "few officers want to be part of such an operation again".[213] Soon after assuming his new post, the Karachi chief announced that the police would reopen cases of those killed in the 1990s. He must also pursue the killing of over 162 police in Karachi in 2013, mostly in target killings, including SP CID Chaudhry Aslam, one of Karachi's top counter-terrorism officers.[214]

[210] Crisis Group Report, *Reforming Pakistan's Police*, op. cit.

[211] Crisis Group interviews, senior police officials, Islamabad, Karachi, Lahore and Quetta, June-October, 2013. "CCPO confirms involvement of officers in kidnapping", *Daily Times*, 21 January 2013. Muhammad Ejaz Khan, "Terrorism unacceptable everywhere, including Balochistan: PM", *The News*, 3 July 2013. Syed Arfeen, "Shocking details of links between policemen and LeJ emerge", *The News*, 25 May 2013; "Blast in Quetta: TTP suicide bomber kills 30 at policeman's funeral", *The Express Tribune*, 8 August 2013.

[212] "Major reshuffle in Sindh police", *Dawn*, 12 September 2013.

[213] "The case is not investigated, and no one is brought to book". Crisis Group interview, Karachi, September 2013

[214] M. Waqar Bhatti, "Police to reopen cases of cops slain since '92", *The News*, 20 September 2013. The TTP has claimed responsibility for the bomb attack in retaliation for the killing of its members in operations led by Aslam. "Taliban kill 'toughest cop' in Karachi blast", *Daily Times*, 10 January 2014. "Policeman gunned down in targeted attack", *Dawn*, 1 January 2014. Fifteen officers have been killed in targeted attacks in Karachi in the first three weeks of the new year. "Another policeman gunned down in Karachi", *Dawn*, 21 January 2014.

VII. Conclusion

Provincial capitals will remain an attractive venue for militant and criminal networks to raise money, recruit foot soldiers and attack ethnic rivals, sectarian minorities and state institutions. Though socio-economic disparities that lead to crime and militancy are important drivers, urban violence is largely the product of inappropriate security policies, including decades of neglecting police reform, and flawed governance.

In many urban centres, particularly Quetta and Peshawar, urban violence is integrally linked to semi-urban, rural or tribal outskirts used by militants as safe havens. Since the police are not allowed to pursue the perpetrators of violence in many of these areas, their hands will remain tied until the FCR and other legal and jurisdictional anomalies are removed. So long as Islamabad allows the military to lead on security, heavy-handed, selective operations, accompanied by appeasement deals, will empower jihadi groups and tribal militants in Peshawar and Quetta.

Karachi's killing spree will continue if the mainstream political parties do not cut their links to armed gangs and persuade their constituents to follow suit. Yet, the nexus between criminal and jihadi organisations countrywide could remain a threat to Karachi's security, as it does to Lahore's. The failure of law enforcement agencies to build strong cases results in the courts freeing violent extremists such as LeJ's Malik Ishaq, emboldened his criminal and jihadi allies. The Punjab government's unwillingness to prevent all banned organisations – from the LeT to the military-backed Lashkar-e-Tayyaba/Jamaat-ud-Dawa and Jaish-e-Mohammed – from operating freely has further emboldened the militants.

Curbing urban conflict requires a mix of political and economic solutions. It also requires improved policing in the provincial capitals. Instead of selective and sporadic action, there is need for consistent, comprehensive efforts to curtail crime across the board. While demoralised police are paralysed by political interference and lack of adequate resources and political support, they could become effective if properly authorised and given institutional and operational autonomy.

The federal government should also clarify its position on talks with the militants. The Pakistani Taliban's new leader, Maulana Fazlullah, who launched a reign of terror in Swat and neighbouring KPK districts just a few years ago, is not a partner for peace. Nor will piecemeal deals with Taliban factions curb militant violence. If tribal militants are allowed to control the hinterlands, their capacity and that of their countrywide network of criminal and jihadi groups to target the urban centres will increase further. Acknowledging and addressing the social and economic causes of urban violence, Islamabad and the provincial governments must also improve policing, but that will not secure the provincial capitals unless accompanied by zero tolerance for any form of militancy on Pakistan's soil.

Islamabad/Brussels, 23 January 2014

Appendix A: Map of Pakistan

Based on UN Map No. 4181 Rev. 1 (January 2004), "North-West Frontier" has been changed to "Khyber Pakhtunkhwa".

Appendix B: Glossary of Terms

ANP – Awami National Party (ANP), a secular Pashtun-dominated party, headed a coalition government in KPK with the PPP from 2008-2013.

ASWJ – Ahle Sunnat Wal Jamaat, the renamed Sipah-e-Sahaba Pakistan, an extremist Deobandi group, the parent organisation of the Lashkar-e-Jhangvi (see below).

BLA – Balochistan Liberation Army, a left-leaning insurgent group, led by Hybariar Marri, fighting for Baloch political and economic rights.

BLF – Baloch Liberation Front, a Baloch insurgent group led by Allah Nazar.

BNP-M – Balochistan National Party (Mengal), a Baloch nationalist political party, led by Akhtar Jan Mengal.

CID – Criminal Investigation Department, lead investigation and civilian counter-terrorism provincial-level agency.

FATA – Federally Administered Tribal Areas.

FC – Frontier Corps, a federal paramilitary force involved in counter-insurgency operations in FATA and Balochistan. It falls under the interior ministry but is headed by a serving army officer.

FCR – Frontier Crimes Regulations, a draconian, colonial-era legal framework adopted in 1901 and retained after independence in 1947 to govern FATA.

FR – Frontier Region, a part of FATA.

HRCP – Independent non-governmental Human Rights Commission of Pakistan.

IB – Intelligence Bureau, the main civilian intelligence agency.

ISI – Inter-Services Intelligence directorate, the military's main intelligence agency.

JUI-F – Jamiat Ulema-e-Islam (Fazlur Rehman), the largest Islamist political party, with a support base in parts of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Balochistan.

KPK – Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, formerly known as the Northwest Frontier Province (NWFP).

LeJ – Lashkar-e-Jhangvi, an extremist Deobandi organisation, responsible for major sectarian killings and other terrorist violence, headquartered in Punjab but with a countrywide network.

LeT – Lashkar-e-Tayyaba, anti-India jihadi group led by Hafez Saeed, banned and renamed Jamaat-ud-Dawa in 2002, responsible for the November 2008 Mumbai attacks.

MDM – Majlis-e-Wahdutul Muslimeen, a Shia political party.

MQM – Muttahida Qaumi Movement, a Karachi-based political party; earlier the Mohajir Qaumi Movement.

MWM – A Shia party formed in 2008 in response to anti-Shia extremism, gained prominence in 2012 and 2013 by leading demonstrations in Quetta against the killings of Shias.

NACTA – National Counter-Terrorism Authority, established in December 2009 and revived after parliamentary endorsement in March 2013.

NP – National Party, a Baloch nationalist party, coalition partner in Balochistan government with the Pakhtunkhwa Milli Awami Party.

PAC – People's Aman (Peace) Committee, a criminal gang in Karach's Lyari district.

PATA – Provincially Administered Tribal Areas.

PIPS – Pakistan Institute of Peace Studies, an Islamabad-based research organisation.

PKMAP – Pakhtunkhwa Milli Awami Party, a Pashtun nationalist political party based in Balochistan's Pashtun belt; currently a coalition partner in Balochistan's provincial government with the National Party led by Chief Minister Dr Abdul Malik Baloch.

PML-N – Pakistan Muslim League-Nawaz, led by Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif, currently heading a majority government at the centre and in Punjab.

PPP – Pakistan Peoples Party, founded by Zulfikar Ali Bhutto in 1967. Since Benazir Bhutto's assassination in December 2007, the party is headed by her widower, former President Asif Ali Zardari, and son, Bilawal Bhutto Zardari. It led the coalition government in the centre from 2008 to 2013 and is currently the largest opposition party in the National Assembly. It also heads the provincial government in Sindh.

PTI – Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf, founded by Imran Khan, currently heading the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa provincial government.

QWP – Qaumi Watan Party, led by former Interior Minister Aftab Ahmed Khan Sherpao, with a support base in western KPK. It was a coalition partner in the PTI-led KPK government until November 2013.

SHO – Station house officer, head of a police station.

SSP – Sipah-e-Sahaba Pakistan, a radical Deobandi group and Lashkar-e-Jhangvi's parent organisation; renamed Ahle Sunnat Wal Jamaat.

TTP – Tehreek-e-Taliban Pakistan (Taliban Movement of Pakistan), an umbrella organisation of predominantly Pashtun militant groups in KPK and FATA.

Appendix C: About the International Crisis Group

The International Crisis Group (Crisis Group) is an independent, non-profit, non-governmental organisation, with some 150 staff members on five continents, working through field-based analysis and high-level advocacy to prevent and resolve deadly conflict.

Crisis Group's approach is grounded in field research. Teams of political analysts are located within or close by countries at risk of outbreak, escalation or recurrence of violent conflict. Based on information and assessments from the field, it produces analytical reports containing practical recommendations targeted at key international decision-takers. Crisis Group also publishes *CrisisWatch*, a twelve-page monthly bulletin, providing a succinct regular update on the state of play in all the most significant situations of conflict or potential conflict around the world.

Crisis Group's reports and briefing papers are distributed widely by email and made available simultaneously on the website, www.crisisgroup.org. Crisis Group works closely with governments and those who influence them, including the media, to highlight its crisis analyses and to generate support for its policy prescriptions.

The Crisis Group Board – which includes prominent figures from the fields of politics, diplomacy, business and the media – is directly involved in helping to bring the reports and recommendations to the attention of senior policy-makers around the world. Crisis Group is chaired by former U.S. Undersecretary of State and Ambassador Thomas Pickering. Its President and Chief Executive since July 2009 has been Louise Arbour, former UN High Commissioner for Human Rights and Chief Prosecutor for the International Criminal Tribunals for the former Yugoslavia and for Rwanda.

Crisis Group's international headquarters is in Brussels, and the organisation has offices or representation in 34 locations: Abuja, Bangkok, Beijing, Beirut, Bishkek, Bogotá, Bujumbura, Cairo, Dakar, Damascus, Dubai, Gaza, Guatemala City, Islamabad, Istanbul, Jakarta, Jerusalem, Johannesburg, Kabul, Kathmandu, London, Moscow, Nairobi, New York, Pristina, Rabat, Sanaa, Sarajevo, Seoul, Tbilisi, Tripoli, Tunis and Washington DC. Crisis Group currently covers some 70 areas of actual or potential conflict across four continents. In Africa, this includes, Burkina Faso, Burundi, Cameroon, Central African Republic, Chad, Côte d'Ivoire, Democratic Republic of the Congo, Eritrea, Ethiopia, Guinea, Guinea-Bissau, Kenya, Liberia, Madagascar, Nigeria, Sierra Leone, Somalia, South Sudan, Sudan, Uganda and Zimbabwe; in Asia, Afghanistan, Burma/Myanmar, Indonesia, Kashmir, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Malaysia, Nepal, North Korea, Pakistan, Philippines, Sri Lanka, Taiwan Strait, Tajikistan, Thailand, Timor-Leste, Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan; in Europe, Armenia, Azerbaijan, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Cyprus, Georgia, Kosovo, Macedonia, North Caucasus, Serbia and Turkey; in the Middle East and North Africa, Algeria, Bahrain, Egypt, Iran, Iraq, Israel-Palestine, Jordan, Lebanon, Libya, Morocco, Syria, Tunisia, Western Sahara and Yemen; and in Latin America and the Caribbean, Colombia, Guatemala and Venezuela.

In 2014, Crisis Group receives financial support from, or is in the process of renewing relationships with, a wide range of governments, institutional foundations, and private sources. Crisis Group receives support from the following governmental departments and agencies: Australian Agency for International Development, Austrian Development Agency, Belgian Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Canadian International Development Agency, Canadian International Development Research Centre, Danish Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ), Dutch Ministry of Foreign Affairs, European Union Instrument for Stability, French Ministry of Foreign Affairs, German Federal Foreign Office, Irish Aid, Principality of Liechtenstein, Luxembourg Ministry of Foreign Affairs, New Zealand (Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade), Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Swedish Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Swiss Federal Department of Foreign Affairs, United Kingdom Department for International Development, U.S. Agency for International Development.

Crisis Group also holds relationships with the following institutional and private foundations: Adessium Foundation, Carnegie Corporation of New York, The Charitable Foundation, The Elders, Henry Luce Foundation, Humanity United, John D. and Catherine T. MacArthur Foundation, Oak Foundation, Open Society Foundations, Open Society Initiative for West Africa, Ploughshares Fund, Pluralism Human Security and Sustainability Centre (PLUSEC), Rockefeller Brothers Fund, and VIVA Trust.

January 2014

Appendix D: Reports and Briefings on Asia since 2011

As of 1 October 2013, Central Asia publications are listed under the Europe and Central Asia program.

North East Asia

China and Inter-Korean Clashes in the Yellow Sea, Asia Report N°200, 27 January 2011 (also available in Chinese).

Strangers at Home: North Koreans in the South, Asia Report N°208, 14 July 2011 (also available in Korean).

South Korea: The Shifting Sands of Security Policy, Asia Briefing N°130, 1 December 2011.

Stirring up the South China Sea (I), Asia Report N°223, 23 April 2012 (also available in Chinese).

Stirring up the South China Sea (II): Regional Responses, Asia Report N°229, 24 July 2012 (also available in Chinese).

North Korean Succession and the Risks of Instability, Asia Report N°230, 25 July 2012 (also available in Chinese and Korean).

China's Central Asia Problem, Asia Report N°244, 27 February 2013 (also available in Chinese).

Dangerous Waters: China-Japan Relations on the Rocks, Asia Report N°245, 8 April 2013 (also available in Chinese).

Fire on the City Gate: Why China Keeps North Korea Close, Asia Report N°254, 9 December 2013 (also available in Chinese).

South Asia

Nepal: Identity Politics and Federalism, Asia Report N°199, 13 January 2011 (also available in Nepali).

Afghanistan's Elections Stalemate, Asia Briefing N°117, 23 February 2011.

Reforming Pakistan's Electoral System, Asia Report N°203, 30 March 2011.

Nepal's Fitful Peace Process, Asia Briefing N°120, 7 April 2011 (also available in Nepali).

India and Sri Lanka after the LTTE, Asia Report N°206, 23 June 2011.

The Insurgency in Afghanistan's Heartland, Asia Report N°207, 27 June 2011.

Reconciliation in Sri Lanka: Harder Than Ever, Asia Report N°209, 18 July 2011.

Aid and Conflict in Afghanistan, Asia Report N°210, 4 August 2011.

Nepal: From Two Armies to One, Asia Report N°211, 18 August 2011 (also available in Nepali).

Reforming Pakistan's Prison System, Asia Report N°212, 12 October 2011.

Islamic Parties in Pakistan, Asia Report N°216, 12 December 2011.

Nepal's Peace Process: The Endgame Nears, Asia Briefing N°131, 13 December 2011 (also available in Nepali).

Sri Lanka: Women's Insecurity in the North and East, Asia Report N°217, 20 December 2011.

Sri Lanka's North (I): The Denial of Minority Rights, Asia Report N°219, 16 March 2012.

Sri Lanka's North (II): Rebuilding under the Military, Asia Report N°220, 16 March 2012.

Talking About Talks: Toward a Political Settlement in Afghanistan, Asia Report N°221, 26 March 2012.

Pakistan's Relations with India: Beyond Kashmir?, Asia Report N°224, 3 May 2012.

Bangladesh: Back to the Future, Asia Report N°226, 13 June 2012.

Aid and Conflict in Pakistan, Asia Report N°227, 27 June 2012.

Election Reform in Pakistan, Asia Briefing N°137, 16 August 2012.

Nepal's Constitution (I): Evolution Not Revolution, Asia Report N°233, 27 August 2012 (also available in Nepali).

Nepal's Constitution (II): The Expanding Political Matrix, Asia Report N°234, 27 August 2012 (also available in Nepali).

Afghanistan: The Long, Hard Road to the 2014 Transition, Asia Report N°236, 8 October 2012.

Pakistan: No End To Humanitarian Crises, Asia Report N°237, 9 October 2012.

Sri Lanka: Tamil Politics and the Quest for a Political Solution, Asia Report N°239, 20 November 2012.

Pakistan: Countering Militancy in PATA, Asia Report N°242, 15 January 2013.

Sri Lanka's Authoritarian Turn: The Need for International Action, Asia Report N°243, 20 February 2013.

Drones: Myths and Reality in Pakistan, Asia Report N°247, 21 May 2013.

Afghanistan's Parties in Transition, Asia Briefing N°141, 26 June 2013.

Parliament's Role in Pakistan's Democratic Transition, Asia Report N°249, 18 September 2013.

Women and Conflict in Afghanistan, Asia Report N°252, 14 October 2013.

Sri Lanka's Potemkin Peace: Democracy under Fire, Asia Report N°253, 13 November 2013

South East Asia

The Communist Insurgency in the Philippines: Tactics and Talks, Asia Report N°202, 14 February 2011.

Myanmar's Post-Election Landscape, Asia Briefing N°118, 7 March 2011 (also available in Chinese and Burmese).

The Philippines: Back to the Table, Warily, in Mindanao, Asia Briefing N°119, 24 March 2011.

Thailand: The Calm Before Another Storm?, Asia Briefing N°121, 11 April 2011 (also available in Chinese and Thai).

Timor-Leste: Reconciliation and Return from Indonesia, Asia Briefing N°122, 18 April 2011 (also available in Indonesian).

Indonesian Jihadism: Small Groups, Big Plans, Asia Report N°204, 19 April 2011 (also available in Chinese).

Indonesia: Gam vs Gam in the Aceh Elections, Asia Briefing N°123, 15 June 2011.

Indonesia: Debate over a New Intelligence Bill, Asia Briefing N°124, 12 July 2011.

The Philippines: A New Strategy for Peace in Mindanao?, Asia Briefing N°125, 3 August 2011.

Indonesia: Hope and Hard Reality in Papua, Asia Briefing N°126, 22 August 2011.

Myanmar: Major Reform Underway, Asia Briefing N°127, 22 September 2011 (also available in Burmese and Chinese).

Indonesia: Trouble Again in Ambon, Asia Briefing N°128, 4 October 2011.

Timor-Leste's Veterans: An Unfinished Struggle?, Asia Briefing N°129, 18 November 2011.

The Philippines: Indigenous Rights and the MILF Peace Process, Asia Report N°213, 22 November 2011.

Myanmar: A New Peace Initiative, Asia Report N°214, 30 November 2011 (also available in Burmese and Chinese).

Waging Peace: ASEAN and the Thai-Cambodian Border Conflict, Asia Report N°215, 6 December 2011 (also available in Chinese).

Indonesia: From Vigilantism to Terrorism in Cirebon, Asia Briefing N°132, 26 January 2012.

Indonesia: Cautious Calm in Ambon, Asia Briefing N°133, 13 February 2012.

Indonesia: The Deadly Cost of Poor Policing, Asia Report N°218, 16 February 2012 (also available in Indonesian).

Timor-Leste's Elections: Leaving Behind a Violent Past?, Asia Briefing N°134, 21 February 2012.

Indonesia: Averting Election Violence in Aceh, Asia Briefing N°135, 29 February 2012.

Reform in Myanmar: One Year On, Asia Briefing N°136, 11 April 2012 (also available in Burmese and Chinese).

The Philippines: Local Politics in the Sulu Archipelago and the Peace Process, Asia Report N°225, 15 May 2012.

How Indonesian Extremists Regroup, Asia Report N°228, 16 July 2012 (also available in Indonesian).

Myanmar: The Politics of Economic Reform, Asia Report N°231, 27 July 2012 (also available in Burmese and Chinese).

Indonesia: Dynamics of Violence in Papua, Asia Report N°232, 9 August 2012 (also available in Indonesian).

Indonesia: Defying the State, Asia Briefing N°138, 30 August 2012.

Malaysia's Coming Election: Beyond Communalism?, Asia Report N°235, 1 October 2012.

Myanmar: Storm Clouds on the Horizon, Asia Report N°238, 12 November 2012 (also available in Chinese and Burmese).

The Philippines: Breakthrough in Mindanao, Asia Report N°240, 5 December 2012.

Thailand: The Evolving Conflict in the South, Asia Report N°241, 11 December 2012.

Indonesia: Tensions Over Aceh's Flag, Asia Briefing N°139, 7 May 2013.

Timor-Leste: Stability At What Cost?, Asia Report N°246, 8 May 2013.

A Tentative Peace in Myanmar's Kachin Conflict, Asia Briefing N°140, 12 June 2013 (also available in Burmese and Chinese).

The Philippines: Dismantling Rebel Groups, Asia Report N°248, 19 June 2013.

The Dark Side of Transition: Violence Against Muslims in Myanmar, Asia Report N°251, 1 October 2013 (also available in Burmese and Chinese).

Not a Rubber Stamp: Myanmar's Legislature in a Time of Transition, Asia Briefing N°142, 13 December 2013.

Appendix E: International Crisis Group Board of Trustees

CHAIRS

Lord (Mark) Malloch-Brown
Former UN Deputy Secretary-General and Administrator of the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP)

Thomas R Pickering
Former U.S. Undersecretary of State; Ambassador to the UN, Russia, India, Israel, Jordan, El Salvador and Nigeria

PRESIDENT & CEO

Louise Arbour
Former UN High Commissioner for Human Rights and Chief Prosecutor for the International Criminal Tribunals for the former Yugoslavia and Rwanda

VICE-CHAIRS

Ayo Obe
Legal Practitioner, Lagos, Nigeria

Ghassan Salamé
Dean, Paris School of International Affairs, Sciences Po

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

Cheryl Carolus
Former South African High Commissioner to the UK and Secretary General of the ANC

Maria Livanos Cattaui
Former Secretary-General of the International Chamber of Commerce

Frank Giustra
President & CEO, Fiore Financial Corporation

Moisés Naím
Senior Associate, International Economics Program, Carnegie Endowment for International Peace; Former Editor in Chief, *Foreign Policy*

George Soros
Chairman, Open Society Institute

Pär Stenbäck
Former Foreign Minister of Finland

OTHER BOARD MEMBERS

Morton Abramowitz
Former U.S. Assistant Secretary of State and Ambassador to Turkey

Kofi Annan
Former Secretary-General of the United Nations; Nobel Peace Prize (2001)

Nahum Barnea
Chief Columnist for *Yedioth Ahronoth*, Israel

Samuel Berger
Chair, Albright Stonebridge Group LLC; Former U.S. National Security Adviser

Micheline Calmy-Rey
Former President of the Swiss Confederation and Foreign Affairs Minister

Wesley Clark
Former NATO Supreme Allied Commander

Sheila Coronel
Toni Stabile Professor of Practice in Investigative Journalism; Director, Toni Stabile Center for Investigative Journalism, Columbia University, U.S.

Mark Eyskens
Former Prime Minister of Belgium

Joschka Fischer
Former Foreign Minister of Germany

Lykke Friis
Former Climate & Energy Minister and Minister of Gender Equality of Denmark; Former Prorector at the University of Copenhagen

Jean-Marie Guéhenno
Arnold Saltzman Professor of War and Peace Studies, Columbia University; Former UN Under-Secretary-General for Peacekeeping Operations

Carla Hills
Former U.S. Secretary of Housing and U.S. Trade Representative

Lena Hjelm-Wallén
Former Deputy Prime Minister and Foreign Minister of Sweden

Mo Ibrahim
Founder and Chair, Mo Ibrahim Foundation; Founder, Celtel International

Asma Jahangir
President of the Supreme Court Bar Association of Pakistan, Former UN Special Rapporteur on the Freedom of Religion or Belief

Wadah Khanfar
Co-Founder, Al Sharq Forum; Former Director General, Al Jazeera Network

Wim Kok
Former Prime Minister of the Netherlands

Ricardo Lagos
Former President of Chile

Joanne Leedom-Ackerman
Former International Secretary of PEN International; Novelist and journalist, U.S.

Lalit Mansingh
Former Foreign Secretary of India, Ambassador to the U.S. and High Commissioner to the UK

Benjamin Mkapa
Former President of Tanzania

Laurence Parisot
President, French Business Confederation (MEDEF)

Karim Raslan
Founder, Managing Director and Chief Executive Officer of KRA Group

Paul Reynolds
President & Chief Executive Officer, Canaccord Financial Inc.

Javier Solana
Former EU High Representative for Common Foreign and Security Policy, NATO Secretary General and Foreign Minister of Spain

Liv Monica Stubholt
Senior Vice President for Strategy and Communication, Kvaerner ASA; Former State Secretary for the Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs

Lawrence H. Summers
Former Director of the U.S. National Economic Council and Secretary of the U.S. Treasury; President Emeritus of Harvard University

Wang Jisi
Dean, School of International Studies, Peking University; Member, Foreign Policy Advisory Committee of the Chinese Foreign Ministry

Wu Jianmin
Executive Vice Chairman, China Institute for Innovation and Development Strategy; Member, Foreign Policy Advisory Committee of the Chinese Foreign Ministry; Former Ambassador of China to the UN (Geneva) and France

Lionel Zinsou
CEO, PAI Partners

PRESIDENT'S COUNCIL

A distinguished group of individual and corporate donors providing essential support and expertise to Crisis Group.

Anonymous (3)
Frank Caufield
Dow Chemical
Frank Holmes
Investec Asset Management
Steve Killelea
Pierre Mirabaud
Ford Nicholson & Lisa Wolverton
Shearman & Sterling LLP
White & Case LLP
Neil Woodyer

INTERNATIONAL ADVISORY COUNCIL

Individual and corporate supporters who play a key role in Crisis Group's efforts to prevent deadly conflict.

CORPORATE
Anglo American PLC
APCO Worldwide Inc.
Atlas Copco AB
BP
Chevron
Equinox Partners
FTI Consulting
Lockwood Financial Ltd
PTT Public Company Limited
Shell
Silk Road Finance Ltd
Statoil
Talisman Energy
Yapı Merkezi Construction and Industry Inc.

INDIVIDUAL
Anonymous
Ryan Beedie
Stanley Bergman & Edward Bergman
David Brown
Neil & Sandra DeFeo Family Foundation
Neemat Frem
Seth & Jane Ginns
Alan Griffiths
Rita E. Hauser
George Kellner
Faisel Khan
Zelmira Koch Polk
Elliott Kulick
David Levy
Leslie Lishon
Harriet Mouchly-Weiss
Griff Norquist
Ana Luisa Ponti & Geoffrey R. Hoguet
Kerry Propper
Michael L. Riordan
Nina Solarz
Horst Sporer
VIVA Trust
Stelios S. Zavvos

SENIOR ADVISERS

Former Board Members who maintain an association with Crisis Group, and whose advice and support are called on (to the extent consistent with any other office they may be holding at the time).

Martti Ahtisaari
Chairman Emeritus

George Mitchell
Chairman Emeritus

Gareth Evans
President Emeritus

Kenneth Adelman
Adnan Abu Odeh
HRH Prince Turki al-Faisal
Hushang Ansary
Óscar Arias
Ersin Arıoğlu
Richard Armitage
Diego Arria
Zainab Bangura
Shlomo Ben-Ami
Christoph Bertram
Alan Blinken
Lakhdar Brahimi
Zbigniew Brzezinski
Kim Campbell
Jorge Castañeda
Naresh Chandra
Eugene Chien
Joaquim Alberto Chissano
Victor Chu
Mong Joon Chung
Pat Cox
Gianfranco Dell'Alba
Jacques Delors
Alain Destexhe
Mou-Shih Ding
Uffe Ellemann-Jensen
Gernot Erler
Marika Fahlén
Stanley Fischer
Malcolm Fraser
Swanee Hunt
Max Jakobson
James V. Kimsey
Aleksander Kwasniewski
Todung Mulya Lubis
Allan J. MacEachen
Graça Machel
Jessica T. Mathews
Nobuo Matsunaga
Barbara McDougall
Matthew McHugh
Miklós Németh
Christine Ockrent
Timothy Ong
Olara Otunnu
Lord (Christopher) Patten
Shimon Peres
Victor Pinchuk
Surin Pitsuwan
Cyril Ramaphosa
Fidel V. Ramos
George Robertson
Michel Rocard
Volker Rühe
Güler Sabancı
Mohamed Sahnoun
Salim A. Salim
Douglas Schoen
Christian Schwarz-Schilling
Michael Sohlman
Thorvald Stoltenberg
Leo Tindemans
Ed van Thijn
Simone Veil
Shirley Williams
Grigory Yavlinski
Uta Zapf
Ernesto Zedillo