

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT BETWEEN THE UNITED STATES ATTORNEY'S OFFICE FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK AND DR. WILLIAM SHER UNDER THE AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT

BACKGROUND

- 1. The parties to this Settlement Agreement are the United States Attorney's Office for the Eastern District of New York (USAO-EDNY) and Dr. William Sher.
- 2. This matter is based upon a complaint filed with the United States Department of Justice, of which the USAO-EDNY is a part. The complainant, Jeffrey Pacheco, alleged that Dr. Sher discriminated against Mr. Pacheco on the basis of his disability in violation of title III of the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), 42 U.S.C. §§ 12181-12189, when he refused to operate on Mr. Pacheco, who is HIV positive.
- 3. Dr. Sher denies that he discriminated against Mr. Pacheco and does not admit Mr. Pacheco's allegations. Dr. Sher maintains that he did not refuse to treat Mr. Pacheco.
- 4. The parties have reached agreement that it is in their best interests, and the USAO-EDNY believes that it is in the public interest, to resolve this dispute. The parties therefore voluntarily enter into this Settlement Agreement.

TITLE III COVERAGE AND FINDINGS

- The Attorney General is responsible for administering and enforcing title III of the ADA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 12181-12189, and the relevant regulation implementing title III, 28 C.F.R. Part 36.
- 6. At the time of the events described herein, Dr. Sher leased or operated a place of public accommodation within the meaning of 42 U.S.C. § 12182(a); is a private entity within the meaning of 42 U.S.C. § 12181(6); and is a place of public accommodation within the meaning of 42 U.S.C. § 12181(7), because he affected commerce and operated a professional office of a health care provider. *See also* 28 C.F.R. § 36.104.
- Under title III of the ADA, no person who owns, leases, or operates a place of public accommodation may discriminate against an individual on the basis of disability in the full and equal enjoyment of the goods, services, facilities, privileges, advantages, or accommodations of a place of public accommodation. 42 U.S.C. § 12182(a); 28 C.F.R.

3733147v.3



and for the server and an operation of the server of the s

DAMAGE SHE WELDERS WITH THE DAMAGE IN THE REAL OF L

和周期的知识法规定。

- a treba a secondar de la servició de concreta de la seconda da la seconda de la seconda de la seconda de la se Servición de Madricio de Marine e constructiva de la seconda de la seconda de la seconda de la seconda de la se
- (1) Site angliss on Stateshouter, and a set applicities that have a static to a sub-Versee (Report and a set of set of
 - k 136. Sääreköüsen senä bei ansta mensyksin kastmeteren illes hava paisi laita ei ja täärylin Mar. Paulasiaris allegikuunen 117. Shen astarrin kui mää hei millema on mariin kaster ken. Paorasen
- (1) The parties from a constant on the sector with reactification of the body of the body of the sector is a sector in the sector is a sector of the sector is a sector in the sector is a sector i

- ¹³ Jg. Anomez V. Andrattis P. Tressikk for administrating and subsetting the first sector process. 42 D. S.C. (g. e.2438 first sector to subsetting out algorithms and analyzing first fille of the first Part 46.
 - (c) At the time of the encodes of a contract group of the presence is a planeter of the effect to be active of the first interpretation where a state of the first interpretation where a state of the first interpretation where a state of the first interpretation of the first inte
 - C. Ekador Right (R. 1995) An end An exergities in which there is "the control of plantic end particle of particle and optimized a set on any deterministic aggification particle of the end of "datase in" deterministic into all particles of a spectrum of a classify order to structure exercises of the Bogers, and the Biggiff, or according to the set of the set of a set of the according to the set of according to the set of th

E 1754 68 ES

§ 36.201(a). Pursuant to these sections, a healthcare provider cannot deny its services to an individual with HIV simply because the individual has HIV.

- Ensuring that medical care providers do not discriminate on the basis of disability is an issue of general public importance. The USAO-EDNY is authorized to investigate alleged violations of title III of the ADA and to bring a civil action in federal court in any case that involves a pattern or practice of discrimination or that raises issues of general public importance. 42 U.S.C. § 12188(b).
- 9. As a result of its investigation of Mr. Pacheco's complaint, the USAO-EDNY has determined:
 - a. Mr. Pacheco has been diagnosed with HIV. He began to experience neck pain and went to see his primary care physician. An MRI revealed significant lymphadenopathy on the left side of his neck. Mr. Pacheco's primary care physician referred Mr. Pacheco to Dr. Sher.
 - b. Mr. Pacheco, an individual with HIV, has a physical impairment that substantially limits one or more major life activities, including the functions of the immune system, which is a major bodily function. Accordingly, he has a disability within the meaning of 42 U.S.C. § 12102 and 28 C.F.R. § 36.104.
 - c. Dr. Sher is an otolaryngologist.
 - d. After examining Mr. Pacheco and performing a needle biopsy, Dr. Sher determined that a full biopsy was appropriate.
 - e. On the day that the surgery was scheduled, a few minutes before the procedure was to begin, Dr. Sher indicated that he would not operate on Mr. Pacheco because Mr. Pacheco was HIV positive. Dr. Sher claims that he did so because he believed that Mr. Pacheco might not need surgery.
 - f. Dr. Sher did not have any further contact with Mr. Pacheco. Approximately three weeks later, another surgeon performed the biopsy on Mr. Pacheco, which confirmed that Mr. Pacheco had Hodgkins' Lymphoma.
- Accordingly, the USAO-EDNY has determined that Dr. Sher unlawfully denied Mr. Pacheco medical services, including surgery, because Mr. Pacheco is HIV positive, in violation of 42 U.S.C. § 12182 and C.F.R. § 36.201 et seq..
- 11. Mr. Pacheco is an aggrieved person pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 12188(b)(2)(B).

- 4. Stasuning the medical care, investors despect a succession of the learn of a set of the control of the co
 - to 18 Australia Millar Archite galatifica al Refer Architete in a complexity (Inc. 172 AQA (I.C. 171 ac Architectura Archi
 - (a) Survey and the rate of the protocol with FMV, where a non-experimencement of provalue weak using a firld protocol of a space function of the value of the or subble of a survey of a prophysicary, where an one half to be when the solution of the Hellinger couple of a physicary and the Fluctures of the Markov of the Mere
- b) Mit Fighterer an optioner wat HTZ name (b) fast appartieum on operative limits one of many momentals and discrete ships for himsions and financial systems whether analysis for the fill of one. Analog (b) for here on a first well to the meaning of 42 or 55 mp (1) or real 38 a 2 of 10 mm (44).
 - a paleon palote no tempo, alle su
 - g. "Ubgi egengianay ale " achieres gent parferes ny savati langery. Die "nam i deservanted for a tadi barro ere disare a
- L. Obtaine-lay (has one merry entry whenever a few with more herbits (h., protokilits, stage to mapfile. We file/encourt the two with that the obtaint few Patheter because Mr. (and one We 111A, providence for their starts and out offsets at the before that fails are store any theory with the rest two en-
- D. Die Stardikker was wie fusies simus warden is Particien. Angeware party (1987) words familieur of group party and first and of worder. Justice water workfichted that has an eres build elementance of a province.
- (9) Accerding gravity UCAS PERSIS Constants, 25 and (8) West Salar and a contraction of C Backeder medical are server body suggery servers of March March Backed Action and S violation 60 PC (5, 3, 6) (5, 5, 1952), and 1, F.K. C. St. 2010 of Sug
 - Fig. 200 Block Read of the state of the

ACTIONS TO BE TAKEN BY DR. SHER

- 12. Dr. Sher will not discriminate against any individual on the basis of disability, including HIV or AIDS, in the full and equal enjoyment of the goods, services, facilities, privileges, advantages, or accommodations he offers, consistent with title III of the ADA, 42 U.S.C. § 12182, and its implementing regulation, 28 C.F.R. Part 36.
- 13. Within 60 days of the effective date of this Agreement, Dr. Sher will attend training on title III of the ADA, including training about HIV/AIDS and discrimination, and will submit evidence to the USAO-EDNY that he has successfully completed the training within thirty days of completion. Dr. Sher will seek and obtain prior approval from the USAO-EDNY before taking the training. If Dr. Sher has already taken such training as of the effective date of this Agreement, he will submit evidence of that training within the sixty day period, which will satisfy the requirements of this section if the USAO-EDNY approves the training.
- 14. Within 30 days of the effective date of this Agreement, Dr. Sher will pay Mr. Pacheco \$75,000 to compensate him for the harm he alleges that he has endured (including, but not limited to, emotional distress, pain, and suffering) as a result of Dr. Sher's alleged conduct.

OTHER PROVISIONS

- 15. In consideration for the agreement set forth above, the USAO-EDNY will close its investigation alleging discrimination based on the findings set forth in paragraph 8. However, the USAO-EDNY may review Dr. Sher's compliance with this Agreement or title III of the ADA at any time. If the USAO-EDNY believes that Dr. Sher has violated title III of the ADA, this Agreement, or any portion of it, the USAO-EDNY may institute a civil action in the appropriate U.S. District Court to enforce this Agreement and/or title III of the ADA.
- 16. Failure by the USAO-EDNY to enforce any provision of this Agreement is not a waiver of its right to enforce any provisions of this Agreement.
- 17. If any term of this Agreement is determined by any court to be unenforceable, the other terms of this Agreement shall nonetheless remain in full force and effect, provided, however, that if the severance of any such provision materially alters the rights or obligations of the parties, the USAO-EDNY and Dr. Sher shall engage in good faith negotiations in order to adopt mutually agreeable amendments to this Agreement as may be necessary to restore the parties as closely as possible to the initially agreed upon relative rights and obligations.
- This Agreement is binding on Dr. Sher, including all principals, agents, executors, administrators, representatives, employees, successors in interest, beneficiaries, and assignees.

3733147v.3

ACTIONS TO BETAKEN BY DR. SINCR

- b) Dr. Sher will not an one annual appring any investigation for basis of disability. including HIV or AIDS, in the fift and email with mentiof the gends, see nerfaultides, privileges, advantages, or accommodeding the offers, consistent validity ID of the ADA, 42 U.S.C. § 12152, and its implementing regulation. IS 105 K that 36.
- F. Witting 60 days of the effective date of three-greenent. Fr. Shere well valuate or effective of the ADA, inclusing tabout of WARDS and discriminances, and well with submittee of the ADA, inclusing tabout of WARDS and discriminations, and well with submittee date of USAO FONV that he has successfully complete or the mathematical solution of the ADA, inclusing the has successfully complete or the mathematical solution of the ADA and the has successfully complete or the mathematical solution of the ADA and the has successfully complete or the mathematical solution of the MAD FONV here mathematical Dr. Sher will seek and obtain prior represendent of the USAO FONV here a date will be realized at the training of the there are the edge of the training of the start in the sector starts of the training of the start is evolved at the training of the start in the date of the training of
- 14. Within 40 days at the criticities does of this Agreement. Or other will pay set Prochases \$75,000 to compensate blackfort or harm he chayes from to an emission fuct deep but, not firmuch to considered districts polity and surfatively as a ready of 1 - - - - s Mayte, conduct

AND STATES ON A STATE OF

- 15. In consider, nion for the approximitient set for its effects, if e 125 well-block Y will close its investigation alloging distribute that based on the fieldings set forth in paragraph 8. However, the US-AO-EDWY may review Dy. Shert's compliance will the Apresment or differill of the AU by a stry three. If the USAO-EDWY releves (nab Dis Sher has violated file OI of the ADA, that Apresment we may position of it, the OSACED SY wishated file OI of the ADA. that Apresment we may position of it, the OSACED SY many institute workers on the appropriate up. Dirith Courted rations determinent and/or the ADA.
- 1.6 Failure by the JSAO-EDMY to enteror any provision of this Agreement for the particular office right to unbride any detribution of this Agradition.
 - (7) (Finity fram of this Agreement is fractioned to any come in the model of the other the other that office a greeneous shull nonetherest remains of the regressification and effective provided. Boweres, the 't the sevenance of any same more domains, the brack office of the regressification from the regression of the sevenance of any same more domains, the brack of the regressification from the regression of the sevenance of any same more domains. The regressification of the regressification from the regression of the particulation of the particle, the US (00-EFD) 't, and DL Sales that the regression of the regres
 - 18.1 This Agreeners is binding on Dr. 20 er. (achtönged) privatnik, agents, exectines, anajnistrators, representatives, englioyees, accessors for referent, banebraach y reditssigners.

E. ALFREN

- 19. This Agreement constitutes the entire agreement between the USAO-EDNY and Dr. Sher on the matters raised herein, and no prior or contemporaneous statement, promise, or agreement, either written or oral, made by any party or agents of any party, that is not contained in this written agreement, including any attachments, is enforceable. This Agreement can only be modified by mutual written agreement of the parties.
- 20. This Agreement does not constitute a finding by the USAO-EDNY that Dr. Sher is in full compliance with the ADA. This Agreement is not intended to remedy any other potential violations of the ADA or any other law that is not specifically addressed in this Agreement, including any other claims for discrimination on the basis of HIV or AIDS. Nothing in this Agreement relieves Dr. Sher of his obligation to fully comply with the requirements of the ADA.
- 21. The effective date of this Agreement is the date of the last signature below.
- 22. The duration of this Agreement will be three years from the effective date.

AGREED AND CONSENTED TO:

February 2 2016

Attorney for Dr. Sher

Dr. William Sher

March February <u>9</u> 2016

ROBERT L. CAPERS United States Attorney Eastern District of New York

ecelle/115 Jolie Apicella

Michael J. Goldberger Assistant U.S. Attorneys (718) 254-6528 (718) 254-6052

- 3.97 In the Agreement wavesures the author of parametric woods (the 038AC of 0.557 and 0.588 Shoreds discussion are additioned and parametric areas and the metarealistic on approved as welfare welfare and parametric and for any plang on a performance of the bound conterned as the static congramment, it is including to proceed and the conequine gable. This Conservation only boundary is informed with the construction the transfer.
- 20. This Agreetign take in community a managety means in this Agreetign take on community and the second faile compliance with the Agreet take Agreet and the Agreet and a second compliance with the Agreet take and the Agreet a
 - The file of subargariant as in order of a first strange of the Still, which is affect of the still
 - Treatments of this Agreement will for here your both dy affer the ast.

4月月日間周辺の1000円間(A-11月月日)

alle deservision

nstR and Ellin all

ter BRE C.E., C. Sterks 1. med-mates with me 4. mean Dreaky - Paska York

5.91116811